KEY BEHAVIORS AND MILESTONES IN ADULT DISCIPLESHIP—
FASHIONING INTENTIONALITY, PERSONALIZATION,
OVERSIGHT, AND ASSESSMENT

A PROJECT REPORT
SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY
IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE
DOCTOR OF MINISTRY

BY
MARTIN D. JOHNSON

WINEBRENNER THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY
FINDLAY, OHIO
JANUARY 28, 2015
KEY BEHAVIORS AND MILESTONES IN ADULT DISCIPLESHIP—
FASHIONING INTENTIONALITY, PERSONALIZATION,
OVERSIGHT, AND ASSESSMENT

A PROJECT REPORT
SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY
IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE
DOCTOR OF MINISTRY

BY
MARTIN D. JOHNSON

APPROVED BY:

Stephen Dunn, Project Mentor January 28, 2015
Michele Nixon, External Reader January 28, 2015
James Davison, Writing Stylist January 28, 2015
M. John Nissley, Program Director January 28, 2015

WINEBRENNER THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY
FINDLAY, OHIO

JANUARY 28, 2015
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**FIGURES** ........................................................................................................................................... ix

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS** ....................................................................................................................... x

**ABSTRACT** ........................................................................................................................................... xiv

Chapter One: INTRODUCTION TO THE PROJECT .............................................................................. 1

  - Context of the Problem .................................................................................................................... 3
  - Statement of the Problem .................................................................................................................. 4
  - Purpose of the Study .......................................................................................................................... 7
  - Research Methodology .................................................................................................................... 8
  - Research Questions .......................................................................................................................... 9
  - Significance of the Study .................................................................................................................. 10
  - Assumptions and Limitations of the Study ...................................................................................... 11
  - Definitions of Terms ....................................................................................................................... 12
  - Organization of the Study ............................................................................................................... 14

Chapter Two: BIBLICAL AND THEOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS .................................................. 16

  - Scripture ........................................................................................................................................ 18
    - Jesus’ Expectation .......................................................................................................................... 19
    - The Apostles’ Teaching ............................................................................................................... 21
    - All Christians Are Disciplers ..................................................................................................... 24
    - Jesus’ Model for Disciple-Making ................................................................................................. 26
  - Summary from Scripture .................................................................................................................. 28
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reason</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secular Education</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goals</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expectancies</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secular Business</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insight from Church and Para-Church Leaders</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pastors</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christian Authors and Para-Church Leaders</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seminarians and Theologians</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary from Reason</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tradition</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical Examples</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christian Predecessors</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tools Ancient and Modern</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Following Christ</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary from Tradition</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pastoral Counseling</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum that Misses the Point</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary from Experience</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Foundational Framework</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter Three: REVIEW OF LITERATURE ................................................................. 79

Anthropology ................................................................................................. 81
Business ........................................................................................................ 86
Christian Discipleship .................................................................................... 93
Education ......................................................................................................... 99
Psychology .................................................................................................... 104
Science ........................................................................................................... 117
Sociology ........................................................................................................ 125
Summary ......................................................................................................... 133

Chapter Four: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND PROCEDURES .................... 136

Part One: Survey ............................................................................................. 136
Part Two: Questions ....................................................................................... 139
Part Three: Focus Group ................................................................................ 140
Summary ........................................................................................................ 144

Chapter Five: RESULTS AND ANALYSIS OF DATA ....................................... 146

Survey ............................................................................................................. 146
Questions ......................................................................................................... 150

Question One of Three .................................................................................. 150
Question Two of Three .................................................................................. 150
Questions Three of Three ............................................................................. 151

Focus Group ................................................................................................... 151

Step One ......................................................................................................... 152
Step Two ......................................................................................................... 153
Step Three ................................................................. 156
Step Four ................................................................. 157
Step Five ................................................................. 160
Summary ...................................................................... 165

Chapter Six: SUMMARY, FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS,
AND RECOMMENDATIONS .................................................. 167
Summary ...................................................................... 168
Findings ...................................................................... 170
Conclusions .................................................................. 175
Recommendations .......................................................... 181

Appendices

APPENDIX A, How Adults Learn and How Teachers Must
Adapt: Abstracts of a Sampling of Significant
Sources in the Field of Adult Education ............... 185

APPENDIX B, Survey ...................................................... 212

APPENDIX C, Quantified Survey Results ...................... 221

APPENDIX D, Additional Suggestions from Respondents .... 233

APPENDIX E, Qualitative Contributions Regarding Progress
and Assessment ............................................................... 240

APPENDIX F, Key Behaviors, Skills, and/or Milestones
in the Life of a Disciple and the Broad
Content Categories in Which They Likely Fit ... 267

APPENDIX G, The Focus Group’s Placement of Key Behaviors,
Skills, and/or Milestones in the Life of a
Disciple into the Broad Content Categories ...... 271

APPENDIX H, The Focus Group’s Input on Progress
and Assessment ............................................................... 274

APPENDIX I, Input from Respondents that Resonate with
Researcher’s Presuppositions................................. 280
APPENDIX J, Guide for Disciples—Including a Self-Assessment Tool ........................................284

APPENDIX K, Handbook for Peer Disciplers ......................................373

APPENDIX L, Focus Group Permission Letter .................................438

APPENDIX M, Permission from Publishers ......................................440

Works Cited ........................................................................................................442

Works Consulted ..................................................................................................450
FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Latin and English Translation of <em>Gloria Patri</em></td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Latin and English Translation of Bernard of Clairvaux’s Hymn</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Dimensions of Mentoring; Multiple Roles in Leading Adults</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Targeted Growth Examples</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Schematic Representation—Development and Deflection</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Schematic Representation of Faith Development, Based on Perry’s Scheme</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Top Forty Behaviors as Rated and Ranked by Respondents</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Initial Recycled Behaviors; Receiving No Votes in Initial Bubbling Process</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Focus Group’s List of Key Behaviors—Actionable List</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Developmental Progression Apprehended by Focus Group</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Key Behaviors of Adult Disciples</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Developmental Progression Apprehended by Focus Group</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Developmental Progression Prepared for Publication</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Self-Assessment Answer Choices</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>The Effectiveness of Exponential One-on-One Discipleship</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many years ago a friend asked me why there could not be a report card for spiritual growth. My friend was lost in a sea of opinions and models for discipleship, none of which gave him a clear-cut path for growth. “Read your Bible more,” “pray without ceasing,” “just wait, it will happen,” and other platitudes were doing nothing to jump-start a flagging spiritual life. What he needed was a plan of action, some key behaviors to emulate and master, and someone to walk alongside him to coach him along the way. I am indebted to this friend, who has asked to remain anonymous, because, even after more than two decades, he still has the same concerns.

I feel the need to clarify that I moved away from that church and that state nearly twenty years ago; I would not have left my friend alone and without remedy had I still been his pastor. When I moved away, my pastoral ties with that congregation were ended so that, (1) they did not have a former pastor continuing to insinuate himself, and (2) I could properly focus on my new congregation. We have kept in touch through the years, but I still have had no better advice to give him than I did two decades ago. As these ideas percolated within my inner being throughout the ensuing years, I have endeavored to write helpful discipleship curriculum, I have written a book on growing as a disciple, I have led formational small groups and retreats, and I’ve endeavored to meet regularly with small groups to help them grow personally in the Christian faith.¹

Still, the echo of my friend’s words about a report card—while not necessarily a literal request—has troubled me for these many years. There must be a way to help adult disciples of Christ make forward progress. Surely there are some standardized steps that can be personalized and then evaluated regularly within the vital relationship of a discipler and disciple. This doctoral research project has provided the impetus and the raw materials to begin the construction of a workable plan to assist adult disciples as they seek to grow in faith and in Christlikeness, and I am grateful to God for this opportunity to study, to create, and to serve.

There have been many people who have helped me process these thoughts through the years: Maurice Berquist, Joe Riley Burns, Floyd Diehm, Kit Tabor, Paul Hill, Blake LaMunyon, Doug Peake, Linda Howard, Sherry Black, John Henry, Cathy and Dennis Turner, Mark Posson, Larry Wren, Steve Smith, Darrell Fraley, Dan and Laurie Acker, Don and Joan Fothergill, Igor Beaufils, David Grogg, Rick Rufenacht, Paul Flores, Al Flores, Jay Rolsten, Sharon Haxton, Julie and Steve Frazier, Esther Cottrell, Randall Spence, Kathryn Helleman, Jeannine Grimm, John Nissley, Sheldon Ames, Rachel Walter, Linda Bergquist, and so many more. Many thanks for the hours of conversation about spiritual matters and discipleship concerns; your influential thinking motivated me, and much of it has made its way into findings and recommendations of this research study. A special thanks to Esther Cottrell and Edward Rosenberry for permission to use e-mail addresses for key Christian leaders in both the Ohio Ministries of the Church of God (Anderson) and the Churches of God General Conference (Findlay). A large thank you to my congregational family at Quarry Ridge Community Church: you have blessed me with invaluable time, encouragement, and support.
My family has always been my best encouragement: my wife Gail and son Zach (how could I have done any of this without you?), Mom and Dad (Leila May and Hiram Johnson), Shelley Norman, Billie Biddy, Steven Johnson, David Johnson, Bonnie Spence, Rosie Vannaman, Charla and Randal Wise, and Rose (Lamb) Williams-Appleton. I would not have followed God’s call to ministry had it not been for you; I would not have gone to seminary had it not been something you encouraged. Much of your faithfulness and inspiration is found within this project, and the fruit of this study will most certainly contain your DNA.

To my project team: thank you.

- Dr. Stephen Dunn, my project mentor, a pillar in the Churches of God General Conference, and a much sought after mentor: thank you for investing in me.
- Michele Nixon, my external reader—the “non-resident practitioner qualified to evaluate the doctoral candidate’s work”—a master teacher who has served as the learning specialist for St. John’s Academy in Toledo, Ohio for 12 years, and as a learning disabilities expert for at least that many more years: thank you for the encouragement and wise suggestions throughout the project.²
- Dr. James Davison, my writing stylist, Greek grammar professor, and friend: you were tasked with catching every prohibited use of the first-person point of view, every inequitable use of gender-specific pronouns, every banned contraction, every period, comma, colon, jot, and tittle out of place, and you made certain that my Turabian was kosher—thank you for your expertise and careful deliberation.

To the members of my project cohorts through the years of researching and writing the doctoral dissertation: Thom Gardner, Kathryn Helleman, Ronglan Huang, Agnes Makau-Olwendo, Justus Musyoka, Dan Pritt, Patricia Snelling, and Art Thiebault: thank you for your input, support, and friendship.

To Linda Davison, Research Project Coordinator for the Doctor of Ministry Program, and to Dr. John Nissley, the Director of the Doctor of Ministry Program: it is difficult to find the proper words to express my appreciation for all you have done for me through this process of research and writing, especially when you consider that you perform this tedious, expert work for every doctoral candidate. Your efforts sharpened the focus, clarified thoughts, improved the composition, and helped bring this project to fruition. Many thanks.
ABSTRACT

Many adult believers lose sight of the fact that the Christian faith involves ongoing spiritual formation; some may never have heard that continued growth is expected by the Master. In 2 Peter 1:3-8, the apostle instructs: “make every effort to add to your faith. . . .” and then lists a number of attributes believers should work to enhance, adding that “if you possess these qualities in increasing measure, they will keep you from being ineffective and unproductive in your knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ.”3 Yet, the majority of adult believers are unsure of how to nurture their spiritual formation, unsure of what activities in which to engage, and unsure of what behaviors they should develop. There is no well-defined program of study and no effective measurement of progress.

This research project was undertaken to discover key behaviors that may be effective in supporting spiritual growth. A survey was sent to a large sampling of Christian leaders to help identify key behaviors that are considered important for adult believers. A focus group of diverse ministry practitioners distilled the list of behaviors, helping this researcher identify how to assist adult disciples to develop in their faith and measure forward progress.

As this researcher embarked upon this study, these assumptions were firmly held: most adult Christians prefer personalized oversight from a discipler who is further along

---

3 2 Pt 1:3-8 [NIV]. This researcher will use The NIV Study Bible, 10th ann. ed. (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1999) throughout, unless otherwise noted.
in their spiritual journey; most adult Christians want some kind of measurement so they can be assured of progress; and most adult Christians grow best when led to develop personal “behaviors” suited to a growing disciple of Christ. This researcher also understood that there is no way to identify all the behaviors a believer should work on throughout an entire life of commitment to Christ, and that terms like “behaviors,” “measurement,” and “assessment” could cause alarm for some adult believers.

Tools and structures are needed to aid in the discipleship process; the alternative is a church with little spiritual growth. With a modicum of effort the result can be a vibrant, healthy church filled with disciples who are intentional about partnering with the Holy Spirit to become more like Christ.
CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION TO THE PROJECT

Many adult disciples lose sight of the fact that the Christian faith involves ongoing spiritual formation. A walk with Christ begins with one’s belief in Jesus as Savior and Lord, but it must continue throughout the rest of their lives as they commit to living as his disciples. “A Christian disciple not only believes Jesus is the Messiah but also is passionately devoted to doing what the Rabbi (Jesus) commands.” Many adult Christians either forget, or have failed to realize, that being a disciple of Jesus Christ means giving up their lives. Disciples live instead the way of Jesus’ life. To be a disciple means Christians “spend our lives apprenticed to our master, Jesus Christ. We are in a growing-learning relationship, always. A disciple is a learner, but not in the academic setting of a schoolroom, rather at the work site of a craftsman.” Disciples are to follow in his footsteps and imitate his life. M. Robert Mulholland, Jr. speaks to the disconnect:

When we say that the Christian journey is a process, we express a truth that is both well-known and well-nigh unknown at the same time. If you ask most Christians about their spiritual pilgrimage, they will say that it is a day-by-day experience with its ups and downs, its victories and defeats, its successes and failures. In brief, it is a process. But if you were to ask them how God works transformation in their lives, many would indicate that God “zaps” them at some point and instantly changes them.

---

4 Ray Vander Laan, with Stephen and Amanda Sorenson (contributors), In the Dust of the Rabbi: Becoming a Disciple, sm. grp. ed. (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2006), 16.


Jesus told the church to “go and make disciples of all nations.”⁷ This command has come to be known as the Great Commission, and requires willing obedience and intentionality on the part of Christians. Prior to giving his commission, Jesus gave some details of how this work was to be done. One of the instructions recorded in Matthew 10 is the instruction to locate a person of peace, or a “worthy person,” and use that home as a base of operations for preaching that “the kingdom of heaven is near.”⁸ Finding a person of peace requires personalized effort and one-on-one interaction.

The guidance of the Holy Spirit can be seen as instrumental in the growth of the first century church; Christ was involved in the oversight of the church he established on earth. As part of his ministry, the apostle Paul worked under the guidance of the Holy Spirit and the authority of the Jerusalem Council, and served as the overseer of several young ministers he helped train.⁹

Oversight and supervision was instrumental in the development of the followers of Christ. The apostle Peter’s instructions to the church were direct and filled with portent: “make every effort to add to your faith,” assuring the believers that “if you possess these qualities in increasing measure, they will keep you from being ineffective and unproductive in your knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ.”¹⁰ The process of becoming and remaining a disciple requires intentionality, personalization, oversight, and continual evaluation.

---

⁷ Mt 28:19 [NIV]. This researcher will use The NIV Study Bible, 10th ann. ed. (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1999) throughout, unless otherwise noted.

⁸ Mt 10:11, 7.

⁹ Acts 15 and 16.

¹⁰ 2 Pt 1:3-11.
Context of the Problem

The apostle Paul warned that “the time will come when men will not put up with sound doctrine. Instead, to suit their own desires, they will gather around them a great number of teachers to say what their itching ears want to hear.”

Certainly in the past few decades in North America, there has been a slackening in the church’s discipleship. The gospel has been used as a means of attracting people, but little is done to grow them into the image of the Christ who attracted them.

Dietrich Bonhoeffer, a martyr of Hitler’s Third Reich, gave prophetic voice to the current situation in the church of North America: “Only he who believes is obedient, and only he who is obedient believes . . . Christianity without discipleship is always Christianity without Christ.”

Bill Hull writes that the church without true discipleship ends up looking and acting like the culture, cautioning that “whenever the difference between the church’s and culture’s definition of morality ceases to exist, the church loses its power and authority.” Hull suggests, “when we see faith as agreement with a doctrinal test and understand grace as forgiveness of sins alone, we lose the idea that disciples is normal. And when we lose discipleship, we also lose vibrant Christianity.”

---

11 2 Tm 4:3.


14 Ibid.
The late Dallas Willard summarized the plight of the North American church, warning:

For at least several decades the churches of the Western world have not made discipleship a condition of being a Christian. One is not required to be, or to intend to be, a disciple in order to become a Christian, and one may remain a Christian without any signs of progress toward or in discipleship. Contemporary American churches in particular do not require following Christ in his example, spirit, and teachings as a condition of membership either of entering into or continuing in fellowship of a denomination or local church. Any exception to this claim only serves to highlight its general validity and make the general rule more glaring. So far as the visible Christian institutions of our day are concerned, discipleship clearly is optional.15

**Statement of the Problem**

Adult Christians in the North American church are not exhibiting growth as disciples of Christ. Christ’s church in North America, specifically the United States, lacks in spiritual power and vibrancy. There is a lack of intentionality in discipleship, little personalization of growing individuals in Christlikeness, and ongoing oversight and evaluation of growing disciples by those disciples who are further along in the journey of faith seems to be on the wane.

Adult Christians in the North American church seem to be unsure of how to grow, unsure of what activities in which to engage, and unsure of what behaviors they should develop. They are also concerned that there is no well-defined program of study and no effective measurement of their progress. Many are unsure of how to nurture their spiritual formation. The church must identify the proper behaviors that must be engaged, and growth in these behaviors must be measured and aided by the help of a peer discipler.

---

Disciples are pilgrims, “people who spend our lives going someplace, going to God,” and as pilgrims rather than “tourists,” disciples “do not acquire information about God but skills in faith” (emphasis mine). What skills should be sought? What behaviors define a life devoted to Christ? God’s Word speaks of growing to be Christlike, but what parts of the individual self must be lost and what parts of Christ must take their place? How does one make these changes—carving off parts of who he already is in deference to becoming something to which he is distinctly alien? “Scripture reveals that human wholeness is always actualized in nurturing one another toward wholeness. . . . There can be no wholeness in the image of Christ which is not incarnate in our relationships with others. . . .” Who is it that can help disciples become spiritually formed, discipled in Christ?

It is not always the individual believer’s fault. “Some people get ‘stuck’ because church leaders lack the knowledge, skills, and resources to develop healthy, maturing followers of Christ.” Some people fail to grow because they have been taught an improper understanding of what it means to be a Christ-follower, perceiving a hierarchy within Christianity. A Christian only needs to acknowledge Christ as Savior; a disciple must acknowledge Jesus as Master. Since both are assured of eternal life, why should anyone choose the more difficult path? Greg Ogden describes this dichotomy perfectly, writing:

---

16 Peterson, A Long Obedience, 17.

17 2 Cor 5:17; Gal 2:20.

18 Mulholland, 17.

19 Ron and Mary Bennett, Intentional Disciplemaking: Cultivating Spiritual Maturity in the Local Church (Colorado Springs: NavPress, 2001), 13.
Being a Christian is easy. The only thing required is that we acknowledge our need of a savior and to receive a gift that I cannot earn nor deserve. But if I identify myself as a disciple, then I am making a statement about the quality of my followership. Being a Christian is a statement about what Christ has done for me; being a disciple is a statement about what I am doing for Christ.  

Many people perceive this as a choice—like the easy way to be a Christian and the challenging way to be a Christian—and choose the path of least resistance. “Christian leaders have sent the message that it is alright to be a Christian without being a disciple of Christ. . . . [W]e have done a miserable job of making disciples.”  

There is now a culture in many churches that suggest that spiritual formation and discipleship is optional, further exacerbating the dilemma of what an adult disciple should be trying to do.  

Some adult disciples mistakenly believe that God is solely responsible for growing the believer in Christlikeness. They read the apostle Paul’s words in Philippians 1:6 “being confident of this, that he who began a good work in you will carry it on to completion until the day of Christ Jesus” to mean that God will do all the work and disciples simply wait until it happens.  

The truth is that there needs to be a great deal of commitment and steadfast investment of time and energy into the process. The apostle Peter tells the church to “make every effort to add to your faith. . . .” and then lists a number of attributes disciples should work to enhance.  

Richard Foster supports the need for personal investment to one’s own discipleship: “The analysis is correct—human striving is insufficient and righteousness is a gift from God—but the conclusion [that

---


21 Ibid.

22 Phil 1:6.

23 2 Pt 1:3-9.
there is nothing one can do] is faulty. . . . it would be proper to speak of ‘the path of disciplined grace.’ It is ‘grace’ because it is free; it is ‘disciplined’ because there is something for us to do.”

**Purpose of the Study**

Study is needed to discover key behaviors that may be effective in allowing proper engagement or reengagement to spiritual growth, encouraging an adult believer’s progress from a non-believer to a new believer, from a new believer to a maturing believer, and from a maturing believer to a role-modeling Christ-follower. These are the “right things” of which Adsit speaks, such as “knowledge, understanding, principles, norms, standards, laws, absolutes” found in Scripture. Richard Foster speaks of “spiritual disciplines” that “call us to move beyond surface living into the depths” and to be “the answer to a hollow world.” If it is possible to determine a fairly accurate, standardized list of key behaviors that fit nearly every adult believer in nearly every setting, then those behaviors can be used to carefully lead disciples in growing to be like Christ.

As this researcher has alluded to earlier, ongoing assessment and evaluation is vital. “When it comes to evaluating how well people are doing in their efforts to emulate Christ, the truly effective churches go beyond collecting and reciting affirming anecdotes. . . . These churches [use] specific tools—most developed in-house—to provide a sense of

---


26 Foster, *Celebration of Discipline*, 1.
what is happening spiritually in people’s lives.”27 By identifying a set of key behaviors, an opportunity exists to measure proficiency in those behaviors. “No church argues that these inventories provide a completely accurate picture of reality; instead, they view their tools as flawed but objective—relatively consistent instruments that aided in determining whether progress was being made from year to year.”28

**Research Methodology**

The research will consist of three parts. First, a list of seventy-five behaviors, skills, or facts associated with Christian discipleship will be sent to pastors, small group leaders, and Christian educators of multiple denominations in multiple states in the United States for their input to identify key behaviors or skills that are considered important for an adult believer to embrace to be successful in personal discipleship. The rating of these seventy-five behaviors will provide important quantitative research data. Respondents will be encouraged to add their own suggestions to the list. Second, two additional questions will accompany the list to secure a substantive qualitative response. Third, a one-day focus group of five to ten pastors from a variety of denominations will help provide beneficial qualitative data to help narrow and clarify the list of key behaviors, and generate ideas on the measurement or assessment of these behaviors to best assist adult disciples to grow and develop in their faith.

---


28 Ibid., 111.
The results of the study will help in the creation of a study guide written for adult disciples and peer disciplers to use in a discipling relationship, and an evaluation tool to facilitate face-to-face conversations between an adult disciple and a peer discipler.

**Research Questions**

Three questions will help identify key behaviors or “mile markers” and the role of personal assessment in the life of adult Christians.

1. *What are the key behaviors that growing disciples exhibit or should exhibit?*

   Immediately following the question will be a list of seventy-five terms, phrases, behaviors, skills, or facts allowing the respondents to rank them in the order of importance: God is Triune; God is eternal; God the Father; Jesus Christ the Son and Savior; Holy Spirit the Comforter and Counselor; worshipping in spirit and in truth; worship as a living sacrifice; reverence; respect; thanksgiving; adoration; praise; exaltation; exultation; devotion; meditation; confession; repentance; mercy; forgiveness; sin; salvation; communion; baptism; Great Commandment; loving God with heart, soul, mind, and strength; loving neighbor as oneself; new commandment; prayer; community; the church; eternal life; eternal separation; spiritual giftedness; calling; witness; faith; new creation; born again; counting the cost; God’s Word; fruit of the Spirit; discipline; discipleship; authenticity; submission; fellowship; Bible study; service; solitude; silence; fasting; frugality; sacrifice; good works; meeting others’ needs; faith with works; ministry; compassion; surrender; stewardship; tithing; offerings; evangelism; missions; being missional; outreach; God’s will; Christlikeness; spiritual growth; making disciples; mentor; Master/Lord; God’s craftsmanship.
The respondents will also have the ability to add to that list any terms they feel may be missing from the list. The creation of a list of behaviors, skills, or “mile markers” in the discipleship journey—perhaps standardized and applicable for the majority of adult disciples—will be compiled based on quantitative and qualitative research.

2. *What elements, behaviors, tasks, and/or skills are missing that causes a pause or gap between conversion and further spiritual development?*

This list of missing behaviors or skills may begin to explain the suspension or interruption in spiritual formation and growth in Christ-likeness experienced by many adult Christians.

3. *What kind of assessment or evaluation will best help measure progress and mastery so that adult disciples and peer disciplers can monitor personal spiritual progress?*

Careful, personalized, and intentional monitoring of spiritual development, in theory, will help adult disciples and peer disciplers to measure growth and plan formational activities.

**Significance of the Study**

Christ’s church in North America in this modern era needs disciples who are intentional about their development in Christ-likeness. In this researcher’s opinion, such disciples need discipleship direction and ongoing constructive assessment of growth. For this to happen, tools and structures are needed to aid in this process. Since much of an adult believer’s growth in faith will contain elements applicable to all adult disciples, regardless of culture, language, or socio-economics, such aids to discipleship can reach beyond North America into the broader church, helping to establish relationships between those seeking to grow and the disciplers who are ready to assist in that growing process.
The result can be a vibrant, healthy church filled with disciples who are intentional about partnering with the Holy Spirit to become more like Christ.

**Assumptions and Limitations of the Study**

This researcher, with twenty years of experience in pastoral ministry, has made an assumption that most adult Christians in North America who try to grow on their own would prefer personalized, regular direction and oversight from a discipler who is further along in her walk with Christ.

Because of two decades of discipleship experience, and based upon personal preferences, this researcher has also made an assumption that most adult Christians in North America want some kind of “mile marker” or measurement toward which to aim so they can be assured of a direction for growth. “Successful pastors care about the discipleship commitment of their people, they monitor it closely, and they respond when the numbers suggest a waffling of dedication to spiritual advancement.”

A third assumption of this researcher is that adult disciples in North America will grow to develop personal behaviors suited to a growing disciple of Christ best when led by a discipler. Peer disciplers who are a few steps ahead in their journey with Christ can help other adult disciples make reasoned, wise, and beneficial steps forward in spiritual growth.

A limitation of the study is that there is no way to identify all the behaviors or “mile markers” a believer should work on throughout an entire life of commitment to Christ. This study will identify and incorporate some behaviors that are considered to be vital by the pastors used in the quantitative and qualitative study.

---

29 Barna, 115.
It is quite possible that terms such as “behaviors,” “measurement,” and “assessment” may be terms that can alarm or cause concern for some adult disciples. In fact, these terms may cause concern for the pastors in the study sample.

**Definitions of Terms**

**Assessment:** The initial measurement to show discipleship behaviors that are already mastered, those needing more development and refinement, and those that are yet to be addressed in the life of the individual adult believer. It is theorized and planned that assessment will be done using a specialized tool to be designed and developed by this researcher.\(^{30}\)

**Behaviors:** The key elements that should be picked up and assimilated by an adult believer as he progresses in Christ-likeness. They are the helpful—albeit arbitrary—touch points to be used to help guide and evaluate a person’s journey with Christ.

**Behavior-based:** The underlying goal of identifying key discipleship behaviors for adult Christians and utilizing these behaviors as the basis for organizing and implementing a personalized, individualized discipleship process.

**Discipler:** An adult believer who is a few steps ahead on the journey with Christ than the adult believer being discipled, who provides direction and oversight for spiritual growth and formation. Although the term “discipler” is preferred, it might be considered synonymous with a spiritual “coach,” “director,” or “mentor.” It denotes a believer who trains another believer in the disciplines of Christ. At times the word “peer” is appended to the term “discipler” to denote that this

---

\(^{30}\) Barna, 110-111.
person is not necessarily a member of the clergy, and is considered an equal in all ways save their modeled maturity in Christ.

**Evaluation:** Throughout the discipleship process, this is the intentional re-assessment, checking in, and course adjustment taking place as a discipler assists the individual adult believer with her next steps. The use of a “report” will help standardize the discipleship process for all adult Christians.

**Guided discipleship:** The process of a discipler providing personalized direction and oversight to an adult believer. This researcher believes it will ultimately include an initial assessment, ongoing discipling assistance, and periodic evaluations to check on growth and the effectiveness of the discipleship process.

**Mile markers:** Key behavioral elements that all adult disciples should be learning and mastering. They are the points in a spiritual journey whereby an individual adult believer can evaluate his or her personal progress. This term is considered synonymous with “behaviors.”

**Oversight:** The supervising or managing of the discipleship process of an individual adult believer by a discipler. While “direction” (see spiritual direction below) suggests instruction and advisement, “oversight” would include planning activities, checking in, doing follow-up, holding someone accountable, and ensuring proper advancement through the process.

**Report:** A file or record created for the purpose of evaluation and facilitation of conversation during the direction and oversight process of discipling. The researcher intends to create such a report to help track progress and mastery of behaviors, and provide discussion starters to guide conversations.
**Spiritual direction:** The individual and personalized instruction and advisement provided by a “discipler” in the intentional and ongoing development of an adult believer.

**Spiritual formation:** The holistic growth and development of each adult believer through the learning and application of discipleship “behaviors” along with the direction and oversight of a discipler.

**Organization of the Study**

Chapter One introduces the context and purpose of the study. The problem of discipleship is presented and the wisdom for identifying key behaviors that can be measured by the careful work of a discipler in guided discipleship direction and oversight is outlined. The methods for quantitative and qualitative research are shared.

Chapter Two will provide the theological foundation and scriptural support for such an approach to intentional, individualized, measured, peer-led discipleship. The role of the Holy Spirit in concert with the roles of the individual adult believer and his or her discipler will be examined.

Chapter Three will briefly look at learning styles, teaching and mentoring techniques, and will introduce existing material on discipleship techniques and concepts regarding fundamental skills of faith or discipleship behaviors. Applications for the local congregation and the broader church will be discussed.

Chapter Four will present and explain the questionnaire used for quantitative research, and the guiding questions used in the focus group to yield qualitative data.

Chapter Five will discuss the research findings and analyze meaning and implications for future discipleship and spiritual formation of adult Christians. Clarification of goals and adjustments in understanding and application will be offered in
order to more successfully create a workable and functioning behavior-based, discipler-led guided discipleship process.

Chapter Six will look at ways in which a discipleship process, utilizing mastery of key behaviors and the direction and oversight of disciplers in the lives of adult Christians, can best be deployed in the local church and inform and equip the broader church-at-large. Items for future development will also be discussed, such as a “how-to” manual for use by churches in implementing a behavior-based discipleship process, and possibly a tool for guiding discipleship conversations and keeping records of individual growth.

An Appendix to the study will contain a guidebook for adult Christians and disciplers to use in delving more deeply into spiritual assessment and formulation of a plan for discipleship. The Appendix will also contain an assessment tool designed to help determine where a person feels he is in the process of developing the identified discipleship behaviors. These tools are intended to produce an easier and more effective implementation of a behavior-based approach to discipler-led, guided discipling.
CHAPTER TWO
BIBLICAL AND THEOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS

Much will be said within this research project that reflects this researcher’s personal and professional assumptions and predispositions. Through nearly twenty years of pastoral ministry, this researcher has tried numerous packaged discipleship programs, reviewed scores of books, and attempted many varied approaches to discipleship and found limited success—both in being *discipled* and in *discipling*. Because of that, this researcher has speculated there are missing elements that would make for more successful and reproducible growth in the lives of adult believers across the spectrum of churches, and this research is one step in endeavoring to identify those elements.

The first place for discovery must be in Scripture itself to find God’s expectations and instructions for discipleship. Principles gleaned from Scripture are then informed by sound reason, guided by both ancient and modern traditions of the church, and seasoned with life experience. These four sources for understanding and deeper discovery have become known in modern theological studies as the Wesleyan Quadrilateral:

The Wesleyan Quadrilateral is not unique to John Wesley, the founder of the Methodist movement and the Great Awakening revivalist of the eighteenth century, but predates him in various forms. The great Church of England theologian Richard Hooker developed his own earlier version of it in the latter part of the sixteenth century. Twentieth-century American Methodist theologian Albert Outler coined the phrase “Wesleyan Quadrilateral.” In actuality, however, some version of it is ancient and common among Christian thinkers. The Wesleyan Quadrilateral . . . regards proper Christian belief as shaped by four main sources and norms: *Scripture, tradition, reason, and experience.*

---

It is not sufficient to state a proposal or theory, yet have no basis for the speculative or creative thought, no sources upon which to rely in understanding the stated problem, no practical experience in support of such speculation, and no ability to explain the assumption or its application to others. In order for this study to contribute to the North American church-at-large and be understandable by many faith traditions, the project must carefully integrate this researcher’s suppositions with the discernible practical knowledge available: investigating the stated problem by means of a thorough biblical and theological inquiry.

Scripture is God’s Word to mankind; his divine revelation provides understanding of discipleship’s meaning, and the historical examples of discipleship found in Scripture will help clarify potential missing components in modern discipleship and the ways discipleship might be improved. Reason incorporates logic and philosophy, pulling together disparate ideas in search of commonality as well as wide appeal and application. The tradition of the church looks at the both “the consensus beliefs held in common by the early church fathers and the Reformers of the sixteenth century” as well as the modern-day thinking by pastors and theologians today. Experience speaks of the spiritual experiences of both the church and of this researcher’s personal experiences in the discipleship of adult believers. “The Wesleyan Quadrilateral gives us a rich and vital way for seeking truth, knowing, loving, and serving God, and for making disciples of Jesus Christ who have the form and the power of godliness. The four ingredients (Scripture, Tradition, Reason, and Experience) work together to help Christians grow in

32 Olson, 57.
holiness of heart and life. . . .” and will be of invaluable benefit for laying a foundation for research into the needed elements for growing adult disciples.33

By using the Wesleyan Quadrilateral of Scripture, reason, tradition, and experience as guides for expressing the foundational impetus for this study, this researcher endeavors to engage in research “while pro-actively working toward transformation.”34 By grounding the motivation for this study in Scripture, reason, tradition, and personal experience, this researcher believes the study will not “simply describe, but explicitly interpret itself from the point of view of a Christian minister,” and should specify how the study will be “of interest to ministers in other ministry contexts.”35

**Scripture**

Scripture is the primary source of truth for all Christ-followers. It provides understanding, instruction, definitions, and historical reflection focused on promoting unity in the faith and giving proper, holistic direction for one’s spiritual life. This is certainly true for the topic of discipleship. God’s Word offers many insights into the Lord Jesus’ desires for his disciples and the missional vision that the apostles undertook to teach regarding the Lord’s precepts. Scripture presents a glimpse into the discipleship process as it actually occurred in the life of the disciples in the life of the early church.

---


Jesus’ Expectation

Jesus made it abundantly clear, “If anyone would come after me, he must deny himself and take up his cross daily and follow me. For whoever wants to save his life will lose it, but whoever loses his life for me will save it.” Discipleship was to be a rejection of one’s own life’s preferences to be replaced with a wholehearted predilection for, and acceptance of, a life of following Christ and his instructions. Discipleship required students to follow the Savior in obedient submission on a daily basis. Jesus made sure the message was clear: disciples surrendered the right to live life their way in order to receive life lived the right way. Jesus said, “If you hold to my teaching, you are really my disciples.”

Jesus also made it clear that there is no such thing as a believer who is not a disciple; discipleship is a privilege, responsibility, and the over-arching lifestyle of all who follow Christ. In Christ, disciples are able to accomplish the tasks set before them precisely because they are continually connected to him and growing in him. As Jesus taught:

I am the true vine, and my Father is the gardener. He cuts off every branch in me that bears no fruit, while every branch that does bear fruit he prunes so that it will be even more fruitful. You are already clean because of the word I have spoken to you. Remain in me, and I will remain in you. No branch can bear fruit by itself; it must remain in the vine. Neither can you bear fruit unless you remain in me. I am the vine; you are the branches. If a man remains in me and I in him, he will bear much fruit; apart from me you can do nothing. If anyone does not remain in me, he is like a branch that is thrown away and withers; such branches are picked up, thrown into the fire and burned. If you remain in me and my words remain in you, ask whatever you wish, and it will be given you. This is to my Father’s glory, that you bear much fruit, showing yourselves to be my disciples.

37 Jn 8:31.
To remain “in” is much more than remaining faithful; remaining “in” Christ is about spiritual nutrition, becoming part of the life-sustaining main vine. If disciples remain “in” then they will bear fruit; if they are not bearing fruit, they apparently are not “in.” Part of the role of a branch is that it must be continually pruned. Pruning is almost always severe, costly, and produces parts that get thrown away; such pruning of a disciple can be painful, but is necessary for spiritual health and fruitfulness. Pruning, remaining “in,” and bearing fruit are descriptors of any believer who is connected to Jesus; they are descriptors of a disciple.

Jesus told everyone the cost of becoming a disciple. The things held most dear in life are the things that must become secondary to the journey with Christ.

If anyone comes to me and does not hate his father and mother, his wife and children, his brothers and sisters—yes, even his own life—he cannot be my disciple. And anyone does not carry his cross and follow me cannot be my disciple.

Suppose one of you wants to build a tower. Won’t he not first sit down and estimate the cost to see if he has enough money to complete it? For if he lays the foundation and is not able to finish it, everyone who sees it will ridicule him, saying, “This fellow began to build and was not able to finish.”

