# Table of Contents (HLC)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Self-Study Process</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brief History of Winebrenner</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizational Structure</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accreditation History</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012 Institutional Snapshot Entering Students</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013 Institutional Snapshot Entering Students</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrollment</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTS student demographics 2007-13</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response to the 2004 HLC Self-Study</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criterion 1 Mission</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criterion 2 Integrity: Ethical and Responsible Conduct</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criterion 3 Teaching and Learning: Quality Resources, and Support</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criterion 4 Teaching and Learning: Evaluation and Improvement</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criterion 5 Resources, Planning, and Institutional Effectiveness</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assumed Practices</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal Compliance Report</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attachments</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronyms</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Self-Study Process

In conducting the self-study at Winebrenner Theological Seminary, the following items constituted the formal charge, which guided the self-study process. Winebrenner Theological Seminary community worked for two years in the evaluation of its practices and processes (attachment 1, timeline) and moved forward following the contours of the HLC Criteria and Federal Compliance guidelines.

Specifically, the following goals guided Winebrenner’s analysis:

- To render an objective and truthful evaluation of the condition of the seminary to the Higher Learning Commission in light of the five accreditation criteria and four themes of high-functioning organizations of higher education.
- To invite the authorities employed by the seminary to appraise the organization, to reach conclusions about its strengths and weaknesses, and to show the institutional will and resolve to know what to do in order to improve the organization’s processes and performances as it meets the needs of its stakeholders.
- To provide the seminary community with an evaluation of itself with the goal of internal ownership of the findings.
- To allow the reaccreditation process to guide organizational development and provide a scheme for overall maturation as well as a set of specific “next steps” for the seminary.
Winebrenner Theological Seminary utilized the PDCA cycle to promote clarity for team work.

The Winebrenner community has an understanding of the purpose, processes and value of organizational self-study. The examination fostered by this reaccreditation self-study is becoming a part of the seminary ethos and organizational opportunities. With the introduction of the new Pathways model of the accrediting process of HLC, this review will serve the seminary well as it moves forward in preparing servants for the Church.

The four teams met monthly to work on their assigned criteria and quarterly meetings were held for all team members to provide updates and information they would need to complete their tasks in the self-study. A self-study coordinator was appointed to organize the teams and the information that was needed to complete this study.

A self-study involves an entire community which includes faculty, staff, students, alumni, and board members. Each served in specific ways and gave of their time, energy, and insights in the process of this self-study. Specifically, two people attended the HLC-sponsored PEAQ self-study training in the last two years, and twenty-two individuals participated in some way as a member of a self-study team. SAFE, the Subcommittee on Assessment for Excellence served as the steering committee for the teams. Each committee member served on one of the study teams as a guide and expert to the criteria.

For the 2014 reaccreditation report to the HLC, the following people and committees worked in exceptional ways to accomplish a review of Winebrenner Theological Seminary and how it provides a quality education for its students. Special thanks are due to each for their efforts.
HLC Self Study Coordinator:
Ruth Whitaker
Academic Advancement Coordinator

HLC Steering Committee (SAFE):
Dr. Joel Cocklin
Vice President of Academic Advancement and Academic Dean
Assistant Professor of Practical Theology
Director, Master of Arts in Practical Theology

Dr. Gwen Ebner
Professor of Christian Ministries
Director, Master of Arts in Family Ministries

Jeannine Grimm
Student Services Coordinator

Kathryn Helleman
Assistant Academic Dean
Director of Assessment

Ruth Whitaker
Academic Advancement Coordinator

Jim Wilder
Coordinator of Admissions, Marketing, & Church Relations

Self-Study Writing Team:
Katie Erickson
Alumni, class of 2010

Jeannine Grimm
Student Services Coordinator

Kathryn Helleman
Assistant Academic Dean
Director of Assessment

Ruth Whitaker
Academic Advancement Coordinator
WINEBRENNER
Self Study for Assessment Organizational Chart

**President:** Dr. David Draper
(Cher Leader)

**Steering Committee**

SAFE Committee: Kathryn Hellman, Gwen Ebner, Joel Cocklin, Jeannine Grimm, Ruth Whitaker, Jim Wilder

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Team #1</th>
<th>Team #2</th>
<th>Team #3</th>
<th>Team #4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Institutional Integrity</td>
<td>Learning/Teaching/Research/Library</td>
<td>Theological Curriculum</td>
<td>Student Recruitment/Admissions/DL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Team Leader:</strong> John Niessley</td>
<td><strong>Team Leader:</strong> Linda Davison</td>
<td><strong>Team Leader:</strong> Jim Wilder</td>
<td><strong>Team Leader:</strong> Joel Cocklin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim Sweeney (faculty)</td>
<td>Gary Staats (faculty)</td>
<td>Shari Brandeberry (staff)</td>
<td>Brandon Withrow (faculty)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dan Fritt (student)</td>
<td>Marty Johnson (student)</td>
<td>Ricky Hull (student)</td>
<td>Shelly Stephenson (student)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim Ridge (alumnus)</td>
<td>Hugh McClintock (alumnus)</td>
<td>Katie Erickson (alumna)</td>
<td>Matt Ginter (alumnus)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art Battle (Trustee)</td>
<td>Dr. Adam-Ferguson, (Trustee)</td>
<td>Mike Walker (Trustee)</td>
<td>Barbara Hochstetller (Trustee)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeannine Grimm (SAFE)</td>
<td>Gwen Ebner (SAFE)</td>
<td>Kathryn Hellman (SAFE)</td>
<td>Ruth Whitaker (SAFE)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction to Winebrenner Seminary

Winebrenner Theological Seminary serves God's mission of reconciliation in changing the world by preparing servants of the Lord Jesus Christ to lead the Church.

Because Winebrenner Theological Seminary acknowledges the supremacy of our triune God, the uniqueness of our Lord Jesus Christ and the authority of Scripture, we strive for excellence in the following values:

- Theological preparation and application for ministry
- Spiritual formation for individuals and communities
- Evangelism and discipleship
- Leadership development
- Community life among students, faculty, administration, and staff
- Broad evangelical unity
Brief History of Winebrenner Theological Seminary

Winebrenner Theological Seminary (WTS) was established in 1942 as a graduate school of theology of Findlay College (renamed The University of Findlay in 1989). In 1961 Winebrenner received its charter from the State of Ohio to become an independent, degree-granting institution. Soon after, it moved from the campus of Findlay College to Melrose Avenue in Findlay. Beginning as a denominational institution founded by the Churches of God, General Conference (CGGC), WTS now serves numerous protestant denominations, as well as a growing number of nondenominational faith communities. The “Melrose years” witnessed the expansion and diversification of curriculum, enrollment, faculty, and mission. The school also received full accreditation and attracted the attention of a diverse evangelical constituency from northwest Ohio and beyond. In 2003, the seminary relocated adjacent to The University of Findlay campus. It occupies a state-of-the-art facility and benefits from close collaboration and resource sharing with The University of Findlay, even as it maintains institutional independence.

Winebrenner recently purchased a campus in Scotland, PA. The Scotland Campus of Winebrenner Theological Seminary represents extension of existing M.Div and MAPT programs into an area of Pennsylvania in which the parent denomination of the seminary has a substantial presence. This extension allows WTS to continue to “…serve God's mission of reconciliation in changing the world by preparing servants of the Lord Jesus Christ to lead the Church.” WTS has petitioned both its accrediting bodies for appropriate permission to offer full degree programs at this additional location. Currently, only occasional courses are being offered in the 2013-2014 Academic Year.

Support for this campus exists within the Churches of God, General Conference (CCGC) denominational leadership in both the Eastern Region and Allegheny Region which are located in geographic proximity to this new location. Enrollment projections reflect the lack of an evangelical seminary within a 100 mile radius of the location, the historic presence of the CCGC in the region, the geographic proximity of the location to both a major interstate and several large
metropolitan areas, and the potential for existing Pastoral Training Institute students (non-degree program of WTS) to transfer into a degree program if offered in their region.

With the addition of the WTS Scotland Campus, and the proposed status change to add this additional location, WTS will require significant ongoing monitoring to ensure that all programs offered gain the same degree of knowledge, formation and experience and receive the same institutional support and services.

The seminary is vitally evangelical in theology and spirit, upholding much of the classical pietistic and revivalist fervor of its namesake, John Winebrenner, founder of the CGGC in Harrisburg, Pennsylvania in 1825. The distinctive Winebrenner tradition and character affirms the position of historic pietism—that the personal experience of regeneration is a divine act and the sole means by which alienated humankind is reconciled to God in Christ. As the name Churches of God suggests, the Winebrenner tradition also recognizes a unity that transcends denominational or sectarian boundaries, a unity expressed through “the right hand of fellowship, without exception” (quoting John Winebrenner) and grounded in the Trinitarian nature of God.

Winebrenner is a seminary shaped by evangelicalism. It is a seminary distinctly shaped by the Churches of God, General Conference, and a seminary community continually being enriched by an ever-growing representation of the many traditions that compose the whole body of Christ. While the seminary is Arminian in theological persuasion, we are nonsectarian in our theological positions. Accordingly, the seminary community encourages administrators, faculty members, and students to recognize and respect different viewpoints regarding doctrines and practices without compromising fundamental historic tenets of Christianity.
Accreditation History of Winebrenner Theological Seminary

The following chronological outline provides a brief accreditation history of Winebrenner Theological Seminary:

- **February 1984.** Winebrenner is a candidate for accreditation with the North Central Association (NCA); degree programs limited to the Master of Divinity.
- **April 1986.** Winebrenner is accredited by the NCA; degree programs limited to the Master of Divinity.
- **January 1989.** Winebrenner is granted candidacy status by the Association of Theological Schools (ATS).
- **June 1991.** Winebrenner is granted initial accreditation for a period of three years by the ATS; approval for the Master of Divinity degree with preliminary approval of the Master of Arts in Christian Education degree.
- **August 1991.** Approval of the Master of Arts in Christian Education degree by the NCA.
- **June 1994.** Accreditation reaffirmed by the ATS for a period of ten years (spring 2004); approval of the Master of Divinity degree and the Master of Arts in Christian Education degree; preliminary approval to the Master of Arts (Theological Studies) degree.
- **August 1994.** NCA accreditation at the master’s level limited to the Master of Divinity degree, the Master of Arts in Christian Education degree, and the Master of Arts (Theological Studies) degree.
- **November 1997.** Preliminary approval granted by the ATS for the Doctor of Ministry degree.
- **August 1998.** Accreditation at the doctoral level of the Doctor of Ministry degree by the NCA.
- **May 2000.** Focused Visit to reaffirm the Doctor of Ministry degree accreditation by the NCA and ATS.
- Approval by both the Higher Learning Commission (HLC) and ATS to change the name of the Master of Arts in Christian Education degree to the Master of Arts in Family Ministry degree.
- **November 2004.** Focus visit for the Comprehensive Assessment Plan (CAP) for student learning.
- **August 2007.** Focus visit for assessment of the CAP for student learning.
- **November 2010.** Monitoring reports sent to the HLC and ATS.
- **June 2011.** Begin self-study for 2014 Focus Visit Reports for both the HLC and ATS.
- **Sept 2013.** HLC Focus visit on enrollment, finances, and planning.
- **June 2014.** HLC Focus visit on Master of Arts Clinical Counseling (MACC) program.
Institutional Snapshot Fall 2012 taken from ATS annual reporting

For each Academic Year data is gathered on student demographics and faculty demographics. The following is a summary of the report; see (attachment 2, 2012 institutional snapshot) for complete details.

KEY: B/NH = Black/Non-Hispanic, W/NH = White/Non-Hispanic, V/NR = Visa/Nonresident, NA = Not Available

During the Fall 2012 there were 18 enrollees:
- M.Div – 8
- MA – 7
- MATS – 1
- D.Min – 2

Student Body for full-time equivalent (FTE) Fall 2012:
- M.Div – 22 males (4 B/NH and 18 W/NH), 11 females (5 B/NH and 6 W/NH)
- MA – 12 males (2 B/NH and 9 W/NH, and 1 NA), 7 females (W/NH)
- MATS – 2 males (W/NH)
- D.Min – 14 males (1 Visa/Nonresident, 4 B/NH, and 10 W/NH) 3 females (1 Visa/Nonresident, 1 B/NH, and 1 W/NH).

Faculty Demographics for Fall 2012 by degree level: (see website for details, http://www.winebrenner.edu/ProspectiveStudents/Academics/Faculty.aspx)
- Doctoral: full-time – 6, part-time – 9
- Master’s: 6 part-time

Faculty Race/Ethnicity:
- 20 W/NH, 1B/NH

Faculty Gender:
- Male: 14
- Female: 6

Faculty Rank:
- Assistant: 15 (indicates all adjunct and part-time faculty)
- Associate: 2
- Full: 3
Institutional Snapshot Fall 2013 taken from ATS annual reporting

For each Academic Year data is gathered on student demographics and faculty demographics. The following is a summary of the report; see (attachment 3, 2013 institutional snapshot) for complete details.

KEY: B/NH = Black/Non-Hispanic, W/NH = White/Non-Hispanic, V/NR = Visa/Nonresident, NA = Not Available

During the Fall 2013 there were 11 enrollees:
- M.Div – 9
- MA – 1
- MATS – 0
- D.Min – 1

Student Body for full-time equivalent (FTE) Fall 2013:
- M.Div – 16 males (2 B/NH, 12 W/NH, and 2 NA), 11 females (3 B/NH and 8 W/NH)
- MA – 7 males (1 B/NH and 6 W/NH), 8 females (1 V/NR, 1 B/NH, and 6 W/NH)
- MATS – 2 males (W/NH)
- D.Min – 8 males (1 Visa/Nonresident, 1 B/NH, and 6 W/NH) 4 females (1 Visa/Nonresident, 1 B/NH, 1 Asian, and 1 W/NH).

Faculty Demographics for Fall 2013 by degree level: (see website for details, http://www.winebrenner.edu/ProspectiveStudents/Academics/Faculty.aspx)
- Doctoral: full-time – 6, part-time – 9
- Master’s: 6 part-time

Faculty Race/Ethnicity:
- 20 W/NH, 1B/NH

Faculty Gender:
- Male: 14
- Female: 6

Faculty Rank:
- Assistant: 15 (indicates all adjunct and part-time faculty)
- Associate: 2
- Full: 3
The raw data is in (attachment 4, data for total headcount), FTE Registration, persons enrolled.
Total Headcount from 2003AY – 2014AY (auditors + non-graduates + graduates)
Graduating Student Program Demographics for Academic Years 2008-2013
See (attachment 5, 2008-2013 graduate data) for all quantitative data by gender, race, financial
debt, personal growth after theological study, student satisfaction for learning skills for future
work, three most important influences on student education experience, importance of field
education, level of satisfaction of school services and academic resources, overall experience in
theological education, and position expected after graduation. This data was taken from the ATS
Graduating Student Survey from each Academic Year.

**Program totals for graduating students AY 2007-8**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mdiv</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA-P</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA-A</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dmin</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THM</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Program totals for graduating students 2008-09**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mdiv</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA-P</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA-A</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dmin</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THM</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Program totals for graduating students AY 2009-10

Program totals for graduating students AY 2011-12

Program totals for graduating students AY 2012-13
Program totals for graduating students 2008-2013 totals

- Mdiv: 39
- MA-P: 9
- MA-A: 21
- Dmin: 7
- THM: 1
- Other: 11

Legend:
- Mdiv
- MA-P
- MA-A
- Dmin
- THM
- Other
WTS Summary Response to the 2004 HLC Self-Study*

(* A Summary of this information is found in [attachment 6, 2004 HLC responses])

**Criterion One:** The institution has clear and publicly stated purposes consistent with its mission and appropriate to an institution of higher education:

- Teaching and learning are given high priority at WTS with the end goal of preparing graduates for worthwhile service in church and religious vocations.