Or suppose a king is about to go to war against another king. Will he not first sit down and consider whether he is able with ten thousand men to oppose the one coming against him with twenty thousand? If he is not able, he will send a delegation while the other is still a long way off and will ask for terms of peace. In the same way, any of you who does not give up everything he has cannot be my disciple.39

Jesus’ hyperbolic instruction to “hate” grabbed the attention and caused the disciple to carefully weigh his life in comparison with the cost of following Christ. His teaching parables illustrated the careful and considered meditation that must go into the decision to follow him: full surrender, full obedience, full commitment—all were required of a disciple.

39 Lk 14:26-33.
Jesus knew there were—and would be—those who would claim him as Lord yet choose not to follow his teachings. He was careful to give this caution:

Why do you call me, “Lord, Lord,” and do not do what I say? I will show you what he is like who comes to me and hears my words and puts them into practice. He is like a man building a house, who dug down deep and laid the foundation on rock. When a flood came, the torrent struck that house but could not shake it, because it was well built. But the one who hears my words and does not put them into practice is like a man who built a house on the ground without a foundation. The moment the torrent struck that house, it collapsed and its destruction was complete.\(^{40}\)

Those who hear how to live as disciples but continually forget or fail to live as instructed will find their failure to implement Christ’s teachings in their lives to be their downfall, spiritually; a disciple is one who hears principles the Master teaches and appropriates them into her life. Discipleship builds within the believer the solid foundation of faith; it is not meant to be an option for a certain caliber or rank of believer—it was meant to be the lifestyle for all believers. If he is to be called “Lord,” then he must be Master. A disciple learns to live as the Master lived and as the Master desires for his followers to live.

The Apostles’ Teaching

The apostle Paul was a Roman citizen and well-versed in Hellenistic life. It was easy for Paul to compare discipleship with training for the Olympic Games. For Paul, discipleship was like being a world-class athlete who trained and disciplined himself. His instructions to young pastor Timothy were to “. . . train yourself to be godly. For physical training is of some value, but godliness has value for all things, holding promise for both

\(^{40}\) Lk 6:46-49.
the present life and the life to come.”

Paul offered similar instructions to the church at Corinth, telling them:

Do you not know that in a race all the runners run, but only one gets the prize? Run in such a way as to get the prize. Everyone who competes in the games goes into strict training. They do it to get a crown that will not last; but we do it to get a crown that will last forever. Therefore I do not run like a man running aimlessly; I do not fight like a man beating the air. No, I beat my body and make it my slave so that after I have preached to others, I myself will not be disqualified for the prize.

Paul taught “Follow my example, as I follow the example of Christ.” Paul was willing to give it his all, and he expected the same from all Christ-followers. Discipleship is not an option, it is not a simplistic or easy-to-follow regimen, nor does it succeed from half-hearted, lackadaisical effort. Paul wanted the church to know that to follow Christ as disciples meant strict training, stringent discipline, and great effort. The Greek word translated as “train” in Paul’s writing is the word γυμνάζω (gumnazo), from which is derived “gymnastics,” and it means to undergo strict, disciplined training; to exercise.

Paul did not use this word casually; he used it intentionally as a call to rigorous “athleticism” in spiritual development and discipleship. The modern “no pain-no gain” motif in exercising and body-building might appropriately be applied to Paul’s

\[\text{1 Cor 9:24-27.}\]

\[\text{1 Cor 11:1.}\]

\[\text{1 Tm 4:7-8.}\]

\[\text{Walter Bauer et al., } A \text{ Greek-English Lexicon of the New Testament and Other Early Christian Literature, 3rd ed. BDAG, revised and edited by Frederick William Danker (Chicago: University Of Chicago Press, 2000), 208. “It is not the self-centered ascetic struggle of the individual for his moral and religious perfection, but the training necessary for the unhindered pursuit of God’s purposes... [Paul’s] exercise was a rigorous development and application of all his strength and ability to serve the glory of God [with] every thought and action.” Cleon L. Rogers Jr. and Cleon L. Rogers III, The New Linguistic and Exegetical Key to the Greek New Testament (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1998), 494.}\]
instructions for discipleship; if it is not strenuous, if it does not stretch and cause some discomfort, then it might be that more effort is needed.

The apostle Peter gave a similar understanding of discipleship, explaining that it would require great effort to add to one’s faith, and that it would require ongoing exertion throughout the whole of life. Peter taught that God provided the raw materials for discipleship, but the impetus for growth always lies within the individual believer:

His divine power has given us everything we need for life and godliness through our knowledge of him who called us by his own glory and goodness. Through these he has given us his very great and precious promises, so that through them you may participate in the divine nature, and escape the corruption in the world caused by evil desires.

For this very reason, make every effort to add to your faith goodness; and to goodness, knowledge; and to knowledge, self-control; and to self-control, perseverance; and to perseverance, godliness; and to godliness, brotherly kindness; and to brotherly kindness, love. For if you possess these qualities in increasing measure, they will keep you from being ineffective and unproductive in your knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ. But if anyone does not have them, he is nearsighted and blind, and has forgotten that he has been cleansed from his past sins.⁴⁵

Discipleship is meant to be a preemptive effort with protective results; a disciple will “make every effort to add” to his faith, possess the qualities of discipleship “in increasing measure,” and the result is that he is kept from being “ineffective and unproductive” with the teaching and understanding he received of Christ.⁴⁶ Perhaps a proactive treatment of this passage would be: a disciple must do all she can and work as hard as she can, then she will have the qualities of a disciple continually growing in her making her highly effective and extremely productive in her understanding of the Master, Jesus Christ, and her life of following him.

---

⁴⁵ 2 Pt 1:3-9.
⁴⁶ 2 Pt 1:5, 8.
The apostle John did not mince words on the importance of taking discipleship seriously. If believers are going to associate themselves with the Master, Jesus, then they must live as the Master lived and obey the Master’s commands. Anything short of complete submission and obedience is not acceptable. John clearly explained:

We know that we have come to know him if we obey his commands. The man who says, “I know him,” but does not do what he commands is a liar, and the truth is not in him. But if anyone obeys his word, God’s love is truly made complete in him. This is how we know we are in him: Whoever claims to live in him must walk as Jesus did.  

John wants all believers to know that if they want to know that they belong to Christ then they must do what Jesus did and live like Jesus lived. Discipleship is not an option; discipleship is a way of life for all who believe in Christ.

All Christians Are Disciplers

Jesus taught that the task of discipling falls to each and every believer; there is no such thing as a Christian who is not a disciple, and there is no such thing as a Christian who is not a discipler. Jesus’ Great Commission to all Christ-followers was very clear when he said, “All authority in heaven and on earth has been given to me. Therefore go and make disciples of all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit, and teaching them to obey everything I have commanded you. And surely I am with you always, to the very end of the age.” Discipling others is the commission given to each and every believer by the Master himself.

Paul also spoke of the vital importance of being disciplers: “We proclaim him, admonishing and teaching everyone with all wisdom, so that we may present everyone

---

47 1 Jn 2:3-6.

48 Mt 28:18-20.
perfect in Christ. To this end I labor, struggling with all his energy, which so powerfully works in me.”⁴⁹ Presenting everyone as fully mature, fully developed disciples is a critical role for all believers, strenuously contending with all the energy Christ gives.⁵⁰ Paul encouraged his protégé, Timothy—and by extension, all Christians today—when he wrote, “And the things you have heard me say in the presence of many witnesses entrust to reliable men who will also be qualified to teach others.”⁵¹ Disciples disciple other disciples; it is meant to be much more than addition or multiplication—it is meant to be an exponential progression with disciples who disciple other disciples, who in turn disciple other disciples. It is how Christ structured the leadership of his church. Paul told the church,

It was he who gave some to be apostles, some to be prophets, some to be evangelists, and some to be pastors and teachers, to prepare God’s people for works of service, so that the body of Christ may be built up until we all reach unity in the faith and in the knowledge of the Son of God and become mature, attaining to the whole measure of the fullness of Christ.

Then we will no longer be infants, tossed back and forth by the waves, and blown here and there by every wind of teaching and by the cunning and craftiness of men in their deceitful scheming. Instead, speaking the truth in love, we will in all things grow up in him who is the Head, that is, Christ. From him the whole body, joined and held together by every supporting ligament, grows and builds itself up in love, as each part does its work.⁵²

Every disciple in the church builds up the body of Christ until all have been grown up into Christ’s likeness. The goal is for everyone to attain to “the whole measure of the fullness of Christ,” and a critical tool must be “speaking the truth in love.”⁵³

---

⁴⁹ Col 1:28-29.
⁵⁰ Mt 28:18-20; Col 1:29.
⁵¹ 2 Tm 2:2.
⁵² Eph 4:11-16.
⁵³ Eph 4:13, 15.
Jesus’ Model for Disciple-Making

The gospels record instances this researcher believes was Jesus’ own way of making disciples. This is not meant to be an exhaustive study; a cursory investigation yielded examples from each of the four gospels:


Jesus’ model of discipling can be seen to be sequential and segmented. It is sequential because it shows movement and development from one element or proficiency to the next. Jesus’ model can also be seen as segmented because upon closer examination, each element or proficiency can be seen to contain its own set of characteristics, objectives, and competencies.

In Luke 9:23 this researcher believes Jesus gives very concise and clear-cut instructions how to live as a disciple: “If anyone would come after me, he must deny himself and take up his cross daily and follow me.” Inherent in this passage are descriptions of what it means to be one of his disciples:

1. “Come after.” A disciple makes a determination: she searches, discovers, and follows the Master. This is no mere spiritual “seeking,” this is determined, reasoned, decisive action.

54 Hull, Complete Book of Discipleship, 169.
55 Lk 9:23.
2. “Deny himself.” A disciple surrenders his will in deference to and preference for the Master’s will. This is not some form of asceticism whereby he does without some pleasure or desire for a time or even for a lifetime; this is about opting—purposefully and preferentially—for Christ’s plans instead of his own.

3. “Take up his cross.” For disciples the “cross” signifies they are willing to walk beside him on the road of obedience—even suffering—to the end of their days, and that they are willing to die to themselves. The cross is not a metaphor for dealing with troubles in life, nor is it a literal requirement of carrying a cross to show some form of membership or obedience. The cross is both a symbol and a mindset: “I have been crucified with Christ and I no longer live, but Christ lives in me. The life I live in the body, I live by faith in the Son of God, who loved me and gave himself for me.”

4. “Daily.” It is not a one-time decision, it is an everyday decision. Salvation does not need to be renewed daily, nor does one’s position in Christ, but the decision and determination to deny oneself and carry the cross in obedience to the Master is a daily occurrence. The world continually vies for the disciple’s allegiance, her heart always seeks its own desires, the enemy quietly invades her defenses, and unless she is daily working on moving forward, she is slowly and inexorably losing hard-won ground.

5. “Follow me.” This is more than walking along behind. It is finding what he did and doing it. It is learning his style and emulating it. It is hearing and studying his words then echoing them. It involves falling in behind him and walking in his footsteps, doing and being just like the Master.

Jesus invited the disciples to follow him. The disciple is asked for a decision: leave one life behind and follow the Master into the life he has willed for the disciple to live. However, this is more than mere following. Following can be done at a distance and without a real relationship. Jesus asked his disciples to actually be in his presence, to walk side-by-side, and to share the intimacy of a true relationship. Jesus poured himself into those who walked beside him. He taught them, showed them, led them, and positioned them to continue his ministry and mission to the world. The disciple is but a branch of the true vine; in order to produce fruit, the disciple must remain connected to the true vine. As Jesus sends his disciples into the world, he calls them to remain fully grafted into him.

56 Gal 2:20.
Summary from Scripture

This researcher has found in searching Scripture, in terms of elements for modern discipleship, that: (1) all believers are disciples; (2) all disciples are invited and expected to grow spiritually; (3) all disciples are expected to deny the world and connect to the Master; (4) it is a daily, intentional task; (5) it requires submission and surrender; (6) it requires knowing and doing the things Jesus did and the things Jesus taught; and (7) all disciples are to make other disciples.

Reason

When looking at reason, the goal is to find comprehensible and articulate intellectual congruence with the subject of adult discipleship. “In Christian belief as in every other area of life the search for coherence and intelligibility is essential.” This researcher asked: (1) What supporting information exists that might reasonably explain or reinforce the concept of adult Christian discipleship? (2) What educational philosophies or learning theories from the secular world of education might apply to adult discipleship? (3) What business and/or organizational philosophies might fit with the discipleship of adults? (4) What opinions or theological theories exist within the context of the church-at-large that might give direction or rationale to the instruction and training of adult disciples?

Secular Education

The search for logic, reason, and congruence took this researcher into the secular field of adult learning, andragogy, learner-centered teaching, experiential learning, and

57 Olson, 57.
transformational teaching. Most resources are ten years old or less, written by professors of Adult Education, Teaching and Learning, Teaching Excellence, Psychology, Anthropology, History, and Statistics in recognized centers for teacher education including Carnegie Mellon University, Pennsylvania State University, North Carolina State University, Louisiana State University, the University of Minnesota, and the University of Pittsburgh Medical Center-St. Margaret Hospital. This researcher also delved into an older text written by Jack Mezirow of Columbia University, and a revised seventh edition of a text written by Malcolm S. Knowles of North Carolina State University, both of which are still considered standard reading for adult education. These resources, authored by great minds in fields that inform adult education, represent thousands of hours of their personal research all made available to this researcher in the quest for elements necessary for successful and transformative adult discipleship.

In order for adults to learn and to be invested in the learning process, they must be motivated; they must have a goal or set of goals, see the value in those goals, and have reasonable expectation for the successful achievement of those goals. 58 “In the context of learning, motivation influences the direction, intensity, persistence, and quality of the learning behaviors in which students engage.” 59

Goals

Adult learners should set goals. “In essence, they act as the compass that guides and directs a broad range of purposeful actions, including . . . interpersonal relationships,

---

58 Susan A. Ambrose et al., How Learning Works: Seven Research-Based Principles for Smart Teaching (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2010), 68-71.

59 Ibid., 68-69.
identity and self-concept . . . and desires to be productive and competent. . . .”

Learning goals enable the adult disciple to have input into what it is they are learning, check on their progress, and get input from a discipler as to advice for successful attainment of those goals.

**Value**

Value describes both a goal’s importance and the significance of the personal take-away for the learner. “People are motivated to engage in behaviors to attain goals that have a high relative value. . . . [W]hen confronted with multiple goals . . . a student will be more motivated to pursue the goal that has the highest value to him.”

**Expectancies**

In valuing “a desired outcome in order to be motivated to pursue it, value alone is insufficient to motivate behavior. People are also motivated to pursue goals and outcomes that they believe they can successfully achieve.” In order to engage in behaviors that will bring about a successful outcome, a disciple must have a sense of positive outcome expectancies.

The environment in which goals, values, and expectancies exist has a high degree of influence on the learner. If the instructor or discipler is positive and supportive, the environment is positively enhanced. “Thus, our framework for understanding motivation

---


61 Ambrose et al., 74.

62 Ibid., 76.
suggests that if a goal is valued and expectancies for success are positive and the environment is perceived to be supportive, motivation will be highest."

The implications for effective adult education also help define strategies and techniques for disciplers of adult disciples, including: (1) connecting the material to the disciple’s interest—showing real relevance for their lives, (2) providing authentic, life-application tasks—learning while doing, (3) having the discipler show his own passion and enthusiasm for discipleship—modeling discipleship for those he is discipling.64

Goals, values, and expectancies are some of the elements needed in adult discipleship, yet learning through life-experiences and ultimately becoming a self-directed learner who is able to disciple others also remain vital essentials.

Adult education, specifically the perspective known as andragogy (“man-leading” as opposed to pedagogy “child-leading”) is defined by Jack Mezirow, Emeritus Professor of adult and continuing education at Teachers College at Columbia University, as “an organized and sustained effort to assist adults to learn in a way that enhances their capability to function as self-directed learners.”65

Becoming a self-directed learner is a goal or outcome of adult education, but not necessarily a means to that end, as indicated by Mezirow’s own goals of transformative adult education, which this researcher believes appropriately correspond to the goals of transformative Christian discipleship:

1. Progressively decrease the learner’s dependency on the educator.
2. Help the learner understand how to use learning resources, especially the experience of others, including the educator, and how to engage in reciprocal learning relationships.

---

63 Ambrose et al., 79-80.
64 Ibid., 82-85.
3. Assist the learner to define his/her learning needs, both in terms of immediate awareness and in terms of understanding the cultural and psychological assumptions influencing his/her perceptions of needs.
4. Assist the learner to assume increasing responsibility for defining learning objectives, planning his/her own learning program, and evaluating progress.
5. Help the learner organize what is to be learned in relationship to his/her current personal problems, concerns, and levels of understanding.
6. Foster learner decision making, select relevant learning experiences that require choosing, expand the learner’s range of options, and facilitate the learner’s taking the perspectives of others who have alternate ways of understanding.
7. Encourage the use of criteria for judging that are increasingly inclusive and differentiating in awareness, self-reflexive, and integrative of experience.
8. Foster a self-corrective, reflexive approach to learning—to typifying and labeling, to perspective taking and choosing, and to habits of learning and learning relationships.
9. Facilitate posing and solving of problems, including problems associated with the implementation of individual and collective action, and recognition of the relationship between personal problems and public [community] issues.
10. Reinforce the self-concept of the learner as the learner and doer by providing for progressive mastery and for a supportive climate with feedback to encourage provisional efforts to change and to take risks; by avoiding competitive judgment of performance; and by appropriate use of mutual support groups.
11. Emphasize experiential, participative, and projective instructional methods and use modeling and learning contracts where appropriate.
12. Make the moral distinction between helping the learner understand his/her full range of choices and ways to improve the quality of choosing and encouraging the learned to make a specific choice.66

Helping adults learn, whether in the college setting, workplace training setting, or Christian discipleship setting, requires “helping adults elaborate, create, and transform their meaning schemes (beliefs, feelings, interpretations, decisions) through reflection on their content, the process by which they were learned, and their premises (social context, history, and consequences). . . .” This describes both andragogy in general and Christian adult discipleship in particular. The goal is to help adult learners derive meaning from life experiences, grow and develop through the process, and ultimately direct their own

66 Mezirow, Transformative Dimensions, 199-200.
learning. “The job of adult educators [those who educate adults] is to help learners look critically at their beliefs and behaviors, not only as these appear at the moment but in the context of their history (purpose) and consequences in the learners’ lives.”

Adult education is about transformative learning—allowing experiences to shape future thinking, personality, and cognitive development. Kelly McGonigal, a health psychologist and lecturer at Stanford University, in writing about teaching for transformation, identifies that “transformative learning is in clear contrast to the more common process of assimilative learning, the type of learning that takes place when students simply acquire new information that can easily fit into their pre-existing knowledge structures.” This researcher believes that transformative learning is at the basis of discipleship; moving a person towards spiritual transformation through experience, challenges, experimentation, apprenticeship, emulation, and other life-altering, behavior and mindset restructurings. McGonigal’s thinking seems to underscore this researcher’s assumption as she writes:

For transformative learning to occur, the instructor [discipler] must strike a careful balance between support and challenge. Trust among students [disciples] and the instructor [discipler] is especially important. . . . [S]tudents must have their beliefs and assumptions actively challenged. . . . [T]o be an agent of change, instructors [disciplers] must understand the process of change and provide both the catalyst and support necessary for transformative learning.

Through transformative learning, a disciple first discovers, then develops, and is ultimately able to demonstrate her understanding of a life committed to the Master, Jesus

67 Mezirow, Transformative Dimensions, 197-198.


69 Ibid., 4.
Christ. Discipleship is transformative learning; it has as its goal that a disciple becomes a self-directed learner, or perhaps more accurately, a disciple who continues to develop and is able to disciple others.

The entire concept of learner-centered teaching and becoming a self-directed learner has at its base the transformation of an adult learner from a person who learns all he or she should learn “from” someone else (a teacher) to become a person who learns from transformative experiences and ultimately becomes able to direct his or her own learning. One typically thinks of a teacher “as one who is responsible” for the things “students should learn, how, when, and if they have learned” because teachers “transmit prescribed content, control the way students receive and use it, and then test if they have received it.”

In adult discipleship, churches and pastors often fall into this same mindset. However, this kind of didactic, top-down, personality-driven teaching does not seem the wisest approach to discipling adults.

Malcolm Knowles, affectionately known by his colleagues as “the Father of Andragogy in the United States” and professor of Adult and Community College Education at North Carolina State University, warned: “Instructors of adults generally want to ensure efficient and effective learning. This focus often leads to concentration on what they are doing rather than what the learner is doing.” Pedagogical strategies would be appropriate at the outset of discipleship, when the disciple has “little previous experience to build on . . . a low degree of readiness to learn . . .” and little or no

---

knowledge for which developmental task she should be prepared for.\textsuperscript{71} Andragogical strategies would very quickly come into play as the discipler would wish for the disciple to “take increasing initiative in the process of further inquiry,” and as the disciples themselves would “tend to be more motivated toward learning that helps them solve problems in their lives or results in internal payoffs.”\textsuperscript{72}

Maryellen Weimer, professor of teaching and learning at the Berks-Lehigh Valley College of the Pennsylvania State University, believes the process of maturing or transforming from “dependent to independent learner is gradual; it does not happen all at once. . . . [I]t is a sequential process and mirrors other kinds of growth. There are moments of insight, growth spurts, and times when no changes are apparent.”\textsuperscript{73} This is certainly true of a Christian disciple. To move from a non-believer to a new believer may involve some “a-ha” moments and perhaps a dynamic conversion experience, but it also may consist of several months to several years of slow development. The growth from a new believer to a maturing disciple is also gradual and sequential; certain competencies must be mastered along the way to maturity. Developing from a maturing disciple to a role-model of the Christian faith may have as many developmental mile-markers and skill mastery as any other stage in the process.

The development from a non-believer to a role-model of the faith is not a sure thing; many pitfalls stand in the way of the process. As Weimer suggests, “the transformation of students into autonomous, self-directed learners is not the inevitable

\textsuperscript{71} Knowles, Swanson, and Holton, 144.

\textsuperscript{72} Ibid., 144, 196.

\textsuperscript{73} Maryellen Weimer, \textit{Learner-Centered Teaching: Five Key Changes to Practice} (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2002), 167-168.
outcome of educational experiences. . . . [G]iving students the opportunity to become independent is a necessity, but it is not a sufficient condition for the development of autonomy and self-direction in learning.”

Helping adult disciples involves many difficulties, both for the disciple as well as for the discipler. Weimer’s research—into “learning-centered teaching”—sheds light on the difficulties and challenges encountered even in adult discipleship.

“Challenge 1: Understanding the Development Process in Context.” An adult disciple develops in and through very real and personal life experiences and situations.

“Challenge 2: Responding to Students at Different Levels.” Disciplers will rarely disciple one person at a time—discipling may occur in groups, or individually but with multiple disciples being led by a single discipler. The discipler must remember that each disciple is progressing at her own pace and mastering different skills at different times and with varied effectiveness or success.

“Challenge 3: Designing a Sequence of Learning Experiences.” As Weimer points out, “the challenge is at the level of individual instructor application.” Each individual discipler will need to carefully map out and oversee each individual disciple’s process of maturation and training.

“Challenge 4: Designing a Learning-Centered Curriculum.” This is a goal of this researcher’s current project. As this researcher postulated in Chapter One, the majority of adult believers are unsure of how to nurture their spiritual formation. They are unsure of

---

74 Weimer, 168.

75 Ibid., 180-183. This researcher is listing Weimer’s four “challenges” in title case as they appear in Weimer’s book, but is not citing each challenge separately beyond this current citation. The researcher’s comments are found in narrative form following each of Weimer’s challenges listed.
how to grow, unsure of those activities in which to engage, and unsure of the behaviors they should develop. They are also concerned that there is no well-defined program of study and no effective measurement of their progress. This process of discipleship requires intentionality, personalization, oversight, and continual evaluation.

Weimer’s writing challenges the church—purely by serendipity, since she wrote primarily to college faculty. She posits that:

. . . [S]uccessful response to developmental issues requires a level of knowledge that does not yet exist conceptually or pragmatically. What is known does establish the importance of development issues and offers a place to start. We know that development of learners is not automatic, although some does occur without much intervention. However, there is the tantalizing possibility that much more is likely if that development happens in the context of carefully planned, sequenced, and inter-connected learning experiences. Even more may occur if it builds off related developmental processes. But how it all fits together at this point remains a mystery, a case to be solved through our collective efforts and experiences.  

Secular Business

The search for logic, reason, and congruence also took this researcher into the secular field of business, leadership, human resource, and applied behavioral science. The resources used were authored by experts in Human Resource Development, Organizational Behavior, and Leadership.

In the area of organizational behavior, a great deal of study has been done on motivation and how adults develop. Paul Hersey and Kenneth Blanchard suggest that more bureaucratic or hierarchical models of management such as those with top-down authority and programs that emphasize achievement of the organization’s objectives, lead to “poor, shallow, and mistrustful relationships. . . .” which do not allow “the natural and

---

76 Weimer, 183.
free expression of feelings,” 77 and result in what Chris Argyris termed “decreased interpersonal competence.” 78 Argyris suggests that people need to develop along a “basic multidimensional developmental process along which the growth of individuals in our culture may be measured,” and which show how an adult becomes self-actualized. 79 Argyris’ developmental process 80 shows that people move: (1) from “a state of passivity” in infancy, into “a state of increasing activity” in adulthood, showing growth in personal involvement; (2) from “a state of dependence” in infancy, into “a state of relative independence” in adulthood, showing growth in self-reliance; (3) from “being capable of behaving in only a few ways” in infancy, to “being capable of behaving in different ways” in adulthood, showing growth in depth of character, ability, priorities, and preferences; (4) from “having erratic, casual, shallow . . . interests” in infancy to “having deeper interests” in adulthood, showing breadth in both focus and awareness; (5) from possessing “a short time perspective” (present only) in infancy, to possessing “a longer time perspective” (past, present, and future) in adulthood, showing an interest in where they have been, where they are now, as well as where they hope to go; (6) from “a subordinate position in family and society” in infancy, to “aspiring to occupy an equal and/or superordinate position relative to their peers” in adulthood; and (7) from “a lack of awareness of self” in infancy, to “an awareness of and control over self” in adulthood.


80 Ibid., 49-51. This citation covers the information in the entire seven-point list.
Hersey and Blanchard view Argyris’ work as an “Immaturity-Maturity Theory,” which suggests that certain developmental changes must take place in an individual “if they are to develop into mature people over the years. . . .” and that “these changes reside on a continuum and that the ‘healthy’ personality develops along the continuum from ‘immaturity’ to ‘maturity.’” This researcher sees less of a continuum, which suggests both forward and backward development, and more of a flow or timeline of development.

This developmental process not only describes human maturation, this researcher also sees them as particularly well-suited for describing the aspects of growth in Christian discipleship. Hersey and Blanchard suggest that “according to Argyris, keeping people immature is built in to the very nature of the formal organization.” This might be said for the modern church and its ineffective discipleship models, built on top-down leadership, seeker-sensitivity, and personality-driven didactic teaching. There is little or no effort invested in bringing people from immaturity to maturity—to self-actualization—as disciples. Argyris’ multidimensional developmental process holds great promise for the improvement of adult discipleship in the church, even as the church embraces learning from experience, skill mastery, and personal differentiation—the growth from simplicity and limited dimensionality in personality and relationships to that of more complexity and fruitful proficiency.

David Kolb, professor of Organizational Behavior at Case Western Reserve University, echoes much of what the educators have theorized, and defines learning as “the process whereby knowledge is created through the transformation of experience.”

---

81 Hersey and Blanchard, 61-62.
In any organization, adult humans will develop as they progress through a series of life and application experiences. By transforming the experience into lessons learned and mastery of skills, what Kolb refers to as “acquisition” and “integration,” the adult learner moves through stages or “states” of development from “embeddedness, defensiveness, dependence, and reaction” to “self-actualization, independence, proaction, and self-direction.” These stages or states can be seen as similar and complementary to Argyris’ multidimensional developmental process, and shed additional light on the process that occurs in adult discipleship:

There is considerable agreement among adult-development scholars that growth occurs through processes of differentiation and hierarchic integration and that the highest stages of development are characterized by personal integration and integrity. . . . [W]ith integrative development comes an increasing freedom from the dictates of immediate circumstance and the potential for creative response.84

Disciples grow and develop through experiences, skill mastery, and differentiation as individuals, finding freedom from the demands, influences, and circumstances of the world while finding new and better Spirit-led answers and choices for life-application decisions.

Insight from Church and Para-Church Leaders

In addition to researching education, learning theories, organizational behavior, and leadership principles, this researcher also endeavored to find what pastors, seminary professors, researchers, and para-church leaders have said about adult discipleship, and how these potentially diverse theories, philosophies, and definitions may serve to construct a base understanding of adult discipleship from the Christian viewpoint.

83 Kolb, 140.
84 Ibid., 213.
Pastors

Eugene H. Peterson, long-time pastor and well-known author, says of disciples:

. . . [W]e are people who spend our lives apprenticed to our master, Jesus Christ. We are in a growing-learning relationship always. A disciple is a learner, but not in the academic setting of a schoolroom, rather at the work site of a craftsman. We do not acquire information about God but skills in faith.\(^{85}\)

Peterson captures the essence of what it means to be a disciple, distinguishing it from being a mere student to that of an apprentice learning his craft. Peterson’s assertion that disciples acquire skills resonates with this researcher.

Bill Hybels, pastor of Willow Creek Community Church asks, “What does it take to do the will of the Father?”\(^{86}\) For this researcher, Hybels’ question echoes the purpose of this study to find what it takes to be a disciple of Jesus Christ. Hybels gives a glimpse into being an adult disciple, stating:

It takes *courage* to join a family that is misunderstood by the world. It takes *discipline* to accomplish the tasks God has set out for his children. It takes *vision* to overcome the inevitable problems and see what God is doing in the lives of his children. It takes *endurance* to stick with your brothers and sisters when it would be so much easier to go your own way. Above all, it takes *love* to hold God’s tender family together and to reach out and invite others to join it—tender, tough, sacrificial, radical love.\(^{87}\)

Hybels gives believers a glimpse into some of the skills or behaviors of a disciple, such as courage, discipline, vision, endurance, and love. These are behaviors that may be used to further develop the eventual outcomes of this study.

\(^{85}\) Peterson, *A Long Obedience*, 17.

\(^{86}\) Bill Hybels, *Who You Are When No One’s Looking: Choosing Consistency, Resisting Compromise*, edited by La Vonne Neff (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2010), 111.

\(^{87}\) Ibid.
Greg Ogden, executive pastor of discipleship at Christ Church of Oak Brook, and former academic director of the doctor of ministry program at Fuller Theological Seminary, identifies “seven marks of discipleship:”\(^{88}\)

1. proactive ministers
2. spiritually disciplined
3. holistic discipleship
4. countercultural force
5. church is essential
6. biblically informed
7. sharing our faith\(^{89}\)

Ogden gives disciples this challenge: “Only as we soberly assess the way things are can we have any hope of getting to the way things were designed to be.”\(^{90}\) This researcher would add that as disciples find the way things used to be, they will be able to determine the missing elements needed for adult discipleship today.

Waylon Moore, pastor and presenter/lecturer for the International Mission Board of the Southern Baptist Convention, defines a disciple as one who is “involved in the Word of God on a continuing basis. . . . [O]ne who lays down his life for others. . . . [O]ne who abides daily in a fruit-bearing union with Christ.”\(^{91}\) This researcher recognizes key words in Moore’s definition: involved, continuing, abiding, daily, fruit-bearing, and union. These terms may be of benefit in helping to identify key elements of adult discipleship.

---


\(^{89}\) Ogden, 24-38.

\(^{90}\) Ibid., 38.

Christian Authors and Para-Church Leaders

Richard J. Foster has been a pastor, an author, and a theologian. His books provide a unique perspective to this research into adult discipleship. Foster suggests that spiritual disciplines “call us to move beyond the surface living into the depths. They invite us to explore the inner caverns of the spiritual realm. They urge us to be the answer to a hollow world.”92 Foster gives a reminder that discipleship is for ordinary people, and that the spiritual disciplines, which are used to develop and strengthen disciples, “are best exercised in the midst of our relationships with our husband or wife, our brothers and sisters, our friends and neighbors.”93 As this researcher is fond of saying, community is the environment in which discipleship best occurs.

Foster also reminds this researcher that, “the inner attitude of the heart is far more crucial than the mechanics for coming into the reality of the spiritual life,” and that discipleship is first and foremost about having a life of relationship and intimacy with God. . . .”94 As this research project comes to maturity, Foster’s admonition about the importance of inner attitude surpassing the mechanics of discipleship will provide much-needed influence and direction.

Mike Breen, pastor in both England and the United States, and currently an author, speaker, and leader of 3D Ministries, helping churches and church leaders understand discipleship, suggests that when it comes to discipleship:

There is no “Plan B.” The problem is that most of us have been educated and trained to build, serve, and lead the organization of the church. Most of us have

92 Foster, Celebration of Discipline, 1.
93 Ibid.
94 Ibid., 4.
actually never been trained to make disciples. Seminary degrees, church classes, and training seminars teach us to grow our volunteer base, form systems, and organizational structures or preach sermons on Sunday mornings and assimilate newcomers from the Sunday service. . . .

However, the call to make disciples still remains. It never wavers and never changes. Make disciples.\(^{95}\)

For Breen and co-author, Steve Cockram, the central question for all churches and all church leaders is the questions of “how” Christians to go about making disciples. “Here’s the thing that can be difficult to wrap our minds around: If you make disciples, you always get the church. But if you make a church, you rarely get disciples. . . . If you know how to disciple people well, you will always get mission.”\(^{96}\) Breen champions discipleship as the starting point for ministry. Instead of focusing so much on the people outside the church, Breen feels that pastors forgot to focus on the people inside the church. “Granted, we should focus on people who don’t know Jesus yet, but Jesus himself gave us the model for doing that: Disciple people. . . . No one accidentally creates disciples. Discipleship is an intentional pursuit.”\(^{97}\)

Alice Fryling, former InterVarsity staff member, and active in discipling, counseling, and speaking, concurs with Breen and Cockram, suggesting that making disciples is “intentional, individualized and inspired” work, and defines disciplemaking as “the process of helping someone establish a relationship with Jesus and instructing that friend in the life of faith. . . .”\(^{98}\) This researcher resonates with Fryling’s use of the terms

---

\(^{95}\) Mike Breen and Steve Cockram, *Building a Discipling Culture: How to Release a Missional Movement by Discipling People Like Jesus Did*, 2\(^{nd}\) ed. (Pawleys Island, SC: 3DM, 2011), 11.

\(^{96}\) Breen and Cockram, 11-13.

\(^{97}\) Ibid., 13, 21.

“intentional” and “individualized,” and believes these will be key in the final outcome of this research project.

Walter A. Henrichsen, author and para-church leader with The Navigators, describes the essential traits of a disciple:

1. He has adopted as his objectives in life the same objective God sets forth in the Scriptures.
2. He is willing to pay any price to have the will of God fulfilled in his life.
3. He has a love for the Word of God.
4. He has a servant heart.
5. He puts no confidence in the flesh.
6. He does not have an independent spirit.
7. He has a love for people.
8. He does not allow himself to become trapped in bitterness.
9. He has learned to discipline his life. 99

Henrichsen gives descriptive parameters to help measure growth and evaluate effectiveness, but stops short of a concrete checklist; there is still plenty of flexibility in the traits of a disciple. Henrichsen affirms that discipleship is neither easy nor casual. “It is evident that one does not become a ‘faithful person’ by being a weekend Christian. The faithful person is one who has applied the Scriptures to every area of his life. The life of discipleship is a life of discipline. . . . [S]uch a life is not easy, but God never promised it would be.”100

Christian author Josh Hunt helps explain what is happening in the life of the disciple. “Fundamentally, the biblical word for ‘disciple’ means learner or student. . . . The word ‘disciple’ does not imply a static state. It implies someone who is growing,

100 Ibid., 16-17.
improving, reaching, stretching.”¹⁰¹ Discipleship does not happen by accident; it requires an intentionality of purpose, a whole-hearted acceptance of the lifestyle, and ongoing growth and development.

George Barna, president of the Barna Research Group, proposes that “discipleship is not a program. It is not a ministry. It is a life-long commitment to a lifestyle.”¹⁰² Barna suggests that “most born-again adults are limited in their ability to grow spiritually because they have failed to set any goals for their spiritual development, failed to develop standards against which to measure their growth, or failed to establish procedures for being held accountable for their growth.”¹⁰³ There is a need for goals. There is a place for standards to help measure and evaluate. There is a necessity for supervision, mentoring, and oversight. All are key elements that will help define the outcomes of this research.

Bill Hull, who has written extensively on discipleship, underscores Barna’s analysis: “Vision, intentionality, a plan, and a relationship for accountability are all missing [today]—these are the very heart of discipleship.”¹⁰⁴ Hull also talks about the shallowness of American faith, cautioning:

The problem we face is that we have created and taught a faith that doesn’t transform people. . . . When Jesus commanded, “Make disciples,” he wasn’t simply referring to converts. He wants followers who follow—people who submit to his teachings and his ways. . . . We’ve made the test for salvation doctrinal rather than behavioral, ritualizing it with walking the aisle, praying to receive Christ, or signing a doctrinal statement.¹⁰⁵


¹⁰² Barna, 19.

¹⁰³ Ibid., 36.


¹⁰⁵ Hull, The Complete Book of Discipleship, 43.
Instead, Hull suggests that “faith as modeled and taught by Jesus requires more than just agreeing to religious truth. It means a commitment to follow Christ daily.”

Hull suggests that there are “competencies” that should be measurable in the life of a disciple: (1) a disciple submits to a teacher who teaches her how to follow Jesus; (2) a disciple learns Jesus’ words; (3) a disciple learns Jesus’ way of ministry; (4) a disciple imitates Jesus’ life and character; and (5) a disciple finds and teaches others for Jesus.

Seminarians and Theologians

Michael J. Wilkins, dean of the faculty and professor of New Testament language and literature at Talbot School of Theology at Biola University, defines discipleship as “living a fully human life in this world in union with Jesus Christ and His people, growing in conformity to His image, and helping others to know and become like Jesus.” Discipleship is attainable; it does not take a special breed of person or superhuman ability, and Wilkins gives some insight into how discipleship is made possible: community. Christians grow “in union with Christ and his people” and because they have as their ultimate goal the teaching and training of other disciples.

Gilbert Bilezikian, professor emeritus of Wheaton College and charter member and elder of Willow Creek Community Church, provides a simple formula to show the vital importance of the disciple in the building of Christ’s church: an individual plus

---


107 Ibid.


109 Ibid.
Christ is a living stone; all believers plus Christ become the living stones that comprise Christ’s church.\textsuperscript{110}

Bilezikian emphasizes the shared lifestyle of faith—discipleship in the community of faith—and how discipleship may be implemented, stating:

Faith has implications for how we think, talk, act, and relate to others. Without faith, the values that determine behavior are borrowed from a world ignorant of divine guidance. With the commitment of faith comes commitment to a new life informed by God’s Word. The Bible rejects some behaviors as being incompatible with God’s will, and it requires in their place other forms of conduct derived from God’s will. . . .

In order to provide clear guidance in those areas of its people, it is appropriate for a church to draw up a statement of responsibility outlining its expectations for its members as well as the means of enforcement. The absence of such a statement sends the message that anything goes. When this happens the line between the church and society becomes blurred, and the church fails to impact society because it is not modeling a Christian lifestyle. On the other hand, a statement of conduct may be so restrictive that it appears cultic and controlling. . . . For this reason, it is advisable for churches to refrain from placing legalistic prohibitions and expectations on their members that go beyond the clear teaching of Scripture.\textsuperscript{111}

Bilezikian believes that a shared life of faith—faith lived in community with others—requires accountability, clear expectations, and mutual effort to grow and develop as believers, so that “through this watchcare Christians can maintain good conduct in the world so that unbelievers may see how honorably they live their lives and may themselves be brought to God (1 Pet. 2:10).”\textsuperscript{112}

M. Robert Mulholland Jr., professor of New Testament at Asbury Theological Seminary, describes spiritual formation as “a process of being conformed to the image of

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{110} Gilbert Bilezikian, \textit{Christianity 101: Your Guide to Eight Basic Christian Beliefs} (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1993), 183.
  \item \textsuperscript{111} Ibid., 196-197.
  \item \textsuperscript{112} Ibid., 197.
\end{itemize}
Christ for the sake of others.”¹¹³ A sense of community, seasoned with service, gives
ingen to the process of discipleship, yet Mulholland is quick to emphasize the process of
discipleship, suggesting:

Spiritual growth is, in a large measure, patterned on the nature of physical growth. We do not expect to put an infant into its crib at night and in the morning find a child, an adolescent or yet an adult. We expect that infant to grow into maturity according to the process that God has ordained for physical growth to wholeness. The same thing is true of our spiritual life.¹¹⁴

Mulholland reminds that “everyone is in a process of spiritual formation,” and that this “process of spiritual shaping is a primal reality of human experience.”¹¹⁵ His summarization of the Christian journey is that it “is an intentional and continual commitment to a lifelong process of growth toward wholeness in Christ,” and that “it is for this purpose that God is present and active in every moment of our lives.”¹¹⁶

Many pastors, theologians, and para-church ministers share some of the same ideas of discipleship: the intentionality, the sense of process, its ongoing nature, and the importance of community. At least one gives some disquieting insights. The late Dallas Willard, professor and director of the School of Philosophy at the University of Southern California, gave a startling wake-up call, lamenting:

For at least several decades the churches of the Western world have not made discipleship a condition of being a Christian. One is not required to be, or intend to be, a disciple in order to become a Christian, and one may remain a Christian without any signs of progress toward or in discipleship. Contemporary American churches in particular do not require following Christ in his example, spirit, and teachings as a condition of membership—either of entering into or continuing in

¹¹³ Mulholland, 12.
¹¹⁴ Ibid., 21.
¹¹⁵ Ibid.
¹¹⁶ Ibid., 24.
fellowship of a denomination or local church. . . . So far as the visible Christian institutions of our day are concerned, discipleship clearly is optional. . . .

Little good results from insisting that Christ is also supposed to be Lord: to present his lordship as an option leaves it squarely in the category of the white-wall tires and stereo equipment for the new car. You can do without it. And it is—alas!—far from clear what you would do with it. Obedience and training in obedience form no intelligible doctrinal or practical unity with the salvation presented in recent version of the gospel.

A different model was instituted in the Great Commission Jesus left the church. The first goal he set for the early church was to use his all-encompassing power and authority to make disciples without regard to ethnic distinctions—from all “nations” (Matt. 28:19). That set aside his earlier directive to go only to “the lost sheep of the house of Israel” (Matt. 10:5-6). Having made disciples, these alone were to be baptized into the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Spirit. With this twofold preparation they were to be taught to treasure and keep “all things whatsoever I have commanded you.” The Christian church of the first century resulted from following this plan for church growth—a result hard to improve upon.117

The picture of discipleship glimpsed in the Great Commission in action is a distant cousin—if it is related at all—to the modern-day equivalent of lukewarm, a la carte discipleship found in many churches today. There is no such thing as a Christian who is not a disciple. Willard gives this exhortation:

Now, becoming a disciple or apprentice of Jesus cannot be negotiated. . . . Rather, becoming a disciple is a matter of giving up your life as you have understood it to that point. Jesus made this starkly clear in Luke 14 and elsewhere. And without that “giving up,” you cannot be his disciple, because you will still think you are in charge and just in need of a little help from Jesus for your project of a successful life. But our idea of a “successful life” is precisely our problem.118

Missing elements of discipleship lie somewhere in the morass of misunderstood and misapplied Scripture that would—mistakenly, to be sure—allow believers to choose to exist as anything else but unconditional disciples of Jesus Christ. It is vital that the church is reminded that discipleship is not an option. Willard’s perceptions, in this


researcher’s opinion, perfectly underscore the need for the research proposed in this project.

Dietrich Bonhoeffer, lecturer in Systematic Theology at Berlin University and Christian activist during World War II, provided a heartening exhortation:

At the very moment of their call, men find that they have already broken with all the natural ties of life. This is not their own doing, but his who calls them. For Christ has delivered them from immediacy with the world, and brought them into immediacy with himself. We cannot follow Christ unless we are prepared to accept and affirm that break as a fait accompli. It is no arbitrary choice on the disciple’s part, but Christ himself, who compels him thus to break with his past. Why is this necessary? Why are we not allowed to grow slowly, gradually, uninterruptedly in progressive sanctification out of the natural order into the fellowship of Christ? What is this power which so angrily comes between a man and the natural life in which it had pleased God to place him? . . . We must face up to the truth that the call of Christ does set up a barrier between man and his natural life. But this barrier is no surly contempt for life, no legalistic piety, it is the life which is life indeed, the gospel, the person of Jesus Christ. By virtue of his incarnation he has come between man and his natural life. There can be no turning back, for Christ bars the way.¹¹⁹

Summary from Reason

This researcher has found, in research into both secular and church-based adult education, that vital elements of discipleship would appear to be: (1) goal-setting, (2) standards against which to measure growth, (3) a relationship of accountability, (4) a vision or plan for growth, (5) intentionality, (6) community, and (7) the value of process.

Tradition

In looking at tradition, this researcher is endeavoring to look at history, customs, and culture to find evidence of discipleship and how the role or practice of discipleship might impact adult discipleship in the modern church setting.

¹¹⁹ Bonhoeffer, 94-95.
Historical Examples

“Passing on wisdom to the young for the purposes of character formation has always been around.”\(^{120}\) There is evidence of master-disciple relationships early in the Old Testament accounts. Jacob might be considered a disciple of his uncle Laban, although the sense of obligation bordered on indentured servitude (Gen 27:41-31:55). Joseph was a disciple of sorts to the Hyksos Pharaoh as Joseph rose to become second in power only to the Egyptian king (Gen 37:1-50:26). Moses had a master-disciple relationship with Joshua from the time of the initial exit from Egypt, throughout the wilderness wandering, to the border of the land of promise in the trans-Jordan. Samuel served the Lord under Eli in a master-disciple relationship, until Samuel grew in stature and knowledge and was able to succeed his master, becoming a prophet, priest, and judge of Israel.

In the Old Testament is found the terms *talmid* and *limmud*. *Talmid* (תָלְמִיד) is a Hebrew word for “disciple” or “student” (from *lamad*, לָמַד meaning to “exercise in,” to “learn”).\(^{121}\) A *talmid* was trained in a specific discipline; in 1 Chronicles 25:8 there is mention of a *talmid*, a student being trained for the role of musician in the worship of God, casting lots to determine musical duties under King David. *Limmud* (לִמּוּד) is a Hebrew word that is translated “disciple,” (also from *lamad*, לָמַד meaning to “exercise in,” to “learn”).\(^{122}\) Isaiah 54:13 finds the word *limmud* used to describe the sons of Israel being taught by God, and Isaiah 50:4 has the plural *limmudim* denoting disciples as

\(^{120}\) Hull, *The Complete Book of Discipleship*, 52.


\(^{122}\) Ibid.
“taught ones.” Many of the Old Testament prophets had students. In 1 Kings and 2 Kings is mentioned the company of learners who were in the service of, or were disciples of Elijah and Elisha. “Elijah and Elisha formed groups of followers who were called ‘the sons of the prophets’ (1 Ki 20:35). They were companions of the true prophets and were taught by the prophets. . . .” and their relationship was one of master and disciple. Isaiah 8:16 says, “Bind up the testimony and seal up the law among my disciples.” Much like Elijah and Elisha before him, Isaiah may have had a group of followers who asked to be instructed by the prophet, or were gathered by the prophet to pass on the prophet’s knowledge and understanding. Although historians find no evidence of Isaiah having a formal school, it is clear that he had disciples to whom he entrusted these important teachings.

In Greek society, in the five or six centuries before Christ, μαθητής (mathetes, meaning “learner”) referred to a student or disciple who committed himself to be trained by a master. Socrates (c. 469 BC-399 BC) had a number of disciples, one of which was Plato. Plato (c. 428 BC-347 BC) also had a number of disciples; one of special promise was Aristotle. Aristotle (c. 384 BC-322 BC) had a number of disciples, and at one point began teaching Alexander (who would one day be called “the Great”), the young son of Philip of Macedon. As was the custom of that day, these philosophers started their own schools and took on a large following of students; Plato founded a school known as the Academy, while Aristotle founded a school known as the Lyceum, both in Athens. There

---


124 Spiros Zodhiates, ed. Hebrew-Greek Key Word Study Bible-NIV (Chattanooga, TN: AMG Publishers, 1997), 1531.
were other well-known masters during those centuries, such as Pythagoras (c. 570 BC-495 BC) and Epicurus (c. 341 BC-270 BC), both of whom had a number of disciples, and both of whom started their own schools.

In New Testament times there is evidence of discipleship relationships in many areas of life. Young men would apprentice under skilled craftsmen or laborers, many times learning the skills of a family endeavor such as herding flocks, carpentry, or farming, but at times learning a trade under the mentoring of a master. Those who wanted to pursue training in religious studies would seek out a rabbi (teacher) under whose tutelage the young disciples would gain knowledge and experience.

In Jesus’ day, a rabbi was not the formal head of a religious community or synagogue as we think of a rabbi today. Instead, rabbi was an honored term of respect given to one who interpreted and taught the Hebrew Bible. Rabbi meant “my superior” or “my master” and came from a Hebrew root meaning “great” or “many.” Disciples and others used this term to refer to great scholars and teachers of the Scriptures. . . .

Rabbis played an important role in the Jewish spiritual culture because there were no formal seminaries at the time of Jesus. Each rabbi taught his disciples how the Torah should be interpreted and obeyed, and his disciples willingly submitted to that interpretation. A rabbi, then, was an honored teacher who was well-versed in the text of the Hebrew Bible. He was highly respected for his knowledge, interpretation, and teaching of Scripture as well as for his personal righteousness. Following a rabbi required a deep commitment on the part of the disciple who would live with and follow the rabbi day in and day out for years in order to learn to be like him and live in obedience to God as the rabbi did.

For the Galileans, walking with God took priority over everything. So a rabbi and his disciples typically were highly respected by others in the community. A family or extended family group usually provided housing and food for a rabbi and his disciples. Because of the high respect for study of the Torah, and the fact that the rabbi was leading other people to the kingdom of heaven and the life to come, each disciple was expected to honor the rabbi even more than his own father. It is difficult for Christians today to imagine such love and commitment to a human teacher.125

125 Vander Laan, 24.
To study under a rabbi was a chosen lifestyle, and the disciples went in search of the best rabbi under whom they could apprentice. As Vander Laan explains,

The *talmid* willingly left home, family, and occupation to be with the rabbi because he wanted more than anything else in the world to be like the rabbi (teacher) in his walk with God. As the rabbi lived and taught his understanding of the Scripture, his *talmid* listened to him, watched him, followed him, memorized his words, and imitated his walk with God. Eventually the *talmid* became a teacher who had his own disciples who wanted to learn from him how to walk with God.\(^{126}\)

Michael Wilkins explains that “the normal pattern in Israel was for a prospective disciple to approach a rabbi and ask to study with him. Later rabbinic disciples followed their master around, often imitating the master’s teaching of Torah. . . .”\(^{127}\) Matthew 8 records an occasion when a teacher of the law, or scribe, came to Jesus and stated, “I will follow you wherever you go.”\(^{128}\) In Jesus’ time, a scribe was a highly trained individual, someone with a fairly high standing in the community, working for the High Priests and the Sanhedrin. A scribe would have spent years training under a rabbi, preparing for his professional life, so he is already a finished disciple, able now to teach others in his profession. His request to follow Jesus “normally indicates a desire for a master-disciple relationship, but this man has in mind the kind of master-disciple relationship in which a potential disciple examines various masters and then enlists himself with the more popular or the best-equipped one.”\(^{129}\) The scribe wanted the comfort and prestige of being associated with a popular, highly respected rabbi, desiring to bask in the reflected glory

\(^{126}\) Vander Laan, 17.


\(^{128}\) Mt 8:18.

\(^{129}\) Wilkins, *Matthew*, 347.
of his master. However, Jesus is quick to quash the scribe’s enthusiasm, telling him,

“Foxes have holes and birds of the air have nests, but the Son of Man has no place to lay
his head.”\textsuperscript{130} It was a reasonable strategy on the part of the scribe:

Rabbis enjoyed a relatively high status within Judaism, but Jesus has no school or
synagogue or prestigious place of honor among the religious establishment. He
stays at the home of friends, relatives, and disciples through most of his ministry
(e.g., 8:14). . . . [H]is ministry will not result in an institutional establishment with
comfortable benefits, and this will also be the lot of those who follow him.\textsuperscript{131}

Wilkins gives further insight into the term “disciple” as well as the role and
expectations of those who called themselves “disciples”:

\textit{ מקהנהול and \textit{talmidh} appear to be equivalent terms. They were popular terms at
the time of Jesus to designate a follower who was vitally committed to a
teacher/leader and/or movement. The terms themselves did not determine the type
of discipleship; the type of discipleship was determined by the type of leader of
movement or teaching to which the disciple was committed. The types of
discipleship covered the spectrum from philosophical (Philo) to technical
(scribes) to sectarian (Pharisees) to revolutionary (Zealots and Menahem) to
eschatological (John the Baptist). The terms were general enough to be used for
all of the above. . . .

\textit{ מקהנהול became a convenient vehicle to carry Jesus’ concept of vital
attachment to himself personally. He was his disciples’ supreme teacher and
leader (Mt 23:7-10). They were not to be disciples of any other person, and were
never to advance to being called rabbi. They were to make disciples of all nations,
but all new disciples were to be taught what Jesus had previously taught them (Mt
28:18-20). \textit{מקהנהול was able to become a specialized term for Jesus’ followers
because the common usage was general enough to hold the specialized
connotations the Christian community appended to it.}\textsuperscript{132}

Wilkins cautions of a distinctive difference for disciples of Christ: “The disciple
of Jesus is not like the disciple of the rabbi who could himself hope to be a rabbi

\textsuperscript{130} Mt 8:20.

\textsuperscript{131} Wilkins, \textit{Matthew}, 347.

\textsuperscript{132} Michael J. Wilkins, “The Concept of Disciple in Matthew’s Gospel: As Reflected in the Use of
It should be noted that Wilkins prefers the transliteration \textit{talmidh} compared to Vander Laan’s \textit{talmid}.
someday. The disciple will always remain a disciple of the Lord. . . .”

The fact that Christian disciples will never attain to the level of their Master does not mean that Christian disciples do not teach other disciples. Wilkins highlights the final phrase in Jesus’ Great Commission, “teaching them to obey everything I have commanded you,” and instructs on its meaning, saying:

The pronoun “them” indicates that everyone who has become a disciple of Jesus is to be involved in the process of discipleship. Access to education by an esteemed rabbi was normally reserved for the privileged men in rabbinic Judaism. Some rabbis denied young girls even the basics of Torah instruction. But Jesus once again breaks down all barriers to indicate that all of his disciples—women and men, Gentile and Jew, poor or rich—must be taught to obey everything he has commanded. This means that everyone who has heard the gospel message and has responded by believing on Jesus for eternal life is a disciple/Christian/believer, all of which are virtually synonymous terms (cf. Acts 2:44; 4:32; 5:14; 6:1-7; 11:26; 26:28).

Today many incorrectly use the title “disciple” to refer to a person who is more committed than other Christians or to those involved in special “discipleship programs.” But we can see from Jesus’ commission that all Christians are disciples. It is just that some are obedient disciples, while others are not. . . .

The activity of discipleship is involved with “teaching.” New disciples are to be taught the rudimentary elements of the Christian life, while more advanced teaching is given to mature disciples as they advance in the Christian life. But the emphasis is not simply on acquiring knowledge; the distinguishing feature is always that disciples are to obey or conform their lives to the teaching. Obedience was the hallmark of Jesus’ disciples. . . .

Wilkins points out, “All disciples, new and mature, are to be taught to ‘obey everything that I [Jesus] have commanded,’ so that they increasingly become like him.”

Jesus taught his disciples to follow, to watch, listen, learn—and emulate. He taught them to teach others using the same techniques: be with, walk beside, spend time,

---

133 Wilkins, “The Concept of Disciple,” 146.

134 Wilkins, Matthew, 956.

135 Ibid., 956-957.
share space, serve together, suffer collectively, copy, and then model. “Discipleship was at the heart of Jesus’ ministry, so it’s not surprising that the word *disciple* is used more than 250 times in the New Testament. In fact, the New Testament is the story of disciples written by disciples who wanted to make disciples. And those disciples dramatically changed the world!” On the other hand, the word “Christian” is found only three times in the New Testament, “and was first introduced to refer precisely to the disciples . . . (Acts 11:26).” Jesus was less a teacher of his disciples and more of a man hard at work allowing others to witness what he was doing. Jesus was a teacher, to be sure, but he did so by turning experiences and teachable moments into life lessons that would ultimately change the world through those who were watching and learning. This is the essence of discipleship—to live a life of example, to show the way, leading, teaching, and helping to change lives along the way.

**Christian Predecessors**

The disciples wanted to be like Jesus. They wanted to know the things he knew, do the things he did, think the way he thought, and feel the things in his heart. The disciples wanted more of him. Willard clarifies:

> From the beginning the church linked the desire for more of God to intentional practices, relationships and experiences that gave people space in their lives to “keep company” with Jesus. . . . The basic rhythm of disciplines (or rule) for the first believers is found in Acts 2:42: “They devoted themselves to the apostle’s teaching [a practice] and to the fellowship [relationships], to the breaking of bread [an experience] and to prayer [another practice].”

---

136 Vander Laan, 11.


From the first-century church, down through the ages, church leaders, theologians, and fellow disciples have searched for ways to help adult disciples grow closer to the Master, Jesus Christ. Thomas à Kempis (1380-1471) encouraged disciples to live lives that emulated Christ himself. Thomas wrote, “Whoever wishes to understand fully the words of Christ must try to pattern his whole life on that of Christ.”

His book, *The Imitation of Christ*, considered the second-most read book next to the Bible, has guided many adult disciples in their journey of faith and development as they worked to imitate Christ by following his teachings and his actions. Action and imitation were the principal elements he embraced.

Ignatius of Loyola (1491-1556) created a series of spiritual exercises to help disciples grow closer to Christ primarily through contemplation. In his book, *The Spiritual Exercises*, Ignatius addresses an ancient practice known as the *Daily Examen* in which disciples take a moment at the end of the day to reflect on their day and how God may have been present or may have influenced them. *Daily Examen* questions might be: (1) For what moment today am I the most grateful? (2) When did I give and receive love today? (3) When did I have the deepest sense of connection with God today? (4) When did I have a sense of connection or disconnection with others, today? For Ignatius, contemplation and meditation were elements in his personal, daily journey with Christ.

Brother Lawrence (1611-1691) strove to live every moment of his adult life in the presence of God. The book, *The Practice of the Presence of God*, written from conversations with Brother Lawrence as well as from letters he wrote, describes how

---


140 Calhoun, 53.
mundane, everyday labor could be an act of worship and connection to God. “The time of business does not with me differ from the time of prayer; and in the noise and clatter of my kitchen, while several persons are at the same time calling for different things, I possess God in as great tranquility as if I were upon my knees at the blessed sacrament.”¹⁴¹ For Brother Lawrence, the “habitual sense of God’s presence” and offering his daily tasks as worship were vital elements of his discipleship.

Many of the early church fathers and mothers instituted disciplines or practices meant to be embraced by disciples seeking to grow closer to Christ and become more conformed to his image. Benedict of Nursia (480-457) showed how to have a “Rule of Life.” John of the Cross (1542-1591) spoke of purity for Christian’s souls. Julian of Norwich (1343-1413) taught about prayer, and Madame Guyon (1648-1717) showed how to pray Scripture. Catherine of Genoa (1447-1510) helped Christians understand the concept of “waiting” for God. Those who wanted to grow as disciples have developed practices to help them—and others—grow in Christlikeness.

Tools Ancient and Modern

As the church became more organized, and more institutional, other means were necessary to educate, if not disciple, the masses. Catechisms, early religious instruction considered mainly to be associated with the Reformation, but having some presence in the medieval church, helped catechumen understand and embrace the Christian faith.¹⁴² Martin Luther’s “Lesser Catechism” of 1529 was written “specifically for purpose, and


shows a lightness of touch, an ease of communication, and a general simplicity of expression. . . Its question-and-answer format was ideally suited to learning by rote, and the work was widely adopted. . ." 143 Catechisms were written to teach children and converts “both the unifying doctrines of Christianity and the distinctives of the particular Protestant denomination,” and the genre was ultimately adopted by the Catholic Church, and still remains in use in the modern church. 144

Creeds and confessions of faith were written primarily to clarify misunderstandings or outright heresies within the church, yet became another instrument for teaching the adult believer. “The basic pattern within the Reformation was thus to acknowledge Scripture as possessing primary and universal authority; the creeds as having secondary and universal authority; and the confessions as having tertiary and local authority (in that such confessions were only regarded as binding by a denomination or church in a specific region).” 145

Author and theologian, Roger Olson, professor of theology at the George W. Truett Theological Seminary at Baylor University, teaches:

The writings of the early church fathers often contain versions of what was known to them as the ‘Rule of Faith’ or simply the ‘Apostolic Teaching.’ Second, third- and fourth-century church fathers (some of whom were also bishops—overseers of groups of churches) Irenaeus, Tertullian, Origen, Cyprian, Athanasius, Basil of Caesarea, Gregory of Nazianzus and Gregory of Nyssa especially expressed the unity of Christian belief as a relatively brief ‘Rule’ (canon, standard) with various expressions. . . The Reformers wrote their own updated rules of faith that often included affirmation of the Apostles’ Creed and the Nicene Creed and newer statements of faith and catechisms. . . 146

143 McGrath, 61-62.
144 Olson, 38.
145 McGrath, 63.
146 Olson, 38.
Creeds could be learned by rote and recited as a congregation, and might be considered the adult version of the rote learning of catechism for children.

Early hymns of the faith were another instrument used to teach the nature and work of the Trinity to adult disciples. The early Christian church used “psalms, hymns, and spiritual songs” to worship and to teach. \(^{147}\) It is quite possible that the apostle Paul included stanzas from early hymns in his epistles, including, “Wake up, O sleeper, rise from the dead, and Christ will shine on you.” \(^{148}\) Paul’s letter to the Philippians contained a beautifully lyric poem that most likely was an early hymn:

Who, being in very nature God,
   did not consider equality with God something to be grasped;
but made himself nothing
   taking the very nature of a servant,
being made in human likeness.
And being found in appearance as a man,
   he humbled himself
and became obedient to death—even death on a cross!

Therefore God exalted him to the highest place
   and gave him the name that is above every name,
that at the name of Jesus every knee should bow,
   in heaven and on earth and under the earth,
and every tongue confess that Jesus Christ is Lord,
   to the glory of God the Father. \(^{149}\)

Some ancient Jewish folk song melodies are still found in modern hymnals today, and may have been used in the first-century church of Jerusalem. The *Gloria Patri* from the 2\(^{nd}\) century, Plainsong chants from the 3\(^{rd}\) century, and the *Te Deum* from the 4\(^{th}\) century are used in worship services nearly every Sunday around the world. A form of  

\(^{147}\) Eph 5:19.  
\(^{148}\) Eph 5:14.  
\(^{149}\) Phil 2:6-11.
plainsong known as Gregorian chants, from the 9th and 10th centuries, are still heard in modern-day liturgical services. Songs from early in Christian history have stood the test of time because they have either been based on Scripture, or they have spoken to the hearts and minds of disciples in ageless ways. The Latin and modern English versions of the *Gloria Patri*, below, show the timeless beauty of these lyrics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original Latin text</th>
<th>English translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Gloria Patri, et Filio,</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>et Spiritui Sancto.</em></td>
<td>Glory be to the Father, and to the Son, and to the Holy Ghost.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Sicut erat in principio, et nunc,</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>et semper, et in saecula saeculorum.</em></td>
<td>As it was in the beginning, is now, and ever shall be, world without end.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Amen.</em></td>
<td>Amen.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2.1. Latin and English translation of *Gloria Patri*  

Many early theologians such as John of Damascus (696-754), Theodulph of Orleans (760-821), Bernard of Clairvaux (1091-1153), Francis of Assisi (1182-1226), Richard of Chichester (1197-1253), and Martin Luther (1483-1546), have penned hymns of the church, and many of their stanzas are still in use. These following lyrics, attributed to Bernard of Clairvaux, are some of hymnody’s most beautiful words, and have helped countless disciples learn of Christ’s love:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original Latin text</th>
<th>English translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Jesu, dulcis memoria,</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>dans vera cordis gaudia:</em>&lt;br&gt; <em>sed super mel et omnia ejus dulcis praesentia.</em></td>
<td>Jesus, the very thought of Thee,&lt;br&gt; With sweetness fills my breast;&lt;br&gt; But sweeter far Thy face to see&lt;br&gt; And in Thy presence rest.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2.2. Latin and English translation of Bernard of Clairvaux’s hymn  

---

Hymns became so popular for use in worship and for the creative and enjoyable reception of knowledge that in order to keep the hymnody of the church intact and to easily reuse these wonderful teaching tools, they were collected and printed in songbooks or “hymnals.” Perhaps the first such song book was the Genevan Psalter (1551), followed by the Scottish Psalter (1665), Geistliche Kirchengesäng (1599), Stralsund Gesangbuch (1665), Münster Gesangbuch (1677), Neuvermehrtes Gesangbuch (1693), Psalteriolum Cantionu, Catholicarum (1710), Katholisches Gesangbuch (1774), the Gesangbuch der Herzogl (1784), and many more throughout the centuries.

Many well-known and well-loved hymn-writers gave the church some of the best-written, theologically sound, and spiritually moving lyrics. Writers such as Isaac Watts, John Wesley, Charles Wesley, John Newton, William Cowper, and Augustus Montague Toplady, all writing from the mid-1600s to the late 1700s, used hymns in remarkable ways to touch the hearts of disciples, and to teach the church the intricacies of theology, doctrine, and practice through lyric verse and moving melody. Although many hymns have fallen into disuse in the modern church, Christians around the world can still turn to hymnody for vital lessons in discipleship.

Toplady’s great hymn, “Rock of Ages,” still teaches those disciples today who are willing to dig deeply into the rich meanings of the stanzas.

```
Rock of Ages, cleft for me, Let me hide myself in Thee;
Let the water and the blood, From Thy wounded side which flowed,
Be of sin the double cure, Save from wrath and make me pure.152
```

---


Following Christ

Perhaps the most important aspect of learning to be a follower of Christ was and is through the process of being discipled—being with, following, and emulating the Master in order to learn what he taught and what he did. Willard explains:

When Jesus walked among humankind there was a certain simplicity to being his disciple. Primarily it meant to go with him, in an attitude of study, obedience, and imitation. There were no correspondence courses. One knew what to do and what it would cost. Simon Peter exclaimed: “Look, we’ve left behind everything and followed you?” (Mark 10:28). Family and occupations were deserted for long periods to go with Jesus as he walked from place to place announcing, showing, and explaining the governance of God. Disciples had to be with him to learn how to do what he did.\footnote{Willard, \textit{Spirit of the Disciplines}, 260-261.}

In today’s church, following Christ requires working under the tutelage of a discipler—a fellow traveler on the journey of Christian faith, who is further ahead on the path of discipleship—who is able to coach and advise on how best to follow the Master, Jesus. A discipler is not a master; Jesus is the Master, the discipler is simply someone who helps “younger” disciples in their spiritual growth and maturity. A discipler helps lead in the requisite study and disciplines necessary to develop in Christlikeness; a discipler also models and teaches a life of spiritual introspection and discipline.

The Trappist monk, Thomas Merton, supported a union between theological study and a life of spirituality, suggesting “we must not separate intellectual study of divinely revealed truth and contemplative experience of that truth as if they could never have anything to do with one another. On the contrary, they are simply two aspects of the same thing. . . .”\footnote{Thomas Merton, \textit{Seeds of Contemplation} (Wheatampstead, UK: Anthony Clarke, 1972), 197-198.} There are those who would criticize Merton’s embracing of intellectual
study and the new-monastic experience, but this blending of the traditional with the modern enriched his life, and has been beneficial to many. Richard Foster writes of Merton: “I am constantly pleased at how applicable Merton’s writings are to the non-monastic world in which most of us live. . . . We need the wealth of experiences and hard-won insights of all who are seeking to follow Christ and become his friend.”

While all Christians are disciples and all Christians are called to disciple other disciples (Mt 28:18-20), not all disciples are called to leave family, home, employment, or give away all they own. Wilkins reveals:

“One of the more striking examples . . . is Joseph of Arimathea, who was a disciple of Jesus but retained his position in society, along with his great wealth, and offered an indispensible service to Jesus at the moment of greatest need that only he could offer (Mt 27:57-60). Whatever our profession, whether preacher or plumber, teacher or technician, hotel maid or hospital orderly, discipleship means that we place as the priority of our lives joining with Jesus in reaching our daily world with the good news of life in the kingdom of heaven. . . . We each have a privileged place of ministry that is unique to following Jesus in our own daily lives. 156

Summary from Tradition

Discipleship, in its many varied forms, has been around since Old Testament times. The older and wiser have always trained the younger and malleable. Tools and techniques have been developed—many of which are timeless and of benefit still today—all of which were born out of a personal desire to grow closer to the Master, Jesus Christ.

This researcher has found that, (1) to be a disciple means to be “exercised” in a discipline by the Master, Jesus, through a disciple a few steps ahead on the journey; (2)

---


156 Wilkins, Matthew, 187.
disciples grow to disciple others, yet never try to attain to the level of the Master, but remain his disciples forever; (3) all believers are disciples, but discipleship requires a personal commitment; (4) following Christ is neither glamorous nor easy; (5) not all disciples are called to leave home, family, or occupation; (6) there are many helpful tools and techniques developed by disciples who have gone before which can help disciples today develop; and (7) discipleship can be both active and contemplative.

**Experience**

The final area of exploration into the foundational aspects of this research project is that of *experience*. Experience is God at work in the life of a disciple, revealing himself and his will through the mundane and the extraordinary occurrences of life. Experience is also the understanding of when one has wandered far from God and into self-made problems and shortfalls. Alister McGrath writes that “spirituality is generally understood to mean the experiencing of God and the transformation of lives as outcomes of that experience.”\(^{157}\) All of one’s personal experiences coalesce into a framework on which life is built, and into a lens through which one views the world.

Moreover, shared experiences in community help shape the individual. People learn from each other, learn together, and begin to sense patterns and lessons that shape a shared present and future. Plans are made based on experiences—both individual experiences and shared experiences—and those plans are carried to completion to create new experiences. It is these experiences—experiences in adult education in general, and discipleship in particular—that this researcher will briefly explore.

---

\(^{157}\) McGrath, 109.
From 1975 to 1980, this researcher spent five years in an undergraduate program to become a certified teacher in K-12 education. There were the requisite liberal arts courses, but there were also two or three teacher-education courses every year. The teacher-education courses included a number of seminars and workshops, field observation, internships, and practicums where learning theories, teaching methods, and educational philosophies were read about and researched. This researcher learned that:

1. new teachers tend to teach the way they were taught, regardless of training otherwise;
2. teaching involves more than information download; there is a need for experiential and active learning;
3. every student is different—a difficult lesson to fully grasp even with professors reiterating it regularly;
4. teachers finally find a "groove" that works, as long as that "groove" includes a little of everything previously listed above.

A major lesson learned through teacher education was the effectiveness of different modes of impartation and the degree to which learners retain material presented. For example, many educators insist on assigning large quantities of reading, and present information in the form of lecture. However, the question must be asked, "How well do people learn by reading, and how well do they learn by listening to lectures?" Research has shown that the majority of adult learners remember:

20% of what we read
30% of what we hear
40% of what we see
50% of what we say
60% of what we do
90% of what we see, hear, say, and do.158

---

It is clear that standard reading assignments may yield minimal positive benefit for learners. Lecture-based teaching yields marginal retention. The combination of reading and lecture are still less effective than having the learners engage their verbal skills in learning—discussing, asking and answering questions, and/or verbalizing opinions. Of the greatest benefit and maximum effectiveness is the combination of aural, visual, verbal, and kinesthetic activities.

This has enormous bearing on teaching techniques and practice. In terms of adult discipleship, this information should be drilled into the heart and mind of every pastor, small group leader, mentor, spiritual director, and discipler. Adult learners who are given a book to read will not learn very much; if that book has pictures, charts, and graphs, they will do better. If the book is studied in a group-setting with lively discussions, learning improves that much more. Add some role-playing, creativity, hands-on activities, reframing/rephrasing, some “field experience,” and students taking turns presenting parts of the lesson, and learning, retention, and assimilation increase exponentially.

The studies on long-term recall also suggest that the more active and experiential the learning environment, the more a learner recalls. For example, after three weeks a learner will recall 70% of what she is told, 72% of what she is told and shown, and 85% of what she is told, shown, and actually experienced. After three months, the learner will only recall 10% of what she was told, 32% of what she was told and shown, yet recalls 65% of what she was told, shown, and experienced. The more active and experiential, the better the retention and recall.159

This researcher read these kinds of facts in an undergraduate program of study, taught primarily by teachers who preferred didactic methods, by which this researcher means lecture-based, non-open environments, non-experiential methods. There was a need for experiences in the Socratic method, the scientific method, self-directed learning with goal-setting, experiential classroom experiences, a Gestalt environment with a wide range of options, and the ability to make noise, move around, use one’s hands, challenge assumptions, test theories, and choose a style of learning that best fit the individual.

It would seem that any adult education that took the above two tables to heart would be very successful; adult discipleship, this researcher believes, would benefit from this approach as well. After all, it is the model Jesus used to teach. Parables challenged entrenched mindsets and startled the learner into new thinking; hyperbole grabbed the attention and shook adult learners by their proverbial shirt collars; hands-on, spit and mud, throwing nets, exorcising demons, money-changer-chasing activities spurred the imagination and challenged the intellect as well as the status quo. Jesus was a masterful experiential learning facilitator, and his disciples changed the world. Are teachers, pastors, and leaders in the church today not all called to do the same?160 “Whether called ‘cooperative,’ ‘collaborative,’ ‘student-centered,’ ‘participatory,’ ‘action-oriented,’ or simply ‘active’ learning, using . . . activities and exercises aimed at enhancing or extending student involvement in learning is limited only by the ingenuity and creative imagination of teachers willing to embrace their use.”161

160 Jn 14:12; 2 Tm 2:2; Mt 28:18-20.

Pastoral Counseling

This researcher also earned a master’s degree in family studies in 1993, logging over 200 hours of marriage and family therapy practicum, as well as writing and developing family ministry curricula for use in church and camp settings. This master’s program was taught by a Christian faculty who promoted the need to be client-centered, empathic, and faith-oriented, while also being strategic and creative. The marriage and family faculty were both experienced and gifted at imparting knowledge. Still, much of what this researcher has found successful in pastoral counseling over the years has come through trial and error, hard knocks, and serendipitous discoveries.