- The seminary is committed to theological education, students and learning, teaching, academic freedom, planning, collaboration, and public disclosure.

- With the recent move adjacent to UF, the seminary is poised to offer solid theological education and a positive learning environment to the Findlay community and the surrounding region.

**Criterion Two:** The institution has effectively organized the human, financial, and physical resources necessary to accomplish its purposes:

- Together the administration, faculty, staff, students, and trustees comprise the human resources of WTS.

- WTS has had three campaigns beginning with "Now More Than Ever" operating campaign in January 2003, followed by “We are Winebrenner” and “AccessGranted” focusing on increasing the number of donors as well as gift levels to support the annual operating budget.

- The new WTS building provides state-of-the-art classrooms, meeting rooms, TLB Convocation Center, and office spaces.

**Criterion Three:** The institution is accomplishing its educational and other purposes:

- Individuals attend WTS primarily to prepare for a lifetime of vocational ministry within the context of a Christian church, institution, or agency.

- The seminary continues to work toward achieving its theological educational purposes as defined by its 23 institutional educational goals (cognitive, affective, and psychomotor).

- The two initiatives that need to have primacy at WTS are assessment and evaluation of student ministry capacities and accessibility of theological education by extension.
• Close attention is paid to the link between individual courses and the broader institutional agenda by requiring each syllabus to reference the institutional educational goals listed at the beginning of the seminary's current catalog. Professors are expected to demonstrate precise correlations between course goals and institutional goals. Ultimately, student evaluation forms in each course are organized around these goals as well. In addition, the 2004 Self-Study Survey indicated that students are generally pleased with the correlation between their studies and the learning goals of WTS.

• The educational programs of WTS are designed to meet varying vocational contexts and foci. Developing programs that have divergent applications and contexts requires a curriculum base that is comprehensive in theological, biblical, and historical reflection and convergent in terms of principles of praxis for specific ministry contexts.

• Teaching and learning are given high priority at WTS. Students are encouraged, and in fact given opportunities, to integrate the academic experience of the classroom with the practical experience of real-world ministry through the Ministry in Context (MIC) program. In addition, WTS offers academic and spiritual resources and services to support students and programs. The school strives to provide the optimal environment for a person-oriented seminary education. To that end, the processes of recruitment and admission, the services available to students and alumni, and the creation of enduring relationships among students and between students, faculty, and staff focus on individual student needs related to the creation of servant leaders.

• The seminary continues to support a strong working relationship among students, faculty, administration, and staff to foster a Christian learning community. WTS, as a learning organization, is committed to individual learning and growth as a path to institutional learning and growth. WTS, as a whole, gets smarter and better as a result of the shared insights of individuals in community.

Criterion Four: The institution can continue to accomplish its purposes and strengthen its educational effectiveness:

• WTS possesses a diverse and talented faculty.

• WTS, with its modem facilities and moderate evangelical theology, serves students from a wide range of backgrounds.

• WTS is attempting to increase the donor base, augment support from the parent denomination, and seek scholarship funding and more financial aid for students. All requirements for admission are clearly stated. Admission policies and practices, published in the WTS Graduate Catalogs (beginning 2003), are consistent with the seminary's role and mission.
An issue emerging from this self-study is the need to develop an annual update of the alumni database information to monitor placement of graduates and their personal and career milestones. The data to be collected should include address changes, significant personal and ministry achievements, and life transitions. This database would be helpful in upgrading alumni relations and planning continuing education programs for alumni. The placement of graduates and alumni could be included in an expansion of the WTS website to provide a ministry employment site for all graduates and alumni to post resumes and for various Christian ministries to post open ministry positions.

Criterion Five: The institution demonstrates integrity in its practices and relationships:

- WTS emphasizes honesty and integrity and encourages high ethical standards on the part of administrators, faculty, staff, students, and trustees.

- WTS has developed policies, principles, practices, and procedures for handling its internal and external dealings.

- Persons are treated with dignity, respect, care, concern, and compassion.
2014 Self-Study for HLC

Criterion One: Mission
Criterion Statement The institution’s mission is clear and articulated publicly; it guides the institution’s operations.

1.A. The institution’s mission is broadly understood within the institution and guides its operations.

1.A.1. The mission statement is developed through a process suited to the nature and culture of the institution and is adopted by the governing board.

“Winebrenner Theological Seminary serves God's mission of reconciliation in changing the world by preparing servants of the Lord Jesus Christ to lead the Church”

WTS has a mission statement that was adopted by the Board of Trustees in November 2001. This process included input from the president’s council and the seminary community including faculty, staff, and students (2004 WTS self-study report, pg 26). The mission statement articulates the commitment of the seminary to prepare servant leaders for biblically-based ministries in the world, in accordance to the teaching and belief of the Churches of God, General Conference.

1.A.2. The institution’s academic programs, student support services, and enrollment profile are consistent with its stated mission.

Admissions staff, and where appropriate the office of the academic dean, reviews admission materials in order to verify that the programs in which students are enrolled are appropriate and will assist them in leading the church serving God’s mission in changing the world. The WTS Enrollment Plan (attachment 51, Enrollment Plan with Appendices) reflects an enrollment profile that is consistent with, and guided by, the mission statement of the institution.

- **Admissions Office Mission**
  - In keeping with Winebrenner’s mission, the Admissions Office seeks to engage potential leaders by assisting them in; recognizing their call, realizing their need for knowledge and skills related to the call, and presenting them with the programs that will prepare them to fulfill the call.

- WTS understands the following characteristics to define the typical Winebrenner student or those characteristics that are sought out by the seminary.
  - Undergraduate degree with a 2.5 GPA (MACC – 3.0).
  - Members of evangelically minded and historically affiliated denominations (Churches of God, General Conference, Church of God (Anderson, IN), Assemblies of God, United Brethren in Christ, Church of the Nazarene, and...
various Baptist, Charismatic, and Pentecostal churches). (See 2013-14 Entering Student Questionnaire – Table 19 –“Comfort with the schools doctrinal positions/theological perspective” 4.1/5.0 –Enrollment Plan-Appendix 2)

- Graduates of Bible colleges or Christian colleges.
- Campus ministry leaders.
- Those interested in pastoral/vocational ministry (M.Div., MAPT)
- Those interested in counseling/caring ministries (MACC, MAFM)
- Those interested in teaching/academic ministry (MA[TS])
- Those living within a 90 minute drive of campus. (See 2013-14 Entering Student Questionnaire – Table 19 – “wanted a school close to home/work” 3.6/5.0)
- Those believing WTS to be the most affordable option.
- Those finding their desired degree can be achieved at WTS in fewer credit hours than at a competitor.
- Those attracted to our delivery system.

Winebrenner continues to promote the mission statement throughout and over all areas of its academic programs, and student support services. All academic programs and course work is focused on preparing students to lead the church in serving God’s mission in changing the world.

This also is expressed in the curriculum wide student learning outcomes (CWSLO’s) that were developed from the mission statement.

- Knowing: Practice Generosity (Graduate Catalog pg 19)
- Being: Seek Wholeness (Graduate Catalog pg 19)
- Doing: Live Missionally (Graduate Catalog pg 19)

For example, Student Support Services aids students in academic abilities (knowing and doing):

- Writing and thinking theologically
- Instructing students for on-line course work
- Matching new students with current students for mentoring

The seminary chaplain aids students in developing personal wholeness (being).

All students during their middler year will participate in a progress review (attachment 7, progress review form). This progress review includes focus on Knowing, Being, Doing by evaluating the students in:

- Attainment of goals that were created in the CM 581 Ministerial Person course
- Personal Wholeness: coping skills, boundaries, and nurturance
- Spiritual Wholeness: spiritual formation
- Support and Accountability: use of accountability
- Academic Program: satisfaction with their academic program
- Responsibility, financial, grades (GPA), and personal habits

1.A.3. The institution’s planning and budgeting priorities align with and support the mission.
The Board of Trustees is responsible for assuring that budgeting and planning are in alignment with the mission of the seminary (see Handbook of Operations, pg 15, section I.C.3). It is to formulate and determine general educational and financial policies as shall be deemed necessary for the administration and development of the seminary in accordance with its stated mission (ibid, pg 9-11, I.A.1 and I.A.2).

In the fall of 2013 WTS, with approval of The Board of Trustees made significant changes to its financial systems as documented in (attachment 38, financial documents). In general, these included refinancing and restructuring of debt in order to create improved cash flow, and a financial plan reflecting the purchase of the Scotland Campus, various contingency plans related to that property, and the creation of a financial advisory team to augment the resources and knowledge of the WTS financial officers.

Continuing efforts are underway to increase endowment funds and the donor base. Other revenue streams, including the leasing of Scotland Campus space, the addition of the MACC program, redesign of several academic programs to improve marketability, and the increase of non-degree program offerings and non-traditional programs to reach currently unexplored market shares.

The 2014-2017 three year financial plan describes a special meeting of the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees, President and Vice Presidents on June 10-11, 2014 in which strategic financial and long range planning were the focus. (Attachment 52, Financial Plan 2014-2017-Trustees Planning Meeting) The Board of Trustees Executive focused on three questions related to the mission and vision of WTS in order to better align the planning and budgeting process with the mission:

1. What does God want WTS to be in three years?
2. What does the church need WTS to be in three years?
3. What does the world need from WTS in three years?

The responses of the Executive Committee are detailed in the appended plan (Attachment 52, Financial Plan 2014-2017-Trustees Planning Meeting) and resulted in identification of seven key themes:

1. International connection
2. Social media
3. Visibility
4. Relevancy (cultural exegesis)
5. Leadership
6. Diversity – to include who we educate
7. Kingdom perspective

These responses and themes assisted the Executive Committee, Finance Committee of the Board of Trustees, Vice President of Institutional Advancement and Director of Finance in the creation of the 2014-2017 Financial Plan. (Attachment 52, Financial Plan 2014-2017-Trustees Planning Meeting) See also, Criterion 5.C.1. response on page 53 for more details regarding planning.
**1.B.C.D. The mission is articulated publicly…the institution understands the relationship between its mission and the diversity of society…the institution’s mission demonstrates commitment to the public good.**

The mission statement and core values have become the foundation for the strategic plan. They drive marketing, recruitment, communication, and hiring. In each of these endeavors, WTS places great value on representing itself as an institution whose primary educational mission is to prepare Christian leaders for service in the kingdom of God by being a broadly evangelical and ecumenical institution of theological education.

- Much of the recruitment media contains the mission statement of the seminary as do all materials used within the admissions process. The Winebrenner website includes the mission statement for public viewing.

- The seminary's philosophy of education emerges from its mission statement, core values, and statement of faith.

- A portion of the WTS mission statement is: “…Preparing leaders to transform the world through Jesus Christ”. This statement presumes values of Scripture, spiritual formation, discipleship, leadership, mission, and community life.

- Our Philosophy of Education has four statements that summarize the overall nature of the seminary program in terms of holistic, formational, practical and continual education. In WTS recruiting materials, this information is expressed through brochures, written material, website information, and through direct contact with potential students.

- The Winebrenner graduate catalog defines the purpose and mission of the seminary (Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog, pg 16-19). This catalog is also posted on the Winebrenner website for public viewing.

- The WTS mission statement could be interpreted as limited to only those entering some variety of Church ministries, and might be perceived as lacking application to students in the MATS and proposed MACC programs.

---

**Recommendation:**
Recommend to review the Mission Statement and determine its coherence to all program work.

WTS affirms the relationship between its mission and the diversity in society, realizing the role the institution plays in a multicultural society.

- The WTS-Findlay campus has expanded to include not only the WTS students but also the UF students, faculty and staff, which brings diversity. Many UF students are international students, with 5.48% representing 34 countries. [http://www.petersons.com/college-search/the-university-of-findlay-000_10000435.aspx](http://www.petersons.com/college-search/the-university-of-findlay-000_10000435.aspx).
• The commitment to broad evangelical unity is reflected in the varied backgrounds and denominational affiliations of the WTS faculty and staff.

• The following denominations are reflected in the current faculty and staff: Churches of God, General Conference, Church of God (Anderson IN), Presbyterian USA, United Church of Christ, Evangelical Lutheran Church in America, Episcopal Church USA, Mennonite, Assemblies of God, Evangelical Free Church, American Baptist, Church of the Nazarene, and independent church traditions.

• This broad evangelical spectrum in both faculty and student populations requires a willingness to affirm “Unity in the essential and Charity in all else.” WTS continues to attract this broad spectrum as evidence of the institutional commitment to evangelical unity and diversity.

• The WTS student population compares favorably to schools similar to WTS in mission and identity. According to WTS data for entering students in the fall of 2012, a population of 78 students enrolled in degree programs included 15 students who self-identified as black and 61 who self-identified as white. This data provides a 19.7% enrollment of black students in that academic year. This can be correlated with all students (as sampled by ATS) in similar schools and programs in the 2013 AY in which 18.31% self-identified as black.

WTS offers several forms of education such as, Master’s degrees, Doctorate degrees, and the Pastoral Training Institute (PTI), which is a non-degree granting program for individuals who do not have an undergraduate degree and would benefit from a theological education.

• This variety receives response through the diversity of degree and non-degree programs offered by WTS. Included in those offerings is the PTI non-accredited program at our Marion Campus (Marion Correctional Institute), for those who are incarcerated. This endeavor provides a theological training to those who would normally not be able to acquire such training.

• WTS is in the process of providing Leadership Training to lay people of the church. This training is offered in various locations in Northwest Ohio and in the Columbus, Ohio area. This initiative is called “Leadership One” and includes serving as a host site for the WillowCreek Global Leadership Summit.

• While Findlay and the surrounding area has limited representation by non-Caucasians, the WTS campus and the UF campus are more diverse. Findlay and the surrounding area have a very minimal exposure to a multicultural society. Within the student body there are Caucasians, Hispanics, African Americans, Africans, Koreans, and Indians. In this respect, the mission statement for changing the world by preparing servants of the Lord Jesus Christ is being fulfilled.
• WTS serves the public by becoming involved in community events. Students, faculty, and staff are invited through e-mails or the Student Newsletter to participate in these community events (attachment 8, student newsletters). The following are events that WTS has been involved in either as an institution or by faculty, staff, students, or alumni:
  • Backyard Mission Trip Team for Findlay and the surrounding area
  • Help Portrait of Findlay
  • On Common Ground (Sand Sculpture events during Holy Week) in Findlay
  • Agency on Aging (Senior Center) Hancock County
  • Rotary Club Findlay
  • National Day of Prayer Findlay
  • Continuing Education events
  • Bridges out of Poverty Hancock County
  • Global Leadership Summits and Global Leadership Lunches

**Criterion Two: Integrity: Ethical and Responsible Conduct.**

**Criterion Statement** The institution acts with integrity; its conduct is ethical and responsible.

2.A. The institution operates with integrity in its financial, academic, personnel, and auxiliary functions; it establishes and follows fair and ethical policies and processes for its governing board, administration, faculty, and staff.

WTS has established policies and processes for its governing board, administration, faculty, and staff and is committed to following fair and ethical practices.

It has a specified organizational structure which delineates authority and accountability (see the WTS Handbook of Operations, pg 23).