Throughout a pastoral career spanning nearly two decades, this researcher has coached and counseled many couples preparing to marry, those already married, those contemplating divorce, and those dealing with parenting issues. This researcher has also created and held numerous family workshops and marriage-enrichment retreats. Through the years, it has become apparent that there are multiple roles that must be played in pastoral counseling. This researcher believes the same roles might be true for discipling of adult believers.

David Clutterbuck, in his book *Learning Alliances*, provides a model of behaviors and alliances in adult learning—what he terms “dimensions of mentoring.”¹⁶² This researcher believes these same behaviors, alliances, and dimensions also show the multiple roles that are present in the work of teaching, training, and discipling adult believers.

Within Clutterbuck’s model can be seen four roles in leading adults: the directive-challenging coach (quadrant A), the directive and nurturing guardian (quadrant B), the non-directive nurturing counselor (quadrant C), and the non-directive yet challenging networker/facilitator (quadrant D). Of course, there are no clearly defined lines between these diverse roles. In this researcher’s experience, this researcher has moved from coach to counselor and back to coach a number of times within a conversation spanning only a few minutes. As a guardian, special care is taken to safeguard emotionally fragile people or situations while still carefully and gently influencing. This is different from counseling, which is more client-centered and self-directed with less overt influence by the counselor. As a facilitator, the influence is non-directive as opposed to the coach, who is more directive; the facilitator allows the client to steer the progress and to speed up or slow down as needed, whereas the coach is a bit more in control of direction and speed. Disciplers working with adult disciples in the church today need to be made aware of these changing and fluctuating roles in order to understand why some techniques work some of the time, and then stop working at other times, and why some disciples move

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Influence (directive)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intellectual need</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(challenging)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional need</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(nurturing)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Influence (non-directive)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

from pliable to resistant and back again almost inexplicably. Each person is different, each situation is different, each day is different, each challenge presents new opportunities and new obstacles when discipling.

It is this researcher’s experience that skills in developmental mentoring are needed in order for adult discipleship to excel and be the most beneficial. The term “developmental” simply means that people are growing and changing; life application is made, and lives are changed and transformed. The term “mentoring” refers to that combination of roles, from coaching to counseling and from facilitating to guarding. “We define true developmental mentoring as ‘an agreed activity between the mentor and client, where goals are generated by and for the client, where the process is person-centered and the learning outcome is transformation.’”163

This kind of discipleship is urgently needed today. Jesus is the Master, and all believers are disciples on the way who are expected to disciple those who are a few steps behind them on the journey. Mutually agreed-upon goals, discipleship training that is personally tailored to each disciple, a desired outcome of life-transformation, and careful and considered use of the flexible roles of counselor/coach, facilitator/guardian are techniques all disciplers need to learn and utilize.

Curriculum that Misses the Point

Unfortunately, experience has shown that the vast majority of discipleship material on the market today pays no attention at all to what this researcher has just related from personal and pastoral experience. Too much of the time, the emphasis has been on evangelism, with little thought given to discipleship. One well-known book, The

163 Brockbank and McGill, 63.
Master's Plan for Making Disciples, has actually very little to say about growing or
developing disciples. It is primarily about church growth, and is published by a group
known simply as “Church Growth Press.”\[^\text{164}\] This is not to say that there is anything
wrong with evangelism; there is a great need for materials to train people on how to share
faith and lead people to Christ. However, Jesus commissioned his disciples to make
disciples, not grow churches. Too much of the time the church seems overly concerned
with leading people to Christ, and far less concerned with growing people in Christ. This
researcher wonders if the church today were truly committed to the Great Commission,
would there be the mega-churches and multi-site churches seen today.

Some books and curricula have emphasized discipleship, but touted it as
something attained beyond becoming a believer. In this researcher’s own experience of
thought—and this former way of thinking takes over very easily—becoming a Christian
has to do with justification, and discipleship has to do with sanctification, which is a very
neatly packaged way of thinking until one stops to realize that this shows it is possible to
be a Christian without being a disciple. This researcher does not believe that is possible,
but it plays out in language use when least expected:

The best of current literature on discipleship either states outright or assumes that
the Christian may not be a disciple at all—even after a lifetime as a church
member. A widely used book, The Lost Art of Disciple Making, presents the
Christian life on three possible levels: the convert, the disciple, and the worker.
There is a process for bringing persons to each level, it states. Evangelizing
produces converts, establishing or follow-up produces disciples, and equipping
produces workers. Disciples and workers are said to be able to renew the cycle by
evangelizing, while only workers can make disciples through follow-up.

The picture of church life presented by this book conforms generally to
American Christian practice. But does that model not make discipleship
something entirely optional? Clearly it does, just as whether or not the disciple

will be a worker is an option. Vast numbers of converts today thus exercise the options permitted by the message they hear: they choose not to become—at least do not choose to become—disciples of Jesus Christ.\textsuperscript{165}

There are many fine small group materials available today, and many of them hold great promise for discipleship if used in the right setting and by a person committed to discipling others. However, very few of these materials contain an actual plan—even implicitly—for a discipler to systematically guide disciples through goal-setting, skill or behavior mastery, accountability, experiential learning, measurement and evaluation, or assist in journeying through the growth process over years until the disciple is ready to begin discipling others. The entire small group “movement” of recent decades seems more concerned with church growth, or with making the large church feel smaller and more intimate, than in growing true disciples.

Many resources have come from para-church organizations like the Navigators and InterVarsity, ostensibly marketed for discipleship, but with little or no discipleship value. One striking example is NavPress’ *Discipleship Journal’s 101 Best Small-Group Ideas*, which contain very little that relates to discipling others in the ways this researcher has found in Scripture, through reason, or within the tradition of the church through the ages.\textsuperscript{166} The first part is subtitled: “Best Ways to Plant, Water, and Grow Healthy Small Groups,” the second part is subtitled: “Hands-On Ideas for Immediate Use in Small Groups,” but no mention is made anywhere about rubber-meets-the-road discipleship. To be generous, this researcher concedes that it might not be a book about discipleship; it may simply be about small groups. However, since it is published by the Navigators, and


carries the “Discipleship Journal” moniker prominently, one would suspect some kind of nod to discipling, but one would be incorrect.

The good news is that, in the hands of someone trained and ready to be a discipler of adult disciples, nearly any curriculum or book on best practices for believers can be made effective for discipling. In this respect, through personal experience, this researcher has great regard for many of the small group materials written by the Willow Creek Association, by Saddleback Valley Community Church, and by Lyman Coleman and Serendipity Press. Formational books that this researcher has found to be of great benefit for discipling include Richard J. Foster’s *Celebration of Discipline*, Robert M. Mulholland Jr.’s *Invitation to a Journey*, and Eugene H. Peterson’s *A Long Obedience in the Same Direction*. Bill Hull’s *The Complete Book of Discipleship* and Greg Ogden’s *Transforming Discipleship* are two vital handbooks this researcher has found for training and guiding disciplers in the important task of understanding and leading others in discipleship relationships.

**Summary from Experience**

This researcher has discovered through personal and pastoral experience that: (1) the field of education holds great promise for training and equipping disciplers; (2) adult learners retain 90% of what they see, hear, say, and do—holding much promise for discipleship; (3) discipling involves more than sharing information; there is a need for experiential learning; (4) every disciple is different; (5) there are multiple roles that must be played in the discipling of adult believers, including coach, counselor, facilitator, and guardian; (6) skills in developmental mentoring are needed in order for adult disciplers to
be the most effective; and (7) most curricula is useful and can be made effective when
used by someone trained to be a true discipler.

Summary of Foundational Framework

The four elements of the Wesleyan Quadrilateral have provided the framework
for presenting this researcher’s foundational understanding of discipleship. The
Quadrilateral has Scripture as one facet of understanding. Many might believe that the
other three facets, reason, tradition, and experience, should also be reserved for
theological reflection alone. This researcher does not hold to that restriction.

The facet of reason suggests the process whereby one comes to a more full
understanding by comparing all facts and measuring both quantifiable as well as
intangible or unquantifiable ideas and concepts. The Quadrilateral would suggest that one
may come to know something of God through what one does not know, and/or through
what one postulates and seeks to understand. This researcher has found that reasoning
from biblical, theological, and extra-biblical sources such as education and business
provides a broader understanding of significant elements in discipleship.

One such element, that comes from outside of theological study, from the field of
adult education, is that pastors, teachers, and disciplers must work “to assist adults to
learn in a way that enhances their capability to function as self-directed learners.”

In writing this dissertation, this researcher was drawn to the field of adult education, and did
significant research into how adults learn. This research can be found in Appendix A of
this dissertation.

167 Mezirow, *Transformative Dimensions*, 199. This quote appeared earlier in this chapter.
The same must be said for the facet of experience from the Quadrilateral. Some may mistakenly limit experience to only those experiences that have a spiritual or formational aspect. This does not have to be so. Many experiences that are not “spiritual” in nature can contribute to one’s understanding of God. Likewise, many experiences in life—that have no spiritual component—can lead to a better understanding of what it means to be a disciple, and how the discipling of adults can effectively be done.

Adult learners must experience what it is they are trying to assimilate into their lives. Hands-on learning must go hand-in-hand with reading and listening. Those involved in discipling others must realize that a combination of techniques and styles must be employed in helping others walk with Christ. There is much to learn from the experiences of those who are learning to walk with Christ as well as those who are on the forefront of adult education.

The implications found in the study of Scripture, reason, tradition, and experience have led this researcher to delve deeply into how adults learn, examining what others are finding about adult learners and discipleship, and discovering how others may be employing teaching techniques that can be assimilated and deployed in the discipleship of adult followers of Christ.
CHAPTER THREE
REVIEW OF LITERATURE

In the study of adult Christian discipleship and the search to uncover key behaviors and activities that may be effective in helping adult believers to engage or reengage in spiritual growth while allowing them to effectively measure their progress, this researcher has found the pool of informative resources to be virtually inexhaustible. Writers and researchers in adult learning theories, engagement theories, psychology, sociology, and human development provide copious research material, much of it written within the last decade. The difficulty then becomes how to select the gems of research. Should the research focus primarily on those books and articles that support this researcher’s own thoughts, or should the research focus primarily on studies that are in juxtaposition to this researcher’s thought processes and beliefs? Since discipleship seems to be educational in nature perhaps the research should be focused upon education. However, there is much to learn from the sciences that study the human mind, mental states, personality, behavior, and social interactions.

The determination was made that there should be a balanced approach. To fully understand adult discipleship, research and review must encompass multiple scientific theories of human development and function. Learning styles, teaching techniques, and learning theories must be explored. Some of the existing material on discipleship will be reviewed, as well as concepts regarding the fundamental skills or behaviors of the
relational aspect of teaching-learning. Many of the sources could be considered as outside
the norm for Christian research, and much of the research suggest theories that have little
to do with Christian discipleship. Still, application can be made to education in general,
and the application to Christian discipleship then becomes reasonably logical.

This researcher must mention what will, undoubtedly, be seen as a possible
detraction from this review of literature: some of the authors studied, and/or the scientists
they reference, come from belief systems other than Christianity. Some make no
statement of faith. Some are self-proclaimed atheists. Many of the thoughts expressed
show a distinct preference for belief in Darwin’s theories regarding evolution. References
to “faith” may not specifically refer to the Christian faith. Some scientists believe there
are no fixed or absolute truths. In short, not all literature reviewed is Christian literature.

This researcher believes that there is much to learn about, and from, the sciences
dedicated to the study of human development, psychology, sociology, and education, and
to ignore any source simply because of an author’s or researcher’s personal belief system
would be unfairly restrict the research, and the results would be biased and unproductive.
There is much to be learned from scientists and philosophers, regardless of their view of
God. In fact, this researcher believes there may be much that can be learned of God
through the studies of those who choose not to believe in God.

Though many Christians do not subscribe to the varied scientific theories of
evolution, that does not mean one cannot learn something from the scientists who reject
creationism and/or intelligent design, and choose, instead, to espouse purely scientific
evolutionary theories. This researcher posits that evolution does exist in the sense that
cultures can and do evolve, theories evolve, and techniques of education have and will
continue to evolve. In this sense, Dierdre Barrett’s work on supernormal stimuli, which will be covered briefly within this chapter, can be used to show how knowledge acquisition has changed and adapted to supernormal stimulation, while more traditional educational approaches have been eschewed or discarded. This is, in essence, educational evolution.\(^{168}\)

This researcher is not subscribing to anti-Creationism or an approach to learning that is devoid of God; there is simply so much to learn, and no source is ignored because its germ does not originate in, or agree with, the Christian Scriptures.

**Anthropology**

As this researcher established in the previous chapter, from the earliest times learning was primarily a function of one who was younger and inexperienced receiving needed information as it was passed on from a teacher who was older and more learned. Whether in the passing on of specialized skills or trades, or the sharing of more esoteric knowledge, this mode of master-to-disciple education was critical because much of the knowledge had to be passed on by word-of-mouth, rote memory, and hands-on demonstration because of the rarity of scrolls, parchments, or codices. Studying daily, walking alongside, repetition, and practice until the new skill or knowledge was fully ingrained were not only an accepted and advantageous form of teaching and learning, it was also quite effective.

Today, society has evolved in such a way that many learners have difficulty learning in this way. With the advent of the printing press and the mass production of books, the dissemination of information has made it possible for learners to have

knowledge at their fingertips, and the one-on-one aspect of the master-disciple relationship became less critical. The information age has provided high-tech machines that have given society instantaneous access and virtually unlimited information storage and retrieval, effectively eliminating the need for memorization or rote learning, and further eroding the need for master-disciple interaction. Sesame Street and other television programs taught children to learn via high energy music and skits, and this energetic, attention-grabbing presentation became the favored mode for many learners. Madison Avenue has developed the ability to present, explain, and sell nearly any item in 60-second, 30-second, and even 15-second commercials. Television and the Internet have reduced the typical attention span by way of shorter and shorter sound bites and flashy presentation. This has changed the way in which many people learn, and undermined the master-disciple learning environment in such a way that it is no longer valued, and largely ineffective. It is not so much about preferences, but about the effects of 

**supernormal stimulus.** Dierdre Barrett explains that

Nobel laureate Niko Tinbergen coined this term after his animal research revealed that experimenters could create phony targets that appealed to instincts more than the original objects for which they had evolved. He studied birds that lay small, pale blue eggs speckled with gray and found they preferred to sit on giant, bright blue ones with black polka dots. The essence of the supernormal stimulus is that the exaggerated imitation can exert a stronger pull than the real thing.¹⁶⁹

Society has become accustomed to short bursts of information, presented in computer-enhanced color, computer generated special effects, surround-sound, and spokespersons of over-exaggerated beauty using neuro-linguistic psychological manipulation. This method of capturing attention and imparting knowledge has been appropriated by the classroom (chalkboards have given way to Power-Point and smart-

---

¹⁶⁹ Barrett, 3.
boards), and the church (sermons are now peppered with videos, theatrical sketches, and audio-visual support). Society has come not only to favor these supernormal stimuli as the preferred method of learning, society has evolved to the point where it is nearly impossible to learn without that stimulation.

Barrett gives some helpful and hopeful advice on bringing these supernormal stimuli under control. “The pleasure mechanism can be shaped as to what it responds to. . . .”

Society can be re-trained, individuals can exercise willpower, and the way in which people learn can be restructured. This is a critical truth if discipleship the way Jesus intended is to be redeemed and reestablished to the highly preferred place of the master-disciple relationship. Barrett suggests:

In our generation, we need to begin to engineer our environment back to something more like what we were designed for and also to notice and resist whatever supernormal stimuli inevitably remain around us. . . . Individually, we must first identify supernormal stimuli. We do not have to just “listen to our instincts,” we can exercise willpower—almost a dirty word these days, but a trainable skill shown to help habitual problems. . . . In a world increasingly designed to stimulate hunger, sexual arousal, and acquisitiveness, chasing the supernormal is a losing game. . . . The key to most of our modern crises lies in “making the ordinary seem strange.” We are the one animal that can notice, “Hey, I am sitting on a polka-dotted plaster egg” and climb off.

Christian discipleship needs, perhaps requires, a more personal, slow, and steady relational approach than the bells, whistles, and fog machine approaches of today’s entertainment/education and information technology. Educational techniques have evolved beyond what the church-at-large knows and appreciates, and some effort must be made to reject the supernormal stimuli of this day and age and replace it with the more traditional, and effective, master-disciple relationships. Adult disciples can learn—must
be re-trained to learn—by personalized approaches that more closely fit the needs of the learner and the vital importance of the subject matter to be taught.

Howard Gardner, in his groundbreaking work on multiple intelligences, suggests that humans possess “several relatively autonomous human intellectual competences” that he describes as “frames of mind.”172 Each person is born with these multiple intelligences that cannot adequately be assessed by any standardized intelligence test because “the exact nature and breadth of each intellectual ‘frame’ has not so far been satisfactorily established, nor has the precise number of intelligences been fixed.”173 These multiple intelligences “can be fashioned and combined” within each of person “in a multiplicity of adaptive ways by individuals and cultures.”

The implications of Gardner’s study in terms of education are significant: each person possesses a unique combination of intelligences, and to adequately teach, instructors must be mindful of their learners’ personal configurations; to adequately learn, learners must be aware of their specific intelligence combination. Gardner writes, “In my view, it should be possible to identify an individual’s intellectual profile (or proclivities) at an early age and then draw upon this knowledge to enhance that person’s educational opportunities and options.”174

A “shotgun” approach to appealing to the widest variety of intelligences may be seen in how Madison Avenue creates commercials. Capturing an audience of several million people requires that the message appeals to the widest variety of frames of mind.

---


173 Ibid.

174 Ibid., 10.
But this flashy presentation simply cannot be sustained in the educational setting; some focus is required to reach the individual rather than the masses. To reach the individual, some effort must be made to understand how the individual is gifted, how the individual learns best, and how the individual is best motivated. This requires a relationship between the learner and the teacher, with give and take, trial and error, and copious course corrections in the teacher-learner interaction. The notion of multiple intelligences allows for a more broad approach in capturing the attention of multiple learners; it also suggests that a more deliberate, personal approach to teaching and learning is required. Gardner elucidates on how multiple intelligences can be used in an educational encounter:

. . . [T]he abilities entailed in an intelligence can be used as a means of acquiring information. Thus, individuals may learn through the exploitation of linguistic codes, of kinesthetic or spatial demonstrations, or of interpersonal bonds. Even as various intelligences can be exploited as means of transmission, the actual material to be mastered may itself fall squarely within the domain of a specific intelligence. . . . And so it turns out that our various intellectual competencies can serve both as means and message, as form and content.175

Such learning is, by necessity, highly individualized. This is something many western educational systems have yet to learn. In the current education systems employed in most of North America, large groups of learners, grouped by age rather than by learning style or ability, are led by one instructor using various methods aimed at the entire group. Gardner’s anthropological approach to education suggests that instruction should embrace all intelligences, but be aimed at a specific intelligence or combination of intelligences found within the individual learner.

What is more, multiple intelligences are best served through experiential learning, taking into account not only the specific intelligences, but also the means or media used

175 Gardner, 334.
to transmit knowledge, the loci or particular sites where learning best takes place, and the
agents or instructors who transmit the knowledge. As Gardner suggests:

Related to, but separate from the intelligences involved are the actual ways of learning exploited in one or another setting. Perhaps most basic is direct or “unmediated” learning: here the learner observes an adult activity in vivo. . . . Closely related to direct observation but involving more overt participation by the learner, are various forms of imitation, where the child observes then imitates (either immediately or subsequently) the actions performed by the model. . . . Much education, particularly in traditional societies, takes place on site: the learner is simply placed near (or gravitates toward) the model, who at the time is doing “his thing”. . . . A [final] variable in the equation of knowledge concerns the particular agents entrusted with the task. Classically, teachers are parents or grandparents, generally of the same sex as the learner; other relatives or members of one’s caste or clan may also serve as the repository of special wisdom.

These anthropological assumptions for the best utilization of multiple intelligences are very similar to the master-disciple, teaching-learning relationship used throughout the centuries of human development. Personal observation of a model or mentor is the basis of the master-disciple learning paradigm. Learning by imitation is another key ingredient in the master-disciple relationship that Jesus modeled in Scripture. In ancient Palestine, a young man sought out a rabbi, asking to attend the rabbi’s school. Jesus’ disciples walked beside him and lived life together every day, watching and imitating as they learned.

Business

In Chapter Two, this researcher has already referred to business theorist Chris Argyris’ multidimensional developmental process, and the writings on organizational behavior by David Kolb, Paul Hersey, and Kenneth Blanchard as examples of how businesses and organizations embrace adult teaching and training techniques to improve

176 Gardner, 334-339.
177 Ibid., 334-336.
their organizations. There is a great deal written about organizational development, systems training, interaction, and accountability within the business world, and it will benefit this research to touch on some additional resources that might have bearing.

Disney Imagineer Chuck Ballew, Senior Concept Designer in Creative Development at Disney writes,

Walt Disney continues to mentor all of us through the stories we hear and read about him. Walt believed in the generosity, optimism, and the goodness of human beings. Mentoring involves giving, the need to respect people and embrace the bond of humans. As a mentor, do not provide every answer. Rather, ask, “Why do you think it is that way?” A good mentor does not give the answers, but helps others figure it out for themselves.178

Disney Imagineers are one part engineer, and one part artist/child/story-teller; they are professional game-players who live, work, and play in the world’s largest playgrounds. How do they accomplish the colossal tasks of designing and building the kind of environment that appeals to so many? They help each other succeed. One of the most obvious ways, from their written testimonials, is that they help one another through on-the-job, experiential learning and mentoring. Mentors let the learner fail while at the same time praising the learner’s successes. Don Goodman, President of Walt Disney Imagineering, says that “you are never alone at Imagineering. No matter how difficult the problem, there is always someone who has seen worse and who knows just what to do.”179 Larry Nikolai, Senior Concept Designer, points out that, “you can accomplish a lot with just a few ingredients, as long as teamwork is at the top of your recipe.”180


179 Ibid., 64.

180 Ibid., 81.
Teacher-learner relationships require collaborative interaction, trial and error experimentation, and learning by doing. The Disney Imagineers raise up new Imagineers by the use of mentoring relationships that encourage failing well, because it is in the failure that larger lessons are learned. Mistakes in design and decoration are always fixed and perfected before the public has access to that part of the park, but behind the creative curtains, Imagineers are helping one another meet and exceed goals through synergistic relationships. Christian Hope, Concept Design Director in Creative Development states, “When we fail, we don’t stop. Sometimes you have to go backward in order to go forward, but we never stop.”

Imagineer David Mumford explains the importance of the fertile soil for growing the creative ideas that must emerge. “Before you can plant a garden, you’ve got to have dirt. But you don’t have to be in love with the dirt—you’re in love with what the landscape will look like when it’s done. You’re passionate about what the dirt will allow you to accomplish.” In adult discipleship, the hard work may not be fun, but the result is both God-honoring and helpful for living life today. Master-disciple relationships need to get down and get dirty in the soil of growing in Christ-likeness. One does not have to love the soil—just the garden that grows through these cooperative efforts.

Mel Silberman, Professor Emeritus of Adult and Organizational Development at Temple University, writes that, “In order to learn something well, it helps to hear it, see it, ask questions about it, and discuss it with others. Above all else, we need to ‘do it.’ That includes figuring out things by ourselves, coming up with examples, rehearsing

---

181 Imagineers, 69.
182 Ibid., 75.
skills, and doing tasks that depend on the knowledge we have.”183 Active training, according to Silberman, is when “the participants do most of the work. They use their brains—studying ideas, solving problems, and applying what they learn.”184

These teaching techniques are at the heart of adult discipleship. Involving all five senses in the learning, practicing, experiencing, making mistakes—all help the adult learner internalize the lessons learned. These active learning/teaching techniques work in business training, college classrooms (in “both synchronous and non-synchronous forms of e-learning”), and in one-on-one or small-group discipleship training.

Joyce Nilsson Orsini, Associate Professor of Management Systems at Fordham University and president of the W. Edwards Deming Institute has compiled a treasure-trove of wisdom from legendary business leader and management and quality control expert W. Edwards Deming. In her book The Essential Deming: Leadership Principles from the Father of Quality, Orsini writes that “best efforts without guidance lead to failure.”185 People left to their own devices on the production line, in the design lab, or in marketing will tend to fail because “the management . . . rid themselves of their responsibility by handing it over to people that are helpless to define quality and to improve processes. . . . The basic cause of sickness in American industry and resulting unemployment is failure of top management to manage. . . . Everyone simply doing his best is not the answer, either. It is first necessary that people know what to do.”186

183 Mel Silberman, 101 Ways to Make Training Active, 2nd ed. (San Francisco: Pfeiffer, a Wiley Imprint, 2005), 1.

184 Ibid.


186 Ibid., 14 &16.
This leadership example parallels this researcher’s initial assumptions that ongoing oversight and evaluation of growing disciples by those disciples who are further along in the journey of faith are critical ingredients in adult discipleship. Adult Christians try to grow, but are unsure of how to grow or what plan of study they should embrace. Without a mentor showing the way and giving needed feedback on the spiritual journey, adult disciples tend to stall in their spiritual formation. The fault does not lay in the immature believer, but in the mature believers failing to instruct and model their faith and to disciple those who need their experience and wisdom.

Deming makes some suggestions for western industry management that can equally be applied to Christian disciple-makers: (1) institute education in leadership; obligations, principles, and methods; (2) more careful selection of the [leadership] people in the first place; (3) better training and education after selection; (4) a leader, instead of being a judge, will be a colleague, counseling and leading his people on a day-to-day basis, learning from them and with them. Everybody must be on a team to work for improvement. . . . (5) A leader will spend hours with every one of his people. They will know what kind of help they need.187

Louis V. Gerstner, Jr. served as Chairman of the Board and CEO of IBM from 1993 to 2002, during which the company experienced a remarkable turnaround, which included seven consecutive years of profit and a tenfold rise in stock prices.188 Unlike Deming, Gerstner suggests that “the best leaders create high-performance cultures. They set demanding goals, measure results, and hold people accountable. They are change

187 Deming, 29-30.

agents, constantly driving their institutions to adapt and advance faster. . . . Personal leadership is about visibility.”

This runs counter to the concept of a discipler, if one uses Jesus as the model. Gerstner did not manage IBM or its people, he led them through intimidation. To save IBM, Gerstner cut nearly 200,000 employees and sold off nearly sixty percent of all IBM real estate, trimming tens of billions of dollars from the bloated, inefficient company. By all accounts, Gerstner saved IBM, and created a new and vibrant industry-leading company, but he did it by making no distinction between people, material, and real estate. Gerstner served the stockholder, with little regard for the “overhead,” which included people. Jesus walked side-by-side with his disciples. He let them fail, and then showed them a better way. He never pushed a disciple away, even when he knew one would betray him, and another would deny knowing him. Jesus poured himself into twelve men, then into seventy-two; he shared life with the multitudes—serving, loving, healing, and teaching them. Jesus led; he did not manage; but his leading was, first and foremost, serving. Gerstner may have changed IBM by leading through intimidation and fear, but Jesus changed the future of humanity by pouring himself out—and into—the entire world, one person at a time.

Jesus identified and taught “the essential skills, knowledge, and personal characteristics needed” to become just like him: a child of God, in right standing with the Father. Lucia and Lepsinger write about *The Art and Science of Competency Models*, stating that “many companies have begun using competency models to help them identify

---

189 Gerstner, 235.

190 Anntoinette D. Lucia and Richard Lepsinger, *The Art and Science of Competency Models: Pinpointing Critical Success Factors in Organizations* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass/Pfeiffer, 1999), 1. The authors were not describing Jesus or his technique; they were describing the use of competency models in business. This researcher infers that a business competency model approach can help explain the work of disciple-making.
the essential skills, knowledge, and personal characteristics needed for successful performance in a job and to ensure that human resource systems focus on developing them.”191 In business, a competency model is a way of pulling together what is needed in an employee, or what might be needed for successful completion of a job or task, and then to allow that competency model to guide “selection, training and development, appraisal, and succession planning.”192

In Christian discipleship, a competency model does not ask what skills or traits are needed to do a job; rather, what skills or traits are needed to grow in Christ-likeness? A competency model in adult Christian disciple-making can help by determining “what behaviors have the most direct impact on performance and success” in spiritual growth?193 It should be noted that the use of the word “performance” comes from Lucia and Lepsinger’s writing, and applies to job performance. However, this researcher has embraced the term to mean effective assimilation and enactment of spiritual formation skills and knowledge; it is about Christ-like behavior, and has nothing at all to do with impressing others or putting on a show, or an act that is to be judged by others.

Using Lucia and Lepsinger’s definition of a competency model, this researcher believes the following applications can be made to Christian discipleship.194

1. Identify essential skills, knowledge, and personal characteristics needed. To best help adult disciples grow in Christ-likeness, one must find skills, traits,
behaviors, and “mile-markers” in spiritual development that can help all adult disciples progress and evaluate their own growth and maturation process.

2. Successful performance. Instead of “performance,” the term “enactment” may best describe the essence of this step. The successful enactment of these essential skills and behaviors will most clearly demonstrate the maturation, formation, and spiritual development of an adult disciple. A process or tool for measuring this successful enactment needs to be devised.

3. Focus on development. Development of Christ-like attributes in an adult disciple is an ongoing process and a life-long commitment. This development process is the foundation of discipleship. The discipler-disciple relationship, like that of the Master-disciple relationship Jesus had with his followers—with the exception that the modern discipler is not raising up a disciple of her own, but a disciple of Jesus, himself—is the essence of the Great Commission that Jesus gave the church in Matthew 18:18-20.

**Christian Discipleship**

Christian authors and publishers have provided the church-at-large with a seeming overabundance of books, articles, workshops, and tracts on discipleship. Many talk of how to be a disciple; many talk of how to be a disciple-maker. Pastors and Christian educators can find in this vast collection a wide variety of teaching and training techniques, activities, discussion questions, and more.

Perhaps the finest material this researcher has found comes from Randy Frazee. Frazee’s groundbreaking work in assessing thirty “core competencies” in the life of a Christian has been called “the best corporate plan for spiritual formation and spiritual
growth” by the late Dallas Willard, and “the best tool of its kind,” by George Gallup, Jr. The assessment tool is to help measure spiritual growth in ten beliefs, ten practices, and ten virtues of the Christian life, what Frazee calls the thirty core competencies:

Beliefs
1. Trinity
2. Salvation by Grace
3. Authority of the Bible
4. Personal God
5. Identity in Christ
6. Church
7. Humanity
8. Compassion
9. Eternity
10. Stewardship

Practices
1. Worship
2. Prayer
3. Bible Study
4. Single-mindedness
5. Biblical Community
6. Spiritual Gifts
7. Giving Away My Time
8. Giving Away My Money
9. Giving Away My Faith
10. Giving Away My Life

Virtues
1. Love
2. Joy
3. Peace
4. Patience
5. Kindness/Goodness
6. Faithfulness
7. Gentleness
8. Self-control
9. Hope
10. Humility

---


196 Ibid., 11.
Frazee is the only author/pastor this researcher has found that is serious about asking, “What are the characteristics or marks that form a profile of Christ in us? What are the core competencies of someone who is increasingly growing in his or her love for God and for others?” His design or “architecture” of the assessment tool is to help adult believers work on ten competencies that help them “think like Jesus” (beliefs), ten competencies that help them “act like Jesus” (practices), and ten competencies that help them “be like Jesus” (virtues). Frazee has designed this assessment tool to be used “in the context of biblical community, such as a small group” because the members of such a group “provide support, encouragement, accountability, and prayer for each other as they individually and corporately seek to grow in Christ’s likeness.”

As much as this researcher is attracted to Frazee’s work, there is also a sense that it is not only somewhat limited, but also shortsighted. Frazee does not present this work as perfected or complete; in fact he comments that “these thirty (competencies) are not exhaustive, but are core characteristics we see over and over again in the Bible.” Yet, the limitation seems to be in a disconnect between the intention (to measure and encourage spiritual growth) and the competencies that seem to fall short of presenting key behaviors or mile markers in the journey of a Christ-follower. The list of beliefs reads more like systematic theology, and has some redundancy in the list of practices. The practices come the closest, in this researcher’s opinion, to being true “competencies,” while the list of virtues appears too nebulous for being guideposts for spiritual formation.

---

197 Frazee, 9.
198 Ibid.
199 Ibid.
200 Ibid.
This researcher acknowledges that the disconnect may be a personal observation or opinion, and does not desire to disparage Frazee’s work. There was nothing like this assessment throughout the history of the church to this present age, and this researcher can find no other similar treatment or tool available on the market today. This places Frazee’s work in an enviable position of being, perhaps, the only assessment tool of its kind in the church.

This kind of tool is what this researcher has hypothesized is needed for adult discipleship in Christ’s church today. There is a need to assess where one is in terms of spiritual formation and to measure the growth as spiritual formation continues. There is also a need for individual disciples to develop a plan for growth with the help of a discipler and then use that plan to map out systematic growth, reassessing and measuring over time. The tool incorporates assessment from others as well as small group discussion guides for helping adult disciples grow by help of the community. A very helpful feature is the “targeted growth” section of the tool, which suggests that the “Beliefs are developed through Practices which produce Virtues.”

For example:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Belief</th>
<th>Practice</th>
<th>Virtue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal God</td>
<td>Prayer</td>
<td>Joy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identity in Christ</td>
<td>Worship, Prayer</td>
<td>Humility</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 3.1 Targeted growth examples. *Source:* Randy Frazee, *The Christian Life Profile Assessment Tool: Workbook* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2005), page 53. These are only two examples of a much longer list in Frazee’s book.

---

201 Frazee, 53.
If a person has trouble with joy in her life, Frazee’s targeted growth model suggests that she look at the “score” in the area of personal God. Working on the practice of prayer should begin to help develop joy. Frazee suggests:

If we struggle in the area of humility, we may want to look at our identity in Christ score. When our identity in Christ is based on our performance and not in our position in Christ, we feel a need to brag and tout our accomplishments or to dominate a conversation. One of the greatest ways to enhance Christlike humility in our lives is to improve our knowledge and belief in our identity in Christ. There are a number of possible connections. Our struggle with worship may have to do with an inadequate view of God (the Trinity). Our struggle with love might involve not seeing other people as God sees them (humanity).

Take some time to probe the gap between your beliefs, practices, and virtues. If you scored high in the beliefs but low in the practices or virtues, look at your scores in the related areas.  

This is the kind of assessment and planning tool that is needed in the church today to help adult disciples get started and stay engaged in spiritual formation.

Another tool, called REVEAL, was developed by Willow Creek Community Church in South Barrington, Illinois and was administered to the members of the Willow Creek congregation. The tool was designed to be more diagnostic of an internal, organic disconnect between what the Willow leadership thought was happening within the congregation, and what the congregation members revealed about their actual spiritual stagnation. It was not an individualized assessment tool that would then be useful in designing and implementing a personal growth plan for each individual church member. Rather than disclose Willow Creek’s results to the church-at-large, the Willow Creek leadership chose to write about their congregation and others in Zondervan books in 2007, 2008, and 2009, and then decided to “roll it out to a wider audience because we

---

202 Frazee, 53.
suspected that the issues we found weren’t just Willow issues. . . .”

What Willow Creek suggests is that churches use the \textit{REVEAL} survey to “benchmark and track spiritual growth in a congregation.” The plan is to use the survey three times over a five-year period; the first survey provides a baseline, and the two follow-up surveys help provide information on how well a congregation is doing in improving beyond the baseline.

Unfortunately, there is an added component of “benchmarking your church’s spiritual profile against the results of any prior surveys as well as other churches in the \textit{REVEAL} database.” Comparing a congregation to itself makes sense; the added component of comparing one congregation to other congregations is not only ill-advised, but terribly unhealthy in this researcher’s opinion. Another component that may be helpful is “Reveal Works, a four-step planning process tool to help your church leadership team develop an action plan that responds to your \textit{REVEAL} findings.”

However, it must be reiterated, the Willow Creek \textit{REVEAL} survey is meant to assess the perceptions of congregation members as to how well they are growing spiritually and how well the congregation as a whole is growing spiritually; it is not an assessment of an individual’s growth, nor does it address a personalized action plan to help the individual member make strides in their development as disciples of Jesus Christ.

While the Willow Creek \textit{REVEAL} survey has merit for measuring congregational health and spiritual development, Randy Frazee’s \textit{Christian Life Profile} is closer to the

\begin{footnotes}
\item[204] Ibid., 261.
\item[205] Ibid.
\item[206] Ibid., 262.
\end{footnotes}
kind of tool that will assesses an individual’s growth in spiritual formation. However, this researcher believes a more effective tool can and should be developed.

**Education**

Perhaps the most abundant research information available to this researcher has been in the field of education. Chapter Two had nearly ten pages devoted to secular education, and this researcher has done extensive study on how adults learn, and has included a paper entitled, “How Adults Learn and How Teachers Must Adapt: Abstracts of a Sampling of Significant Sources in the Field of Adult Education” as additional, supporting research in Appendix A of this project.

A helpful resource, even though published in 1992, is Bruce Wilkinson’s *The Seven Laws of the Learner.* The ideas expressed in Wilkinson’s work have a timeless and universal quality, and, although the book is a discovery of how learners learn, it is far more a treatise on best practices for teachers. Although written for the Christian church, Wilkinson presents ideas that can be applied to any setting in which teachers are leading learners of any age.

Explaining the close relationship between learning and teaching, Wilkinson quotes Deuteronomy 4:1 “I teach you to observe” and Deuteronomy 5:1 “that you may learn them and observe them,” showing that the Hebrew root for both “teach” and “learn” is לָמד (lamad), which means “exercise in; learn, teach” and “Instruction

---

Teaching and learning are interconnected. If the learner is not learning, the teacher is not teaching. Teaching and learning are human-to-human interactions; a teacher-learner relationship. Discipleship must necessarily be a master-disciple relational interaction, between Jesus and his disciple, as facilitated by the discipler in personal relationship with her fellow disciple.

Wilkinson’s book contains “laws” that are not so much “laws” as they are “realities” of the teacher-learner relationship. There are seven laws, not so much because there are only seven teacher-learner realities, but because, in this researcher’s opinion, a teacher like Wilkinson would choose the number or perfection around which to organize his lessons. Whether “laws” or “realities,” and whether seven or some other number, this book speaks to teachers everywhere about truly engaging their learners. “The Bible says that teaching means ‘causing learning’. . . . Teaching is what the teacher does in the student. How do you know if you are a great teacher? By what your students learn.”

When students experience transformation, the teacher has been successful.

However, transformation in some circles is very different than the transformation normally spoken of in the Christian realm. Jack Mezirow, Emeritus Professor of Adult and Continuing Education and the former chair of the Department of Higher and Adult Education at the Teachers College at Columbia University, has been instrumental in the development of the Transformation Theory in education. The Transformation Theory in education has, at its core, the assumption that individuals should pursue autonomy and

---


209 Ibid., 18.

shun conformity. They must have the ability to choose what they wish to learn, embrace pluralism, and seek self-governance. In turn, teachers of adults, in the Transformation Theory of education, “do not indoctrinate . . . they create opportunities. . . . They make every effort to transfer their authority over the learning group to the group itself as soon as this is feasible. . . .”

While the Transformation Theory in education may address many adult and continuing education settings and situations in colleges, universities, and job-training, it hardly applies to the master-disciple relationship in which the teacher leads in what must be learned, expects imitation, depends on learner compliance, and seeks as a chief goal the replication of a likeness of the teacher in the learner. Transformation Theory seeks to block out power relationships that typically occur between teachers and students, and seeks to establish a “social democracy necessary for a transformative learning.”

Transformation Theory suggests that any kind of conformity impedes personal and social development, and keeps one from creating a personal, unique “sense of responsible agency.” This seems to run counter to the process of making and building disciples who are, by definition, being made into the image of their Master, Jesus.

Another of the many theories of adult learning, the “proficiency theory” states that “interest in enhanced proficiency facilitates persistence in adult learning activities

---


212 Ibid., 30-31.

213 Ibid., 31.

214 Ibid., 8.
that are satisfying and productive of personal growth.”215 As an adult learner gains expertise or expanded abilities in the learning environment where the experiences are positive and constructive, the learner will continue to engage in those activities, and will continue to find success in learning. Simply stated, when learning is satisfying and successful—the learner will stick with it.

Continuing to involve oneself “in helpful learning activities is crucial to learning.”216 Likewise, when an educator is able to know or identify an adult learner’s “current and desire proficiency,” the educator is able to “plan and conduct effective learning activities,” which encourage continued learning.217 In addition to addressing the concept of proficiency, this theory of adult learning “attends to dynamics of learning such as simplification, practice, reinforcement, pacing, and sequencing,” all of which are components of the master-disciple relationship in its work of growing healthy disciples of Jesus Christ.218

To best facilitate learning, teachers first discover the learner’s level of proficiency. This will immediately direct the sequencing of what must be learned, the pacing of the learning process, and how to best simplify what must be learned for the learner. The sequencing, pacing, and simplification then inform the reinforcement and the practice of the knowledge imparted. “Proficiency is a level of competence, adeptness, and confident control, based on expertise, skill, and knowledge acquired through education


216 Ibid.

217 Ibid., 379.

218 Ibid.
and experience.” As a learner gains proficiency through successful experiences, the learner will desire more proficiency and will seek more successful experiences.

Teachers—or in the case of this research, discipliers—must learn to assess the “discrepancies between current and desired proficiencies” in the life of the learner, or disciple. This assessment helps the teacher organize the lessons to be learned, to guide the learner in setting and meeting objectives, and to devise and engage the learner in meaningful developmental activities. “Most adult learning activities entail some blend of knowledge and attitude change, and often skill as well. . . . It is the close correspondence between learning and action . . . that is one of the main distinguishing characteristics” of adult education when compared to the education aimed at children and youth. This aspect of proficiency theory is closely related to Christian discipleship in which a discipler is personally involved in helping set desired objectives and outcomes to assist the disciple in gaining new faith behaviors, knowledge, attitudes, and overall life-change.

For adults to learn, they must have an understanding not only of what they are learning, but also why they are learning it. There must be a sense of scope and sequence, of meaning and application. “For anyone (learner, teacher, other) to intentionally enhance proficiency it is helpful to have some sense of directionality, some sense of what distinguishes progress from change.” In this researcher’s experience, adult discipleship must not only include personal interaction between the discipler and the disciple, but also a well-planned course of study, recognizable objectives, and an understanding of how the

---

219 Knox, 381.
220 Ibid.
221 Ibid., 384.
222 Ibid., 388.
disciple’s life might be changed because of the discipleship process. Proficiency theory also seems to suggest that discipleship should involve some form of personal assessment to know when, and how deeply, life-change has occurred.

**Psychology**

The study of psychology—looking at the human mind and human behavior—yields a great deal of information relevant to education. Studying temperaments and discovering educational techniques that best accommodate those temperaments help educators create systems of learning that make teaching and learning most effective. In a similar manner, using psychology to study the cognitive approaches to faith, and the subsequent assimilation of faith into people’s lives, gives Christian educators—teachers, pastors, mentors, and disciplers—a wealth of understanding of how faith is apprehended throughout the life span.

James Fowler speaks of faith as “a human universal,” suggesting people are “endowed by birth with nascent capacities for faith,” and further proposing that “how these capacities are activated and grow depends to a large extent on how we are welcomed into the world and what kinds of environments we grow in.”²²³ Many people may find exception to this theory, and might “reject the claim that faith is a generic feature of the human struggle to find and maintain meaning and that it may or may not find religious expression.”²²⁴ Fowler is not attempting to define faith as “indigenously

---


²²⁴ Ibid., 91.
Christian,” but as the human capacity for faith in something or someone; to have belief and find significance for life in something above human nature.\textsuperscript{225}

Fowler suggests that people develop faith in stages in much the same ways as developmental psychologists purport structural-developmental and psychosocial developmental theories of human growth and development. Fowler’s stages of faith consist of a pre-stage (in infancy) with six recognizable stages throughout the life cycle.

Pre-Stage: Undifferentiated Faith (Infancy)

In the pre-stage called Undifferentiated faith the seeds of trust, courage, hope, and love are fused in an undifferentiated way and contend with sensed threats of abandonment, inconsistencies, and deprivation in an infant’s environment. . . . The emergent strength of faith in this stage is the fund of basic trust and the relational experience of mutuality with the one(s) providing primary care and love.\textsuperscript{226}

Stage 1: Intuitive-Projective Faith (Early Childhood)

. . . [T]he fantasy-filled, imitative phase in which the child can be powerfully and permanently influenced by examples, moods, actions, and stories of the visible faith of primally related adults. . . . [M]arked by a relative fluidity of thought patterns. The child is continually encountering novelties for which no stable operations of knowing have been formed.\textsuperscript{227}

In the pre-stage, faith development is indistinguishable from infantile feelings and physical and emotional development; this development is as dependent upon the caregiver/parent as is the infant’s source of nourishment. In Stage 1 the caregiver/parent continues to provide vital one-on-one guidance and stimulus as the growing learner forms frames of reference that can be relied upon in future life situations.

\textsuperscript{225} Fowler, \textit{Stages of Faith}, 91.

\textsuperscript{226} Ibid., 121.

\textsuperscript{227} Ibid., 133.
Stage 2: Mythic-Literal Faith (School Years)

. . . [T]he stage in which the person begins to take on for him- or herself the stories, beliefs, and observances that symbolize belonging to his or her community. Beliefs are appropriated with literal interpretations, as are moral rules and attitudes. . . . [It is] a world based on reciprocal fairness and an immanent justice based on reciprocity. 228

Now the developing learner is influenced by the enveloping community as well as the closer relationship of caregiver/parent. Blind belief is now regimented and personalized; fact becomes more important than instinct. This new paradigm is moderated by essential interactions with others around them in one-on-one and group exchanges with authority figures as well as with peers.

Stage 3: Synthetic-Conventional Faith (Adolescence)

A number of spheres now demand attention: family, school or work, peers, street society and media, and perhaps religion. Faith must provide a coherent orientation in the midst of that more complex and diverse range of involvements. Faith must synthetize values and information; it must provide a basis for identity and outlook.

Stage 3 typically has its rise and ascendency in adolescence, but for many adults it becomes a permanent place of equilibrium. It structures the ultimate environment in interpersonal terms. . . It is a “conformist” stage in the sense that it is acutely tuned to the expectations and judgments of significant others and as yet does not have a sure enough grasp on its own identity and autonomous judgment to construct and maintain an independent perspective. 229

Here is where the disconnect or pitfall occurs for many adult Christians. Life intrudes on faith development, and without careful, intentional guidance, adult Christians become lodged in this habitation of conforming, pleasing others, and pretense. Without the one-on-one, master-disciple relationship, the Christian in Stage 3 can become entrenched in the adolescence of faith. Two distinct problems can rob the adult Christian

---

228 Fowler, *Stages of Faith*, 149.

229 Ibid., 172-173.
of a vibrant spiritual development: living to please others, or failing to complete the task of synthesis of faith values with life, and the task of identifying and actualizing the believer’s identity in Christ.

Stage 4: Individuative-Reflective Faith (Young Adulthood)

The movement from Stage 3 to Stage 4 . . . is particularly critical for it is in this time that the late adolescent or adult must begin to take seriously the burden of responsibility for his or her own commitments, lifestyle, beliefs, and attitudes. . . . Stage 4 most appropriately takes form in young adulthood (but let us remember that many adults do not construct it and that for a significant group it emerges only in the mid-thirties or forties. . . . Restless with the self-images and outlook maintained by Stage 4, the person ready for transition finds him- or herself attending to what may feel like anarchic and disturbing inner voices. Elements from a childish past, images and energies from a deeper self, a gnawing sense of the sterility and flatness of the meanings one serves—any or all of these may signal readiness for something new.

Most adult Christians in North America seem to spend an inordinate amount of time trying to make the shift from Stage 3 to Stage 4. In this researcher’s experience, adults seem to be making the shift later and later in life. Fowler states that “for a significant group it emerges only in the mid-thirties or forties,” but this researcher has seen many adults frozen at Stage 3 or the bridge to Stage 4 well into their fifties and sixties. For many, these problems are simply insurmountable:

1. individuality versus being defined by a group or group membership;
2. subjectivity and the power of one’s strongly felt but unexamined feelings versus objectivity and the requirement of critical reflection;
3. self-fulfillment or self-actualization as a primary concern versus service to and being for others;
4. the question of being committed to the relative versus struggle with the possibility of an absolute.

---

231 Ibid., 182.
232 Ibid.
Even when the move is made to Stage 4, few find life in Stage 4 satisfying or beneficial due to the fact that the move from a more concrete and literal faith to a more abstract and complex faith can feel somewhat disconcerting. Although Fowler states that at this point the developing learner desires to move on to “a more dialectical and multileveled approach to life truth,” in the experience of this researcher, many prefer to move backwards to a more adolescent life in Stage 3 faith.\textsuperscript{233}

Crises, trauma, and grief can be catalysts for some entrenched adult Christians; critical life-changing events can jump-start a desire to move beyond the confines of an adolescent faith. Unfortunately, for some, such life-experiences can also cause adults with adolescent faith to retreat further back in the faith stages, or perhaps discard faith altogether. Careful one-on-one discipling may be the only way of moving forward in spiritual formation.

Stage 5: Conjunctive Faith (Mid-life and Beyond)

Conjunctive faith involves the integration into self and outlook of much that was suppressed or unrecognized in the interest of Stage 4’s self-certainty and conscious and affective adaptation to reality. . . . Here there must also be a new reclaiming and reworking of one’s past. There must also be an opening to the voices of one’s “deeper self.” Importantly, this involves a critical recognition of one’s social unconscious—the myths, ideal images, and prejudices built deeply into the self-system by virtue of one’s nurture within a particular social class, religious tradition, ethnic group, or the like.

Unusual before mid-life, Stage 5 knows the sacrament of defeat and the reality of irrevocable commitments and acts. . . . Alive to paradox and the truth in apparent contradictions, this stage strives to unify opposites in mind and experience. . . . Stage 5 can appreciate symbols, myths, and rituals (its own and others’) because it has been grasped, in some measure, by the depth of reality to which they refer.\textsuperscript{234}

\textsuperscript{233} Fowler, \textit{Stages of Faith}, 183.

\textsuperscript{234} Ibid., 197-198.
To reach this stage of faith requires careful discipling. The integration of identity and ideology can certainly take place without the interaction of a master-disciple relationship, but incorrect beliefs, misunderstandings of the inner voices, or listening to the wrong voices, can further entrench incorrect faith development or allow vital life lessons to go unexamined and unlearned. As beneficial as discipling is prior to this stage, careful one-on-one guidance in Stage 5 is vital for the maturation in Christlikeness.

Stage 6: Universalizing Faith

From the beginning of our work there has been a complex image of mature faith in relation to which we have sought for developmentally related prior or preparatory stages. [This is the] normative endpoint, the culminating image of mature faith in this theory. . . .

Fowler believes that few adult believers actually attain this final stage in faith development; this researcher concurs with that assessment. This stage is not only a sign of a transformed life, it is evidence of the most fully-developed Christlike life that Christians may see this side of Heaven. Fowler explains:

Heedless of the threats to self, to primary groups, and to the institutional arrangements of the present order that are involved, Stage 6 becomes a disciplined, activist incarnation—a making real and tangible—of the imperatives of absolute love and justice of which Stage 5 has partial apprehensions. . . .

Persons best described by Stage 6 typically exhibit qualities that shake our usual criteria of normalcy. Their heedlessness to self-preservation and the vividness of their taste and feel for transcendent moral and religious actuality give their actions and words an extraordinary and often unpredictable quality. . . . Their enlarged visions of universal community disclose the partialness of our tribes and pseudo-species. . . . It is little wonder that persons best described by Stage 6 so frequently become martyrs for the vision they incarnate.

---


236 Ibid., 200.

In this researcher’s thinking, the only way to reach this highly-functioning Christian maturity is through carefully focused and intentional master-disciple relationships that are replicative; a hallmark of this Stage 6 maturity is the desire to reproduce this maturity in others. Disciples of Jesus Christ make other disciples of Jesus Christ in an ongoing, exponential process. Christians grow in faith because others help them and lead them in their growth. Those who are carefully nurtured and discipled in turn help and lead others in their spiritual growth and development.

In a vital book on spiritual growth and healing, psychologists Henry Cloud and John Townsend identify four “models of how people grow,” heal, and mature that have come down through the ages of the church. All four models have had some measure of success, which has caused many practitioners of Christian psychology to hook their proverbial wagon to a particular model and utilize it even when they find it does not work as often as they might like. Cloud and Townsend clarify:

The sin model said that all problems are a result of one’s sin. . . . The truth model held that truth would set you free. . . . The experiential model held that you had to get to the pain in your life—find the abuse or the hurt—and then somehow “get it out. . . .” The supernatural model had many variations. Charismatics sought instant healing and deliverance; others depended on the Holy Spirit to make the change happen as he lived his life through them. Exchanged-life people (those who hold that you just get out of the way so Christ can reproduce his life in you) as well as other very well-grounded students of the spiritual life trusted God to lead them and make changes in them.

These models of how people grow and develop are worded more from the standpoint of psychological healing. This is due largely to the fact that they were apprehended by Henry Cloud while he served in a Christian psychiatric hospital. Yet

---


239 Ibid., 16-17.
these models have application to the spiritual maturation of Christians. A sin model suggests that to grow in Christlikeness, one simply needs to rid oneself of sin. A truth model suggests that spiritual development comes as one comes to know the “Truth.” An experiential model suggests that one must have first-hand experience in order for growth to take root. A supernatural model suggests that God will perform all the growth in a believer; a believer simply waits for him to complete his work. Yet, as Cloud and Townsend observed, “Sincere Christian people who had been very diligent about spiritual growth often hit an area of life that did not give way to their best spiritual efforts, whether that was prayer, Bible study, Christian service, or just ‘being good.’”

Christians try to employ any number of learning strategies in an effort to grow through hurt or to grow to be more like Christ, but find immovable obstacles in their path towards spiritual growth.

Cloud and Townsend suggest that, psychologically, “all growth is spiritual growth.” Both men believe that there is “no such thing as our ‘spiritual life’ and then our ‘real life.’ It is all one.” Through the ages, humanity has adapted to the problems of life by finding new and better ways to address the symptoms, rather than the root of the problem. “We zero in on the ‘problem’ that someone needs help with. . . . Or we hammer in on a pattern of behavior. . . . This thinking happens not only when we help people with personal problems . . . but also when we preach, teach, disciple, or encourage people to engage in spiritual disciplines.” As disciple-makers, the task is not simply to help people become better at prayer, more adept at Bible study, or more fluent in the

240 Cloud and Townsend, 19.
241 Ibid., 9.
242 Ibid., 21.
243 Ibid., 27.
languages of spiritual disciplines; the task is to help adults become life-long, committed disciples of Jesus Christ. Focusing less on symptoms or shortcomings, or on techniques to remedy either or both, the focus must be on an entirely different model of how people grow: the Master Jesus’ relationship with his disciple, through the use of a one-on-one discipler-disciple relationship.

This is necessarily an active, involved process. One cannot engage in a personal relationship without actively interacting with a person. Likewise, one cannot be discipled without intentionally interacting with a discipler who serves as an under-shepherd for the Great Shepherd, Jesus. A passive approach to spiritual growth will yield little to no spiritual progress. “When we are passive, we shrink from the risk of the faith life itself.” God’s soul takes no pleasure in this (Heb. 10:38). He himself stays actively involved with us, even when what we do causes him pain (Eph. 4:30), because he values his role in our lives. And Jesus’ active obedience models the same for us.”\(^\text{244}\) The master-disciple relationship is active; the master-disciple relationship urges obedience. Jesus modeled this relationship and calls his followers to engagement in this active obedience.

In her article “Game Engagement Theory and Adult Learning,” researcher Nicola Whitton suggests that “it is learner engagement that is important for creating effective learning experiences.”\(^\text{245}\) Arguing that fun can be “a by-product of learning,” Whitton asserts that fun is not the essential component for effective learning, rather, engagement with learning is the single most important requirement for effective learning.\(^\text{246}\)

\(^{244}\) Cloud and Townsend, 341.


\(^{246}\) Ibid.
In her argument against fun as the chief motivating factor for engagement through games, Whitton explains that engagement through video games included a “sense of authenticity,” an “identification with the environment,” a “compelling narrative,” and an “experience of flow” as factors that helped describe engagement. The experience of flow has given rise to “flow theory,” which focuses on “the state in which people are so involved in an activity that nothing else seems to matter; the experience itself is so enjoyable that people will do it even at great cost, for the sheer sake of doing it.” This almost mindless engagement, in this researcher’s opinion, comes close to describing addictive behavior and/or neural-manipulation. It goes beyond engagement into the realm of control; the controlling of an individual by outside influence through the use of sensory stimulation. This kind of engagement should be studied, but it has no place in education. Unfortunately, flow theory of engagement is similar to (perhaps identical to) the audio-visual stimulation of high-energy television programs, the intense sound and visual bites from Madison Avenue, and high-intensity programming on the Internet:

Flow theory puts forward the notion that certain factors add to the enjoyment of an experience, and the more of these elements that are present the more enjoyable, engaging, and immersive that experience is. The factors that the theory describes are the following:

1. a challenge that requires skill to achieve with an attainable goal and known rules
2. complete absorption in the activity
3. clear goals
4. immediate feedback
5. concentration on the task in hand
6. a sense of control, lacking the sense of worry about losing control
7. loss of self-consciousness
8. transformation of time

247 Whitton, 598.


249 Whitton, 598-599.
The flow theory of engagement through games of any kind, whether it is a video
game, a board game, or a multi-player role-playing game in person or on the Internet,
suggests that it is in losing oneself in the game that provides engagement. However, flow
theory is not the only theory of engagement. Whitton’s own research provides two factors
that contribute positively to engagement, and four factors that negatively impact
engagement.\textsuperscript{250} These factors, in this researcher’s opinion, have application beyond game
or engagement theory, impacting how people engage, or fail to engage, in learning
environments and/or with teachers. The two factors found to contribute positively to
engagement were: (1) being able to see swift and steady improvement; and (2) a
perception of being good at an activity.\textsuperscript{251} The four factors found to negatively influence
engagement were: (1) difficulties in getting started; (2) being stuck during the activity;
(3) lack of trust in the environment; and (4) intrinsic boredom with the subject matter or
activity itself.\textsuperscript{252}

When looking at the psychological impact of both the positive and negative
factors, it is easy to see how these would affect nearly any educational endeavor,
including Christian discipleship. When a learner is able to see swift improvement, they
are motivated to commit to the process of learning; when a learner is able to see steady
improvement, they are willing to continue learning. Likewise, when a learner finds that
she is proficient or successful in a learning activity, she will be more likely to fully
embrace the activity and apply herself more readily to learning. At the same time, when
any one of the four negative impacts is encountered, a learner will have the tendency to

\textsuperscript{250} Whitton, 601-602.

\textsuperscript{251} Ibid., 601.

\textsuperscript{252} Ibid., 602.
disengage from learning. Having difficulty getting started, getting stuck, having a lack of trust in either the teacher or the learning environment, and/or simply becoming bored with the material being learned, will all cause some level of disillusionment or disconnect from learning.

Discipleship with adults must take these engagement factors into consideration when devising ways to engage adult learners. The positive motivational factors—swift and steady improvement, and the experience of success in the endeavor—must be enhanced. The negative influences on engagement—difficulty starting, getting stuck, distrust in the teacher or the teaching environment, and boredom—must all be carefully monitored and mitigated.

Whitton produced a “model of engagement with learning” that consists of six factors that this research believes are applicable to adult Christian discipleship:253

1. **Challenge.** This factor suggests that what is undertaken has meaning, requires some measure of skill, is perceived as attainable, and has clearly set rules and goals. The discipler sets a challenge before the disciple, much in the same way Jesus would: “he who has ears to hear, let him hear,” and “I tell you the truth.”254 The challenge is to grow in Christlikeness and to follow the Master’s commands. “Therefore go and make disciples . . . teaching them to obey everything I have commanded you,” Jesus had told the disciples, followed by the assertion and affirmation, “you will be my witnesses.”255

---

253 Whitton, 604. This researcher will list the six factors with no further citation of Whitton’s work, except where there is a direct quote.

254 Mk 4:9; Mt 21:31.

255 Mt 28:19-20; Acts 1:8.
2. **Control.** The learner is able to make choices, and everything that is done in the learning environment has “clear, fair, and consistent feedback.”\(^{256}\) The disciple always has choices: follow, freeze, fall back, or fall away. The only constructive choice is to follow, and following is rewarded. Jesus’ Beatitudes and his teaching on salt and light in Matthew 5 are both encouragement as well as feedback.

3. **Immersion.** This addresses the learner’s level of “absorption in and concentration on an activity.”\(^{257}\) The Apostle Peter discipled the church well when he instructed, “make every effort to add to your faith. . . . For if you possess these qualities in *increasing* measure. . . .” (*emphasis* mine).\(^{258}\) Jesus asked the disciples to give everything up to follow him.\(^{259}\)

4. **Interest.** The learner has, or is provided with, a clear and understandable attraction to the subject matter to be learned. John 3:16-21, as an example, offers disciples a compelling reason to follow Christ.\(^{260}\)

5. **Purpose.** Although not of much importance to game-players, purpose is important to adult learners who want to know what they are learning, and why. Jesus teaches that “anyone who has faith in me will do what I have been

---

\(^{256}\) Whitton, 604.

\(^{257}\) Ibid.

\(^{258}\) See all of 2 Pt 1:3-11.

\(^{259}\) Lk 9:23-25.

\(^{260}\) The great gospel explanation and call to discipleship contained in John 3:16-21 encapsulates what it is to which disciples can and should be attracted in a relationship with Christ. Some interpreter’s do not believe this passage was uttered by Jesus, but contained John’s own words. This researcher exegetes and interprets John 3:16-21 to be Jesus’ own words to his church of that day and unto his second coming.
I will ask the Father, and he will give you another Counselor to be with you forever—the Spirit of truth.\textsuperscript{261}

As Whitton points out: “Although this model was initially developed in the context of games and learning, it is hypothesized that it may have wider applicability to learning activities in general in the context of Higher Education, as each of the factors is also a mark of an effective educational experience as well as an enjoyable gaming one.\textsuperscript{262} Whitton’s hypothesis is correct; this researcher has effectively applied the model to Christian discipleship.

\textbf{Science}

Educational theories have been addressed in this chapter, as have the sciences of anthropology and psychology; the science of sociology will be covered later in this chapter. It might seem redundant to offer a section on “science” since so much of the literature reviewed has had science as its foundation. Still, there are some theories or studies that do not fit neatly into educational theories, which tend to be less about technique and more about how humans are “wired” cognitively. There is scientific literature that tends not to fit neatly into anthropology, education, psychology, or sociology. This section focuses on two scientific theories that provide a more general scientific approach to understanding learning and instruction.

One scientific theory, the Cognitive Load Theory, seeks to define “a framework of instructional design principles based on characteristics and relations between the structures that constitute human cognitive architecture, particularly working memory, and

\textsuperscript{261} See all of Jn 14:10-27.

\textsuperscript{262} Whitton, 605.
long-term memory.” There are five suppositions or principles that inform the cognitive load theory:

1. *Long-term memory and the information store principle.* Humans have the ability to store enormous amounts of information in long-term memory.

2. *Schema theory and the borrowing and reorganizing principle.* Humans gain new information by borrowing schemas, or structures of information, from others such as teachers, which are then stored in one’s own long-term memory. Because this process of borrowing and storing is inexact, some of the information may be slightly altered.

3. *Problem solving and the randomness as genesis principle.* Although borrowing and reorganizing does not, in and of itself, create new information, if details or pieces of the borrowed information are missing, one will fill in what is missing by trial and error, which effectively does create new information.

4. *Working memory and the narrow limits of change principle.* One’s working memory is somewhat limited in how it deals with this created new information, so some new information is lost in the process.

5. *Long-term working memory and the environmental organizing and linking principle.* “Working memory is only limited when processing novel information. It is able to deal with vast amounts of previously organized information brought

---


264 Ibid. 449-450. This list of suppositions or principles will be presented without continued citation except where there may be direct quotations; all five principles are found on pages 449 and 450 of this source.
in from long-term memory (Ericsson & Kintsch, 1995) reducing the burden on working memory and thus lowering cognitive load.”

The authors of the study sought to explain that “the structure and characteristics of this cognitive architecture indicate the primary purpose of instruction is to construct schemas in long-term memory.” The human brain is constructed in such a way as to store enormous amounts of knowledge in long-term memory, and to use working memory to filter and organize new information for storage in long-term memory. Education’s primary purpose is the giving of new schemas to another for long-term memory storage. The authors further suggest that “instructional designs that do not aim to alter long-term memory and which ignore working memory limitations when processing novel information are likely to be ineffective.” As teachers teach, they must be mindful that the goal is to load new information schemas into the long-term memory of learners, while also being cautious not to overload the learners’ working memory. Another purpose of education is to help, when the working memory is overloaded and novel information is lost or contains gaps, to restore the correct information in order to clarify and complete the schemas stored.

Nancy Frey, Douglas Fisher, and Sandi Everlove, in their book Productive Group Work: How to Engage Students, Build Teamwork, and Promote Understanding explain another facet of the cognitive architecture:

Ongoing neuroscience research also supports the idea that emotions affect learning. Current study of the amygdalae, a pair of almond-shaped neuronal


266 Wong et al, 450.

267 Ibid.
clusters located deep in the temporal lobes of the human brain, suggests that its chief functions are to process learning formed through emotional events (especially fear and reward) and to further consolidate these memories as they move from working memory (short in duration) to long-term (more permanent) memory.268

Any strong neural activity taking place at the same time as learning (assimilation into long-term memory) can impact the amount and quality of information schemas being sorted into long-term memory storage. A negative emotion, including fear about what is being learned or fear of forgetting the information, or the four negative elements that Whitton suggested (difficulties in getting started, being stuck during the activity, lack of trust in the environment, and intrinsic boredom with the subject matter or activity itself) can also become extremely emotional events which, in turn, can negatively affect the consolidation of learning into long-term memory.269

The cognitive load theory has implications for Christian discipleship in that it suggests that knowledge schemas can be passed on by a discipler to the disciples, which the disciples then “borrow” and “reorganize” to store in long-term memory; the study of Scripture can also provide schemas for long-term memory storage. When certain pieces of information are missing or reorganized incorrectly, the disciple will have the tendency to create new information through a process of trial and error, assimilating that information found to be dependable. However, this process of filling in the missing pieces through practice and assimilation requires a great deal of working memory, causing some of the potentially stored schemas to be lost. Thus, the discipler must


269 Whitton, 602.
reiterate the information through repetition and the learner must process the information
through on-going practice in order for the new information to be fully assimilated into
long-term memory.

Educators and authors, Terry Doyle and Todd Zakrajsek, have researched
extensively into how the human brain learns best, and have presented at numerous
teaching conferences to help teachers better understand ways to help learners become
more efficient learners. Their recent book, *The Science of Learning*, is written to help
both learners and teachers understand how the brain learns, and how to harness that
knowledge to become better at learning and teaching.²⁷⁰

The authors explain the fundamentals of how the brain functions in learning:

> [W]hen you learn something new, some of your brain cells establish connections
> with other brain cells to form new networks of cells, which represent the new
> learning that has taken place. When frequently activated, these new networks
> have the potential to become long-term memories. In fact, every time you use or
> practice the newly learned information or skill, the connections between the brain
> cells get stronger and recalling the information becomes easier. . . . Any practiced
> knowledge or skill becomes a more permanent part of your memory and will be
> easily available to you when you need it, even if you don’t need it for weeks or
> months at a time.

> The important message for all learners is that new learning requires a
> considerable amount of practice and a meaningful connection to other information
> in order to become a more permanent part of memory.²⁷¹

The authors give helpful advice on the critical need for proper nutrition,
hydration, sleep, and exercise to prepare and support the brain in learning.²⁷² They
introduced neurological terms such as “potentiation” (how long-term memories are
formed), the “distributed practice effect” (practicing new knowledge over time), and

---


²⁷¹ Ibid.

²⁷² Ibid., 8-10.
“transference” (the ability to apply new knowledge to new situations) to augment comprehension of the science of learning. Doyle and Zakrajsek facilitate application of new understanding of the brain in learning by pointing out needed changes in both teaching and learning. They explain:

New insights into how the human brain learns makes it clear that many of the learning practices that faculty used in the past, and that students continue to use, are highly inefficient, ineffective, or just plain wrong. Better learning does not always require more effort or more time; rather one need only effectively align how the brain naturally learns with the demands of [the learning environment].

For example, one particular area of research shows that using multiple senses in the learning process increases the quality and quantity of what is learned; memory is improved “when two or more senses are used together.” By using multiple senses in learning, students are given “more than one way of experiencing something.” This process of learning is called “elaboration” and consists of “creating multiple paths to information.” By creating these multiple paths—by learning with multiple senses—the easier it becomes to store and recall information.

---


274 Doyle and Zakrajsek, 1.

275 Ibid., 45.

276 Ibid.

277 Ibid., 52.
In Chapter Two, this researcher cited Anne Brockbank and Ian McGill, noting that research has shown that the majority of adult learners remember:

- 20% of what we read
- 30% of what we hear
- 40% of what we see
- 50% of what we say
- 60% of what we do
- 90% of what we see, hear, say, and do.  

Even with something as dull as reading a textbook, multiple-sensory learning can be employed. “Annotation is a simple process of making notes in the margin of the textbook that identify, in your own words, the important concepts, ideas, facts, and details. By using your pencil, you add the sense of touch to the reading process, making it multi-sensory.” Doyle and Zakrajsek go on to explain “patterns” in learning, which are also benefits that come from annotating. They emphasize:

First, by translating what you are reading into your own words, you are identifying whether you understand what you are reading. If you can’t translate the material, you don’t yet understand it. The process of translation greatly adds to your comprehension and recall of the text material. Second, using your own words is one of the best ways to make remembering what you read easier. Your own words are your most familiar pattern, and using familiar patterns makes learning easier.

Doyle and Zakrajsek’s book is a treasure trove of helpful information for both students and teachers. It should be required reading for all high school and college students as well as faculty. It should also be required reading for all pastors and disciplers, because it clarifies how the human brain learns, and how best to help align

\[\text{278 Brockbank and McGill, 74.}\]
\[\text{279 Doyle and Zakrajsek, 53.}\]
\[\text{280 Ibid., 56-69.}\]
\[\text{281 Ibid., 53-54.}\]
what one must learn with how one actually processes the information into long-term memory.

There is much that the authors suggest that has application in discipleship. Using multiple senses in such activities as reading and writing helps with memory retention. Adding smell or taste can help enhance learning. Reading while listening to someone speaking or listening to music can be beneficial. Talking or reading aloud or recitation can be used in nearly any discipleship setting. Finding and recognizing patterns in discipleship activities can easily be introduced. Making annotations in the margins of Bibles or writing in a journal can help bring the information to life in ways that make it easier to remember and recall.

Another scientific approach to learning theory, known as “rhizoactivity,” eschews the “adjective-plus-learning theory” practice of identifying theories, suggesting that such identification either describes a universal characteristic of learning—which is unlikely to exist—or describes a specific aspect of learning—which therefore limits that theory.\textsuperscript{282} Both of these views of the “adjective-plus-learning theory” identification are problematic for many postmoderns; the author of the study states that “postmodern critique rejects locating human actions, including learning, within any foundational certainty.”

Author Kang suggests that there is a different way in which to define or describe learning, preferring “rhizoactivity” as the more constructive, postmodern adjective. The term comes from the combination of two words: “rhizo” and “activity.” “Rhizo” comes from “rhizome,” which in biology is a underground runner or stem of a plant that is

capable of producing roots and shoots to become an autonomous plant; the use of this word is “to capture the multiplicity of learning that always makes connections to anything else and pursues heterogeneity.” In this sense, “rhizoactivity” suggests that learning is an ongoing process, stretching out through culture and history, flavored and influenced by each learner and teacher. “The adjective-plus-learning theory tries to describe the originality of learning by using a certain adjective to capture the trace [culture, heritage, history, context, institution, or discourse]. In contrast, research on learning with a concept of rhizoactivity is like playing a detective role to investigate the trace.

In the area of Christian discipleship, rhizoactivity could be said to be the reproductive activity through replication of the Master, Jesus. The rhizoactivity of Christian discipleship can change a disciple at any time or place in life, and is an ongoing, life-long process, not only throughout the life of an individual disciple, but, through replication, throughout the long life of those disciples who continually make disciples who make other disciples. Faith is a rhizome in an individual’s life and in the life of Christ’s church; discipleship is a rhizoactivity wherein the rhizome of faith sends out runners, sets down roots, sends up new growth, and spreads the life of Christ-like faith throughout the world.

**Sociology**

In sociology, the focus of study is on society and the individual’s interaction with it. Behaviors, structures, relationships, and values—all are considered and investigated. Looking at Christian discipleship through the lens of sociology requires an examination of ethics, interactions between individuals and groups, as well as cultural influences.
One of the most important and effective influences on people—as individuals and within groups—is that of the peer group. Researchers David Hemphill and Shari Leskowitz speak of learning as a “situated activity in a community of practice.” Far from peer pressure or formal education, the authors suggest that learning takes place when the “whole person” is engaged, rather than when that person receives “a body of factual knowledge about the world.” Learning is not confined to teachers imparting knowledge to learners. “Learning from peers” provides a “cooperative effort” and should take place within the community of practice. The Hemphill/Leskowitz study centered upon a “loosely knit community of anarchist, anti-capitalist, ‘Do-It-Yourself’ (DIY) activists,” but peer learning, cooperative learning, and learning within a community in which practice can take place are all transferable principles to the church.

“Positive interdependence is considered by many to be the defining quality and most important component of cooperative group work.” The term positive interdependence, coined by David Johnson and Roger Johnson in their book, Learning Together and Alone: Cooperation, Competition, and Individualization, is used to indicate the quality of working together in the learning environment “where students work together to accomplish shared goals.” With positive interdependence, all concerned

---


284 Ibid.

285 Ibid., 67.

286 Ibid., 57.

287 Frey, Fisher, and Everlove, 23.

recognize that “individual success is inextricably linked to the success of every other member of the group.”\textsuperscript{289} The “affective filter hypothesis” suggests that emotion can impede or filter the ability for a student to learn.\textsuperscript{290} Uncertainty, low self-esteem, fear of failure, embarrassment, or even failure to achieve objectives can all act to reduce the effectiveness of learning. On the other hand, the positive experiences that working together toward successful learning can produce an “improved flow of academic information and a heightened state of learning.”\textsuperscript{291} This collaborative learning takes place when students realize “that every member is indispensable to achieving their mutual goals and that they are both dependent on and obligated to their peers.”\textsuperscript{292} This is also true in Christian discipleship, and while one-on-one discipleship is needed, working in groups in which the members encourage one another must also be carefully considered.