Regarding integrity in financial matters, WTS is a member of the Evangelical Council for Financial Accountability (http://www.ecfa.org/MemberProfile.aspx?ID=7988). As a member of ECFA we are held to high standards (Attachment 52 Financial Plan 2014-2017) in the following 7 core areas:
1. Doctrinal Issues
2. Governance
3. Financial Oversight
4. Use of Resources and Compliance with Laws
5. Transparency
6. Compensation-Setting and Related-Party Transactions
7. Stewardship of Charitable Gifts
   a. Truthfulness in Communications
   b. Giver Expectations and Intent
   c. Charitable gift communication
   d. Acting in the best interest of givers
   e. Percentage compensation for securing charitable gifts

WTS is registered with IRS, Annual Revenue and Expense data reported, and 2013, 2012, 2011, and 2010 Forms 990 filed with the IRS.

With regard to academic and personnel matters, WTS has specified policies delineated in the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog and the [WTS Handbook of Operations](http://www.winebrenner.edu/Portals/47/Documents/ATS%20MONITORING%20REPORT_11-1-10.pdf) (parts II & III). The Handbook of Operations specifies its commitment to nondiscriminatory policy in employment (III.B.1) and provides guidelines on grievance management (III.E). The Handbook of Operations (pg 83-88) contains detailed guidelines on the unacceptability of any form of harassment from any school-related persons, whether verbal in nature or in the form of physical contact.

WTS does not have formal auxiliary services as HLC delineates them (i.e., dining services, student housing, faculty or staff housing, intercollegiate athletics, student stores, a public radio station), but does share services with The University of Findlay as noted in the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog-Student Handbook (pg 21). WTS “benefits from close collaboration and resource sharing with The University of Findlay, even as it maintains institutional independence” (attachment 9, Cooperative agreement).

2.B. *The institution presents itself clearly and completely to its students and to the public with regard to its programs, requirements, faculty and staff, costs to students, control, and accreditation relationships.*

WTS is committed to public disclosure of complete and clear information.

Specific information about WTS is available in a variety of ways. In addition to traditional formats such as seminary catalogs and publications, electronic vehicles such as a website and social networks (Facebook, Twitter, etc.) are also available.

The publications and advertising are factual and fairly describe not only the mission statement, but also the history, core values, statement of faith, philosophy of education, institutional and educational goals, standards of life, affiliations, security information, continuing education opportunities, campus, and community life.

The WTS catalog and website clearly present its programs, requirements, faculty and staff, as well as costs to students, financial aid, governance and accreditation relationships with ATS (Association of Theological Schools) and HLC (Higher Learning Commission).

The primary means of published materials regarding WTS are the institution’s website (www.winebrenner.edu), brochures, donor letters, news releases, and the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog. A copy of the catalog is also accessible on the institution’s website.

Media provide details regarding degree programs and degree requirements (Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog, pg 24-33, 41-70), administration and staff (ibid., pg 8) faculty (ibid., pg 11-15), costs to
students (ibid., pg 34-40), control (ibid., pg 5–7), and accreditation relationships (ibid., pg 22; cf. http://winebrenner.edu/AboutWTS/AccreditationReportsandInformation.aspx).

The Graduate Catalog and Website provide information on charges and fees, including refund policies (http://www.winebrenner.edu/ProspectiveStudents/Admissions/TuitionandFees.aspx; Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog, pg 34).

The Coordinator of Admissions, Marketing, and Church Relations at WTS maintains media updates to the website. This person reviews all changes in publication details with department heads to ensure accuracy. The accuracy of information published in each academic year’s graduate catalog is reviewed, maintained, and updated by the Vice President of Academic Affairs (academic dean), degree program heads, and the registrar.

2.C. The governing board of the institution is sufficiently autonomous to make decisions in the best interest of the institution and to assure its integrity.

1. The governing board’s deliberations reflect priorities to preserve and enhance the institution.
2. The governing board reviews and considers the reasonable and relevant interests of the institution’s internal and external constituencies during its decision-making deliberations.
3. The governing board preserves its independence from undue influence on the part of donors, elected officials, ownership interests, or other external parties when such influence would not be in the best interest of the institution.
4. The governing board delegates day-to-day management of the institution to the administration and expects the faculty to oversee academic matters.

Established policies and processes for its governing board are spelled out in the Constitution and Bylaws of its Handbook of Operations (pg 13–23).


WTS belongs to and is held in trust for the Churches of God, General Conference by its Board of Trustees to manage and control the business, academic, and all other affairs of the seminary (ibid., pg 13). The Board’s primary role is to make policies and exercise responsibility for sound management in accordance with the seminary's stated mission. It serves as sole authority with regard to these policies (ibid., sec. I.C.3, pg 15).

The Board’s mechanism for considering reasonable and relevant interests of the institution’s internal and external constituencies during its decision-making deliberations is clearly articulated in the Constitution and Bylaws of its Handbook of Operations (pg 13–23), see also (attachment 10) for the Board of Trustees meeting agendas from 2011-13 and (attachment 10b, the Board of Trustees survey results).

- The Board enforces a conflict of interest policy for its members to ensure its members’ independence from undue influence on the part of donors, elected officials, ownership
interests, or other external parties when such influence would not be in the best interest of the institution (ibid., I.C.10 pg 21).

- The administration is responsible to and approved by the president through their immediate supervisor regarding day-to-day management (ibid., sec. III.B.2, pg 49), who is responsible to the board (ibid., pg 23),

- The faculty oversees academic matters (ibid., sec. II.A. and II.B.1, pg 25).

2.D. The institution is committed to freedom of expression and the pursuit of truth in teaching and learning.

WTS is a confessional institution. It is shaped generally by evangelicalism and distinctly shaped by the Churches of God, General Conference; see Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog, pg 16–17; WTS Handbook of Operations, sec. I.A.1–3, pg 9–12, and (see attachment 11, CGGC constitution).

WTS expresses an evangelical theology “that is gracious in spirit, respectful in dialogue, far-reaching in scope and centered in the cross. By growing in the knowledge of the Lord in both breadth and depth—through a faith-seeking-understanding approach veracity and generosity: confessing evangelical orthodoxy and catholicity, trusting in the triune-revelation and atoning sacrifice in Jesus Christ; recognizing human knowledge limitations; exuding a gracious heart and attitude regarding peripheral doctrines and interpretations; and dialoguing in humble, respectful, and non-coercive ways with all people” (Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog, pg 17-18).

WTS is committed to the freedom of expression and the pursuit of truth in teaching and learning within the parameters of its confessional allegiances (see WTS Handbook of Operations, sec. II.C.5, pg 28).

WTS’s guidelines on Academic Freedom encompass WTS’s officers, faculty, and students (WTS Handbook of Operations, sec. II.C.4, pg 28).

The specified guidelines for Academic Freedom concern principally the faculty (WTS Handbook of Operations, sec. II.C, pg 27–28). “Central to the vocation of the seminary—its officers, faculty, and students—is the inquiry for truth.” The statement further notes that this inquiry is both a communal and an individual vocation.

- The seminary’s policy is not “to dispense theological education as ready-made opinions or dogma, but rather to help the student to understand the basis of thought and realize the importance and consequences of an idea” (sec. II.C.4, pg 28).

- Moreover, when a subject is debatable, the teacher “should carefully indicate the alternatives, pointing out the issues involved in making a decision” (Ibid.).

- In an interview conducted with the Academic Dean he notes “Academic freedom and general freedom of inquiry are important for the classroom as well. Professors or
students should never be harassed in any way for their questions and views. Each class should foster an open and safe ethos. We do not just tell students what they should or must believe or think. We want students to develop their own critical thinking skills and an open environment in which professor and student alike are free to probe sometimes difficult theological and biblical issues.” (Interview with Dean Joel Cocklin August 19, 2013)

2.E. The institution ensures that faculty, students, and staff acquire, discover, and apply knowledge responsibly.

WTS has and enforces policies on academic honesty and integrity. The Catalog/Student Handbook defines the policy on page 100 in the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog/Student handbook. All students are expected to read and understand this policy; there is a form that the student signs to acknowledge their understanding of WTS policies.

The institution provides effective oversight and support services to ensure the integrity of research and scholarly practice conducted by its faculty, staff, and students.

Students are offered guidance in the ethical use of information resources.

The institution ensures that faculty, students, and staff acquire, discover, and apply knowledge responsibly. WTS is committed to the pursuit of truth: “Central to the vocation of the seminary—its officers, faculty, and students—is the inquiry for truth” (WTS Handbook of Operations, Sec.: II.C.4, pg 28).

The institution provides effective oversight and support services to ensure the integrity of research and scholarly practice conducted by its faculty, staff, and students. WTS faculty bears responsibility to conduct themselves in a manner consistent with established policies of the board and executive practices with regard to institutional research and instructional methods (WTS Handbook of Operations, sec.: II.B.3.c, pg 26). Faculty is answerable to the academic dean, who bears responsibility for enforcing policy.

Students are offered guidance in the ethical use of information resources. WTS delineates a policy of academic integrity for students (sec. B.1, pg 100 appended to the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog). Students bear personal responsibility “to represent as their own work in reports, papers, or examinations only what they are entitled to honestly present. Violations of academic integrity include dishonesty and plagiarism” (pg 100).

Students are offered guidance with regard to the acquiring, discovering, and applying knowledge responsibly through student services (Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog, sec. II, pg 108-109). It includes academic and personal advising by a combination of the academic dean, registrar, program directors, faculty, and office of student services. Master’s degree students take IS 510, Foundations in Theological Studies, in which they demonstrate understanding of graduate level theological research, critical thinking, writing, and computer skills (Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog, pg 85). They are oriented to the librarian resources by the WTS librarian. D.Min students are provided a similar orientation by the Research Project Coordinator and the WTS librarian.
Faculty and staff integrity of research and scholarly practice is not addressed specifically in the WTS Handbook of Operations.

**Recommendations:**

- *The WTS Handbook of Operations does not address specifically “integrity of research and scholarly practice,” although it does mention “institutional research” in connection to faculty. This should be clarified and delineated regarding faculty.*
- *Policy regarding staff with regard to “integrity of research and scholarly practice” is not evident. This should be clarified and delineated.*

**Criterion Three: Teaching and Learning; Quality, Resources, and Support**

**Criterion Statement**
The institution provides high quality education, wherever and however its offerings are delivered.

**3.A.1. Courses and programs are current and require levels of performance by students appropriate to the degree or certificate awarded.**

Programs and course descriptions are reviewed by the Curriculum Development and Review Committee in order to ensure that there is rationality between the program and the courses contained within it.

All courses are designed with a work load appropriate to the master’s level degree programs they support. This is verified through the Office of the Academic Dean reviewing each syllabus prior to a class being offered.

Additionally, WTS complies with the Department of Education standards for instructional hours per credit hour and has a published credit hour definition in the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog (pg 30, Credit Hour Definition).

**3.A.2. The institution articulates and differentiates learning goals for its undergraduate, graduate, post-baccalaureate, post-graduate, and certificate programs.**

Learning goals are included in each program description in the course catalog. The master’s level programs are all described using the institutional assessment outcomes of Knowing, Being, and Doing, also in each program description in the course catalog.

At the master’s level, the emphasis is on knowledge acquisition and integration, spiritual formation, and practical skill development. These differ from the doctoral level program in which students are integrating and reflecting on acquired knowledge, manifesting growth, and contributing new insight to their discipline.
3.A.3. The institution’s program quality and learning goals are consistent across all modes of delivery and all locations (on the main campus, at additional locations, by distance delivery, as dual credit, through contractual or consortia arrangements, or any other modality.)

Winebrenner prides itself on the consistency of its program quality and learning goals across all modes of delivery and locations. A template for syllabi was created to stay within consistent parameters for all course work, including on-line, hybrid, distance learning, and directed study work whether on the Findlay, Scotland, or Marion campus.

The learning goals for students and programs are expressed on each syllabus, consistent with Winebrenner’s mission and student outcome goals (attachment 12, syllabus template).

Program information in the catalog and on the website also expresses the quality and learning goals for students. Each program will define the Knowing, Being, and Doing program outcomes for graduates and assessment outcomes for students. These are found under each program description in the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog (D.Min, pg 63; M.Div pg 45; MATS pg 58; MAFM pg 52; MACC pg 49 and MAPT pg 55).

Course evaluations also use the terminology for curriculum wide student learning outcomes:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PART ONE – STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES</th>
<th>STRONGLY DISAGREE</th>
<th>DISAGREE</th>
<th>UNDECIDED/ &quot;MORE OR LESS&quot;</th>
<th>AGREE</th>
<th>STRONGLY AGREE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>This course has helped me to integrate faith into daily living. (SLO: seek wholeness)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This course has helped me to express and evaluate ideas and opinions with grace. (SLO: practice generosity)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This course has encouraged me for serving God and others. (SLO: live missionally)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All courses on each campus use this same template.

The Curriculum Wide Student Learning Outcomes (CWSLO) are evaluated in each course regardless of delivery method or location, (attachment 13, CWSLO AY data).

The entering, graduating, and alumni constituencies are surveyed using an instrument provided by ATS (attachment 5, graduating student questionnaire GSQ and (attachment 14, alumni questionnaire AQ). All online classes have the Assistant Academic Dean enrolled in an observational role to ensure high quality in this setting.

3.B.1. The general education program is appropriate to the mission, educational offerings, and degree levels of the institution.
WTS offers master’s level programs, which do not include general education requirements. WTS has core curriculum that is used for all master’s level curriculum:

- Ministerial Person
- Survey of Christian History
- Worldviews, Perspectives, and Christianity
- Interpreting the Bible
- Foundations in Theological Studies

(These are each outlined in the 2014 Fall Graduate Catalog pg 71-91)

3B.2. The institution articulates the purposes, content, and intended learning outcomes of its undergraduate general education requirements. The program of general education is grounded in a philosophy or framework developed by the institution or adopted from an established framework. It imparts broad knowledge and intellectual concepts to students and develops skills and attitudes that the institution believes every college-educated person should possess.

This does not apply as WTS does not offer any undergraduate degrees. See response above for WTS’s core curriculum.

3.B.3. Every degree program offered by the institution engages students in collecting, analyzing, and communicating information; in mastering modes of inquiry or creative work; and in developing skills adaptable to changing environments.

All master’s level programs included courses in which research-based assignments in the collecting, analyzing, and communicating of information is a normative activity. See the example below taken from CH 540 A Survey of the History of Christianity syllabus:

- CH 540 assignments-- The student will write a biographical paper on an historical figure covered in class from either the ancient or medieval periods, specifically between 90 A.D.-1450. This paper will explore the life and thought of this individual, focusing on a specific belief, contribution, or accomplishment and the continued relevance of this figure for understanding Christianity today. It will provide an opportunity to integrate what is learned throughout the course, making particular use of the course texts.

Students are also given opportunity to respond creatively to course assignments. For example:

- NT 630 Spirituality of Luke (Fall 2013): Produce a written research project on an aspect of Luke’s contribution to spirituality, demonstrating responsible interpretation and appropriate contextualization (application) to either a preaching or teaching context with a targeted audience. An assignment guide sheet will be provided specifying the details of the assignment (attachment 15, assignment guide).

Students develop skills appropriate to changing environments. For example:
• Worldview, Perspectives and Christianity focuses on changes globally in religious traditions and perspectives.
• Church in Mission, Christ and Culture, and Cultural Exegesis include the area of modern Christianity and its ever-changing methods to engage and ever changing world.

The D.Min program utilizes the engagement of students in collecting, analyzing, and communicating information in the research and writing portion of their dissertation (see pg 65 of the 2014 Fall Graduate Catalog).