William G. Perry, Jr. wrote an insightful and challenging treatise on the \textit{Forms of Ethical and Intellectual Development in the College Years} in which his research pointed to a “scheme,” or progression, of nine potential “Positions” of development and three potential “Positions” of deflection (alternatives to development) to demonstrate how college students progress and mature—or fail to progress and mature—through their college years.\textsuperscript{293}

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{289} Frey, Fisher, and Everlove, 23.
\item \textsuperscript{290} Ibid., 25.
\item \textsuperscript{291} Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{292} Ibid., 23.
\item \textsuperscript{293} William G. Perry, Jr., \textit{Forms of Ethical and Intellectual Development in the College Years: A Scheme} (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1999), 64-223.
\end{itemize}
Starting with embeddedness (a starting place of relative security from which it is difficult to proceed without some intervening or motivating issue or challenge—like starting college) and aiming at actualization (that place where a person chooses to “move ahead from challenge to challenge,”) students are theorized to move through nine possible Positions of development (see Figure 3.2). Although the scheme consists of
this nine-Position progression, Perry suggests a simplified view of the scheme “may be conceived in two major parts centering on Position 5.” Perry clarifies:

The outlook of Position 5 is that in which a person perceives man’s knowledge and values as relative, contingent, and contextual. The sequence of structures preceding this Position describes a person’s development from a dualistic absolutism and towards this acceptance of generalized relativism. The sequence following this Position describes a person’s subsequent development in orienting himself in a relativistic world through activity of personal Commitment.

Perry’s scheme suggests that college freshmen enter their first year of school embedded in a basic duality mindset—what Perry refers to as “Authority-right-we” versus “illegitimate-wrong-others.” It is a world of black and white, right and wrong; living in the safety of what you know, which, in essence, is the worldview of childhood. The college student then progresses through Positions in the scheme which show the modifying of dualism, the realizing of relativism, and the evolving of commitments (life choices, belief systems, values, relationships, and more).

The three Positions of deflection, or alternatives to development and growth, are (1) Temporizing: a pause in growth that may or may not involve some form of alienation or entrenchment in the developmental scheme; (2) Retreat: “an entrenchment in dualism . . . undertaken in reaction to the complexities, envisioned or imagined, of more advanced Positions;” and (3) Escape (or disengagement) in one of two directions: toward disassociation, “the passive delegation of all responsibility to fate,” or toward encapsulation wherein the student uses activity and competence to insulate himself

---

295 Perry, 64.
296 Ibid.
297 Ibid., 66.
298 Ibid., 64-65; 170-171.
“from the implications of deeper values.” As mentioned earlier, the amygdalae, a part of the brain’s limbic system, process both fear and reward aspects of learning; learners who experience emotional crises can freeze, retreat, or escape in stressful situations.

This researcher commented earlier that disciples always have choices, and listed “follow” as the only constructive choice, followed by three negative choices of “freeze, fall back, or fall away.” These strongly correlate to Perry’s deflections of Temporizing, Retreat, and Escape. This researcher also sees correlations between Perry’s deflections and Whitton’s four elements that negatively influence engagement in learning (difficulties in getting started, being stuck during the activity, lack of trust in the environment, and intrinsic boredom with the subject matter or activity itself.) Whitton’s four negative elements, especially difficulty getting started, being stuck, and becoming bored are at the center of the deflections Perry posits, resulting in a slowing or stoppage in learning and engagement, and/or a complete break through Retreat or Escape.

This researcher has provided only a cursory explanation of Perry’s scheme. Still, this simplified view of the scheme provides insight into the Christian discipleship. It is worthy to note that Perry suggests that the scheme is familiar, and that the progression is recognizable in areas outside of college education, suggesting “there is so little that is novel about it that it finds an almost full expression in the Book of Genesis,” making allusions and drawing inferences to the events of the Book of Genesis in his writing.

---

299 Perry, 198-213.
300 Frey, Fisher, and Everlove, 25.
301 Whitton, 602.
302 Perry, 67.
In a similar manner, this researcher sees a correlation between Perry’s scheme and the discipler-disciple process.

Figure 3.3 is this researcher’s attempt at applying Perry’s scheme to Christian discipleship. The main line of faith development, which could also be defined as the process of sanctification, starts at the point of conversion marked by the figure of the cross at the upper left corner. This line of faith development is a life-long process, moving from a “borrowed faith” received from parents, a local church congregation, or the person who was instrumental in leading the new believer to faith in Christ, to a place in which the person’s faith is more fully developed and maturing.
Perry’s “modifying of dualism,” “realizing of relativism,” and “evolving of commitments” remain a part of this modified scheme since new believers do start at a place of more concrete faith to a place of more resolute commitment, by moving through periods of ever-changing and continually progressing standards and values.303

Along that progression, believers face varying numbers and varying degrees of decision points, as illustrated by the capital “D” within a circle. At these times of decision, the believer may disengage from the maturation process, choosing one of three possible paths of deflection: immobility, or a stalling-out or getting “stuck” in faith development; regression, or a return to a more comfortable or more preferred point of maturation, which could perhaps be termed as “backsliding”; or withdrawal, an apostate or, less serious, a defeated state in which the believer steps away from the nurture of the church and the growth process associated with discipleship. The believer may also be discipled by someone a few steps ahead of her in the faith development scheme, where the more mature discipler spurs the less mature disciple on to new growth in faith.

All along the scheme, at the points of disengagement or discipleship, the discipler-disciple relationship is most needed and is most effective. Personal interaction, accountability, personalized lessons, activities, and assignments, as well as personal one-on-one assessment of progress make the difference between moving on in discipleship, and being deflected from progress through disengagement. Left to their own devices, adult Christians will tend toward an entropy-like disintegration or dissolution of faith; with regular and intentional help from a peer discipler a few steps further along on the maturity scheme, adult Christians will be better equipped, and more likely, to grow towards a maturing and Christ-like faith.

303 Perry, 64.
Summary

Christ’s church in North America has been faltering in recent history, especially in the United States. Lacking spiritual power and vibrancy, the process of making and building disciples of Jesus Christ is on the wane. As this researcher has stated, there is a lack of intentionality in discipleship, there is a lack of personalization in the process of growing individuals in Christ-likeness, and there is a lack of ongoing oversight and evaluation of growing disciples by more mature disciples who are further ahead in the journey of being formed spiritually.

There is a sense of disorientation and confusion as to how disciples are to grow. What spiritually significant behaviors should be encouraged? What spiritually beneficial activities and conversations should be engaged? What program of study should be followed, and how is growth to be measured? Who will help, or are adult Christians on their own? Some of the answers to these questions might be found in an understanding of how adults learn. Yet, the way in which adults learn has undergone dramatic changes in the ensuing years after Jesus began teaching his disciples. Societal changes suggest that learning is less personal, yet educational changes suggest learning must be more personalized. New understanding of how the human mind and human cognitive architecture works suggests a need for experiential learning, repetition, and practice in the context of community, yet culture has developed an appetite for supernormal stimuli that directly opposes and pushes away such basic techniques.

Much of the literature reviewed gives a clear indication that to best impart knowledge, there must be some effort made to fully understand how an individual learner best learns. This requires a personal relationship between teacher and learner. One cannot
engage in a personal relationship without actively interacting with a person, thus, it stands to reason, one cannot engage in a growing life of discipleship without engaging in personal interaction between a discipler and a disciple. Observation of a mentor and learning by imitation is foundational for learning, and is the basis of the master-disciple learning paradigm. This is an active, intentional process; a passive approach to spiritual growth will produce few positive results.

The literature suggests that without the personal interaction of a teacher with the learner, learners can become stalled in development. Left to work at growing on one’s own, most adult Christians will experience a slowing or even dissolution of their spiritual vitality. Cognitive load theory suggests that when the working memory is overloaded and new information is lost or contains gaps, the person imparting the knowledge schema must work to restore the correct information; this requires one-on-one interaction. Adult disciples can become stuck in an adolescent faith, and negative life-experiences can cause these disciples with adolescent faith to shrink yet further from spiritual formation, and possibly abandon faith altogether. Careful, personal discipling may be the only way of moving forward in spiritual formation.

Engagement theory suggests that a learner needs to be able to see self-improvement while also sensing being good at an activity. Proficiency theory suggests that as a learner gains expertise or expanded abilities in the learning environment where the experiences are positive and constructive, the learner will continue to engage in those activities, and will continue to find success in learning. To see self-improvement and to gain expertise, the learner must know what skills, behaviors, and activities must be learned. The discovery and engagement of the essential skills and behaviors of Christian
discipleship will guide the maturation, formation, and spiritual development of an adult disciple. Research will show what key behaviors and skills best describe a growing disciple of Jesus Christ. Further, since the literature suggests that learning involves some form of personal assessment to know how well one is progressing, one must not only know what skills must be mastered, and he must have some way of measuring success. A tool or an evaluative process for measuring the engagement of the key behaviors and skills must be devised.

Growing as a disciple of Christ is a *rhizoactivity*. Well-tended, intentional spiritual formation through peer-to-peer discipleship spreads throughout the world and throughout the ages, setting down roots and sending up new growth, reproducing disciples and exponentially building Christ’s church. Attention now must turn to discovering the key behaviors that growing disciples should exhibit, the elements, behaviors, tasks, and/or skills that are missing that cause this pause or gap between conversion and further spiritual development, and the kind of assessment or evaluation will best help measure progress and mastery so that adult disciples and peer disciplers can monitor personal spiritual progress.
CHAPTER FOUR
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND PROCEDURES

The actual research methodology for this project is composed of three parts: (1) a survey of behaviors, skills, or actions that may be associated with Christian discipleship; (2) a two-question questionnaire to obtain qualitative data to accompany the survey’s quantitative data; and (3) a one-day focus group to distill both quantitative data and qualitative data into actionable results.

**Part One: Survey**

An Internet hyperlink will be distributed via e-mail to over two-hundred pastors and/or Christian educators of multiple denominations in multiple states in the United States. The hyperlink will connect them to a survey on the SurveyMonkey website, a web-based research and data analysis company. Founded in 1999, SurveyMonkey online surveys have become an essential research tool for a variety of research fields, allowing researchers to design research tools, distribute and collect responses, and analyze results through the cost-effective use of the Internet and e-mail. “Literally millions of people use SurveyMonkey for everything from customer satisfaction and employee performance reviews, to course evaluations and research of all types.”

---


The following instructions will accompany the hyperlink:

*Your help is needed on a research project for a doctoral project through Winebrenner Theological Seminary in Findlay, Ohio. The following link will take you to a survey on the SurveyMonkey website. The survey will take at least five minutes to complete—perhaps longer—depending on the depth of your thinking and the length of your responses. Seventy-five statements will simply require that you rate them; three questions will invite you to write a brief answer. The survey is to help discover key behaviors Christian disciples should exhibit, activities in which they should engage, and milestones they may reach as they grow in Christ.*

*Will you please help with this important research? Your identity will remain anonymous; your input will be compiled with the input of other respondents and used for further research. The findings may be included in a guidebook or handbook for publication, and the finished project will be made available for viewing on Winebrenner’s website. Thank you for your assistance.*

This researcher will utilize e-mail addresses from currently existing e-mail lists of church leaders in judicatories of the Church of God (Anderson) in Ohio, and the Churches of God (General Conference) in the United States. Additionally, the survey will be sent to current seminary students, recent graduates, and faculty of Winebrenner Theological Seminary as well as ten to twenty professional colleagues of this researcher engaged in ministry in church congregations in the Episcopalian, Foursquare, Independent Christian, Mennonite, Presbyterian, Society of Friends (Quaker), United Brethren, United Church of Christ, and United Methodist denominations. The use of these professional colleagues will not negatively impact the collected data, in this researcher’s opinion, because: (1) they will account for a small percentage of the total respondents; (2) their responses will be anonymous; (3) their responses can be configured in any way they personally decide, effectively producing randomness; and (4) since they are from varied denominational backgrounds, their results will safeguard the external validity of the study.
When respondents click on the link, they will first encounter a partial re-cap of the instructions found outlined above, along with this additional statement:

*This list of behaviors, skills, and/or milestones in the life of a disciple of Jesus Christ is not meant to be exhaustive, nor is it meant to be interpreted as doctrinally sound for all approaches to the Christian faith. Some may actually be considered offensive to some streams of Christianity. They were not intended to be “off-putting,” but they are intended to make one stop and think what truly is a key behavior or milestone in the Christian life. These are meant to be a starting place for research.*

They will be asked to rate seventy-five behaviors or skills that they believe are important for an adult believer to embrace in order to be successful in his/her personal growth as a disciple of Jesus Christ. The rating of these behaviors will provide substantive quantitative data. The question to be asked is: *What are the key behaviors that growing disciples exhibit or should exhibit?* Following this single question will be a list of seventy-five behaviors, skills, or activities with the instructions: *Below, please rate each of the behaviors or skills to help determine which are important in growing as a disciple of Jesus Christ.* The listed items will be rated in one of three ways: (1) not important; (2) somewhat important; (3) very important. Each behavior/skill must be rated before the respondent can continue. The list of behaviors or skills can be found in the sample survey, Appendix B.

As noted above, these behaviors and/or skills are not meant to be exhaustive, nor are they to be interpreted as doctrinally sound for all approaches to the Christian faith; they are meant as a starting place and speak to the many areas of learning and praxis in the life of an adult disciple, covering broad categories such as: (1) praising and adoring God; (2) loving God and loving others; (3) belonging to the community of faith—the church; (4) growing to be more like Jesus; (5) serving God and serving others; and (6)
telling others the Good News of salvation through Christ. Appendix F contains a table showing which behaviors or skills fit within these six broad categories.

Following the rating of these behaviors, the participants will be given the opportunity to add their own suggestions of key behaviors or skills in a comment/essay box in the SurveyMonkey form. Any added suggestions will be collected by this researcher and regarded as helpful, additional, qualitative data that provides needed safeguards for internal validity, allowing the participants to expand the survey, eliciting a more complete and unbiased list of behaviors and/or skills.

**Part Two: Questions**

Following the rating of listed behaviors, and the contributions of additional behaviors from the respondents, two questions will be posed to secure substantive qualitative data. These questions will allow the participants the opportunity to contribute more of their own personal ideas to the research data. The first of these two questions addresses the disconnect between the experience of God’s grace and the lifelong development into the image of Christ.

1. *In your opinion, what elements, behaviors, tasks, and/or skills are missing in the lives of adult believers that cause a gap between conversion and further spiritual development?*

   This list will help identify what behaviors and/or skills that may be missing or lost that may help explain the suspension or interruption in the spiritual formation of many adult Christians in North America.

   The second of the qualitative data-gathering questions will begin to ascertain how assessment may be apprehended and designed.
2. What kind of assessment or evaluation will best help measure progress and mastery so that adult disciples and peer disciple-makers can monitor personal spiritual progress?

As this researcher has posited, careful, personalized, and intentional monitoring of spiritual development should help to measure growth and assist in planning developmental activities and lessons for growing adult disciples of Jesus Christ.

The survey is simply a hybrid form of field research in which the survey serves as observation of church leaders’ thoughts and opinions on the subject of discipleship. The survey results, both the quantitative and the qualitative results, will combine to become the field research journal of findings.

The field research will simply gather information for the creation of a list of behaviors. It does not assess the respondents, but asks them for their input and subjective opinion. This researcher will create a list of key behaviors for adult disciples in North America. Future experimental research may be done, and is highly encouraged by this researcher, into the accuracy and/or effectiveness of the final list to be postulated. Further, this researcher will create a proposed assessment tool for use in discipler-disciple relationships. Again, future research is encouraged by this researcher into the accuracy of the assessment tool in actual, practical discipling of adult disciples in North America.

**Part Three: Focus Group**

It is the plan of this researcher to take these seventy-five rated behaviors and/or skills, as well as the behaviors and/or skills added by the respondents, and distill them down into a list of thirty to forty key behaviors that are applicable to the church in North America. This list of actionable behaviors/skills may then be incorporated into a study
guide, handbook, or manual written by this researcher for adult disciples and peer
disciplers to use in the discipler-disciple relationship.

It is also the plan of this researcher to use the focus group to begin determining
ideas on how to measure and assess growth in the behaviors/skills on the actionable list.
This researcher hopes to create an evaluative tool to facilitate the face-to-face discipling
conversations between the adult disciple and the disciple-maker.

This researcher will convene a one-day focus group of five to ten pastors from a
variety of denominations. The members of the focus group will include professional
colleagues known by this researcher, as well as professional colleagues they choose and
bring with them, people not known by this researcher, the known/not known composition
of the group adding to the effective external validity of actionable results gleaned from
the focus group. This group of professionals from a cross-section of denominations will
work together to help narrow and clarify both the quantitative data and the qualitative
data into a working, actionable list of key behaviors.

This will be done using storyboarding techniques and the “The McNellis Master
Planning Model” this researcher learned in training workshops with McNellis
Compression Planning.\footnote{McNellis Compression Planning, http://www.mcnellisco.com [accessed January 21, 2014].} Compression Planning is used, as McNellis president and
founder Jerry McNellis says, “When you need a group to resolve a critical problem or
capture a major opportunity. It is not meant for situations where an individual genius can
solve and implement your thorny problem. Use it where you need a cross section of
ideas. . . .”\footnote{Ibid.} Jerry McNellis, who trained this researcher, was mentored by “one of the
most creative minds of modern times, the creator of Displayed Thinking for Disney, Mike Vance.\textsuperscript{308} The storyboarding techniques used in McNellis Compression Planning are much the same as those techniques instituted by Mike Vance’s mentor, Walt Disney, and still used today by the Disney Imagineers in creative planning, pulling together the linear thinking of engineer-mechanical types and the circular thinking of artist-creative types. Walt Disney designed his storyboarding techniques on the storyboarding practices of Leonardo Da Vinci.\textsuperscript{309}

The focus group will use the data collected by the Survey Monkey process to generate and develop ideas in a creative process called “churning,” like churning “cream into butter.”\textsuperscript{310} Pat McNellis, a Compression Planning trainer and the son of founder Jerry McNellis says, “The concept is that you have to work an idea to get something useful out of it.”\textsuperscript{311}

To facilitate the churning of ideas, this researcher will first visually prepare and post signs that describe the Overall Purpose of the focus session, which reads much like a book or movie title: “Growing Adult Disciples.” The Purposes of the Focus Group will then be posted: (1) “Defining Key Behaviors;” and (2) “How to Assess or Measure Spiritual Growth.”\textsuperscript{312} The Non-Purposes of the Focus Group will also be posted—the things the Focus Group will not do: (1) “Argue Theology and Doctrine;” (2) “Enlarge the

\textsuperscript{308} McNellis Compression Planning online.


\textsuperscript{310} McNellis Compression Planning online.

\textsuperscript{311} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{312} McNellis and McNellis, \textit{Training Notebook}, pt. 5, 2.
List of Key Behaviors;” (3) “Change the Quantitative Rating;” or (4) “Allow Doctrine or Dogma to Push Extremes.”

The creation of the purposes of the Compression Planning session requires careful thinking. “Getting realistic, understandable, verifiable, and measurable purposes is critical.” Poorly planned purposes can lead the focus group on wild goose chases; carefully planned and worded purposes can keep the focus group on task and produce higher quality results in less time.

If no discernable pattern or ranking is found of the survey’s list of seventy-five behaviors, the focus group will use a Compression Planning technique known as “bubbling up” to determine the highest rated behaviors. If a pattern or ranking can be discerned, the list will be put on the planning board, and the additional behaviors added by the respondents will also then be inserted into the list by “bubbling” in a focus phase.

The focus group will then work to split the behaviors/skills into three categories: (1) non-believer to new believer; (2) new believer to maturing believer; and (3) maturing believer to role-model. If a behavior does not fit into one of the three categories, it will be placed in a “recycle bin” for future consideration. If a behavior fits in more than one of the three categories, that behavior will be added to all applicable categories. This will allow the focus group to begin to visualize a developmental progression as a first step in imagining an assessment process or tool.

---

314 McNellis Compression Planning online.
When the focus group is finished exploring and focusing the data, it will all be written down and saved for use by this researcher in creating a handbook or guide, and an assessment tool or process, for use in the interaction between discipler and disciple. As mentioned earlier, further research into the efficacy of these proposed documents is encouraged by this researcher.

**Summary**

This researcher believes that most adult Christians in North America would benefit from personalized direction and oversight from a discipler who is further along in her walk with Christ. This researcher also believes that most adult Christians in North America want some kind of “mile marker” or measurement to provide assistance in assessing their spiritual growth. The results of the study will help in the creation of a list of key behaviors or “mile markers” in the discipleship journey, applicable for the majority of adult disciples in North American churches. The research will also bring to light elements, behaviors, or skills that may be missing that cause a pause in spiritual development. The research will then suggest some form of assessment or evaluation to help monitor discipleship progress.

This researcher believes there is no way to identify all the key behaviors or “mile markers” an adult believer should work on throughout an entire life of commitment to Christ. This study will identify behaviors that are considered to be the most important so that future research may be done, and so disciple-makers in the church may use these materials to motivate adult disciples. Likewise, any attempt to identify all causes for a suspension in spiritual formation will prove impossible. This research will attempt to identify the causes for interruption for many—but not all—adult Christians in North
America. Any ideas for assessment and evaluation will, similarly, be limited. However, the attempt to understand key behaviors and common causes for interruption in spiritual progress will, in this researcher’s opinion, point to some form of helpful subjective, self-analytic assessment tool to assist disciples and disciplers in starting, or re-starting, and maintaining the discipleship process.

From this research, this researcher will develop a guidebook for adult Christians and disciplers to use in delving more deeply into spiritual assessment and formulation of a plan for discipleship. This researcher will also develop an assessment tool, suitable for self-analysis and peer discipler/disciple analysis, designed to help determine where a person may be in the process of developing as a disciple of Jesus Christ in certain identified discipleship behaviors. These tools are intended to produce an easier and more effective implementation of a behavior-based approach to discipler-led, guided discipling.
CHAPTER FIVE
RESULTS AND ANALYSIS OF DATA

The research methodology for this project consisted of three parts: (1) a survey of behaviors, skills, or actions that may be associated with Christian discipleship; (2) three questions appended to the survey to obtain respondents’ qualitative data to accompany the survey’s quantitative data; and (3) a one-day focus group to distill both quantitative data and qualitative data into actionable results.

Survey

An Internet hyperlink was e-mailed to 1,073 people: senior pastors, associate pastors, executive pastors, worship leaders, and Christian educators in the Church of God (Anderson), the Churches of God (General Conference), Episcopalian, Foursquare, Independent Christian, Mennonite, Presbyterian, Society of Friends (Quaker), United Brethren, United Church of Christ, and United Methodist denominations, as well as to seminary students, recent seminary graduates, and the seminary faculty of Winebrenner Theological Seminary. The Internet link invited them to participate in a survey on the SurveyMonkey website.316

Respondents were asked to rate seventy-five behaviors or skills that they believe are important for an adult believer to embrace in order to be successful in his/her personal growth as a disciple of Jesus Christ. The question was asked: What are the key behaviors

316 SurveyMonkey, MySurveys.
that growing disciples exhibit or should exhibit? Following this single question was a list of seventy-five behaviors, skills, or activities with the instructions: Below, please rate each of the behaviors or skills to help determine which are important in growing as a disciple of Jesus Christ. Respondents were required to rate each item in one of three ways: (1) not important; (2) somewhat important; (3) very important. A sample survey is located in Appendix B.

There were 227 surveys returned, which is slightly more than a 25% response ratio (25.817%). Figure 5.1 shows the top forty behaviors as rated by the respondents. A full listing of all seventy-five behaviors ranked in the order of their average rating is found in Appendix C. The numbers in the rating columns refer to the number of respondents who chose that rating. The far-right column shows the average rating of the key behavior. (The far-left number is the question number from the survey.)

Top forty behaviors as rated and ranked by respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Behaviors</th>
<th>Three choices for ranking the behaviors—the numbers below show the dispersion of the 277 responses:</th>
<th>Average Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(These are the top forty behaviors from the survey listed according to their ranking—the average rating shown in the far right column. The numbers to the left of the behaviors below indicate the original order of the behaviors on the survey.)</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
<td>Somewhat Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Seeks God first.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33. Lives out the Great Commandment of loving God and loving others.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Loves people as Christ loved.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47. Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72. Desires to grow more and more into the likeness of Jesus Christ.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Behaviors</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
<td>Somewhat Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38. Understands sin, forgiveness, and grace.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Participation in the fellowship of the community of faith.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Spends time alone with God on a regular basis.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41. Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60. Believes that God answers prayer.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Developing spiritual fruit in life.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40. Understands prayer as conversation with God.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. Understands what it means to love one another as Christ loved us.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44. Believes the Holy Spirit is alive and active in the church today.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61. Lives a life of example.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Lives out the Great Commission.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. Understands and believes in Jesus Christ as fully God and fully human.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56. Committed to a life of prayer.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Shares the Good News of Christ with others.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48. Lives as an ambassador of Jesus Christ in the world.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Student of the Bible engaged in regular study.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and the Holy Spirit.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Engages in private, personal times of worship.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Shows compassion to all.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42. Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Behaviors</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
<td>Somewhat Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Presents life as an act of worship.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69. Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. Understands and believes in the eternality of God.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75. Hates the sin – but loves the sinner.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Submits to accountability in spiritual development.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46. Is able and willing to help lead a person to faith in Christ.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36. Belief in real, tangible spiritual enemy known as Satan or the devil.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66. Willing to lay down one’s life for others and/or for the cause of Christ.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Lives in intentional community with other Christ-followers.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Actively participate in corporate worship.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74. Shows hospitality to others to both those in the church and those outside the church.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Understands and engages in relational evangelism.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Practicing tither.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 5.1 Top forty behaviors as rated and ranked by respondents
Questions

Question One of Three

In addition to the rating of these seventy-five behaviors, the respondents were given the opportunity to add their own suggestions of key behaviors or skills in a comment/essay box in the SurveyMonkey form (considered the first of the three qualitative questions), allowing the respondents to expand the survey, eliciting a more complete and unbiased list of behaviors and/or skills. Of the 227 surveys received, 101 respondents contributed to this list (36.46%). Appendix D lists the additional behaviors and comments added by the respondents.

Question Two of Three

In addition to the rating of listed behaviors, and the contributions of additional behaviors, two more questions were posed. These questions allowed the respondents the opportunity to contribute their own personal ideas. The second of three questions addressed the disconnect between the experience of God’s grace and the lifelong development into the image of Christ: “In your opinion, what elements, behaviors, tasks, and/or skills are missing in the lives of adult believers that cause a pause or gap between conversion and further spiritual development?” This list of ideas was meant to help identify those behaviors or skills that respondents felt may be missing or lost, helping to explain the suspension or interruption in the spiritual formation of many adult Christians in North America. Of the 227 surveys received, 249 respondents contributed to this list of ideas (89.89%). The specific ideas provided by the respondents are found in Appendix E.
Question Three of Three

The third of the three questions was to help determine how assessment or measurement may be designed: “What kind of assessment or evaluation will best help measure progress and mastery so that adult disciples and peer disciple-makers can monitor personal spiritual progress?” It has been the assumption of this researcher that careful, personalized, and intentional monitoring of spiritual development will help adult disciples, and the disciplers who work with them, to measure growth within the discipleship process, enabling peer disciplers to plan developmental activities to guide growing adult disciples. Of the 227 surveys received, 237 contributed ideas to this question on assessment/measurement (85.55%). Like the responses to question two, the ideas contributed by the respondents for question three are found in Appendix E.

This field research simply gathered information for the creation of a list of behaviors. It did not seek to assess the respondents, but simply asked them for their input and subjective opinions. The list of behaviors was then sent to a focus group. The behaviors and/or skills are not meant to be exhaustive, nor are they to be interpreted as doctrinally sound for all approaches to the Christian faith; they are meant as a starting place and speak to the many areas of learning and praxis in the life of an adult disciple.

Focus Group

This researcher took the results from the survey, as recorded in Appendices B, C, and D, to a focus group made up of twelve people (a pastor, church elders, Christian educators, small group leaders, college students, and maturing Christians). This group of Christian leaders was tasked with working together to help narrow and clarify the data into an actionable list of key behaviors using Storyboarding and Compression Planning.
techniques. The goal was to further define the key behaviors and brainstorm how to assess or measure spiritual progress, for the purposes of creating actionable information this researcher could use to create a study guide for adult disciples, a manual for peer disciples, and an assessment tool for use in the disciple/discipler relationship.

Step One

This researcher prepared and posted signs to describe the Overall Purpose of the focus session: “Growing Adult Disciples,” and the Purposes of the Focus Group: (1) “Defining Key Behaviors;” and (2) “How to Assess or Measure Spiritual Growth.” In addition, Non-Purposes were posted to keep the focus group away from non-essentials—the things not on the agenda: (1) “Argue Theology and Doctrine;” (2) “Change the Quantitative Rating;” or (3) “Allow Doctrine or Dogma to Push Extremes.”

Because a discernable ranking was found in the survey’s list of seventy-five behaviors, this researcher, in an effort to keep the process from becoming too unwieldy, selected only the first forty behaviors from that list (see Appendix C) as a starting place for the focus group. Additional behaviors (provided by the respondents—see Appendix C) could be added into the list by the focus group using a creative process called “churning” where focus group members were encouraged to talk together, rate, and rank the behaviors. Six additional behaviors were added during the “churning” session: (1) Teachable: demonstrates openness as a life-long learner in the things of Christ; (2) Lives

---

317 McNellis Compression Planning online.
318 McNellis and McNellis, Training Notebook, pt. 5, 2.
319 Ibid., pt. 5, 6.
320 McNellis Compression Planning online.
as a peacemaker; (3) Forgiveness: knows the importance of giving and receiving forgiveness; (4) Personal relationship with Jesus; (5) Shows evidence of life-change and spiritual growth; and (6) Understands what it means to say “Jesus is Lord.” All forty-six behaviors were written on note cards and placed on a display board for visualization.

Step Two

An additional session utilizing a process known as “bubbling” to allow the focus group to “vote” on the behaviors on the list. Each participant was given three sticky dots and was asked to vote to keep on the list their top three choices of behaviors. The rules were laid out: (1) a participant could vote for three behaviors; (2) a participant could not place more than one of their dots on a single behavior; (3) once a behavior had three dots, no additional dots could be added; (4) participants were not required to place all three dots—if their three choices already had three dots (votes) they could vote for other behaviors or vote for none at all. The following fifteen behaviors received no dots, so they were physically removed from the list in the middle of the board, and moved to a section at the side of the board marked “recycle bin.”

- Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and Holy Spirit
- Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God.
- Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us.
- Understands what it means to love one another as Christ loved us.
- Lives out the Great Commission.
- Hates the sin—but loves the sinner.
- Belief in a real tangible spiritual enemy known as Satan or the devil.
- Shares the Good News of Christ with others.
- Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.
- Understands prayer as conversation with God.
- Believes the Holy Spirit is alive and active in the church today.
- Willing to lay down one’s life for others and/or for the cause of Christ.
- Shows compassion to all.
- Presents life as an act of worship.
- Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.

Figure 5.2 Initial recycled behaviors; those receiving no votes in initial bubbling process
During the “bubbling” process, the group asked if there could be an addition or a clarification of the behaviors to include a specific mention of “being missional” or “engagement in short-term mission trips.” This researcher declined that request since neither of these items was found on the additional suggested behaviors list from the respondents (an oversight or omission this researcher finds quite perplexing). This researcher clarified that these items could be revisited as the group worked through the comments from respondents regarding the cause of pauses or gaps between conversion and further spiritual development (Appendix E).

After removing the fifteen behaviors to the recycle bin, the remaining thirty-one behaviors were recorded and removed from the board. Focus then turned to those behaviors in the “recycle bin.” This researcher read each one to the group to determine if any of the behaviors should be added back into the list and which ones should be permanently discarded. Through the discussion, the focus group indicated that some of the behaviors seemed redundant and thus received no votes. For example, Shares the Good News of Christ with others and Lives out the Great Commission were viewed as being the same behavior, and therefore apparently cancelled each other out in the bubbling process. Both were affirmed as needed; both were placed back in the main list. The behaviors Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and Holy Spirit, Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God, and Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us were seen less as “behaviors” and more as pre-requisites for being considered a Christian. In the ensuing discussion, the group came to realize these were key “initial” or “starting out” behaviors, and so they were added back to the main list. Similar discussions added all the behaviors back into the main list except for one:
Hates the sin—but loves the sinner. This was viewed as more of a cliché than a behavior, and another behavior, Loves people as Christ loved, seemed to say it better.

Through the “bubbling” process, the “churned” behaviors became a workable list of forty-five behaviors.\(^{321}\) (See Figure 5.3.) The number forty-five was arrived at only through the “bubbling” process. The number could easily have been thirty-five or sixty-five. In fact, at one point in the initial churning discussions, the list was down to thirty-four, and then dropped down to twenty-four. The group asked if all seventy-five of the original behaviors could be included, but was instructed by this researcher to keep the list manageable. The focus group worked to create this list of actionable behaviors:

Focus Group’s list of Key Behaviors—actionable list

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus Group’s list of Key Behaviors—actionable list</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Seeks God first.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Lives out the Great Commandment of loving God and loving others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Loves people as Christ loved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Desires to grow more and more into the likeness of Jesus Christ.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Understands sin, forgiveness, and grace.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Participation in the fellowship of the community of faith.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Spends time alone with God on a regular basis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Believes that God answers prayer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Developing spiritual fruit in life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Lives out the Great Commission.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Understands and believes in Jesus Christ as fully God and fully human.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Committed to a life of prayer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Shares the Good News of Christ with others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Lives as an ambassador of Jesus Christ in the world.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Student of the Bible engaged in regular study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and the Holy Spirit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Engages in private, personal times of worship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Shows compassion to all.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Presents life as an act of worship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Willing to lay down one’s life for others and/or for the cause of Christ.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Lives in intentional community with other Christ-followers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Actively participates in corporate worship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Shows hospitality to others to both those in the church and those outside the church.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Understands and engages in relational evangelism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Practicing tither.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Lives as a peacemaker.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Forgiveness: knows the importance of giving and receiving forgiveness</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

| Understands prayer as conversation with God. |
| Understands what it means to love one another as Christ loved us. |
| Believes the Holy Spirit is alive and active in the church today. |
| Lives a life of example. |
| Understands and believes in the eternality of God. |
| Submits to accountability in spiritual development. |
| Able and willing to help lead a person to faith in Christ. |
| Belief in a real, tangible spiritual enemy known as Satan or the devil. |
| Personal relationship with Jesus. |
| Teachable: demonstrates openness as a life-long learner in the things of Christ. |
| Shows evidence of life-change and spiritual growth. |
| Understands what it means to say “Jesus is Lord.” |

Figure 5.3 Focus Group’s list of key behaviors—actionable list

**Step Three**

Once the list was set, this researcher introduced the focus group to the six broad content categories identified in chapter four, namely: (1) praising and adoring God; (2) loving God and loving others; (3) belonging to the community of faith—the church; (4) growing to be more like Jesus; (5) serving God and serving others; and (6) telling others the Good News of salvation through Christ. This researcher created the original list of seventy-five key behaviors simply as a starting place for research, believing these behaviors spoke to the many areas of learning and praxis in the life of an adult disciple as suggested by the broad categories above. Appendix F contains this researcher’s attempt to estimate where the seventy-five behaviors might likely fit under the six broad content categories.

This researcher assigned easily-recognizable titles to the six broad content categories to help clarify their content and placed them on the board for the focus group to see, and under which the key behaviors and/or skills could be categorized. Those single-word labels were: Worship, Love, Belong, Grow, Serve, and Tell, corresponding to the numbered list above.
The focus group was instructed to break into six groups of no more than three people in each. The groups worked together to divide the six broad content areas so that each of the six groups would represent one content area. The assignment for each group was to take the list of forty-five behaviors and decide which behaviors fit with their content area. The focus group was reminded that, at this point in the process, no new behaviors could be added, nor could the wording of the behaviors be modified. If the group felt a behavior needed to be removed, it could be placed in the “recycle bin” for future consideration. If a behavior fit in more than one of the six broad content areas, that behavior could be added to all applicable content areas simply by creating an additional card with the behavior written on it. Appendix G contains a table showing how the final list of forty-five behaviors fit under the content categories as arrived at by the group.

Step Four

Once the behaviors were placed in content categories, the focus group was tasked to further identify how the behaviors fit into three developmental categories: (1) non-believer to new believer; (2) new believer to maturing believer; and (3) maturing believer to role-model. This allowed the focus group to begin to visualize a developmental progression as a first step in imagining an assessment process. Such a developmental progression is illustrated in Figure 5.4, with the full forty-five key behaviors being listed rank and file by both content categories and developmental categories.

This researcher wishes to clarify that some readers may take exception to these developmental categories being similar to those spoken of in LeRoy Eims’ book, *The Lost Art of Disciple Making*, in which Eims suggests three “levels” of Christians: the
convert, the disciple, and the worker. This researcher spoke against these “levels” in Chapter Two of this project, suggesting it shows it is possible to be a Christian without being a disciple, a position this researcher holds untenable. The developmental categories presented by this researcher are quite different in that they do not suggest one can be a Christian without being a disciple, but allow that there is a scope and sequence—a progression of maturity—from being a non-believer to a role-model of the faith, a truth nearly every pastor, theologian, and adult Christ-follower will affirm exists. This is clearly what Eims was trying to suggest in his book, which this researcher, admittedly, has found of great benefit, especially the “training objectives” for a disciple, which undergird this researcher’s belief in the possibility of creating an actionable list of key behaviors and a way of measuring their development.

Developmental Progression apprehended by Focus Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Non-Believer to New Believer</th>
<th>New Believer to Maturing Believer</th>
<th>Maturing Believer to Role-Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Worship**                 | • Understand and believes in Jesus Christ as fully God and fully human.  
• Actively participates in corporate worship.  
• Understands and believes in the eternality of God.  
• Presents life as an act of worship.  
• Engages in private, personal times of worship.  
• Lives a life of example.  
• Spends time alone with God on a regular basis.  
• Practicing tither.  
• Engages in private, personal times of worship.  |  

| **Love**                    | • Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.  
• Understands what it means to love one another as Christ loved us.  
• Lives out the Great Commandment of loving God and loving others.  
• Spends time alone with God on a regular basis.  
• Understands what it means to love one another as Christ loved us.  
• Forgiveness: knows the importance of giving and receiving forgiveness.  
• Willing to lay down one’s life for others and/or for the cause of Christ.  
• Loves people as Christ loved.  
• Understands prayer as conversation with God.  
• Committed to a life of prayer.  |  

322 Eims, 61, 124.

323 Ibid., 75.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Belong</th>
<th>New Believer to Maturing Believer</th>
<th>Maturing Believer to Role-Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
<td>Lives in intentional community with other Christ-followers. Developing spiritual fruit in life.</td>
<td>Lives a life of example. Practicing tither. Loves people as Christ loved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation in the fellowship of the community of faith.</td>
<td>Submits to accountability in spiritual development.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lives as a peacemaker.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belong</td>
<td>Grow</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal relationship with Jesus.</td>
<td>Shows evidence of life-change and spiritual growth.</td>
<td>Understands what it means to say “Jesus is Lord.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Believes the Holy Spirit is alive and active in the church today.</td>
<td>Seeks God first.</td>
<td>Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and the Holy Spirit.</td>
<td>Believes that God answers prayer.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understands sin, forgiveness, and grace.</td>
<td>Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belief in a real, tangible spiritual enemy known as Satan or the devil.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understands prayer as conversation with God.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grow</td>
<td>Serve</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
<td>Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
<td>Able and willing to help lead a person to faith in Christ.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.</td>
<td>Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loves people as Christ loved.</td>
<td>Loves people as Christ loved.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shows hospitality to others, including those in the church as well as non-believers.</td>
<td>Shows hospitality to others, including those in the church as well as non-believers.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shows compassion to all.</td>
<td>Shows compassion to all.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tell</td>
<td>Tell</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Live out the Great Commission.</td>
<td>Lives out the Great Commission.</td>
<td>Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lives as an ambassador of Jesus Christ in the world.</td>
<td>Lives a life of example.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shares the Good News of Christ with others.</td>
<td>Understands and engages in relational evangelism.</td>
<td>Able and willing to help lead a person to faith in Christ.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 5.4 Developmental Progression apprehended by Focus Group
These forty-five key behaviors—applicable to Christ’s church in North America, organized into broad content categories, and further organized into developmental categories—becomes an actionable compilation of behaviors, skills, or mile-markers that can be modified and incorporated into a study guide and manual written by this researcher for adult disciples and peer disciplers to use in the discipling relationship.

Step Five

Once the focus group had identified the forty-five behaviors and had visualized both the content categorization and developmental progression, the focus moved to brainstorming how to measure and/or assess growth in these behaviors/skills. Utilizing the survey responses to the questions, “In your opinion, what elements, behaviors, tasks, and/or skills are missing in the lives of adult believers that cause a pause or gap between conversion and further spiritual development?” and “What kind of assessment or evaluation will best help measure progress and mastery so that adult disciples and peer disciple-makers can monitor personal spiritual progress?” this researcher helped facilitate a brainstorming session with the focus group.

All of the qualitative responses from the survey were distributed to each member of the focus group (Appendix E), and after reading the respondents’ input, the focus group then brainstormed by giving ideas and suggestions to two clarifying questions that were placed in the center of the display board: “How do we motivate people to keep growing after they come to faith in Christ?” and “How can we best measure progress?”

The rules for the brainstorming session were very simple: (1) there is no such thing as a bad idea; (2) thinking outside of the box is needed and expected; (3) no one can argue with someone else or put down any idea. A scribe was assigned to attempt to
capture the essence of all input; those notes are reproduced in edited form in Appendix H. Main or big ideas were captured on note cards, written by the contributor, and placed in on the display board to help the group stay on track with brainstorming and remember what had already been said.

The brainstorming started on the first clarifying question, “How do we motivate people to keep growing after they come to faith in Christ?” The discussion progressed for fifteen minutes, at which point this researcher felt the discussion provided an opportunity to pose the second clarifying question, “How can we best measure progress?” The entire brainstorming session lasted forty-five minutes.

Appendix H contains the ideas that were generated by the focus group, based in part on the comments from the survey respondents (Appendix E). This researcher will utilize these ideas and suggestions, along with the input from the survey respondents, to create a study guide, a discipler’s handbook, and an evaluative tool to facilitate the face-to-face discipling conversations between the adult disciple and the disciple-maker.

It is interesting to note some of the reactions of the focus group to the comments from the respondents. Some felt the majority of the comments regarding missing elements were helpful, especially comments worded as “positives” that were absent, but including the comments that were worded as “negatives” that were present. Some of the focus group members felt a few of the uncategorized comments were simply unhelpful, and a few were mean-spirited; this researcher directed the focus group to disregard the uncategorized comments.

All members of the focus group saw a pattern emerge: discipleship under a mentor is critical; investment in understanding Scripture supports the process;
maintaining commitment to the growth process is fundamental; connection in meaningful relationships within a local church cannot be overemphasized; and there needs to be a systematic pathway or map to help adult believers walk on the journey of spiritual growth. When any one of these key components is missing, there can be a gap, pause, or, as one member of the focus group stated, a “disconnect” between the conversion from non-believer to new believer and the continued growth into Christlikeness. 324

Of special note, the focus group felt the concept of becoming “self-feeders” between Sundays was important and a concept largely missing from their experiences in the Christian faith. 325 Coupled with the disciple/discipler relationship, a believer who is consistent in working to feed oneself should be a growing disciple of Jesus Christ. The idea of embracing “a kingdom life of submission to Jesus” was also an attractive concept, and was discussed as being how believers should be living out their everyday lives. 326 Another special note was that the concept of “being on mission” did not turn up in any of the survey respondents’ comments in any concrete way. 327 The focus group did specifically request that this omission should be addressed in the final guide, manual, and self-assessment tool.

When the discussion turned to how to assess, one particular attitude was raised quickly and became a focus of discussion: some of the respondents were stridently

---

324 Focus group participant #1, Focus Group led by author, Sylvania, OH, June 23, 2014. Responses are kept anonymous although the members of the Focus Group have granted permission for their responses to be shared; please see Appendix L.

325 Survey respondent #65, survey respondent #198, Survey by author, Findlay, OH, June 21, 2014. All respondents were anonymous. (Please see anonymity statement in Appendix B.) The numbers associated with the responses indicate the order in which the responses were received.

326 Ibid., survey respondent #113.

327 Focus group, participant #2.
opposed to any kind of assessment or evaluation. Some respondents felt it is not possible
to evaluate or assess something as personal, intangible, and subjective as personal
spiritual growth, while other respondents felt a move to assessment was, basically,
moving in the wrong direction. Comments ranged from not being a “fan of assessment,”
incredulity regarding assessment, suggesting “I do not think there is any ‘product’ that
can be developed to measure such progress,” to outright hostility towards such a process:
“I don’t think there is an assessment or evaluation that could ever be even close to
adequate, nor should one ever be created.”328 One respondent stated that assessment is not
possible and that “only God can assess,” adding that “They should sit down, be still
before the Lord, have their Bible open (which they live by and read every day) and ask
Him (sic) to guide them and help them understand how to live their faith in a way that
would be pleasing to Him (sic).”329 One respondent asked, “Is a formal assessment or
evaluation really necessary?” while another suggested he/she was “not convinced that
these characteristics are quantifiable.”330 A respondent sensed this as intrusive, stating that
“Each person needs to exam (sic) their own heart…. Only God knows what is inside …
people need to stop trying to exam (sic) the hearts of others! God will lead you to where
you should be if you stay open to His (sic) leading.”331 It was clear that some respondents
considered any kind of standardization or assessment a move towards cookie-cutter faith
and Pharisaical legalism.332

328 Survey, respondent #26, respondent #51, and respondent #170.
329 Ibid., respondent #3.
330 Ibid., respondent #11, and respondent #69.
331 Ibid., respondent #37.
332 Ibid., respondent #180, and respondent #170.
This researcher must emphasize that the use of an assessment tool is not about quantifying spiritual growth, but measuring one individual’s move from one stage of growth to the next, under the watchful eye and caring heart of a peer discipler. The concept of assessing spiritual progress is not about numbers or metrics or making all believers the same, with the exception that they should all be moving towards Christlikeness. This is about finding a self-assessment tool that will facilitate and improve the disciple/discipler relationship and guide a disciple along the path of being discipled to be like Jesus Christ.

The focus group believed that some kind of tool was needed since the existing discipleship strategy the church-at large is currently employing does not seem to be working. Telling people to talk to God with your Bible open may be kind-hearted and well-meant, but it does not answer the question posed by so many struggling adult believers: how do I know if I am making progress? Telling new believers to listen to what God is telling them is not helpful when new believers have no idea how to listen to God or what the very next steps are to take to grow spiritually. The focus group sensed that much of the pushback from respondents was because they may be mature believers who understood the process yet had lost sight of the uncertainty of next steps in spiritual growth once the excitement of conversion subsides and life begins to intrude once again.

This researcher found several comments from survey respondents that seem to resonate with this researcher’s presuppositions regarding assessment. These comments suggest that the concept of peer disciplers, assessment, and a listing of key behaviors or mile markers in the life of an adult disciple are positive steps in the right direction in discipleship. One respondent recommended “A plan or model, adapted to the individual
but [showing] a progression of both study and praxis that helps to insure all areas of knowledge are covered.” Another respondent admitted, “Not sure of the content,” then added, “it should be something made available for self-evaluation—a written reminder for the new believer of benchmarks that eventually should be met that reflect spiritual growth.” This researcher found encouragement from the suggestion that “A weekly meeting or evaluation is needed to keep the adult disciples on track. Adult disciples should be asked questions about how often they pray, how often they read the Bible, how often they share their faith with others, and in what areas of their life they would like to see more growth.” In a similar manner, a respondent suggested, “Some ways to evaluate would be 1) Are they involved in a small group Bible study? 2) Do they attend Worship regularly? 3) Do they have an accountability partner? 4) Are they aware of and using their spiritual gifts? These would be a few ‘markers’ that could be used to see if there is any growth in the believer.” Another simply recommended: “A ‘map’ which provides a standard.”

Thirty-four respondents offered proactive, positive comments that provided added impetus to the creation of the study guide, manual, and self-assessment tool. (These comments can be found in Appendix I.)

**Summary**

A survey sent to 1,073 people asked for a ranking of seventy-five key behaviors or skills of adult disciples of Jesus Christ. There were 277 total responses, and 101 of

---

333 Survey, respondent #125.

334 Ibid., respondent #216.

335 Ibid., respondent #29.

336 Ibid., respondent #210.
those respondents added to the list with additional suggestions. More than 200 respondents also gave insight and ideas regarding the disconnect between the point of Christian conversion and the ongoing development into Christlikeness, as well as how assessment or measurement might be developed or designed. Some respondents viewed the concept of assessment and a standardized list of behaviors as an incorrect approach to discipleship, while others gave encouragement and support to such a strategy.

This researcher believes that most adult Christians in North America want some kind of list of “mile markers” and/or some kind of self-assessment and long-term measurement to provide assistance in evaluating their spiritual growth. Through a survey and a focus group, this researcher has created an actionable list of key behaviors or skills for adult disciples in North America. The data from the survey identified some causes for the interruption in spiritual development for many adult Christians in North America. In addition, the focus group added new insights and has given some helpful direction into this researcher’s work to develop a subjective, self-analytic assessment tool to assist disciples and disciplers in starting, or re-starting, and maintaining the discipleship process. From this research, this researcher will also develop a manual to give direction, ideas, and techniques to peer disciplers, and a guidebook for adult Christians and peer disciplers to use in delving more deeply into spiritual assessment and formulation of a plan for discipleship. These tools will be developed to produce a more effective implementation of a behavior-based approach to discipler-led, guided discipling.

Future research is also encouraged by this researcher into the accuracy of the list of behaviors for adult disciples in North America, believing that additional behaviors can be identified and used to help the forward momentum of adult discipleship.
CHAPTER SIX

SUMMARY, FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This researcher believes that many pastors and adult believers lose sight of the fact that the Christian faith involves ongoing spiritual formation and that this process of learning is highly individual and requires intentionality. While each disciple has his or her own unique style of learning, one key element generally missing in many adult believers’ spiritual development is the input of a peer discipler. “To move beyond the seeking stage, we must have a teacher. . . .” The motivational assistance of a peer discipler can help the individual understand and embrace the “subjective value of a goal” as well as the “expectations for successful attainment of that goal.”

There needs to be a great deal of commitment and investment of time and energy into the discipleship process. The apostle Peter tells followers of Christ to “make every effort to add to your faith. . . .” and then lists a number of attributes believers should work to enhance, adding that if disciples “possess these qualities in increasing measure, they will keep [us] from being ineffective and unproductive in [our] knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ.” Richard Foster suggests, “. . . it would be proper to speak of ‘the path of disciplined grace.’ It is ‘grace’ because it is free; it is ‘disciplined’ because there is


338 Ambrose et al., 69.

339 2 Pt 1:3-9.
something for us to do.”340 Spiritual growth in Christ must be both intentional and ongoing.

**Summary**

This researcher began this research project with this problem statement: the majority of adult believers are unsure of how to nurture their spiritual formation, unsure of how to grow, unsure of what activities in which to engage, unsure of what behaviors they should develop, concerned that there is no well-defined program of study, and concerned that there is no effective measurement of spiritual progress. In this researcher’s opinion, something is needed to help adult disciples find the proper behaviors and activities in which to engage, and to help them map out and assess their spiritual growth, especially with the help of a peer discipler. Because of personal pastoral ministry experience and discipleship work spanning two decades involving helping adult disciples navigate their personal spiritual journeys, this researcher approached the research project with the assumption that becoming and remaining a disciple of Jesus Christ requires intentionality, personalization, oversight, and continual evaluation.

Earlier in this project this researcher reviewed theological literature and literature from other fields including anthropology, business, education, psychology, science, and sociology. The research encompassed multiple scientific theories of human development and function, learning styles, teaching techniques, and adult learning theories. Current material on discipleship was also reviewed.

What was discovered was that, to best impart knowledge, there must be some effort made on the part of the teacher to fully understand how the individual learner best

---

learns. This suggests a personal relationship between teacher and learner. The research data supported that approach. The discipling relationship between a disciple and a peer discipler was considered a vital ingredient in developing any kind of discipleship program or process. The supervision and personal investment of a peer discipler, and the disciple learning by imitation, is foundational for learning, and is the basis of the peer discipler-disciple learning paradigm.

The literature on engagement theory suggested that a learner needs to be able to see self-improvement while also sensing being good at an activity, while proficiency theory suggested that, as a learner gains expertise or expanded abilities in the learning environment where the experiences are positive and constructive, the learner will continue to engage in those activities, and will continue to find success in learning. To see self-improvement and to gain expertise, the learner must know what skills, behaviors, and activities must be learned. The research data supported this understanding that the discovery and engagement of essential, even standardized, skills and behaviors of Christian discipleship will support and guide the maturation, formation, and spiritual development of an adult disciple.

The review of literature suggested that learning involves some form of personal assessment to know how well one is progressing; one must not only know what skills must be mastered, there must be some avenue for measuring progress towards success. The research data suggested that, while such a tool may be difficult to construct, some

341 Whitton, 601.
342 Knox, 381.
form of assessment or evaluative process for measuring the engagement of the key
behaviors and skills should be created and implemented.

There were some detractors; some survey respondents denounced any attempt at
standardization or assessment as folly. Some stated that discipleship is only between the
Holy Spirit and the believer, and any attempt to enhance, support, or systematize
discipleship is worldly influence. Yet, the reality is that adult disciples are asking for
help, and the church has been offering little other than platitudes and well wishes for far
too many generations.

The majority of the research respondents believed something can and should be
done to support and enhance the disciple/peer discipler relationship, insisting that it is this
discipleship relationship that is most central to the success of adult disciples growing in
Christ-likeness. The research clearly suggested that spiritual growth in Christ must be
intentional and ongoing, it must be personalized, it must involve ongoing assessment,
and, most importantly, it requires the supervision and input of a caring, peer discipler to
be most effective.

**Findings**

The research methodology for this project consisted of three parts: (1) a survey of
behaviors, skills, or actions that may be associated with Christian discipleship; (2) three
questions appended to the survey to obtain respondents’ qualitative data to accompany
the survey’s quantitative data; and (3) a one-day focus group, made up of church leaders
from youth to adult, was convened to distill both quantitative data and qualitative data
into actionable results.
The seventy-five key behaviors were chosen by this researcher based on the researcher’s review of the literature, as well as the life experiences and pastoral experiences of this researcher, to give respondents a place to start in ranking behaviors and adding behaviors to the mix. Some of the key behaviors were worded to be innocuous (“Love the sinner but hate the sin”) or inflammatory (“Speaking in tongues”). Some were more post-modern in their scope (“Lives in intentional community with other Christ-followers”) while some were traditional (“Faithful Sunday morning attendance”).

Key behaviors were rated and ranked by survey respondents, which were then carefully reduced to a list of forty-five actionable behaviors by a focus group, through a process of Storyboarding and Compression Planning. The behaviors are listed in Figure 6.1 in no particular order.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>• Seeks God first.</th>
<th>• Lives out the Great Commission.</th>
<th>• Willing to lay down one’s life for others and/or for the cause of Christ.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Lives the Great Commandment of loving God and loving others.</td>
<td>• Understands and believes in Jesus Christ as fully God and fully human.</td>
<td>• Lives in intentional community with other Christ-followers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Loves people as Christ loved.</td>
<td>• Committed to a life of prayer.</td>
<td>• Actively participates in corporate worship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.</td>
<td>• Shares the Good News of Christ with others.</td>
<td>• Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Desires to grow more and more into the likeness of Jesus Christ.</td>
<td>• Lives as an ambassador of Jesus Christ in the world.</td>
<td>• Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Understands sin, forgiveness, and grace.</td>
<td>• Student of the Bible engaged in regular study.</td>
<td>• Shows hospitality to others to both those in the church and those outside the church.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Participation in the fellowship of the community of faith.</td>
<td>• Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and the Holy Spirit.</td>
<td>• Understands and engages in relational evangelism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Spends time alone with God on a regular basis.</td>
<td>• Engages in private, personal times of worship.</td>
<td>• Practicing tither.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God.</td>
<td>• Shows compassion to all.</td>
<td>• Lives as a peacemaker.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Believes that God answers prayer.</td>
<td>• Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Presents life as an act of worship.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These behaviors, in this researcher’s opinion, could become a standardized list of “mile markers” for adult disciples in North America. The mile markers can be said to be key behaviors, discipleship activities, or skills that can be observed, personalized, developed, and measured in the context of the disciple-peer discipler relationship.

Additionally, this researcher believes the list may be applicable to adult disciples in many other countries and in many denominational contexts because these mile markers appear to transcend nationality, conform to Christian orthodoxy and orthopraxy, and can be presented in ways that affirm denominational preferences. Additional study would need to be done to determine the validity of these assertions.

The focus group then categorized the list of forty-five behaviors by content categories (Worship, Love, Belong, Grow, Serve, Tell; see Appendix G). These six broad content categories were identified by this researcher in Chapter Four as praising and adoring God, loving God and loving others, belonging to the community of faith—the church, growing to be more like Jesus, serving God and serving others; and telling others the Good News of salvation through Christ. The first two, Worship and Love, have to do...
with the “upward” aspect or focus of the spiritual lives of disciples—those things that are God-focused, and speak about knowing God. The second two, Belong and Grow, have to do with the “inward” focus of spiritual life—those things that are about edifying the disciple internally, and speak to growing in Christ. The final two, Serve and Tell, have to do with the “outward” focus of spiritual life—those things that speak to how disciples share Christ with the world.

The focus group further categorized the list of forty-five behaviors by developmental categories (non-believer to new believer; new believer to maturing believer; and maturing believer to role-model) creating a chart of development progression to show how these mile markers might best be engaged and developed in the life of an adult disciple. It is important to note that this continuum from non-believer to role model is not meant to become a classification of Christians; they are positions or labels on a continuum of growth, showing a progression of growth as true disciples of Jesus Christ.

The scope and segmentation (the rank and file organization), as apprehended by the focus group, can be seen in Figure 6.2 (identical to Figure 5.4 in the previous chapter). This organization helps illuminate an inherent developmental progression of the key discipleship behaviors, and provides impetus for the creation of tools to help disciples and peer disciplers.

---

344 Richard J. Foster, *Prayer: Finding the Heart’s True Home* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1992), xii. I believe Richard Foster first used the terms “inward,” “upward, and “outward” when he described the triune movements of prayer. No further citation will be made in reference to this aspect of Foster’s work within this paragraph.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Non-Believer to New Believer</th>
<th>New Believer to Maturing Believer</th>
<th>Maturing Believer to Role-Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Worship</strong></td>
<td><strong>Love</strong></td>
<td><strong>Belong</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Understand and believes in Jesus Christ as fully God and fully human.</td>
<td>• Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.</td>
<td>• Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Actively participates in corporate worship.</td>
<td>• Understands what it means to love one another as Christ loved us.</td>
<td>• Participation in the fellowship of the community of faith.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Understands and believes in the eternality of God.</td>
<td>• Lives out the Great Commandment of loving God and loving others.</td>
<td>• Lives as a peacemaker.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grow</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Personal relationship with Jesus.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Believes the Holy Spirit is alive and active in the church today.</td>
<td>• Shows evidence of life-change and spiritual growth.</td>
<td>• Understands what it means to say “Jesus is Lord.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and the Holy Spirit.</td>
<td>• Seeks God first.</td>
<td>• Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Understands sin, forgiveness, and grace.</td>
<td>• Believes that God answers prayer.</td>
<td>• Submits to accountability in spiritual development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Belief in a real, tangible spiritual enemy known as Satan or the Devil.</td>
<td>• Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us.</td>
<td>• Teachable: demonstrates openness as a life-long learner in the things of Christ.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God.</td>
<td>• Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
<td>• Practicing tither.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Understands prayer as conversation with God.</td>
<td>• Student of the Bible engaged in regular study.</td>
<td>• Committed to a life of prayer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Developing spiritual fruit in life.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Engages in private, personal times of worship.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Desires to grow more and more into the likeness of Jesus Christ.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 6.2 Developmental Progression apprehended by the Focus Group

**Conclusions**

This progression is clarified as those mile markers a disciple should be “discovering” about faith in Christ, followed by those mile markers a disciple should be “developing” as a maturing believer, culminating in those mile makers a disciple should be “demonstrating” as a role model in the faith.

This researcher took literary liberty in fine-tuning the wording and the number of mile markers in the developmental progression for possible future publication. For example, “Lives out the Great Commandment of loving God and loving others” could be worded: “Discovering the Great Commandment,” or “I have discovered the Great Commandment.” What follows is a chart showing the final developmental progression of the mile markers as fine-tuned by this researcher. (See Appendix J, “Guide for Disciples,” for details on how this developmental progression can be used.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Serve</th>
<th>New Believer to Maturing Believer</th>
<th>Maturing Believer to Role-Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
<td>• Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.</td>
<td>• Loves people as Christ loved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Shows hospitality to others, including those in the church as well as non-believers.</td>
<td>• Shows compassion to all.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.</td>
<td>• Able and willing to help lead a person to faith in Christ.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tell</th>
<th>Non-Believer to New Believer</th>
<th>New Believer to Maturing Believer</th>
<th>Maturing Believer to Role-Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Live out the Great Commission.</td>
<td>• Lives out the Great Commission.</td>
<td>• Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Lives as an ambassador of Jesus Christ in the world.</td>
<td>• Lives a life of example.</td>
<td>• Able and willing to help lead a person to faith in Christ.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Shares the Good News of Christ with others.</td>
<td>• Understands and engages in relational evangelism.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Non-Believer to New Believer</strong></td>
<td><strong>New Believer to Maturing Believer</strong></td>
<td><strong>Maturing Believer to Role-Model of the faith</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discovering</strong></td>
<td><strong>Developing</strong></td>
<td><strong>Demonstrating</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Worship</strong></td>
<td>I have discovered God.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating an understanding and a heart for worship—privately and corporately.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I have discovered worship.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating an understanding of communion and baptism.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Love</strong></td>
<td>I have discovered the Great Commandment.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating love for God and for others.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I have discovered Jesus’ New Commandment.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating devotion to a life of prayer, loving God through my conversations with him, enabling me to find direction and answers to the questions of my life.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Belong</strong></td>
<td>I have discovered God’s plan for humanity — how life was supposed to be.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating what it means to live in community-establishing a good reputation and living out a life of example.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I have discovered Community - how life is supposed to be NOW.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating that I am committed to loving others and being with them in community.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grow</strong></td>
<td>I have discovered the plan of salvation.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating spiritual authenticity, submitting to being discipled, and growing towards the time I can disciple others.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I have discovered how to develop into an unconditional follower (disciple) of Christ.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating knowledge of spiritual disciplines such as worship, prayer, confession, submission, fellowship, study, service, solitude, silence, fasting, tithing, and more.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Serve</strong></td>
<td>I have discovered God’s will for me.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating how to surrender time and talents in service to God and the people around me by being involved in a place of meaningful service in my local church.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I have discovered that how God gifted me helps me understand how and where God wants me to be active and involved.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating my awareness of spiritual giftedness by sharpening my gifts, and helping others develop their own, to excel in their places of meaningful service.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 6.3 Developmental Progression prepared for publication

It should be noted that a person’s conversion to faith in Christ is presumed; it is a step taken prior to engaging the discipleship mile markers or behaviors in this progression, prior to continued growth in Christlikeness. Other aspects of church life such as baptism, communion, and/or church membership are not addressed since these may be quite different for each church situation. This list was created to be ecumenical in its language, and in keeping with orthodox Christian faith.

These mile markers do not specifically assign or address tasks that need to be accomplished, although they may infer some tasks or activities that could be undertaken for spiritual development. For example, one mile marker speaks of discovering spiritual gifts for use in the local congregation. Inherent in this behavior is the task of taking a spiritual gift inventory to find one's gifts, and then finding a meaningful ministry in which to actively use those gifts. Another mile marker speaks of developing spiritual fruit in life. This clearly is an observed trait that necessarily requires the “developing” aspect
of paying attention to growth, pursuing opportunities for growth, and then doing some careful introspection to see how one is doing in this area.

Christ’s church in this modern era needs disciples who are intentional about their development in Christ-likeness. Such disciples need discipleship direction and ongoing constructive assessment of growth. For this to happen, tools and structures are needed to aid in this process.

A “Guide for Disciples” has been developed by this researcher, based on the research gleaned through this project, to help adult disciples make forward progress in their Christian growth as disciples. (See Appendix J, “Guide for Disciples.”) The Guide contains ideas for both the disciple and the peer discipler, to assist both in making well-informed decisions in developing a plan for growth. (See especially Appendix J, Section Six—“Next Steps,” Section Seven—“Study Guide,” and Section Eight—“Developing a Plan of Action for Growing as a Disciple.”)

Within the “Guide for Disciples” (Appendix J) is an evaluative tool developed by this researcher, in answer to both the early assumptions and the research, to help adult disciples and their peer disciplers determine a starting place in discipleship, and to craft a personalized plan for growth and development. (See Appendix J, “Guide for Disciples,” Section Five, “Checking My Progress—A self-assessment tool to help you take your spiritual pulse, and create a personal plan for growth.”) The assessment tool could be used to assess where adult disciples are in their spiritual development at the start of the discipling process; the same tool should be used to evaluate ongoing progress in discipleship on an annual or semi-annual basis.
The assessment tool presents a series of questions and declarative statements that the adult discipler must answer or address. Each question or declaration allows for a choice of three answers. Depending on the wording of the question or declaration, the answer choices are:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Negative answers signifying non-compliance, incompleteness, or lack of mastery.</th>
<th>Ambiguous answers signifying lack of full compliance, ambivalence, or partial mastery.</th>
<th>Positive answers signifying full compliance, completeness, or full mastery.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“I don’t understand.” or “I don’t think so.”</td>
<td>“I need some help.” or “I’m not sure.”</td>
<td>“I am OK.” or “Yes, I think so.” or “Yes, I have.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 6.4 Self-Assessment answer choices

The assessment tool will illuminate what has been “mastered,” and what must yet be addressed in the ongoing maturation process as an adult Christ-follower, and the rest of the Guide will give helpful assistance on future steps in Christian development. Like the mile markers, the assessment instrument does not specifically assign or address tasks that need to be accomplished, although it may infer some tasks or activities that could be undertaken to enhance or facilitate spiritual development.

A “Handbook for Peer Disciplers” has also been developed by this researcher, born out of the research within this project, to give additional assistance to peer disciplers who become the Holy Spirit’s instrument in challenging and growing adult disciples of Jesus Christ (see Appendix K). As mentioned throughout this project, a vital key to the successful development of adult disciples are the peer disciplers who are fully engaged in the process. The “Handbook for Peer Disciplers” will help equip those who are just a few steps ahead on the journey of discipleship as they help others to grow in Christ.
This researcher has heard the question posed, “Are there enough mature Christians in the church today to disciple all of those who need discipling?” The question is quite valid. It is possible, in our modern day and age, with the population growing and church memberships shrinking, that there may not be enough mature Christians in the church today to disciple all of the less-mature Christians. This would be true if discipleship employed a 1 + 1 approach, which fortunately it does not. Even if one mature disciple worked with twelve less mature disciples each year, the total disciples trained after ten years would only be 120 disciples. The Great Commission provides a better understanding: all disciples make disciples.\textsuperscript{345} The only way this can work is if a peer discipler disciplers one or more per year, with each of those disciplers discipling one or more a year. Mere addition will not suffice and simple multiplication will not work; this will have to employ exponential discipleship. Simply put—disciplers want to make disciplers who in turn want to make disciplers who in turn want to make disciplers. The process is ongoing and self-perpetuating and results in exponential growth rather than simple addition or multiplication; see Figure 6.5.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Static (you grow in Christ— and that is all)</th>
<th>Addition (you make one disciple a year)</th>
<th>Multiplication (you and your disciple each make one disciple a year)</th>
<th>Exponential (you and your disciple each make one disciple a year and each of those disciples make one disciple a year . . .)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>512</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 6.5 The effectiveness of exponential one-on-one disciplership

\textsuperscript{345} Mt 28:18-20.
With exponential, one-on-one discipleship, in twenty years, one disciple who makes a new disciple every year, who has each of those disciples make one disciple every year has made no less than 524,288 disciples. Taking it further:

- twenty-five years = 16,777,216 compared to 25 by addition or 48 by multiplication;
- thirty years = 536,870,912 compared to 30 by addition or 58 by multiplication;
- thirty-five years = 17,179,869,184 (compared to 35 by adding or 68 by multiplying);
- forty years = 549,755,813,888 (compared to 40 by adding or 78 by multiplication).

The good news is that as of 2015, there are slightly more than 7 billion people in the world. If churches disciple people exponentially—starting now—the entire world population could be reached for Christ somewhere between 2045 and 2050. It can be done. If the church can employ a workable discipleship process, there will be enough disciplers to get the job done. That is how God designed discipleship to work. The “Handbook for Peer Disciplers” and the “Guide for Disciples” are not meant to be a simple fix or a panacea; they are born out of the research into the key behaviors and milestones in adult discipleship, and are designed to answer the need for intentionality, personalization, oversight, and ongoing assessment. The research focuses on “what” and “why”—the tools this researcher has designed are but one “how” adult discipleship may be done, when taking into consideration what the research suggests.

**Recommendations**

This researcher has posited that adult disciples desire to find the key behaviors of growing Christ, and that adult disciples desire help in implementing and evaluating their spiritual growth, especially with the help of a peer discipler. The research has revealed
that discipleship best occurs when it is comprised of intentionality, personalization, oversight, and ongoing assessment.

**Intentionality:** Discipleship is intentional in the sense that it is not left to chance, nor is it assumed that spiritual formation will be the sole purview of the Holy Spirit without the disciple’s involvement. The key behaviors are not an inflexible standardized list, but they serve to help move disciples in a purposeful direction.

**Personalization:** This intentionality allows for discipleship to be personalized for the individual disciple. A personal plan of action allows the disciple to create a strategy for growing as a disciple of Jesus Christ that addresses specific, individual needs.

**Oversight:** This personalization works well when employed in a disciple/peer discipler relationship. A peer discipler, mentor, coach, director, or pastor can help the adult disciple design the plan of action, or can work with an existing plan of action, giving insight, advice, and supervision.

**Assessment:** Oversight can be greatly enhanced through the use of an assessment tool. Designed to help the disciple and peer discipler work together to determine the current level of growth in the life of the disciple, the evaluative tool can also be used periodically to assess continued growth.

Since much of an adult believer’s growth in faith will contain elements applicable to all adult believers, regardless of culture, language, or socio-economics, this researcher believes such aids to discipleship can reach beyond most barriers into the broader church, helping to establish relationships between those seeking to grow and the disciplers who are willing to assist in that growing process. The result can be a vibrant, healthy church
filled with disciples who are intentional about collaborating with the Holy Spirit to become more like Christ.

Much remains to be done. Congregations must organize, disciplers must step forward, and the intentional discipleship culture of the early church must be reawakened. The approach to discipleship must be personalized, and the hard work needs to be supervised by those who are a few steps ahead in the journey of faith. Initial assessment must be followed by ongoing evaluation of each growing disciple in order to keep all disciples moving forward in the endeavor to be more like the Master. The stakes are high, and each adult disciple has a choice: Christ’s church in North America can either languish in ineffectiveness and powerlessness or live up to Christ’s call and commission, living lives of discipline, vibrancy, and example.
# APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>How Adults Learn and How Teachers Must Adapt: Abstracts of a Sampling of Significant Sources in the Field of Adult Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Quantified Survey Results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Additional Suggestions from Respondents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>Qualitative Contributions Regarding Progress and Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Key Behaviors, Skills, and/or Milestones in the Life of a Disciple and the Broad Content Categories in Which They Likely Fit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>The Focus Group’s Placement of Key Behaviors, Skills, and/or Milestones in the Life of a Disciple into the Broad Content Categories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>The Focus Group’s Input on Progress and Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Input from Respondents that Resonate with Researcher’s Presuppositions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>Guide for Disciples—Including a Self-Assessment Tool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td>Handbook for Peer Disciplers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L</td>
<td>Focus Group Permission Letter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>Permission from Publishers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX A:

HOW ADULTS LEARN AND HOW TEACHERS MUST ADAPT:
ABSTRACTS OF A SAMPLING OF SIGNIFICANT SOURCES
IN THE FIELD OF ADULT EDUCATION
Appendix A: How Adults Learn and How Teachers Must Adapt:
Abstracts of a Sampling of Significant Sources
in the Field of Adult Education

Introduction

Robert Marzano instructs that “teachers can encourage students to apply what they have learned by assigning cognitively complex tasks, giving them structured choices in the classroom, and providing opportunities for learning in the real world.”¹ These techniques, and many others from educational experts in colleges and universities around the globe, help teachers do a better job of imparting knowledge. However, for adult learners, something more is needed; instead of knowing new or better ways of applying what is learned, there needs to be a radical change in how new learning is best imparted and assimilated in the first place.

Adults learn differently than children. Little to no research is needed to see that a first-year graduate student learns in dramatically different ways than a first-grader in elementary school. Content is vital in the formative years; experience reigns supreme in the mid-life of an adult learner. The teacher is highly regarded by elementary students, whereas a college instructor is viewed with suspicion by most college students, and may even be considered a hindrance to learning by many non-traditional adult students.

How do adults learn? What does a successful learning environment for adults look like? What practices and principles do instructors need to learn and adapt in order to successfully teach adult today? These questions guide the research for this paper, which is undertaken to better understand the changes needed for better adult education.

Developing Learner-Centered Teaching:

A Practical Guide for Faculty,
Phyllis Blumberg

“Learner-centered teaching shifts the role of the instructors from giver of information to facilitators of student learning.”² The more traditional method of teaching, where a teacher lectures or shares information and students work to retain the information for a future assessment might be called “instructor-centered teaching.” Learner-centered teaching, therefore, is all about shifting the focus to what and how the students are actually learning. There is no single method used, rather, learner-centered teaching utilizes a variety of teaching methods and types to help create an environment that enhances how students learn.


² Phyllis Blumberg, Developing Learner-Centered Teaching: A Practical Guide for Faculty (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2009), xix.
In her foreword to Blumberg’s book, Maryellen Weimer, Professor Emeritus at Penn State University suggests that adult learners today learn best with a wide and varied repertoire of instructional strategies that actually involve the students in their own learning.\(^3\) The more traditional approach to teaching might involve dumping material into the laps of students, with students memorizing or filing information for testing, but with little or no understanding, practical application, or long-term retention.