3.B.4. The education offered by the institution recognizes the human and cultural diversity of the world in which students live and work.

WTS is committed to broad evangelical community and to the preparation of ministry leaders for a variety of settings and denominations.

In general, WTS addresses issues of human and cultural diversity in a variety of course offerings: Church in Mission, Christ in Culture, Biblical Worldview, Interpreting the Bible, Pastoral Care and Counseling, Spiritual Formation, Theology, and Survey of Christian History. These courses specifically seek to address a range of socioeconomic, historic, and cultural perspectives within and outside of religious tradition.

Within the MATS program the religious studies concentration allows a more formal exploration of diversity beyond the Christian tradition.

Within the MACC program the Biblical studies coursework allows the student to have a basic understanding of the Christian ethos for integration into their clinical perspective.

3.B.5. The faculty and students contribute to scholarship, creative work, and the discovery of knowledge to the extent appropriate to their programs and the institution’s mission.

Scholarship, creative work, and discovery of knowledge are essential to the work of a theological seminary. Master’s level students regularly engage in research in response to course assignments in courses such as Survey of Christian History, Theology, Biblical Worldview, Interpreting the Bible, New Testament Foundations, and Old Testament Foundations. The professor for each course guides this research. Documentation is demonstrated through various syllabi.

D.Min. students are engaged in a 3-6 year process of research and writing focused on a specific problem or area within the broader church. They present chapters to a peer review process and are guided in research by a writing team and the research assistant. Final projects are archived electronically through ProQuest, printed for cataloging in the Library, and available on the WTS website, http://www.winebrenner.edu/ProspectiveStudents/Academics/DoctorofMinistry/DoctorofMinistryProjects.aspx.
WTS faculty publishes books, write for journals, and contribute to scholarly debate and discussion within their specific disciplines. This activity is tracked through the use of faculty updates provided to the Office of the Academic Dean on a trimester basis. During annual faculty reviews this activity is discussed, (attachment 16, faculty update form).

3.C.1. The institution has sufficient numbers and continuity of faculty members to carry out both the classroom and the non-classroom roles of faculty, including oversight of the curriculum and expectations for student performance; establishment of academic credentials for instructional staff; involvement in assessment of student learning.

Every department is headed by either a PhD or D.Min degreed faculty who has oversight of certain programs. Currently WTS employs five full-time faculty members. Additionally, several administrators also teach on a part-time basis. Adjuncts are employed to teach in all programs with a current ratio of full-time faculty to adjuncts of roughly 1:2 in any given trimester.

Each full-time faculty member is required to serve on a committee. These committees are chaired by both faculty and administrative staff. Oversight for these committees is the responsibility of the Office of the Academic Dean.

Curriculum is monitored by the Committee for Curriculum Design and Review. Student performance and assessment of student learning is monitored by SAFE. Credentials of instructional staff are reviewed by the Office of the Academic Dean and by appointed committee members when the institution hires a faculty member. Sufficient faculty members exist to staff these and other key committees (attachment 17, for committee participation).

3.C.2. All instructors are appropriately credentialed, including those in dual credit, contractual, and consortial programs.

When a new full-time faculty person is added to the faculty, the credentials of that individual are reviewed by the Search Committee. This committee is chaired by the Academic Dean and includes representatives of the faculty, Board of Trustees, the president, and Office of the Academic Dean. Letters of reference are reviewed along with curricula vitae. Before the final contract is offered applicants provide copies of academic transcripts to verify academic degrees granted. These are held in the permanent file of all faculty members. A focus group consisting of faculty, staff, alumni, board members, and students evaluate the candidate as they present on a specific topic suggested by the Search Committee. The evaluations are collected and analyzed by the Search Committee and a selection is made. This procedure is defined in the Handbook of Operations section II.D. pg 28-30.

The faculty approves and recommends the final selectee to the Seminary President. The President presents the individual to the Board of Trustees Committee on Academic, Faculty and Student Affairs for their review. The Committee recommends for final approval the selected candidate to the full Board of Trustees.
In the case of adjuncts, the Office of the Academic Dean reviews the individual’s curricula vitae. Transcripts are required and a personal interview is conducted before the contract is offered.

The complete criteria for appropriate credentialed candidates are found in the Handbook of Operations, pg 28-31. There is also an annual performance evaluation completed in the spring for each employee, (attachment 18 for current faculty and staff qualifications).

3.C.3. **Instructors are evaluated regularly in accordance with established institutional policies and procedures.**

This policy is in the Operations Handbook Sec. II.G Evaluation (pg 32-33) as follows:

- Each member of the teaching faculty will be evaluated according to the Manual for Personnel Evaluation and Development Procedures.
- Faculty qualifications and evaluations are detailed in the Handbook of Operations, pg 28-33.
- All instructors, adjunct, and full faculty are evaluated using the same four-year cycle (attachment 19 and attachment 19b, faculty evaluations and development).

The academic dean reviews all faculty evaluations.

- If there are any actions to be taken, a scheduled one-on-one meeting is made with the faculty member.
- If no actions are required, the evaluations are filed in the faculty’s personnel folder that is kept in a locked filing cabinet in the registrar’s office.

**NOTE:** During the transition from the previous Academic Dean to the current Academic Dean, a year cycle was missed. In order to rectify this both the Student Evaluation and Academic Dean’s evaluation will take place in the 2013-2014 academic year. Additionally, the Office of the Academic Dean has agreed to include all adjuncts in the four-year evaluation cycle. The task of faculty evaluation is included in the job responsibilities of the Assistant Academic Dean with oversight by the Academic Dean. All interviews are conducted jointly by the Academic and Assistant Academic Deans.

3.C.4. **The institution has processes and resources for assuring that instructors are current in their disciplines and adept in their teaching roles; it supports their professional development.**

See previous criteria (3.C.3.) regarding faculty evaluation and professional development.

Additionally, all instructors provide updated curriculum vitae on an annual basis, and provide research and activity updates upon request of the Academic Advancement Coordinator, usually each trimester. Oversight of these tasks is the responsibility of the Office of the Academic Dean. As in the previous section it should be noted that adding an Assistant Dean has improved the ability to track this task.
Faculty is required to complete an Annual Professional Development Plan and to note areas of desired development. The task of professional development for faculty has been assigned to the Assistant Academic Dean.

3.C.5. Instructors are accessible for student inquiry.

Faculty is accessible, though not always physically present on campus. Office hours are posted adjacent to faculty office doors in the case of full time faculty. Details of adjunct hours are provided via Blackboard. Adjuncts teaching as a distance may use virtual office hours.

- 59% of students report high level of collegiality and engagement with faculty, 36% report a medium level.
- Overall there is 95% satisfaction in this area.

(Attachment 20, is the student survey quantitative data).

Professors are typically on campus on a weekly basis during the academic trimester. For the majority of professors this takes place on Tuesday since the block delivery system results in the greatest student density on this day. Professors are available by appointment at other times in order to meet the student’s needs.

https://ufonline.findlay.edu/webapps/portal/frameset.jsp?tab_tab_group_id=3_1&url=%2Fwebapps%2Fblackboard%2Fexecute%2Flauncher%3Ftype%3DCourse%26id%3D_90524_1%26url%3D.

Recommendations:

“Evaluate faculty engagement with students and consider how best to balance physical presence versus the availability of email and other contact technologies.”

3.C.6. Staff members providing student support services, such as tutoring, financial aid advising, academic advising, and co-curricular activities, are appropriately qualified, trained, and supported in their professional development.

Student services are provided by the Student Support Coordinator who uses resources both in-house and through our cooperative agreement with the University of Findlay.

- Students are referred to the Writing Center at UF for academic writing assistance.
- Students are referred to ITS for computer training.
- Students are referred to the Shafer library staff for assistance in research skills. The director of the WTS Library holds a degree in MLIS, Masters of Library and Information Science.
WTS faculty has not been formally trained in academic advising. However, many come from academic settings in which they have both received and provided academic advising. The registrar serves as a resource for faculty and students with specific questions.

- The registrar has ongoing training on updates to the GradPro system (database for students).
- Staff will periodically attend the Student Personnel Administration Network (SPAN) provided by ATS for updates on FERPA, registration, retention, human resources, and student aid.
- Conferences provided by HLC and ATS are attended by staff for the latest updates and training needs that will aid in their work.
- Improvement is needed in the area of development.

Currently, a budget is available for all faculty and staff. However, the responsibility is between the Academic Dean and the individual to identify needed training and to locate this training.

### 3.D.1. The institution provides student support services suited to the needs of its student populations.

Student support services sends out a survey for midpoint and graduating students. The results of these surveys are found in (attachment 20).

![Graph](image.png)

A library evaluation is added to each course evaluation for aiding the library in services for our students whereas the librarian and the assistant academic dean review this data to enhance the library collections to meet the student’s needs. The results of these surveys are found in (attachment 21).

In general these survey results, as well as other results indicate that students are satisfied with the services provided. Data for the Scotland Campus is not available at this time since the campus is not yet in fully accredited.
3.D.2. The institution provides for learning support and preparatory instruction to address the academic needs of its students. It has a process for directing entering students to courses and programs for which the students are adequately prepared.

Survey courses and foundations courses exist to provide a preparatory level of education for later course offerings.

Students are directed to take the IS 510 orientation course and CM 581 The Ministerial Person within the first two trimesters after beginning a program. These are also provided to Scotland Campus students as an online course and an intensive course.

WTS require a brief reading sample, transcripts of previous work, and interview for all incoming students. If a student does not have an undergrad degree a check sheet for BA equivalency is used (attachment 22, BA equivalency check sheet).

3.D.3. The institution provides academic advising suited to its programs and the needs of its students.

In addition to the statement in 3.D.2., all program directors act as advisors for students in their programs. This involves an initial interview as an assignment within IS 510. Further follow up is initiated by the student as needed or by the program director if a need is identified by the Office of the Academic Dean or Student Support Coordinator.

All program directors also make retention calls to the students in their programs as part of their academic advising role.

3.D.4. The institution provides to students and instructors the infrastructure and resources necessary to support effective teaching and learning (technological infrastructure, scientific laboratories, libraries, performance spaces, clinical practice sites, museum collections, as appropriate to the institutions offerings).

These statements are taken from the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog:

- Library: Shafer Library provides Winebrenner Theological Seminary campuses and The University of Findlay with services that promote the learning and research activities of students and faculty through print and online resources (attachment 23, library agreement with WTS). Ohio users with an active ID may borrow materials from a pool of over 49 million items owned by OhioLINK institutional libraries, and use the non-circulating reference materials. All users may search the electronic research databases, which include a variety of full-text resources. Further information may be found on the seminary’s website: http://www.winebrenner.edu/currentstudents/library.

- Technological infrastructure is provided and maintained through a contract with The University of Findlay Technology Services (attachment 24, cooperative agreement with
UF). As a small institution WTS benefits from the professionalism and expertise of the UF staff. Classrooms are equipped with current projection equipment and computers. All full-time professors are provided with computers for office use, and in many cases with laptops for more portability.

- The TLB auditorium located in the WTS facility is a state of the art performance venue used by the broader Findlay and Toledo community as well as WTS and UF events.

- See also this UF page as evidence of facility: [http://www.findlay.edu/offices/businessaffairs/facilities/Winebrenner-Theological-Seminary](http://www.findlay.edu/offices/businessaffairs/facilities/Winebrenner-Theological-Seminary).

The addition of the MACC program requires the addition of clinical practice sites which will be created and staffed in cooperation with Emerge Counseling services, Pathways Christian Counseling, Century Health, Arbors Counseling, Shalom Ministries, and also the modification of existing spaces at WTS as stated in the MACC program application with HLC (attachment 25, MACC program application).

3.D.5. *The institution provides to students guidance in the effective use of research and information resources.*

The IS 510 Foundations in Theological Studies course introduces all WTS master’s level students to the library collection, database resources, and the methods for utilizing these collections. The WTS librarian serves as instructor for this portion of the course. Additionally, students are provided with instruction in terms of identifying best resources. The librarian is available to work with classes or student on an individual basis with regard to research and information resources.

In the D.Min program, an orientation to research and to the WTS library collection is taught by the WTS librarian. Also, writing teams assist the student with research practices.

In the MATS program, additional research skills are taught as a part of the thesis process.

Shafer library is actively developing “lib-guides” which are web-link collections that direct a student to best resources on particular topics. WTS instructors are beginning to work with the WTS librarian to establish lib-guides for WTS class topics.

3.E. *The institution fulfills the claims it makes for an enriched educational environment.*

Winebrenner’s campus building is suitable for an academic classroom environment which includes computer, projector, and whiteboards. The furniture can be reconfigured for large groups, small groups, or lecture style classes.
WTS shares the Shafer Library with the University of Findlay, which gives the student greater access to resources.

Winebrenner also uses online classes through Blackboard which is a system provided by the University of Findlay.

WTS’s presence adjacent to the UF campus and the cooperative agreement provides access to arts performances, sporting events, technology support, and allows engagement with UF students, faculty, and staff (attachment 9, cooperative agreement with UF).

Most classes consist of six to twelve students, giving the student a more individualized learning experience.

Students are able to express their input for course materials and teaching methods through course evaluations, faculty evaluations, and surveys presented by Student Support Services.

CM 786, Supervised Ministry took the place of the CM 780, Ministry in Context (MIC) in 2006. Supervised Ministry is a three-trimester course during the academic year before graduation. Supervised Ministry allows the student a rich and varied educational experience with opportunity to practice skills integration. The student will choose a ministry context and utilize their seminary training in the praxis. Online dialog between professor and cohort students is done weekly to share and grow in understanding of their ministry setting. A Supervised Ministry manual is available to the student and to the supervisor at the ministry site. The course description can be found in the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog on page 41 and (attachment 26, Supervised Ministry Manual).

Community had been experienced throughout the trimesters beginning with Theological Summits (The TS have been eliminated as the result of an evaluation by the Committee on Curriculum Review and Design). Currently, monthly community meals, and monthly Simply Supper programs engage students with faculty. A community lounge area for students and faculty has been created in the faculty office area to promote community with faculty, staff, and students (attachment 27, Community Life/Student’s Independent Study on Seminary Community Life).

An Independent Study by a current student is planned for the Summer 2014 trimester which will focus on developing further opportunities and approaches to community from a student led perspective.

3.E.1. Co-curricular programs are suited to the institution’s mission and contribute to the educational experience of its students.

WTS does not have co-curricular programs. All programs are the sole responsibility of the seminary.
3.E.2. The institution demonstrates any claims it makes about contributions to its students’ educational experience by virtue of aspects of its mission, such as research, community engagement, service learning, religious or spiritual purpose, and economic development.

The CWSLOs are intended to foster vital qualities of knowing, being, and doing in all participants in WTS graduate degree programs. Specific program-level outcomes and course-level goals stem from and correspond to the following three CWSLOs that serve as assessment markers for the seminary’s CAP (Comprehensive Assessment Program):

As followers of Jesus Christ and servant leaders of the church, we are called to:

- **Knowing—Practice GENEROSITY.** We express an evangelical theology that is gracious in spirit, respectful in dialogue, far-reaching in scope and centered in the cross. By growing in the knowledge of the Lord in both breadth and depth—through a faith-seeking-understanding approach—we serve God’s plan for theological veracity and generosity: confessing evangelical orthodoxy and catholicity, trusting in the triune God’s self-revelation and atoning sacrifice in Jesus Christ; recognizing human knowledge limitations; exuding a gracious heart and attitude regarding peripheral doctrines and interpretations; and dialoguing in humble, respectful, and non-coercive ways with all people.

- **Being—Seek WHOLENESS.** We embrace holistic formation by integrating a biblical worldview into all areas of life. By aspiring to be whole in all dimensions of reality—in accordance with the scriptural metanarrative—we serve God’s plan for personal and communal fullness: fusing faith, learning, calling, and praxis; developing self-awareness, maturity, spirituality and wisdom; and embodying a Christian view of and for life.

- **Doing—Live MISSIONALLY.** We engage in God’s mission of reconciliation and redemption as people of the kingdom, empowered by the Holy Spirit. By participating in the grand narrative of God’s reign—living in service to the church and for the sake of the world—we serve God’s plan for reconciling all things to himself through Jesus Christ our Lord: contextualizing and incarnating the good news in particular historical and cultural settings; exegeting shifting culture in light of the unchanging Word; guiding and discipling others through Christ-centered witness and leadership; and engaging in lifelong learning as co-laborers in God’s kingdom and mission.
Criterion Four: Teaching and Learning; Evaluation and Improvement

Criterion Statement  The institution demonstrates responsibility for the quality of its educational programs, learning environments, and support services, and it evaluates their effectiveness for student learning through processes designed to promote continuous improvement.

4.A.1. **The institution maintains a practice for the quality of its educational programs.**

The process is maintained through the collective work of the SAFE committee, the academic dean, and all program directors.

4.A.2. **The institution evaluates all the credit that it transcripts, including what it awards for experiential learning or other forms of prior learning.**

Students may be admitted to masters programs as a result of a BA equivalency evaluation using a standard form and process.

4.A.3. **The institution has policies that assure the quality of the credit it accepts in transfer.**

Any credit that is transcript is evaluated by the dean and registrar on case by case basis. This is detailed in the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog on page 24-26.
The WTS registrar reviews all transcripts for both incoming students and current students for accuracy and quality of the credits for learning. All grades and transcript information is kept confidential on the GradPro database, and these are archived daily at an off site server by the software service provider. Student files are kept secure under lock and key in the registrar’s office in fireproof filing cabinets. These policies are found in the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog/Student handbook, on pages 110-111.

All course credits are reviewed by the registrar and faculty before graduation. The faculty review approves the graduate by vote after review and discussion of credentials (grades for completion of program).

4.A.4. The institution maintains and exercises authority over the prerequisites for courses, rigor of courses, expectations for student learning, access to learning resources, and faculty qualifications for all its programs, including dual credit programs. It assures that its dual credit courses or programs for high school students are equivalent in learning outcomes and levels of achievement to its higher education curriculum.

As part of the admissions process, the candidate submits a brief writing sample which the Admissions Committee assesses. If weaknesses are present, the individual will be referred to the writing center at The University of Findlay, per working agreement.

The prerequisites are listed in course descriptions. For example, NT 521 Greek Grammar is the prerequisite for NT 522 Greek Exegesis.

Revised courses, new courses, and course descriptions are all approved by faculty.

Learning outcomes are evaluated by the SAFE committee. Additionally, SAFE uses the CWSLO data to evaluate the achievement of each graduating class.

The WTS Handbook details the qualifications for faculty and staff, also (attachment 40, staff qualifications). The importance of resumes, transcripts of earned degrees, qualifying experience, and references in the hiring of WTS staff is normative. Within the interview process, discussion of educational qualifications, experience, and demeanor are consistently important to the hiring process. Training of new staff persons has been improved in the recent past compared to the anecdotal and experiential on-the-job training in regards to procedures, use of resources, and technical job elements.

The Student Support Coordinator is pro-active in orienting all new faculty, adjunct faculty, and staff; a check sheet (attachment 41), has been developed so that all individuals receive consistent information. Task specific training is accomplished within each department.

4.A.5. The institution maintains specialized accreditation for its programs as appropriate to its educational purposes.
WTS is accredited with the Association of Theological Schools, which has specific standards that relate directly to the unique dynamics of theological education: spiritual formation, etc. See Section one of the ATS’ Handbook of Accreditation: [Attachments/general-institutional-standards for ATS.pdf](Attachments\general-institutional-standards for ATS.pdf).

WTS will also seek accreditation via the Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP) for the MACC degree currently under development. This program will be monitored by having specialized accreditation with the Ohio Board of Regents, CSWMFT Board and by 2018, CACREP accredited.

**4.A.6. The institution evaluates the success of its graduates. The institution assures that the degree or certificate programs it represents as preparation for advanced study or employment accomplish these purposes. For all programs, the institution looks to indicators it deems appropriate to its mission, such as employment rates, admission rates to advanced degree programs, and participation rates in fellowships, internships, and special programs.**

Winebrenner has received a Lilly Grant (attachment 29, Lilly Grant document) that will allow for hiring an Alumni Coordinator. At the point of writing this self-study, there is a volunteer who has been contacting alumni to monitor the placement of graduates and personal/career milestones as well as contact information. Recently WTS began collecting data on our alumni through an Alumni Questionnaire via the ATS Alumni Questionnaire to monitor and track alumni from the five-year graduation point. At this time there is only two years of data (attachment 14, AQ data).

This data will then be reviewed by SAFE and the part-time Alumni Coordinator. The focus data that will be reviewed and utilized will be that of indebtedness, placement, effectiveness of seminary training, and resilience in ministry (are they still in ministry after five years).

The MACC program, given its purpose of preparing clinical mental health counselors for practice in the state of Ohio, will measure the employment rates and rates of successful completion of the state of Ohio licensure examination for clinical mental health counselors. This is reflected in the MACC section of the Academic Catalog (pg 49-51)

The SAFE committee directed by the Director of Assessment, will review the alumni feedback as it pertains to program and course effectiveness. Programs are assessed on an annual basis using feedback from students and alumni surveys.

Alumni are invited to WTS Leadership One events on a quarterly basis and to community dinners on a monthly basis.

**Recommendations:**
Expand on the alumni relations between Winebrenner and our graduates. Have reunions for fellowship and feedback on how the alumni are doing in their field of ministry.
4.B.1. The institution has clearly stated goals for student learning and effective processes for assessment of student learning and achievement of learning goals.

Student Learning Outcomes are stated in the catalog. Outcomes are established in the catalog, course descriptions, and syllabi.

- **WTS Student Learning Outcomes:**
  - As followers of Jesus Christ and servant leaders of his church, we are called to:
  - **Seek WHOLENESS**
    - We embrace holistic formation by integrating a biblical worldview into all areas of life.
  - **Practice GENEROSITY**
    - We express an evangelical theology that is gracious in spirit, respectful in dialogue, broad in scope, and centered in the cross.
  - **Live MISSIONALLY**
    - We engage in God’s mission of reconciliation and redemption as people of the Kingdom.

4.B.2. The institution assesses achievement of the learning outcomes that it claims for its curricular and co-curricular programs.

The learning outcomes are measured in course evaluations, the progress review, and capstone projects at both the course and at the program level, see (attachment 30, example from CM 700 MAFM Capstone expectations).

Assessment is overseen by both the SAFE committee and the Director of Assessment.

The Statement of Educational Effectiveness and Comprehensive Assessment Plan also addressed this (attachment 31).

4.B.3. The institution uses the information gained from assessment to improve student learning.

Data gained through assessment is presented to the SAFE committee, faculty, administration, and other committees as appropriate. Data is reviewed and necessary adjustments are recommended and then implemented.

For example, retention data showed the negative impact of the First Class Free (FCF) program, which was then eliminated. Retention was significantly decreased during this period due to this and other factors.

- 32 out of 63 FCF students returned with 24 FCF students never returning. See (attachment 32, quantitative data).
Retention, student success, and anecdotal evidence are used by the Student Services office to support programming and adjustments to the orientation course. See the Comprehensive Assessment Plan for more information, (attachment 31, CAP).

4.B.4. *The institution’s processes and methodologies to assess student learning reflect good practice, including the substantial participation of faculty and other instructional staff members.*

WTS has regular open communication between various stakeholders in regards to student learning assessment:

- Faculty
- SAFE
- Staff
- Other committees also assessing student learning

SAFE is comprised of faculty, administrative, and staff members. SAFE communicates regularly with faculty regarding student learning. Program Directors are involved in the development of their programs and use SAFE as a resource in this regard.

All faculty members receive copies of student course evaluations which are a direct assessment of student learning outcomes. These are also reviewed by the Academic Dean, Seminary President, and Assistant Academic Dean. Instructors are encouraged to apply the information received in each trimester’s report in their course development. Anecdotally, faculty reports the utility and application of this information.

The recently-created Committee for Curriculum Review and Development (CCRD), which also includes representatives of faculty, staff, and administration, is another initiative that seeks to review and develop program and course curriculum in an interdisciplinary and cooperative environment.

The Student Support Coordinator serves as a member of both SAFE and CCRD and in this capacity serves to express the needs and concerns of students.

4.C. *The institution demonstrates a commitment to educational improvement through ongoing attention to retention, persistence, and completion rates in its degree and certificate programs.*

Winebrenner’s retention process (attachment 33) is to make personal calls during the period between formal registration and semester start to active students who have not yet registered for a subsequent term. Each program director makes calls to the student in their program based on a list generated by the registrar and student support coordinator that takes into account a wide variety of mitigating factors. The call is recorded on an electronic retention report form. This form is then sent to the academic advancement coordinator, registrar, and student services coordinator for review and documenting. The student services coordinator follows up with calls.
to students who could not be reached during the late registration period. This is an ongoing process.

The 2014 Enrollment Plan (attachment 51, Enrollment Plan, Increase Retention) describes a process for increasing retention and improvement evaluation of retention data currently being collected.

Tactics:
- Program directors contact students who have failed to register in order to encourage registration for the next term and provide other important advice.
- Data has been compiled as a result of the Retention for Success plan, but in preparation for this (Enrollment) plan, it was determined that it was not effective in measuring needed markers. A new system is being devised using the definition that a “retained” student is one who is registered or intends to register for the next trimester and continues from year 1 to year 2 in his/her program. Informed by more effective data, WTS will be able to implement systems and policies to enhance retention.

Evaluation:
- Director of Assessment and Registrar compile retention data. The Director of Assessment will analyze it and report to Admissions Committee and SAFE annually by November 1.
- Students’ reported obstacles to enrollment are collected and analyzed. The Director of Assessment will report to Admissions and SAFE as data is received early each trimester.
- Degree completion rate of NN%
- Graduation rate of NN%, however, WTS intends to further investigate an appropriate rate for measuring and assessing graduation rates across all programs.

The matriculation data is also analyzed by the SAFE committee for program improvement (attachment 34, matriculation data). Data from the ATS Graduate Survey (GS) is also reviewed by the Dean, Assistant Dean, and SAFE committee (attachment 5, the ATS GS).

Completion rates are also posted as part of the Statement of Educational Effectiveness on the institution’s website. Data on completion rates is available in the Assistant Academic Dean’s office.

4.C.1. The institution has defined goals for student retention, persistence, and completion that are ambitious but attainable and appropriate to its mission, student populations, and educational offerings.

WTS actively pursues students to achieve maximum retention (attachment 33, Retention for Success). As a part of the 2014 Enrollment Plan it is noted that degree completion and graduation rates must be defined for effective evaluation of programs. (Attachment 51, Enrollment Plan, Increase Retention)
**Recommendation:**

WTS should evaluate current rates of retention, persistence and completion and define goals for each of these benchmarks.

4.C.2. The institution collects and analyzes information on student retention, persistence and completion of its programs.

The Retention for Success (Attachment 33) plan collects data regarding students who are eligible to register, but have not. Students are contacted by Program Directors who are trained to assist in either registering the student or learning what is impeding their registration.

Data is compiled by the Academic Advancement Coordinator and registrar.

The Student Services office coordinates ongoing support for students who have failed to register for classes by calling or meeting with the student to help understand and support the student for continuing their degree program.

The Student Services office also tracks long-term retention trends.

See 4.C for details.

4.C.3. The institution uses information on student retention, persistence, and completion of programs to make improvements as warranted by the data.

Retention data and responses are evaluated by SAFE and other departments. Changes are recommended and made as warranted.

For example, cohort retention data showed the negative impact of the First Class Free program, which was then eliminated. Retention had significantly decreased during this period as a result of this and other factors (attachment 32, retention data).

Retention, student success, and anecdotal evidence are used by the Student Services office to support programming and adjustments to the orientation course.

The 2014 Enrollment plan defines a clearer process for reporting of student retention, persistence and completion in all programs which will allow for improvements on the basis of this data.

4.C.4. The institution’s processes and methodologies for collecting and analyzing information on student retention, persistence, and completion of programs reflect good practice. (Institutions are not required to use IPEDS definitions in their determination of persistence or
Completion rates. Institutions are encouraged to choose measures that are suitable to their student populations, but institutions are accountable for the validity of their measures.

Completion rates are calculated on an annual basis by the director of assessment. (See web-link http://winebrenner.edu/ProspectiveStudents/Academics/StatementofEducationalEffectiveness.aspx).

- Rates differ from the IPEDS definition in the MAPT/MACD program because this course is designed for an extended model.
- Students complete the 60 credit hour program in four years rather than the normative two years for a program of this length.
- This variation is clearly stated in the catalog which describes this program as a four-year part-time distance learning program.

Retention data is maintained by the student support coordinator and is reviewed with SAFE on an annual basis.

- The Retention for Success Plan was created by SAFE in the 2012-2013 academic year, revised in the 2013-2014 academic year. It gives clear direction in terms of process.
- Data is recorded by Program Directors and evaluated and coded by the director of assessment, (attachment 36, call data).

Institutional data on assessment of student learning is accurate and addresses the full range of students who enroll.

Assessment of student learning takes place across all programs using CWSLO’s (curriculum wide student learning outcomes). These are calculated at the end of each academic year and reflect the students’ learning using established benchmarks embedded within the program. These include quantitative measures such as grades received in capstone projects and specific course work, and qualitative measures such as the assessment of a student in middler review. The final scores in these benchmarks are calculated for all graduates in a program and then tabulated as a final percentage of learning score. The target score for all master’s level students is 85% and 95% in the D.Min program, see web-link: http://winebrenner.edu/ProspectiveStudents/Academics/StatementofEducationalEffectiveness.aspx.

All students graduating from a program are included in this calculation. The maintenance and reporting of this data is the responsibility of the director of assessment.

**Criterion Five: Resources, Planning, and Institutional Effectiveness.**

**Criterion Statement:** The institution’s resources, structures, and processes are sufficient to fulfill its mission, improve the quality of its educational offerings, and respond to future challenges and opportunities. The institution plans for the future.

5.A.1. The institution has the fiscal and human resources and physical and technological infrastructure sufficient to support its operations wherever and however programs are delivered.
Recently in a financial focus visit, conducted September 2013, HLC raised three primary concerns regarding whether the institution’s resource base supports its current educational programs: finances, planning, and enrollment. These areas are subject to the overall trends seen and documented in other like institutions of WTS’s nature and size. In response to these concerns WTS has initiated the following:

- A three year financial strategy plan has been developed (attachment 52, 2014-2017 Financial Plan). The institution has created a financial advisory committee to consult and guide future financial strategies in addition to the direction received from the Board of Trustees who retain full decision making authority. WTS has addressed its strategic long-term financial needs (attachment 38). See details below.
- An Enrollment Plan has been drafted with clear goals, deadlines and methods of assessment and management. See details below.
- An increased focus on planning is evident in IA as reflected in the creation of these specific plans for institutional success.

**Financial Trends and Planning**

The spring trimester of 2004 was the high point for Winebrenner Theological Seminary (WTS) in both enrollment and net assets. We completed a successful $10,000,000 campaign for five years of annual funding and the construction was finalized of a $6,000,000 building in to which we moved in August of 2003. Graduate headcount was 104 and FTE at 77.2. The June 31, 2004 audited report indicated that net assets were at an all-time high of $8,942,174.

In early 2008 WTS began to anticipate the possibility of a recession and began to reduce costs through staff attrition and many other cost saving reductions. These actions helped the institution weather the immediate recession, but left Winebrenner understaffed in the area of recruiting and admissions. The short term solution to cash flow created a longer term detriment in the area of recruiting. Winebrenner is just now beginning to add the personnel needed to carry out the plan for increasing enrollment.

The decline in enrollment and the apparent inability of WTS to slow or turn around the decline has forced the administration to begin to look honestly at programs, plans, needs of prospective students, and the current environment of seminary education in our region and in the United States. Winebrenner does not intend to assign blame to societal changes, but rather to become better equipped to adapt to changes, and to address the current educational needs of persons desiring to integrate faith and career in a holistic manner.

The financial issues that confront WTS are a symptom of the preceding concerns. Winebrenner has failed in the past to adequately plan, implement, and assess the institutional advancement plan. Winebrenner has taken steps in the past two years to begin to improve the process and must continue to plan, implement, evaluate/assess, and adapt the plan to changing data and student needs while maintaining its focus on the mission.
The following strategies are further described in the attached financial plan (attachment 52, 2014-2017 Financial Plan)

Summary of Strategies

1. Increase Enrollment
   - Increased recruitment events.
   - Master of Arts in Clinical Counseling.
   - More aggressive retention plan.
   - Increased marketing.
   - Revamping of several programs.

2. Campaigns for Scotland and Scholarships
   - Raise funds to renovate Scotland campus.
   - Raise funds to increase Scholarships.

3. Scotland Campus
   - Grow to maximum of 400 Korean junior high/high school students resident on campus.
   - Continue to work to lease more of the nearly 1 million square foot of space.
   - Continue to work on land development and potential sale of portions of the 165 acre campus.

4. Personnel
   - Recent hires have increased the reach and effectiveness of institutional advancement.
   - Search continues for a Development/Recruiting Officer.

5. Improve Annual Fund Giving
   - The Director of Advancement has been tasked with improving the annual fund giving.

6. Endowments
   - Mr. Lyne will present two to four seminars a year 2015-2016 for potential donors.
   - Assessment will be done quarterly by the President’s Council.

7. Financial Advisory Committee and the National Development Council
   - The plan is to join the advisory committee to the National Development Council. The National Development Council includes business leaders from the Pennsylvania area, national Churches of God leaders, and leaders from areas Winebrenner has targeted for recruiting.

Enrollment

Due to the reduced enrollment trends in the late 2000’s positions in recruitment were eliminated and roles consolidated within remaining IA staff. In order to improve current enrollment trends the need for a full-time recruiter has been identified. The WTS Enrollment Plan (2014) indicates a deadline of December 31, 2014 for this hire to take place. Currently WTS employs two part-
time regional coordinators. These individuals are networked in denominations that historically provide students to WTS. Additionally plans are underway to hire an additional regional coordinator also by year end 2014. (attachment 51, Enrollment Strategies)

The seminary would benefit from the addition of a dedicated staff person in the area of marketing which would assist in addressing enrollment trends. Plans are underway to launch new marketing materials which include an increased focus on the role of program directors. (Attachment 51, Enrollment Plan, Involve Program Directors)

- In 2012 program directors participated in the development of marketing plans for their programs (See examples in Enrollment Plan-Appendix 6). These need updated to reflect program changes in 2014.
- Faculty are invited to attend recruiting events. This will be increased as more events are conducted.
- In cooperation with the Dean’s Office, the Admissions Office will develop strategies for faculty integration earlier in the recruiting process (calls, emails, etc.).
- Videos and images of program directors will be more heavily integrated into promotional materials in order to foster connection between prospective students and their program director.

Other details of the Enrollment Plan include the addition of the MACC program, the credit hour reductions in the MATS and MAFM programs, the addition of Scotland Campus as a second location, and the potential to take the reduced MATS to an all online format.

The seminary has sufficient faculty, both full-time and adjuncts, to provide courses in its current programs. The addition of the MACC program will require the addition of faculty, initially adjuncts, but also full-time faculty. The increased expenses and salaries will be offset by the increased enrollment in the MACC program.

Staff levels in Academic Advancement (AA) are sufficient to carry out the day to day administrative tasks of the institution. The addition, in 2014, of an Assistant Academic Dean has assisted in balancing this work load. Staff levels in Institutional Advancement (IA) were reduced in response to down turns in enrollment and resources. The recent addition of an Assistant to the Vice President of Institutional Advancement and a Coordinator for Leadership One who also has responsibility for the Lilly Grant tasks has improved the work load in IA. However, additional staffing for enrollment management and recruitment are necessary. These needs are noted and deadlines established for hiring in the 2014 Enrollment Plan. (Attachment 51, Enrollment Plan) Scotland Campus staff will need to be increased to meet the needs of that campus when it becomes an approved additional location. Discussions regarding staffing needs have taken place in the President’s Council within the last year.

Physical assets regarding the building and equipment are of excellent levels, as mentioned in criterion 3.E. The Scotland Campus facility provides ample room for classes as an additional campus site and also allows spaces which can be leased for additional income. Initially leases have been initiated with a daycare, Korean international students, and a STNA training program. Negotiations are underway with the local school district and several higher education institutions
regarding use of office and classroom spaces. Leasing revenue will be essential for the long term financial stability of the Scotland Campus. Additionally, the financial plan includes provision for fundraising toward renovation of facilities at the Scotland Campus to increase the potential number of spaces which can be made available for lease. (Attachment 52, 2014-2017 Financial Plan and attachment 53, Scotland 3 Year Budget)

WTS, through its collaborative agreement with UF, has access to significant information technology resources. Email addresses are provided to all students regardless of location or program delivery method. All students have access to electronic library resources. Library development is underway at the Scotland Campus to meet the needs of student in that geographic region.

WTS does not make elective resource allocations or disbursements of revenue to any super-ordinate entity. It functions as a stand-alone institution with separate 501 (c) (3) status. The WTS Scotland Campus operating budget currently exists as a separate line items from that of the WTS Findlay Campus operating budget and safeguards are in place to prevent resource drain on the institution. (Attachment 55, Budget 2014-2015)

5.A-2. The institution’s resources allocation process ensures that its educational purposes are not adversely affected by elective resource allocations to other areas of disbursements of revenue to a super-ordinate entity.

5.A.3. The goals incorporated into mission statements or elaborations of mission statements are realistic in light of the institution’s organization, resources, and opportunities.

The current mission statement was developed by the Board of Trustees in 2001 through a process which included consultation with the faculty, staff and students of the seminary. The mission statement, when contextualized, reflects the institutional integrity of the seminary and is aligned with Christian educational values and ethical teaching standards of the seminary. The June 2014 meeting of the Executive Committee reaffirmed this mission statement and further developed
themes to focus the activity of WTS in the next decade. (Attachment 52, Financial Plan 2014-2017)

- International connection
- Social media
- Visibility
- Relevancy (cultural exegesis)
- Leadership
- Diversity – to include who we educate
- Kingdom perspective

The mission statement is: “Winebrenner Theological Seminary serves God's mission of reconciliation in changing the world by preparing servants of the Lord Jesus Christ to lead the Church.” This is posted within Winebrenner’s website under “About.” It fits the nature of the institution, it is easily remembered, and it is integrated into the WTS’s statement of faith.

On each course syllabus, the learning outcomes are to seek wholeness, practice generosity, and live missionally. It has in the past been linked with Winebrenner’s vision statement of “preparing leaders to transform the world through Jesus Christ.”

Winebrenner’s overall mission statement does not appear in the syllabi or near any prominent viewing areas within the building.

**Recommendations:**
*To have the institution incorporate the mission statement within each course’s syllabus and review verbally how it will manifest itself within the class.*

**5.4.4. The institution’s staff in all areas is appropriately qualified and trained.**

The WTS Handbook details the qualifications for faculty and staff, (see also attachment 40, staff qualifications). The importance of resumes, transcripts of earned degrees, qualifying experience, and references in the hiring of WTS staff is normative. Within the interview process, discussion of educational qualifications, experience, and demeanor are consistently important to the hiring process. Training of new staff persons has been improved in the recent past compared to the anecdotal and experiential on-the-job training in regards to procedures, use of resources, and technical job elements.

The Student Support Coordinator is pro-active in orienting all new faculty, adjunct faculty, and staff; a check sheet has been developed so that all individuals receive consistent information. (see attachment 41, Orientation Check Sheet)
Task specific training is accomplished within each department. There is room for improvement in this area with a more targeted process of training and the addition of professional development to staff job descriptions.

5.A.5. The institution has a well-developed process in place for budgeting and for monitoring expenses.

The 2004 self-study demonstrated a need for attention to the issue of long range planning at WTS with attention to budgeting and monitoring of expenses. The 2004-2014 decade reflected significant fiscal challenges which increased the need for improved budgeting processes.

Previous HLC focus visits and monitoring reports have addressed the issue of financial stability. The institution’s budgeting process has been evaluated and changes made to reflect recommendations from HLC. This is an ongoing process as reflected by HLC’s request of continued monitoring of the WTS financial stability. WTS responses to HLC’s concerns are well-documented and reflect a responsiveness to the situation.

WTS has focused directly on issues of financial stability. The work of the Finance Committee of the Board of Trustees has resulted in increased awareness at the Board of Trustees level and decision making regarding new programs, the addition of the Scotland Campus and also refinancing of short term debt. This is reflected in the Board of Trustees Agendas and Minutes and in the June 2014 meeting of the Executive Committee. (Agendas attached, see attachment 10. Minutes available in the resource room during the comprehensive visit. (See also attachment 52, 2014-2017 Financial Plan)

A financial advisory committee has been formed, made up of business leaders from diverse backgrounds, making recommendations to the Vice President of Institutional Advancement (VPIA). This body has no decision-making authority and serves only in an advisory capacity with the full knowledge and consent of the Board of Trustees.

The VPIA and Finance Director in conjunction with the Finance Committee of the Board of Trustees have drafted a financial and strategic plan for the next three years 2014-2017 designed to guide the financial and strategic activity of the institution both at the Findlay and Scotland campuses.

**Recommendations:**
- Extend and expand the planning process to encompass not only the financial advisory committee members but add current students to the feedback process.

5.B.1. The institution has and employs policies and procedures to engage its internal constituencies—including its governing board, administration, faculty, staff, and students—in the institution’s governance.
The policies and processes for WTS regarding its internal constituencies as it relates to governance of the Board of Trustees, administration, faculty, staff, and students are outlined in the Handbook of Operations. (See attachment 50, Handbook of Operations)

The Board of Trustees, administration, faculty, staff and students engage in shared governance to fulfill the WTS mission in the following ways:

- The level of engagement between the groups noted above was obtained via a short survey (See attachment 20, Student Survey)

- The secretary to the President also serves as the assistant secretary to the board and is present for every board meeting. This then fulfills the criteria for a staff representative present at all WTS Board of Trustee Meetings.

- Each year there is an appointed faculty and student representative that serves on the board of trustees. These individuals have both voice and vote. Both of these representatives serve on the Board of Trustees Committee on Faculty, Academic and Student Affairs in an advisory capacity. This provides a voice in major decisions such as the hiring of faculty, advancement in rank, and issues of student concern which are raised to the Board of Trustees level.

- There is a student representative to the faculty who is appointed by the President’s Council and has both voice and vote. This individual participates in all meetings of the faculty but is excused during Executive Sessions.

5.B.2. The governing board is knowledgeable about the institution; it provides oversight for the institution’s financial and academic policies and practices and meets its legal and fiduciary responsibilities.

The level of knowledge about WTS and its educational practices, spiritual mission, and academic and future goals from a governance perspective is high, based on the following details:

- WTS personnel provide accurate reports and information during all Board Meetings, and actively participate in the committee discussions where these issues are addressed.

- Many WTS Board of Trustees members are invited and participate in WTS activities in addition to Board Meetings. Reported activities include, attending graduations, attending Theological Summits, and other activities held at WTS.

- Many of the WTS Board of Trustees are alumni, current and former teachers, and have other affiliations with WTS outside of being a Trustee. (See attachment 10b, Trustees Survey)
The Finance and Business Affairs Committee thoroughly reviews and provides information regarding the WTS Budget and other financial issues to be voted on by the WTS Board of Trustees. The Academic, Faculty and Student Affairs addresses academic, faculty and student issues with recommendations to be voted on by the entire WTS Board.

The WTS Board of Trustees receives regular academic reports regarding WTS and its academic goals. The Board meets at least twice a year pursuant to the Handbook of Operations and Bylaws for the Trustees and reports regarding academic reports and goals are provided in the reports from the Academic, Faculty and Affairs Committee. There is a faculty and a student representative to the Board of Trustees that aid in reporting academic goals and processes.

The WTS Board of Trustees meets its legal and fiduciary responsibilities as it relates to governance for WTS by:

- Carrying out all activities indicated in the Handbook of Operations regarding the legal and fiduciary obligations it holds.

- Acquisition of the Scotland Campus in Pennsylvania is an example of the WTS Board of Trustees oversight and governance in continuing to meet all of the legal, fiduciary, academic, financial and future goals of the seminary. This decision reflects careful evaluation of the legal and financial ramifications and a determination that the mission of WTS is supported by this action (attachment 10 Board of Trustees meeting agendas).

**Recommendations:**

*The WTS Board of Trustees should continue its current practices to meet all of its legal, fiduciary, academic, financial and future goals.*

5.B.3. The institution enables the involvement of its administration, faculty, staff, and students in setting academic requirements, policy, and processes through effective structures for contribution and collaborative effort.

Winebrenner prides itself on the diversity of individuals engaged in committee work. Additionally, the Board of Trustees involves administration, faculty, staff, and students in decision making. The following is an example of committees which comprise the diversity among its members: (attachment 17 for complete listing – this listing is also found on the Blackboard organization for faculty & staff information site).

- Faculty – administration, faculty, staff, student, and volunteer staff.
- Board – board, staff and administration, faculty, and student representatives.
- SAFE – administration, staff, faculty.
- Student Support – staff from academic and business offices.
- Admissions – staff from academic and business offices.
- Curriculum Design and Review – administration, faculty, and staff.
All policy is formed by the President’s Council or the Board of Trustees but substantial opportunities exist for committees to propose policy via the Vice Presidents of Academic and Institutional Advancement who are ex officio members of all committees within their reporting structures.

5.C.1. **The institution allocates its resources in alignment with its mission and priorities.**

WTS allocates resources according to its mission of training leaders for the church. Priorities include sustaining existing programs, developing new programs that will benefit the church, sustaining existing locations and expanding locations to provide opportunities for program growth as well as the ongoing engagement of necessary functions to support this mission.

Cash reserves are available currently to support stated mission and priority. The recent purchase of the Scotland campus property demonstrates the determination of the seminary to utilize all resources at its disposal in order to solidify its financial position. The new site addition demonstrates WTS’ commitment to serve their concentrated core constituents and continue allocating resources in alignment with its stated mission and priorities.

WTS is developing the MACC professional counseling program in alignment with its mission of training future professionals, who in addition to their professional skills, will also serve as resources to the church ([attachment 43, MACC recruitment data]). WTS must carefully monitor the launch of the MACC program. The MACC program is an essential facet in supporting the long term priorities of the institution. Projected expenses and income for the MACC have been adjusted to reflect the intention of an initial Spring 2015 launch of two cohorts, one full-time and one part-time, and additional cohorts, one full-time and one-part time in the Fall of 2015. ([attachment 55, MACC projections])

Recruitment remains a concern. Effective recruitment will require allocated funds to support marketing and the hiring of a full time recruiter. This has been noted in the Enrollment Plan (2014) with particular emphasis on enrollment in the MACC. ([attachment 51, Enrollment Strategies]) This is an essential task so as to secure financial stability, missional priorities, and institutional objectives. Of particular concern is the enrollment level in the MACC program, as this new program launches, as well as sustaining and increasing enrollment in all other programs.

5.C.2. **The institution links its processes for assessment of student learning, evaluation of operations, planning, and budgeting.**

SAFE has created a robust system of assessment of student learning. However, WTS’s system for integrated evaluation of student learning, operations, planning and budgeting requires additional definition and monitoring. There is a tendency to engage issues that are viewed as urgent but a lack of long range focus on issues that will become urgent in the future.

The financial advisory committee has been formed to provide advice and guidance to the financial decision making process at WTS. The refinancing of the building was the result of that committee’s strategic planning in response to depleted funds. Without that planning, the
organization would be in a crisis position at this time. The institution currently has the personnel and procedures in place to implement the financial plan as presented for the 2013-2014 academic year based upon available documentation and information.

The 2014 self-study process has improved awareness in Institutional Advancement regarding the need for closer working relationships with Academic Advancement in the areas of student assessment and program effectiveness.

**Recommendations:**

- *WTS should maintain the financial advisory committee.* This body assists in balancing strategy with execution of that strategy.
- *WTS should develop systems for integrating assessment of student learning with decisions regarding operations, planning and budgeting.*

---

5.C.3. The planning process encompasses the institution as a whole and considers the perspectives of internal and external constituent groups.

There is a need for continued focus on internal assessment of policies and processes in Institutional Advancement similar to the focus that has taken place in Academic Advancement. Reductions in staffing in the Institutional Advancement department have resulted in a focus on day to day operations with little additional time available to complete planning and evaluation of those operations.

The addition of the financial advisory committee has assisted in providing external perspective to the planning process. This group meets with the VPIA on an as needed basis.

The Board of Trustees has members in common with the University of Findlay Board of Trustees, CGGC, and other constituents who contribute to the planning process for financial and enrollment life of the seminary. The Board of Trustees also created the National Development Council to serve as a vehicle for informal conversation with external constituent groups and also to provide opportunity to identify prospective Board of Trustee members.

Of future urgency for the seminary is engaging with external constituent groups who are the end consumers of WTS graduates, local judicatories, non-profits and others who hire WTS grads, in order to determine if the skills, knowledge and personal formation of WTS grads reflect the needs of these constituencies.

This concern has been noted and is addressed in part through the 2014 Enrollment Plan. *(Attachment 51, Enrollment Plan)* The addition of regional representatives in the Toledo and Scotland PA areas will augment the work of those already employed in the Lima and Bowling Green areas. These individuals increase the ability of WTS to network with local judicatories, area non-profits, and other external constituent groups. While their primary purpose is recruitment the creation of networked relationships will assist in providing necessary feedback regarding the quality of WTS graduates. A process for more formal evaluation will be developed.
5.C.4. The institution plans on the basis of a sound understanding of its current capacity. 
Institutional plans anticipate the possible impact of fluctuations in the institution’s sources of 
revenue, such as enrollment, the economy, and state support.

The recent 2014 3 year financial plan notes the impact of recent fluctuations in the economy and 
enrollment and its effect on the institution. “The decline in enrollment and the apparent inability 
of WTS to slow or turn around the decline has forced the administration to begin to look 
honestly at programs, plans, needs of prospective students, and the current environment of 
seminary education in our region and in the United States. Winebrenner does not intend to 
assign blame to societal changes, but rather to become better equipped to adapt to changes, and 
to address the current educational needs of persons desiring to integrate faith and career in a 
holistic manner.

The financial issues that confront WTS are a symptom of the preceding concerns. Winebrenner 
has failed in the past to adequately plan, implement, and assess the institutional advancement 
plan. Winebrenner has taken steps in the past two years to begin to improve the process and 
must continue to plan, implement, evaluate/assess, and adapt the plan to changing data and 
student needs while maintaining its focus on the mission.” (2014-2017 Financial Plan)

As a graduate school WTS does not receive state support but does experience fluctuations 
resulting from changes in enrollment and the economy. WTS has increased its cash reserve 
through refinancing short term and long term debt in order to provide a cushion against current 
enrollment trends. This resulted in a change in WTS CFI rate from 0.6 to 2.3 in a one year period 
from 2012-2013.

In addition to this WTS has invested in strategies of new and revised programs, including the 
addition of the MACC program and credit hour reductions in the MATS and MAFM programs in 
order to create greater appeal to students and potential increases in enrollment. The new campus 
in Scotland PA has been established to accept students in the heart of the Churches of God, 
General Conference (CGGC). These endeavors are part of a strategic plan to grow revenue and 
enrollment for Winebrenner, thus expanding the opportunity for theological education for clergy 
and lay persons. The 2013 HLC Financial Focus details the initial stages of this work 
(attachment 38) as does the 2014 Enrollment Plan, (attachment 51, Enrollment Plan) and 2014-
2017 Financial Plan (attachment 52).

5.C.5. The institution planning anticipates emerging factors, such as technology, demographic 
shifts, and globalization.
WTS has substantial access to information technology support through its cooperative agreement with The University of Findlay. This results in use of Blackboard to teach online classes. WTS will seek approval in 2014 to create an online version of the existing MATS program. Before moving to this delivery venue WTS determined that a credit hour reduction was necessary to the overall design of the program. This was executed with intent to design a program which could be offered online at a later date. Other masters level programs at WTS cannot currently be offered online due to restrictions by WTS’ other accrediting bodies. However, WTS will continue to monitor these restrictions and where accrediting standards allow will adapt programs accordingly.

Demographic shifts (age and type of students) data is collected within the ATS entering student survey (attachments 2 and attachment 3). This data is analyzed by SAFE and used to inform decision making by program directors.

5.D. The institution works systematically to improve its performance.

Administrators, staff and faculty at WTS recognize the need for systematic review of the institution. This is carried out at the Academic level through the work of the SAFE committee. Where IA functions are directly related to the Academic functions of the institution these are also evaluated through SAFE. There is a need to create a systemic review of the institution’s work in IA in order to improve performance.


The SAFE committee maintains a log of activity which documents the evaluative process of the Academic Advancement Team and some areas of the Institutional Advancement Team.

A procedure and flow chart is utilized for student matriculation (attachment 33). This allows the various operations, such as SAFE, admissions, registrar, progress review, faculty approval and grading, financial aid, and student services to monitor and collect documents that support the student learning outcomes. The data is kept in the Assistant Dean’s office.

Standard documentation is maintained regarding the financial activity of the institution which is audited annually and reported to the Board of Trustees as each meeting.

Minutes are maintained of all Board of Trustees, President’s Council and Faculty Meetings. These are available for review.

The president’s council consisting of the President, VP of Academics, VP of Institution, VP of the PA Initiative, Director of Development, and Executive Assistant to the president, oversee and review all evidence of performance of WTS’ operations.

5.D.2. The institution learns from its operational experience and applies that learning to improve its intuitional effectiveness, capabilities and sustainability, overall and in its component parts.
In the decade since the 2004 self-study WTS has developed greater focus on assessment in the area of Academic Advancement. Significant challenges in Institutional Advancement, declining enrollment, fiscal constraints, and reduced staffing, have made sustained focus on planning difficult. The IA staff, despite these challenges, has continued to investigate new possibilities in financing, programming, marketing and the like. While not all of these attempts have been successful, (see for example First Class Free retention data) there remains a strong commitment to change as necessary for the growth and survival of the institution. Recent strategies for enrollment and recruitment are noted in the 2014 Enrollment Plan. (Attachment 51, Enrollment Plan)

The Board of Trustees shares this same commitment to change as necessary for growth and survival, as evidenced by the purchase of the Scotland Campus, approval of the MACC program and other measures in the areas of financial planning, designed to sustain and enhance the function of the seminary.

**ASSUMED PRACTICES**

**Assumed Practice A.1.** The institution has a conflict of interest policy that ensures that the governing boards and the senior administrative personnel act in the best interest of the institution.

WTS utilizes a conflict of interest policy and sign-off for all members of the WTS Board of Trustees, administrators, faculty, and staff signs a conflict of interest policy statement annually (attachment 45).

**Assumed Practice A.2.** The institution has ethics policies for faculty and staff regarding conflict of interest, nepotism, recruitment and admissions, financial aid, privacy of personal information and contracting.

The ethics of this institution are presumed in the following statement from the WTS Handbook of Operations: “All members of the Winebrenner Theological Seminary community are expected to manifest a proper attitude and conduct toward the Christian life and testimony of the Seminary. The standards of conduct expected are those indicated for Christians in the scriptures as citizens of the kingdom of God. The Christian is a resident alien living in anticipation of the age to come” (pg 12 of the Handbook of Operations).

Policies pertinent to faculty and staff are addressed in Part IV of the Handbook of Operations. The policies for recruitment, admissions, financial aid, and privacy of personal information are addressed in the Student Handbook and Graduate Catalog.

**Assumed Practice A.3.** The institution provides its students, administrators, faculty, and staff with policies and procedures informing them of their rights and responsibilities within the institution.

WTS provides faculty and staff with a Policy/Procedure Handbook. This handbook is available and accessible by all employed as it resides on the Blackboard Organization site under Faculty Staff resources for Winebrenner. It is also available through the Human Resource office.
As people are hired, this handbook is made available to the new employee. The contents of this handbook describe all institutional rights and responsibilities.

- **Part I – Institutional Perspective**
  - Institutional Standards
  - Constitution
  - Bylaws
  - Org Chart

- **Part II – Faculty**
  - Includes: membership, responsibilities, academic freedom, appointments, adjunct, rank, evaluation, contract renewal, promotion, probation/dismissal, dispute resolution policy, termination, resignation, retirement, sabbatical leave, leave from duties, compensation, medical insurance, long-term disability and accident insurance, tuition waivers for WTS, tuition exchange program between UF and WTS, housing allowance, outside employment, professional growth and development, operational procedures, grievances, harassment, drug and alcohol policy.

- **Part III – Administration and Staff Policies**
  - Includes: personnel, employment policies, tuition waivers for WTS, tuition exchange program between UF and WTS, grievances, harassment, sabbatical leave, policies regarding conduct, security.

- **Part IV – Policies**
  - Includes: Employee tuition waivers, employee recognition policy, contributions policies, investment policy, faculty policies for instructional media, faculty professional development policy, tuition exchange with UF, performance appraisal policy, counseling guidelines for faculty and staff, harassment policy, computer resources policy, school loan counseling policy, graduate student research assistantships, student-spouse tuition discount, graduate enrollment incentive program, personal references, inclement weather, illness in class policy.

WTS also includes a student handbook as a part of the annual Graduate Catalog. This document informs the student of their rights and responsibilities enrolled students at WTS. This can also be accessed on the Winebrenner website and on Blackboard in the student resources organizational page (attachment 46, screenshot of student resources page).

**Assumed Practice A.4.** The institution provides clear information regarding its procedures for receiving complaints and grievances from students and other constituencies, responds to them in a timely manner, and analyzes them to improve its processes.

The student handbook describes the process for conflict resolution in grade dispute, conflict between students, and grievances (Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog pg 101). There have not been any grievances in the past ten years (2004-2014) so an analysis of the process has not been done.
There has been assessment of grading, syllabus information, and course evaluation questions analyzed by the SAFE committee to document the student’s awareness of policies (attachment 35, SAFE log). Currently each syllabus presents the grade scale and lists the expectations and values of course work and participation for determining the grade.

Example: From TH 500 A Survey of Christian Theology syllabus (Spring 2014)

**IV. EVALUATION AND GRADE SCALE**

**Grade Scale:** A (96–100), A– (90–95), B+ (87–89), B (83–86), B– (80–82), C+ (77–79), C (73–76), C– (70–72), D (65–69), F (below 65)

*A course in which a student receives a D or F will not meet the requirements for degree credit.*

- **Assigned Reading**—Reading report due April 1. (10% of course grade)
- **Attendance, Attentiveness and Quality of Class Participation** (10% of course grade)
- **Research Exam 1: Midterm** (25% of course grade)
- **Written Project** (30% of course grade)
- **Research Exam 2: Final** (25% of course grade)

*Assumed practices A.5.a-h. The institution makes readily available to student and to the general public clear and complete information including: statements of mission, vision, and values, full description of the requirements for its programs, including all reerequisite courses. Requirements for admission both to the institution and to particular programs. Policies on acceptance of transfer credit...all student costs, including tuition, fees, financial aid policies, practices and requirements and a policy on refunds. Policies regarding academic good standing, probation, dismissal; enrollment requirements. A full list of its instructors and their academic credentials. Its relationship with any parent organization and any providers of its instruction.*

WTS makes readily available to the students a catalog and handbook that includes all of the above expectations. Each student is to read and then sign a form that indicates that they have read and understand these items. The signed form is kept on file in the Academic Advancement Coordinator’s files.

During the orientation class (IS 510) this information is briefly reviewed and the expectation of signing and returning the form is explained.

WTS makes this information readily available on the website and in the catalog. Admissions staff also explains this information to potential and accepted students.

*Assumed Practices A.6. The institution assures that all data it makes public are accurate and complete, including those reporting on student achievement of learning and student persistence, retention and completion.*
The primary media of published materials regarding WTS are the institution’s website (www.winebrenner.edu) and Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog (which is also accessible on the institution’s website: http://www.winebrenner.edu/Portals/47/Documents/Academics/Fall%202013%20WTS%20Catalog.pdf). The Coordinator of Admissions, Marketing, and Church Relations at WTS, maintains updates to the website and reviews all changes in publication details with department heads to ensure accuracy. The accuracy of information published in the WTS Graduate Catalog is reviewed, maintained, and updated by the Vice President of Academic Affairs (Academic Dean), degree program heads, and the registrar.

WTS provides a convenient summary of student achievement of learning on its website under the title of “Statement of Educational Effectiveness”: http://winebrenner.edu/ProspectiveStudents/Academics/StatementofEducationalEffectiveness.aspx.

**Assumed Practices A.7.a-c. The institution portrays clearly and accurately to the public its current status with the Higher Learning Commission and with specialized, national, and professional accreditation agencies.**

WTS provides details on its accreditations (by HLC, Association of Theological Schools, and the Ohio Board of Regents) on its website (www.winebrenner.edu): http://www.winebrenner.edu/AboutWTS/AccreditationReportsandInformation.aspx. The Graduate Catalog is also accessible on the institution’s website.

The website provides hyperlinks to the following Accreditation Reports, which includes the 2004 Self-study report, ATS monitoring report, and HLC progress report: http://www.winebrenner.edu/AboutWTS/accreditationReportsandInformation.aspx

WTS also facilitates Clinical Pastoral Education credit, where necessary for chaplaincy major (Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog): “Clinical Pastoral Education (CPE) is a multi-dimensional learning experience in settings approved by a professional chaplaincy certification association. The academic dean can supply current information on programs and application procedures. Students interested in CPE will register through a certified CPE training agency and transfer the credits to WTS. The seminary will grant up to three credits for a unit of CPE.”

**Assumed Practice A.8. The governing board and its executive committee include public members.**

As a seminary of the Churches of God, General Conference, the Bylaws of WTS requires that the Board of Trustees consists of members elected by the Administrative Council of the denomination (Section I.C.1; WTS Handbook of Operations, pg 13). The Board is to be composed of not more than 17 voting members (Section I.C.1.a), one of which includes the Director of the denomination by virtue of the office (Section I.C.1.b). At least two-thirds of 17 trustees shall be members of the denomination (Section I.C.1.d). This allows for up to one-third of the trustees to be non-Churches of God, General Conference. Additionally, the Board allows for non-voting positions: an annually selected student trustee (Section: I.C.1.e), an annually
selected faculty trustee (Section I.C.1.f), honorary trustees (Section I.C.1.g) and trustees emeriti (Section I.C.1.h), not to exceed one-third of the total number of regular voting trustees (Section I.C.1.i).

The WTS Graduate Catalog provides a full listing of the Board of Trustees (including Trustees Emeriti and Honorary Trustees), their Board responsibilities, city and state, and vocation (pg 5–6). The website lists their names, Board responsibilities, city and state (http://www.winebrenner.edu/AboutWTS/BoardofTrustees.aspx).

Included among the Board of Trustee members are several individuals engaged in public ventures including broadcasting, medical practice, accounting, and other non-religious business ventures. These individuals provide a public presence to the Board of Trustees.

**Assumed Practice A.9. The governing board has the authority to approve the annual budget and to engage and dismiss the chief executive officer.**

The Bylaws of WTS indicates that the Board of Trustees has the authority to approve the annual budget (Section: I.C.3; WTS Handbook of Operations, pg 15–16) and to engage and dismiss the president (Section: I.C.4–7; WTS Handbook of Operations, pg 16–17). The Board of Trustees’ powers are to be exercised in keeping with the seminary’s stated mission (Section: I.A.1–2; WTS Handbook of Operations, pg 9–11).

**Assumed Practice A.10. The institution documents outsourcing of all services in written agreements, including agreements with parent or affiliated organizations.**

WTS documents outsourcing of all services in written agreements, including agreements with parent or affiliated organizations. The documents are primarily held in department files. Finance related documents are held in the Financial Office. Service agreement documents between the seminary and the University of Findlay (UF) are held in the President’s Office.

Three documents related to the WTS – UF cooperative relationship were reviewed: Cooperative Agreement, Cooperative Maintenance Agreement, and Cooperative Real Estate Agreement (attachments 9).

**Assumed Practice A.11. The institution takes responsibility for the ethical and responsible behavior of its contractual partners in relation to actions taken on its behalf.**

There is no written policy with regard to WTS taking responsibility for the ethical and responsible behavior of its contractual partners in relation to actions taken on its behalf.

**Assumed Practices B.1a-h. Programs, courses, and credits**

WTS programs contain and exceed the minimum requirements for semester credits for all of its degree programs. The following are the semester credits for completion of a degree program (these are also listed in the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog by program):

- **DMin** requires a completion of 32 credit hours.
• M.Div requires a completion of 82 credit hours.
• MAFM requires a completion of 60 credit hours, petition submitted to reduce to 48 credit hours.
• MATS requires a completion of 60 credit hours, petition submitted to reduce to 48 credit hours.
• MAPT requires a completion of 60 credit hours.
• MACC requires a completion of 69 credit hours upon approval.

The office of the registrar monitors all students’ completion of program and course credit for graduation. The degree programs all contain course mapping so students can be guided for correct course work completion. This is available to the student in the WTS Graduate Catalog and the registrar sends out to each student their progress sheet that lists the classes taken and yet to be taken.

**Assumed Practices B.2.a-c. Faculty Roles and Qualifications**

These practices have been identified in Criterion Three responses.

**Assumed Practices B.3.a-b. Support Services**

The financial aid officer reviews students’ eligibility for financial assistance and assists the student in a full understanding of financial debt and consequences. The FAFSA website also has a sign-off page for the student to state that they understand the debt and pay back policies ([attachment 47](#), student indebtedness and [Title IV](#)).

The office of the registrar maintains accurate transcript and records of all students. Upon request of a transcript, the registrar will respond to the student’s or institution’s request for a formal transcript within two to three business days.

**Assumed Practice C.1. Instructors (excluding for this requirement teaching assistants enrolled in a graduate program and supervised by faculty) have the authority for the assignment of grades. (This requirement allows for collective responsibility, as when a faculty committee has the authority to override a grade on appeal.)**

All instructors create their course requirements and grading points according the established institutional grading scale: **Grade Scale: A (96-100), A- (90-95), B+ (87-89), B (83-86), B- (80-82), C+ (77-79), C (73-76), C- (70-72), D, F**  A course grade of D or F will not meet the requirements for degree credit. This is reflected in each course syllabus. Grades are assigned appropriately according to assignments and returned to the registrar for posting in the student database, GradPro, for each student. A student has the right to appeal a grade through a written letter to the dean and this is then reviewed in the faculty monthly meetings for approval or disapproval.

**Assumed Practices C.2. The institution refrains from the transcription of credit from other institutions or providers that it will not apply to its own programs.**
All transcripts from other institutions are reviewed by the registrar and the admissions committee to determine eligibility for credit in a program at Winebrenner. This is detailed in the Fall 2014 Graduate Catalog on pages 110-111.

**Assumed Practice C.3. The institution has formal and current written agreements for managing any internships and clinical placements included in its programs.**

The Supervised Ministry course allows the student to choose their own placement for internship by approval of the director of Supervised Ministry. The Supervised Ministry Manual reflects full detail of choosing a placement for their praxis work (attachment 26, Supervised Ministry Manual).

The MACC program has identified the following for clinical practice agreements and internships. Formal agreements will be executed with these settings before students are placed for internships.

- Pathways Christian Counseling  
  230 W. Sandusky St.  
  Findlay, OH
- Century Health  
  2515 N. Main St.  
  Findlay, OH
- Emerge Ministries  
  900 Mull Ave  
  Akron, OH
- Arbors Counseling  
  2690 Billingsley Rd.  
  Columbus, OH
- Shalom Ministries  
  St Rt. 2  
  Archbold, OH

**Assumed Practice C.4. A predominantly or solely single purpose institution in fields that require licensure for practice is also accredited by or is actively in the process of applying to a recognized specialization accrediting agency for each field, if such agency exists.**

At this time of the writing of this self-study, there are no licensure requirements for our current degree programs. Upon approval of the MACC, graduates will meet the academic requirements to take the Ohio State Licensure Board examination.

**Assumed Practice C.5. Instructors communicate course requirements to students through syllabi.**
All students have access to course syllabi through the Blackboard website. All course requirements are detailed in each syllabus for course work, schedule of classes and lecture topics, required texts, projects, and all assignments (attachment 12, syllabus example).

**Assumed Practice C.6. Institutional data on assessment of student learning are accurate and address the full range of students who enroll.**

The SAFE committee maintains accurate records and analyzes all student learning data over all programs. The data is filed with the Assistant Dean for security and is used in improvement decisions by the committee for student learning.

**Assumed Practice C.7. Institutional data on student retention, persistence, and completion are accurate and address the full range of students who enroll.**

Winebrenner collects and maintains data for student retention. After the registration closes, those students who did not register for the coming term are called by the program directors to inquire why they chose not to register for the upcoming term. This data is then recorded on a spreadsheet and in GradPro. Follow up continues for a period of six terms. This data is shared with admissions, academic department, and faculty (attachment 33, Comprehensive Retention Plan for more detail).

**Assumed Practice D.1. The institution is able to meet its current financial obligations.**

Refer to Criterion 5.A and C for detail on current financial obligations.

**Assumed Practice D.2. The institution has a prepared budget for the current year and the capacity to compare it with budgets and actual results of previous years.**

WTS has a prepared budget for the current fiscal year and has compared it with previous year’s budgets. The budget is approved by the Board of Trustees. (Attachment 55, 2014-2015 Budget)

**Assumed Practice D.3. The institution has future financial projections addressing its long-term financial sustainability.**

A financial advisory committee was formed in 2013 to assist the Vice President of IA in making future financial projections to address long term financial sustainability. The business office maintains the financial analysis and projections.


**Assumed Practice D.4. The institution maintains effective systems for collecting, analyzing, and using institutional information.**

Each department and area of WTS maintains systems for collecting, analyzing, and using institutional information for improvement in both the business and academic levels for success.
Data is collected each academic year for student information and each fiscal year for business and financial information.

**Assumed Practice D.5.** The institution undergoes an external audit by a certified public accountant or a public audit agency of its own financial and educational activities and maintains audited financial statements. For private institutions that audit is annual; for public institutions it is at least every two years.

- WTS retains a certified public accountant to perform an annual external audit of its financial and educational activities and maintains these audited reports.
- WTS’s last audited return was September 19, 2013 by Ridge and Company, Certified Public Accountants, 314 W. Hardin Street, Findlay, Ohio 45840.

**Assumed Practice D.6.** The institution’s administrative structure includes a chief executive officer, chief financial officer, and chief academic officer (titles may vary) with appropriate credentials and experience and sufficient focus on the institution to ensure appropriate leadership and oversight.

The WTS Administrative Structure (CEO, CFO, Chief Academic Officer, etc.) is as follows:

- The WTS Administrative Structure is noted on the WTS Faculty and Administration Organizational Chart (pg 7). Also the WTS Administrative Structure is as outlined in the 2004 ATS and HLC Report in Chapter 8 – Authority and Governance (pg 115–118).

All senior administrators maintain offices in WTS facilities and are engaged on a daily basis with the administrative tasks of the institution, (attachment 37, Vice President’s job descriptions).

**FEDERAL COMPLIANCE REPORT**

Federal Compliance Report is found in (attachment 49).
CONCLUSION

As this institutional self-study concludes, it is important to note that Winebrenner Theological Seminary is using the process as a way to guide organizational development. The self-study charge guided individuals and committees in their work and provided a framework to conduct the organizational analysis. The SAFE committee is dedicated to its purpose as it has a greater, more visible leadership role for the institution and the educational responsibility to the students. The study:

- Provided the seminary community with a self-evaluation.
- Rendered a just and accurate evaluation of the condition of the seminary.
- Invited stakeholders the opportunity to better understand the institution as they served on the self-study teams.
- Allowed the reaccreditation process to guide organizational development into a new era for learning.

Thus, the reaccreditation self-study has performed a valuable function for Winebrenner Theological Seminary where the institution and the students will long benefit in a well-rounded educational system for learning.

Opportunities for Winebrenner Theological Seminary

In using the work of the self-study, it is important that the WTS leadership and community consider the following “next steps” as it moves into the future:

- Build financial strength and stability according to the strategy of the 2014-2017 Financial Plan.
- Review professional development at all levels and for all personnel.
• Mature the assessment of learning systems/processes.
• Foster and implement a strategic planning process with particular emphasis on enrollment and finances.
• Hire recruitment staff to replace positions lost during financial challenges.
• Integrate the mission statement in all areas of the institution including material published for students.
• Coordinate the exchange of information and data across all areas of the institution.
• Increase interaction with both internal and external community groups.
• Improve external knowledge and perceptions of the WTS brand.
• Develop an alumni connection to WTS.

To summarize the self-study, Winebrenner Theological Seminary sufficiently meets and exceeds the minimum requirements of accreditation.

Winebrenner Theological Seminary believes that it fulfills the HLC criteria for accreditation, while noting recommendations which will further strengthen the institution. WTS formally requests that the Higher Learning Commission grant continued accreditation to the seminary for a ten-year period, including the designation of the Scotland PA campus as an additional location and the reaccreditation of all degrees currently approved.
List of Attachments:

- 1 – Self-study timeline
- 2 – Institutional snapshot for 2012
- 3 – Institutional snapshot for 2013
- 4 – FTE by years
- 5 – Profile of Graduating students from 2006-2013
- 6 – Summary of HLC responses by Winebrenner
- 7 – Progress Review Documents
- 8 – Sampling of student newsletters
- 9 – WTS-UF Cooperative Agreement
- 10 – Board of Trustees meeting agendas
- 10b – Board of Trustees survey data
- 11 – CGGC Constitution
- 12 – WTS syllabus template
- 13 – CWSLO AY Data 2011-13
- 14 – Student surveys
- 15 – Assignment guide sheet
- 16 – Blank faculty update form
- 17 – Committee Roster 2013-14
- 18 – Faculty Staff Qualifications
- 19 – Faculty Evaluation and Development
- 19b – Performance evaluation process and forms
- 20 – Student surveys
- 21 – Library Data from Spring 2014
- 22 – Applicant Audit Portfolio
- 23 – Library Collection Policy
- 24 – Information Technology agreement with UF
- 25 – MACC program application
- 26 – Supervised Ministry Manual
- 27 – Community Life
- 28 – Admissions Documents
- 29 – WTS Lilly Project Summary
- 30 – CM 700 MAFM Capstone
- 31 – CAP for Winebrenner
- 32 – FCF Retention – no audits
- 33 – Matriculation Flowchart
- 34 – Matriculation data for Students
- 35 – Financial documents
- 36 – Retention Call Data
- 37 – VP Job Descriptions
- 38 – Financial Documents
- 39 – Scotland Campus Documents
- 40 – Staff qualifications
- 41 – Faculty Staff Orientation
- 42 – Screen Shot of Faculty Orientation on Blackboard
- 43 – MACC recruitment data
- 44 – Agreement between WTS and UTS
- 45 – Conflict of Interest Policy
- 46 – Screen Shot of Student Orientation on Blackboard
- 47 – Data Student Indebtedness
- 48 – Title IV default data
- 49 – Federal Compliance Report
- 50 – Interview with Academic Dean
- 51 – SAFE Activity Log 2005-May 2014
- 52 – Financial Plan 2014-17
- 53 – Scotland 3 year budget
- 54 – MACC Projections
- 55 – 2014-15 Budget
Acronyms:

AA – Academic Advancement
ATS – Association of Theological Schools
CAP – Comprehensive Assessment Project
CACREP - Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs
CCRD - Committee on Curriculum Review and Design
CGGC – Churches of God, General Conference
CSWMFT - Counselor, Social Worker and Marriage and Family Therapist
C-WSLO – Curriculum-Wide Student Learning Outcome
D.Min – Doctorate of Ministry
FAFSA - Free Application for Federal Student Aid
FASAP – Financial Aid and Satisfactory Academic Progress
FAO – Financial Aid Officer
FCF – First Class Free
FSA – Federal Student Aid
GPA – Grade Point Average
HLC – Higher Learning Commission
IA – Institutional Advancement
MACC – Master of Arts in Clinical Counseling
MAFM – Master of Arts in Family Ministry
MAPT – Master of Arts in Practical Theology
MATS – Master of Arts in Theological Studies
MCI – Marion Correctional Institute
M.Div – Master of Divinity
MIC – Ministry in Context
NCA – North Central Association
PDCA – Plan Do Check Act
PTI – Pastoral Training Institute
SAFE – Student Affairs for Excellence
SGEIIP – Seminary Graduate Enrollment Incentive Program
SM – Supervised Ministry
TLB – The Lord’s Business (Main Auditorium)
UF – University of Findlay
VPAA – Vice President of Academic Advancement
VPIA – Vice President of Institutional Advancement
WTS – Winebrenner Theological Seminary