Blumberg recommends course objectives that utilize “transdisciplinary skills” such as “communication skills and teamwork skill development.”\(^4\) She suggests creating a study guide for each chapter of required reading and making the guides available online; the study guides could include “learning objectives, key concepts, and questions that the instructor requires the students to answer.”\(^5\) Blumberg asks instructors to hold periodic “intra-teach sessions” during which students engage in “an active learning exercise” to “review the content of the chapters by discussing study questions.”\(^6\) In learner-centered teaching, students are encouraged to “transform and reflect on most of the content to make their own meaning out of it,” and the instructor “frames and organizes content so students can learn additional content that is not taught.”\(^7\)

*How Learning Works: Seven Smart Research-Based Principles for Smart Teaching*, Susan A. Ambrose, Michael W. Bridges, Michele DiPietro, Marsha C. Lovett, and Marie K. Norman

“Any set of learning principles is predicated on a definition of learning. . . . Learning is a process, not a product; learning involves change in knowledge, beliefs, behaviors, or attitudes; learning is not something done to students, but rather something students themselves do.”\(^8\)

The authors believe “that (1) learning is a developmental process that intersects with other developmental processes in a student’s life, and (2) students enter our classrooms not only with skills, knowledge, and abilities, but also with social and emotional experiences that influence what they value, how they perceive themselves and others, and how they will engage in the learning process.” These presuppositions inform the seven principles which the authors believe are “all at work in real learning situations,” and are “functionally inseparable.”\(^9\) The principles are:

\(^3\) Blumberg, xv.

\(^4\) Ibid., 70.

\(^5\) Ibid.

\(^6\) Ibid.

\(^7\) Ibid., 75.


\(^9\) Ibid., 4.
1. Students’ prior knowledge can help or hinder learning.
2. How students organize knowledge influences how they learn and apply what they know.
3. Students’ motivation determines, directs, and sustains what they do to learn.
4. To develop mastery, students must acquire component skills, practice integrating them, and know when to apply what they have learned.
5. Goal-directed practice coupled with targeted feedback enhances the quality of students’ learning.
6. Students’ current level of development interacts with the social, emotional, and intellectual climate of the course to impact learning.
7. To become self-directed learners, students must learn to monitor and adjust their approaches to learning.

The authors assert these principles are: (1) “domain-independent,” working equally well in all subject areas; (2) “experience-independent,” suited to all situations and levels of teaching expertise; and (3) “cross-culturally relevant,” suggesting the principles work in all cultures, although “culture can and does influence how the principles should be applied. . . .”

The Adult Learner: The Definitive Classic in Adult Education and Human Resource Development,
Malcolm S. Knowles, Elwood F. Holton, and Richard A. Swanson

The authors reveal critical differences between andragogy and pedagogy (from the Greek words andras, meaning “man,” versus paidagogy), meaning “child,” both terms paired with ago, meaning “to lead”), to be understood as the science of teaching adults and children, respectively.

The authors define pedagogy as giving the teacher “full responsibility for making all decisions about what will be learned, how it will be learned, when it will be learned, and if it has been learned. It is teacher-directed education. . . .” and is based on the following assumption about learners: (1) the need to know, learning only what the teacher expects; (2) the learner’s self-concept, which is largely that of a “dependent personality;” (3) the role of experience, which is vested primarily in the teacher and not in the learner; (4) readiness to learn, focusing only on what the teacher expects; (5) orientation to learning, which tends to be focused only on “subject-matter content;” (6) motivation, typically external incentives such as grades or teacher approval.

Conversely, andragogy changes those assumptions slightly, placing the responsibility for learning in the hands of the learner. Perhaps it can best be understood as

---

10 Ambrose et al, 7-8.


12 Ibid., 60-62.
learner-directed education. The authors share these major adjustments to the assumptions about learning:

Assumption 1, the need to know: “Adults need to know why they need to learn something before undertaking to learn it . . . [Adult] learners discover for themselves the gaps between where they are now and where they want to be.”\(^{13}\)

Assumption 2, the learner’s self-concept: “Adults have a self-concept of being responsible for their own decisions, for their own lives . . . They resent and resist situations in which they feel others are imposing their wills on them.”\(^{14}\)

Assumption 3, the role of the learners’ experiences: “Adults come into an educational activity with both a greater volume and a different quality of experience from that of youths . . . They have accumulated more experience . . . The richest resources for learning reside in the adult learners themselves.”\(^{15}\)

Assumption 4, the readiness to learn: “Adults become ready to learn those things they need to know and be able to do in order to cope effectively with their real-life situations.”\(^{16}\)

Assumption 5, orientation to learning: “Adults are life-centered (or task-centered or problem-centered) in their orientation to learning . . . They learn new knowledge, understandings, skills, values, and attitudes most effectively when they are presented in the context of application to real-life situations.”\(^{17}\)

Assumption 6, motivation: “Adults are responsive to some external motivators . . . but the most potent motivators are internal pressures” such as self-esteem and quality of life.\(^{18}\)

The authors are quick to note that both models are viable, and both can be used effectively with all ages. Depending on the situation, pedagogy can be effective with adults, while andragogical techniques may work well with children.

**Effective Grading: A Tool for Learning and Assessment in College,**
Barbara E. Walvoord and Virginia Johnson Anderson

Teaching adult learners must start in the conceptual stages of how the course is designed and developed. The establishment of learning goals utilizing “concrete verbs such as define, argue, solve, and create” help form desired outcomes—“I want my students to . . .”—which are firmly held before any course content is planned.\(^{19}\) All

\(^{13}\) Knowles, Swanton, and Holton, 63.

\(^{14}\) Ibid.

\(^{15}\) Ibid., 64.

\(^{16}\) Ibid., 65.

\(^{17}\) Ibid., 66.

\(^{18}\) Ibid., 67.

assignments, classroom activities, and assessment then flow from these learning goals or desired outcomes.

Once learning goals are established with the adult learners in mind, “our responsibility as teachers is to create an environment that encourages student motivation for learning.”20 The authors point out principles to guide in creating a motivating environment:

Principle 1: “Grades do not necessarily decrease students’ intrinsic motivation”—such feedback should be “informative and constructive;”

Principle 2: “motivation affects behavior, but behavior also affects motivation”—“if we can help our students act like highly motivated learners, they may begin to be more highly motivated;”

Principle 3: “motivation can be influenced by the qualities of a course”—“assignments that are clear . . . strategies that encourage . . . feedback that is frequent”; and,

Principle 4: “the teacher’s motivation”—the attitude the instructor brings to the learning environment—is a vital contribution to successful adult learning.21

The crux of Walvoord’s text is centered on linking teaching, learning, and grading.22 “The most important principle is this: grading should be integrated with everything else that happens in the classroom. . . . It is part of a system that includes shaping goals and assignments, communicating with students, helping them learn what they need, responding to them, and evaluating the quality of their work.”23 Although the academic world tends to loath teaching to the test, Walvoord suggests that if a test “really tests the central learning goals of the course—then we should teach to it.”24 In addition to teaching what is being graded, Walvoord clarifies that grading what is being taught is equally important. What messages is the instructor sending the learners? What does the instructor feel is really important? These should be strategically taught and assessed. For example, “discussion is perhaps the most valued and least graded skill in college classrooms. . . . If we instead use the motto, ‘Grade what you teach, and teach what you grade,’ we can align our teaching and grading more fully with the goal of enhancing student’s discussion skill and helping them learn through discussion.”25

20 Walvoord and Anderson, 25.

21 Ibid., 25-27.

22 Ibid., 61.

23 Ibid.

24 Ibid., 62.

The research on teaching and learning is consistent: the more information you provide your students about the goals of a course, their responsibilities, and the criteria you will use to evaluate their performance, the more successful they will be as students, and the more successful you will be as a teacher.” 26 A learning-centered syllabus asks and answers the question, “What do students need to know to derive maximum benefit from their educational experience?” 27 The focus is on both content and process: “Process refers to the skill students will need to meet success as they are learning the content.” 28

The course syllabus is a vital “point of interaction between you and your students in and out of class, face-to-face, and online,” and is a tool that helps: (1) “convey to your students what matters to you about learning; (2) set a tone for learning and how to learn that students will accept; (3) send a message about what students can expect from you and the campus community to support their learning during the term.” 29 The process of designing a learning-centered syllabus is outlined by the authors:

1. Develop a well-grounded rationale for your course: “All aspects of your course are influenced by the sometimes-taken-for-granted beliefs and implicit assumptions that frame how you think about and practice the educational process.” 30 Instructors should explain their style of teaching and the background of what they are trying to teach.

2. Decide on desired outcomes and assessment measures: “Plan your course with process, content, and product goals in mind. . . . Whenever you formulate learning goals, you should simultaneously address assessment procedures.” 31 The syllabus states up front what you hold up as desired course and personal outcomes.

3. Define and delimit course content: “Be clear about what is most worth knowing. . . . The crucial knowledge that students must take away and retain from a course.” 32 Course content should not be open for too much interpretation, but should clarify what will be taught and learned.

4. Structure your students’ active involvement in learning: “What strategies will you use to shape basic skills and procedures, present information, guide inquiry, monitor individual and group activities, and support and challenge

---


27 Ibid., xii.

28 Ibid., 11.

29 Ibid.

30 Ibid., 15.

31 Ibid., 16.

32 Ibid., 18.
critical reflection?” By establishing the learners’ active role, the stage is set for learner-centered activities and assessment.

5. **Identify and assemble resources required for active learning:** “Active thinkers—those engaged in speaking and listening, reading, writing, and reflecting about a topic of interest—assemble a rich array of resources (people, materials, and strategies) to facilitate their creative intellectual activity, both alone and in collaboration with others.”

Helping adult learners discover and research contradictory viewpoints and/or supportive relevant material enables them to learn both broadly and in-depth.

*On Course: A Week-by-Week Guide to Your First Semester of College Teaching,*
James M. Lang

Learning and teaching require different skills and mindsets, as do observing and participating, thinking and feeling. However, most teachers were once learners, and they bring to their teaching the experiences of being learners—including the faulty assumptions and incorrect theories. “Most college and university faculty believe that they can help other human beings learn complex subject matter simply by relying upon their own experience as learners, casual observations of their fellow teachers, common sense, and their own big brains.” Teachers of adult learners must learn some additional pieces of the puzzle if they are to be successful in helping the learners in their classes. Adult learners are vastly different than child learners; learning is an ever-changing process through the life-span; different people learn in different ways, therefore a wide and varied approach is required; and how one was taught may be the easiest “go-to” way of teaching, but it may be an incorrect and/or ineffective way of teaching.

Lang suggests several ways in which adult learners can be engaged in learning; two ideas can be used throughout the semester: whole class discussions and small group break-outs. Other ideas Lang reserves for re-energizing the classroom: posters, field trips, inkshedding, trials, and case studies, as especially effective in teaching adult learners.

*Posters.* In small groups, learners “map out” or “create a visual representation” on a poster board of some idea, theme, comparison, or contrast of something being studied. “The idea is not so much that they have to draw things as that they have to construct a visual representation of relationships among things—people, books, ideas, places, time periods, arguments, theories, problems, strategies for completing an assignment or paper, and so on.”

---


34 Ibid., 19-20.


36 Ibid., 235-237.

37 Ibid., 236.
Field Trips. Think about “how and where your disciplinary theories and subject matter operate in the world. A political scientist might attend a city council meeting with her students; a Spanish teacher might visit the local Hispanic Heritage center; a chemist could arrange for a tour of a local manufacturing plant.”

Inkshedding. In short, inkshedding involves each person spending five minutes writing down everything they can think of regarding the topic of the day or from a reading assignment. Each learner passes their notes to the next person, who reads through their notes, and then begins to add to that neighbor’s writings in response to what they saw written there. After doing this four or five more times, the class, who have already “engaged in an extended dialogue with one another, all on paper” are ready to discuss the topic in detail out loud in a whole class discussion.

Trials. Holding a mock trial can be adapted to “just about every discipline.” Book characters, real-life persons, historical figures can all be put on trial. Half the class can be the prosecution, the other half the defense. Trying these figures through the lens of another person or character adds to the complexity and the learning. “You don’t even have to limit yourself to trying individuals; you might put a theory or idea on trial, one that has a controversial place in your field. . . .”

Case Studies. “Case studies present to students a real-life problem scenario—one that may or may not have actually happened—which they learn about, explore, and recommend actions to resolve. Ideally, students use the knowledge and thinking skills developed in the course to resolve or make recommendations about the case.”

What the Best College Teachers Do,
Ken Bain

Too often, adult learners interpret what instructors intend as new learning “in terms of the intuitive framework they [bring] with them to the course,” and can perform “all kinds of mental gymnastics to avoid confronting and revising the fundamental underlying principles” that guide their thinking prior to the course.

Bain asks what it is that “the best teachers know that helps them overcome—at least partially and sometimes fully—these problems?” The author found that successful teachers (1) “know their disciplines well and are active and accomplished scholars, artists, or scientists—even if they do not always have long publication records;” (2) “they

---

38 Lang, 238.
39 Ibid., 239-240.
40 Ibid., 240-242.
41 Ibid., 242.
42 Ibid.
44 Ibid., 24.
have an unusually keen sense of the histories of their disciplines, including the controversies that have swirled within them, and that understanding seems to help them reflect deeply on the nature of thinking in their field;” (3) they have “generally cobbled together from their own experiences working with students conceptions of human learning that are remarkably similar to some ideas that have emerged in the research and theoretical literature on cognition, motivation, and human development.” These are the key concepts Bain discovered:

1. **Knowledge is constructed, not received.** “According to the traditional view, memory is a great storage bin. We put knowledge in it and then later pick out what we need. . . . The best teachers don’t think of memory that way. . . . Instead, they say we construct our sense of reality out of all the sensory input we receive, and that process begins in the crib. We see, hear, feel, smell, and taste, and begin connecting all those sensations in our brains to build patterns of the way we think the world works. So our brains are both storage and processing units. At some point, we begin using those existing patterns to understand new sensory input. By the time we reach college, we have thousands of mental models, or schemas, that we use to try to understand the lectures we hear, the texts we read, and so forth.”

2. **Mental models change slowly.** “Learners must (1) face a situation in which their mental model will not work (that is, it will not help them explain or do something); (2) care that it does not work strongly enough to stop and grapple with the issue at hand; and (3) be able to handle the emotional trauma that sometimes accompanies challenges to longstanding beliefs.”

3. **Questions are crucial.** “Questions help us construct knowledge. They point to holes in our memory structures and are critical for indexing the information that we attain when we develop an answer for that inquiry.”

4. **Caring is crucial.** “People learn best when they ask an important question that they care about answering, or adopt a goal that they want to reach. If they don’t care, they will not try to reconcile, explain, modify, or integrate new knowledge with old.”

Teaching is more than transmitting information; teaching “is creating those conditions in which most—if not all—of our students will realize their potential to learn.” Bain suggests that “part of being a good teacher (not all) is knowing that you always have something new to learn—not so much about teaching techniques but about

---

45 Bain, 24-26.

46 Ibid., 26.


48 Ibid., 31.

49 Ibid.

50 Ibid., 173.
these particular students at this particular time and their particular sets of aspirations, confusions, misconceptions, and ignorance.”51 More than technique, “the best teaching is often both an intellectual creation and a performing art.”52

New Faculty: A Practical Guide for Academic Beginners, Christopher J. Lucas and John W. Murry, Jr.

In active learning, sometimes called “learner-centered or “cooperative” learning, the emphasis is on getting the learners involved in the process. Generally a group activity or setting, active learning “requires collaborative effort among students, shared discussions, direct participation, and hands-on experience.”53 Teachers are less focused on disseminating content, and more focused on helping learners process and assimilate information.54 Many active learning possibilities include:

Student presentations, panel discussions, symposia, group exercises, debates, dramatizations and psychodramas, role-playing exercises, simulations, case-method studies, guided journal-writing, independent study projects, game-playing, “icebreakers” for starting a class . . . open-ended and closed small-group discussions, competitions, “fish-bowl” discussions, conceptual puzzle solving, roundtables, min-lectures, brainstorming, partnering, computer software development projects, polls and surveys, field trips, multimedia presentations, service projects, video productions, peer teaching, interviews, and much else besides. The list is almost endless.55

The authors list some guidelines for active learning for adult learners in the college classroom:
1. The professor is “student oriented.”
2. Students participate in establishing goals and objectives.
3. The classroom climate is supportive and interactive.
4. Activities are problem centered and student driven.
5. Assessment is continuous and supportive.
6. Teaching respects learner initiative and participation.
7. Multilevel learning outcomes are expected.56

51 Bain, 174.
52 Ibid., 175.
54 Ibid., 74.
55 Ibid., 75.
56 Ibid., 82-83.
Authors Lucas and Murry also address learning styles, pointing out that problems seem to arise “when learning style and teaching method are incongruent.”

A great deal of information is shared about the many different (some suggest “preferred”) styles of learning, teaching styles, personality types, and generational differences, and the authors give little help in this regard except to say that it is hoped that instructors “will develop enhanced sensitivity to the fact that students do appear to differ in how they learn. . . .” and that instructors “must learn to eschew reliance on any single teaching approach . . . to the virtual exclusion of a broad range of other possibilities.”

What is clear is that when teaching adult learners, “teacher talk must be supplemented or integrated with visual presentation, lecturing must be leavened by flexibility, planning with improvisation, and predictability of classroom routine with spontaneity and elements of the unexpected.”

_The Skillful Teacher: On Technique, Trust, and Responsiveness in the Classroom_,
Stephen D. Brookfield

Brookfield’s text offers a broad, foundational approach to skillful teaching. While teaching is “a highly variable process that changes depending on any number of contextual factors,” Brookfield suggests that three core assumptions should remain constant:

1. “Skillful teaching is whatever helps students learn.
2. Skillful teachers adopt a critically reflective stance towards their practice.
3. The most important knowledge skillful teachers need to do good work is a constant awareness of how students are experiencing their learning and perceiving teachers’ actions.”

The author provides helpful insights into what adult learners value in their instructors. “In students’ eyes an important component of successful learning is perceiving the teacher as both an ally and an authority. . . . A teacher is perceived as being effective because she combines the element of having something important to say or demonstrate with the element of being open and honest with students.” Two “clusters” of preferred characteristics emerge in Brookfield’s research: credibility and authenticity. Those clusters and their accompanying indicators are listed below.

Credibility—“the perception that the teacher has something important to offer and that whatever this ‘something’ is (skills, knowledge, insight, wisdom, information)

---

57 Lucas and Murry, 84.

58 Ibid., 88.

59 Ibid.


61 Ibid., 55.
learning it will benefit the student considerably.”

Four specific indicators of credibility are: (1) Expertise—“being able to demonstrate a high level of command of the skills or knowledge she is seeking to communicate to the students;”

(2) Experience—“having a backlog of experience helps a teacher make good decisions about learning activities;”

(3) Rationale—confidence is inspired when students “see that teachers clearly have a plan, a set of reasons, informing their actions. . . . [Making] explicit the implicit assumptions about teaching and learning that guide a teacher’s actions;”

(4) Conviction—“is recognized by students when teachers make it plain that they feel the subject matter, content, or skills being taught are so crucial that they want to explore every way they can to make sure students have learned them properly.”

Authenticity—“Students recognize that teachers are authentic when those teachers are perceived to be allies in learning who are trustworthy, open, and honest in their dealings with the students. They are viewed as allies in learning because they clearly have the students’ interests at heart.”

The four indicators of authenticity are: (1) Congruence—“between words and actions, between what you say you will do and what you actually do;”

(2) Full Disclosure—“the teacher’s regularly making public the criteria, expectations, agendas, and assumptions that guide her practice;”

(3) Responsiveness—“the dimension of authenticity . . . that focuses on demonstrating clearly to students that you teach to help them learn in the way that is likely to be most helpful to them;”

(4) Personhood—“the perception students have that their teachers are flesh and blood human beings with lives and identities outside the classroom.”

Brookfield offers this caveat: “Although it is reasonable for us to strive to be credible and authentic in equal measure, it is unreasonable for us to expect ourselves ever to attain some sort of perfect balance between these two features.”

Using these indicators as our own professional measures of success and self-improvement will help us meet adult learners’ desires and expectations for how they prefer to learn.

---

62 Brookfield, 56. The indicators listed under “credibility” are found on pages 59-67.

63 Ibid., 59.

64 Ibid., 61.

65 Ibid., 63.

66 Ibid., 64.

67 Ibid., 67.

68 Ibid.

69 Ibid., 69.

70 Ibid., 70-71.

71 Ibid., 71-72.

72 Ibid., 73.
Learner-Centered Teaching: Five Key Changes to Practice,
Maryellen Weimer

The author brings some understanding to today’s college student, which would include most non-traditional, adult learners. Rather than “empowered, confident, self-motivated learners,” Weimer believes the adult learners in college today are:

. . . hopeful but generally anxious and tentative. They want all classes to be easy but expect that most will be hard. They wish their major (whatever it might be) did not require math, science, or English courses. A good number will not speak in class unless called on. Most like, want, indeed need, teachers who tell them exactly what to do. Education is something done unto them. It frequently involves stress, anxiety, and other forms of discomfort.73

Weimer asks, “How can we overcome these kinds of attitudes that often compromise students’ ability to learn?” She suggests that “in order to be learner-centered, instructional practice needs to change” in five specific areas.74

1. The Balance of Power. “To be truly learner-centered, we must begin with greater insights into the role of power in our classrooms; who exerts it, why, and with what effects and what benefits.”75 In a learner-centered classroom, power over learning activities, assignments, course policies, course content, and evaluation is shared between learners and instructor.

2. The Function of Content. Weimer tells us that, “As it currently stands, content, not teachers or learners, centers the instructional universe. If we aim to be learner-centered, content still needs to be focal point of the universe, but it can no longer be the exclusive center, the only, or even the most important variable when it comes to instructional decision making.”76

3. The Role of the Teacher. Learner-centered teachers “position themselves alongside the learner and keep the attention, focus, and spotlight aimed at and on the learning processes.”77 These seven principles guide the teacher: (1) teachers do learning tasks less—“teachers must always stop doing the learning tasks of organizing the content, generating the examples, asking the questions, answering the questions, summarizing the discussion, solving problems, constructing the diagrams, and others;” (2) teachers do less telling—students do more discovering; (3) teachers do more design work—“the instructional design aspect of the teacher’s role are more important in learner-centered environments;” (4) teachers do more modeling—they “assume the role of master learner and demonstrate for students how skillful learners approach learning tasks;” (5) teachers do more to get students learning from and with

---

73 Maryellen Weimer, Learner-Centered Teaching: Five Key Changes to Practice (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2002), 23.

74 Ibid., 8.

75 Ibid., 28.

76 Ibid., 50.

77 Ibid., 76.
each other; (6) teachers work to create climates for learning; (7) teachers do more with feedback—“evaluation events are used in ways that maximize their learning potential.”

4. **The Responsibility for Learning.** The first three areas have focused on what teachers need to do to make the environment more learner-centered. Ultimately, the responsibility for learning must rest with the student. “This involves developing the intellectual maturity, learning skills, and awareness necessary to function as independent, autonomous learners.”

5. **Evaluation Purpose and Processes.** In the learner-centered environment, these changes in evaluation occur: (1) “evaluation activities are used in ways that enhance their already inherent potential to promote learning. . . .” (2) “evaluation processes are opened to students in ways that give them opportunities to develop self- and peer-assessment skills.” Weimer recommends that “evaluation activities are used not just to generate grades but to promote learning as well.”

“A Case Study of Radical Adult Education and Transformative Learning through a Diverse Adult Learning Workshop,”
Michelle Glowacki-Dudka, Darolyn “Lyn” Jones, Diane Brooks, Tory Flynn, William Frankenberger, De’Von Kissick-Kelly, James Rediger, and K. Smith

Seven adult learners took part in a 5-week summer course in adult learning in which the instructor sought to include the learners in all aspects of the course, including the development of the actual course itself, providing a unique opportunity “to generate new knowledge together.”

Of special note are the transferable principles from this course and study that can be replicated in other courses.

1. **Individual experience.** The diverse backgrounds of the learners provide “fertile ground to cultivate new learning and find personal transformation.”
2. **Critical reflection.** Written reflections give the learners opportunity to process presuppositions and new learning.
3. **Dialogue.** Class interaction and discussion provide opportunities for class members to express opinions and learn and understand one another.

---

78 Weimer, 82-91.

79 Ibid., 95.

80 Ibid., 125.

81 Ibid., 145.


83 Ibid., 28.
4. Holistic orientation. Encouraging emotional investment and relational growth, as well as “engaging all parts of the mind and body in the learning process” are critical to adult learning.  

5. Awareness of context. Each learner brings to the learning environment not only their experiences (see item 1 above), but also their own context: vulnerabilities, world view, employment, relationships, etc. These personal factors necessarily flavor the course experience.

6. Authentic relationships and practice. Instructors must be “deeply engaged with the learners through negotiation of the curriculum, engaging in honest dialogue, personal sharing, listening without judgment, and constructing new knowledge together. . . .”

Implications for replication in other areas of adult education are that (1) the learning environment must invoke trust and experimentation; (2) instructors must encourage input from the learners in terms of course content, projects, and assignments; (3) instructors and courses must encourage the learners’ creative use of “multiple dimensions of knowing as they present and engage with the material and other learners;” and (4) adult learners need to “reflect critically” on what they are learning, and “dialogue about ways to test, apply, and implement their new ideas.”

“Adult Learning Theories and Theological Education,”
Reg Wickett

Many seminaries and colleges of theological education have begun to embrace new theories of adult education. These new theories have placed in sharper focus the experience of the adult learner, specifically how learning is a life-long process. Of particular interest to the author of the study is the ongoing learning process for those in Christian ministry. “People who engage in ministry will be challenged by the continuously changing needs of the communities which they serve. Ministers will need to learn through their careers in order to work with their community.”

The author reviewed three theories of adult learning “normally referred to as self-directed learning, experiential learning, and transformative learning” and drew conclusions or implications for their use in adult theological education.

From self-directed learning, the learning contract or learning covenant emerges as a specialized tool for tailoring the subject matter, application, and assessment of new learning to the individual.

---

84 Glowacki-Dudka et al., 28.
85 Ibid., 29.
86 Ibid., 30.
88 Ibid.
From experiential learning, field experience or supervised ministry internships allow for the engagement of real-life challenges to instill and actualize new skills and understanding. These field experiences can help adult learners “acquire additional skills to maximize their ability to have new experiences and to gather the required information from the situation to support their learning.”  

From transformative learning, the process of re-thinking one’s closely-held beliefs “in the face of various experiences, including alternative views of theology and the process of biblical criticism,” is a critical part of discovering what we truly believe and who we truly are. 

“‘The Grand Experiment:’ Modeling Adult Learning with Adult-Ministry Students,” Laura K. Simmons

The author experimented with self-directed learning in her seminary class to discover if it is a realistic methodology for seminary education. The following are the author’s discoveries for how self-directed, adult learning may best be implemented.

1. “When students are permitted some choice in what they will study, they almost invariably bring more passion to their work than if [the instructor] assign[s] it. . . .”
2. “It is important to provide a certain level of structure within which to experiment with self-directed learning,” so those learners who are more comfortable with pedagogical instruction “can find ways to succeed. . . .”
3. “In-class presentations are not the only way students can share their expertise with one another. . . .”
4. “It remains important to use required readings and integrative/summative assignments to provide some consistent exposure to and grappling with the basic body of information in a field. . . .”
5. It is always best to help personalize and customize learning contracts based on an individual student’s personality and needs.

89 Wickett, 159.

90 Ibid., 160.


92 Ibid.

93 Ibid.

94 Ibid., 49.
“Adult Learning Theory for the Twenty-First Century,”
Sharan B. Merriam

“Whether we are assisting adults in preparing for the GED, coaching executives
in a Fortune 500 company, or demonstrating a new agricultural technique in a developing
country, the more we know about how adults learn the better we are able to structure
learning activities that resonate with those adult learners with whom we work.”

Author Merriam presents a simple overview of the dynamic field of adult learning, and poses
some observations for consideration in helping adult learners.

The learning context has become a critical component in adult learning, context
being understood as the learner’s personal history, culture, environment, and more.
Rather than focusing solely on how an individual processes information, there is a need
to understand the learner’s personal context as well as the context in which a group of
learners may find themselves. “The spotlight has definitely shifted from understanding
adult learning from the individual learner’s perspective to the learner in context. . . . This
linking of the individual’s learning process to his or her context makes for a richer, more
holistic understanding of learning in adulthood.”

Learning, once seen as a purely cognitive process, is now seen as a
“multidimensional phenomenon” consisting of a more holistic combination of “the body,
the emotions, and the spirit as well as the mind.” Learning through meta-narratives,
sensory and kinesthetic experiences, personal experiences of spirituality, and awareness
of “diverse worldviews and epistemologies” are all important aspects of learning for
many adults. “The mind, body, spirit, emotions, and society are not themselves simply
sites of learning; learning occurs in their intersections with each other.”

Some of the instructional strategies for adult learning that become evident in
Merriam’s appraisal include: (1) critical reflection and dialogue, both individually as well
as in groups; (2) “connecting new learning with learners’ previous experience;” along
with (3) incorporating “creative and artistic modes of inquiry” into instructional
practice.

Merriam challenges her readers: “We need only attend to our own mind, body,
spirit, and emotions and the sociocultural and material contexts in which we ourselves
learn to recognize the potential of their expanded vision for our adult learners.”

95 Sharan B. Merriam, “Adult Learning Theory for the Twenty-First Century” New Directions for
Adult and Continuing Education, no. 119, (Fall 2008): 93-98. Education Source, EBSCOhost [accessed
September 3, 2013].

96 Ibid., 94-95.
97 Ibid., 95.
98 Ibid., 96.
99 Ibid., 97.
100 Ibid., 97-98.
101 Ibid., 98.
“Adult Learning Theory: Applications to Non-Traditional College Students,”
Cari Kenner and Jason Weinerman

Kenner and Weinerman assert that much of “adult learning theory comes from the organizational development (OD) field where the focus on learning theory is seen as a way of providing employees with the tools they needed to perform better in the workplace.”

The authors also seek to address those adult learners who are considered “entry-level adult learners who are between the age of 25 and 50, have a high school diploma or a GED, are financially independent, and have one semester or less of college-level course work,” since these are considered the most highly nontraditional undergraduate college students on Horn’s “Nontraditional Scale.”

Three strategies are proposed by the authors to engage nontraditional adult learners:

1. Awareness. Instructors must be aware that adult learners possess practical skills that may not be altogether helpful in the academic environment. An instructor “can be mindful of the frustration adult learners may experience as they fail to incorporate material presented in the traditional academic fashion.”

2. Framing. Since adult learners’ skill sets are more task-oriented and based on the practical rather than the abstract or theoretical, instructors need to frame new learning in connection with “strategies learned in developmental coursework.”

3. Competition and Repetition. Many adult learners have established metacognitive strategies—those approaches to learning that have been learned or acquired previously and have become ingrained and/or preferred—that may actually prevent adult learners from having success in new collegiate experiences. “The longer adult learners have been away from the academic environment, the more deeply ingrained these strategies will be and the more difficult they will be to dislodge.” The authors identify “competition” as the technique for removing ineffective metacognitive strategies, which consists of making a new learning strategy more attractive and efficient than the existing, ineffective learning strategy.

---


104 Kenner and Weinerman, 91.

105 Ibid., 92.

106 Ibid., 93.

107 Ibid.
are so ingrained and “resistant to change,” new learning strategies must be introduced and repeated in a variety of ways, “especially if the repetition forces competition between new strategies and the adult learner’s existing strategies.”

“An Integrated Model for Practicing Reflective Learning,” Patricia Ann Castelli

Author Castelli challenges that the term or method of transformative learning with adult learners implies that change occurs, but that it does not “necessarily guarantee change.” To better understand this “multi-faceted learning theory,” Castelli introduces the “many foundational learning theories that influenced and shaped transformative learning. Most notable of these include elements from adult learning and instructional design, experiential learning, and the social sciences.”

Instructional design is the first theory Castelli addresses, suggesting “guidelines for enhancing interest, effort, and performance in classroom instruction,” which include: . . . finding motivational ways to capture the learner’s interest by ensuring the instruction is designed to meet their personal needs, creating a safe learning environment by building credibility in the classroom, and finding relevant ways to challenge the learner by assigning projects and tasks designed to derive personal satisfaction from the learning experience.

Experiential learning—learning through experiences—is the second theory presented by Castelli. In experiential learning, “people learn more from their experiences when they spend time thinking about them. . . .” working through a process called “the spiral of experience” in which learners “take the time to reflect in their actions, observe their behaviors, and reflect on how they would do things differently. . . .” Those learners who “do not seek feedback or constructive criticism from others particularly when it confronts their fundamental ideas or actions” are known as “single-loop learners.” Such learners do not progress through the spiral of experience, and “are destined to repeat ineffective patterns,” whereas double-loop learners are willing to confront their views and beliefs and encourage others to do so. Double-loop learners are

---

108 Kenner and Weinerman, 93.


110 Ibid., 16.

111 Ibid., 17.

112 Ibid., 18.

113 Ibid.
most apt to reflect on their experiences and change since they are not afraid to learn and grow beyond their comfort zone.”

Castelli believes “the social sciences of psychology, spirituality, and sociology have also contributed to transformative learning.” These sciences are a part of learning “since they mostly involve change, which is a critical component of transformative learning.”

“Human consciousness, self-concept, and behavior,” as well as “a holistic view of self that reflects the intellectual, emotional, moral, and spiritual dimensions of our being in the world,” as well as “the expansion of multi-cultural dimensions and the effects of globalization” all play a part in adult learning.

The integration of transformative or reflective learning into teaching adults requires the incorporation of five elements:

1. Openness: A “safe learning environment and an atmosphere of trust” encourage students to “share their personal experiences,” and instructors “can garner trust quickly by sharing her/his personal experiences first, mistakes made, and valuable life lessons learned.”

2. Purpose: “Providing instructional opportunities that relate specifically to the learner and experiences that encourage her/his personal and professional development will indeed be purposeful for the learner.”

3. Meaning: “Finding meaning and significance in the learning experience requires critical and reflective thinking. New awareness causes the learner to question conflicting thoughts and assumptions.”

4. Challenging beliefs: As the adult learner discovers that “current beliefs may not be accurate,” she/he will begin to “consider and search for alternative approaches and concrete ways to change behaviors. . . . This is commonly referred to as double-loop learning.”

5. Ongoing dialogue and feedback: “Creating opportunities for ongoing dialogue and feedback must be planned and intentional. To be effective, dialogue and feedback should occur one-on-one (between learner and instructor) as well as during planned group discussions and dialogue.”

---

114 Castelli, 19.
115 Ibid.
116 Ibid.
117 Ibid., 19-20.
118 Ibid., 20.
119 Ibid.
120 Ibid.
121 Ibid.
122 Ibid.
Summary

There is a great deal written about adult learning theories, practical ideas for improving the teaching of adults, and both pedagogical and andragogical techniques suitable for the variety of learning styles and situations one might find in American adult education. It would be a daunting task—if it could be done at all—to condense or summarize all of the diverse views. Yet, there are, perhaps, a few similarities that appear throughout much of the research and writing.

1. Experience. Taking into account and utilizing the personal experience of the adult learner in teaching, as well as using experiential activities to help new learning take hold, are found in many of theories today, and seem to be crucial for adult learning.
2. Reflection. Getting in touch with the emotional and even spiritual aspects of what is being learned and/or has been learned and sharing these touch points in learning is vital for full assimilation of new learning.
3. Application. Adult learners tend to enjoy the abstract in terms of thought, but desire real-life, practical application for their specific situation. New learning needs to address the everyday reality in which the adult learner lives and works.
4. Content. Similar to application, adults learners want input into what it is they are learning, how they will learn it, and how they will be evaluated. Encouraging such input at the beginning of a course will make the experience richer for the adult learner and more of a success for the teacher.
5. Evaluation. For adult learners, evaluative activities are as important as learning activities; in fact, evaluative activities need to be opportunities to learn. Assignments and/or assessments that offer no opportunity to learn create anxiety and frustration, whereas those evaluative activities that contain learning opportunities can improve learning, morale, and application.

This research only scratches the surface of how adults learn, and how teachers of adult learners must adapt their teaching to meet the specific needs and learning styles of their adult students. There is much to learn, and the process of adapting teaching will never end. Michael Flachmann offers this challenge to teachers of adult learners:

Good teaching is a journey rather than a destination. It’s not like a subway stop where, once you are there, you can cease moving forward... Inertia is an insidiously powerful negative force in teaching—the urge to keep doing things the way we’ve done them for years. It’s a bit like belonging to the pedagogical equivalent of Alcoholics Anonymous: there’s always a poor teacher in us waiting to emerge. We have to resist the temptation to stay as we are, to rest at the bus stop.123

---


Marzano, Robert J. *Formative Assessment and Standards-Based Grading*. Bloomington, IN: Marzano Research Laboratory, 2010.

———, David C. Yanoski, Jan K. Hoegh, and Julie A. Simms with Tammy Hefelbower and Phil Warrick. *Using Common Core Standards to Enhance Classroom Instruction and Assessment*. Bloomington, IN: Marzano Research Laboratory, 2013.


Snyder, Catherine. “Finding the ‘Royal Road’ to Learning to Teach: Listening to Novice Teacher Voices in Order to Improve the Effectiveness of Teacher Education.” *Teacher Education Quarterly* (Fall 2012): 33-53. *Education Source*, EBSCOhost [accessed September 3, 2013].


APPENDIX B:

SURVEY
Appendix B: Survey

An Internet hyperlink to the survey was e-mailed to 1,073 pastors, Christian Educators, and church leaders of multiple denominations in multiple states in the United States. The following instructions accompanied the hyperlink:

Your help is needed on a research project for a doctoral project through Winebrenner Theological Seminary in Findlay, Ohio. The following link will take you to a survey on the SurveyMonkey website. The survey will take at least five minutes to complete—perhaps longer—depending on the depth of your thinking and the length of your responses.

Seventy-five statements will simply require that you rate them; three questions will invite you write a brief answer.

The survey is to help discover key behaviors Christian disciples should exhibit, activities in which they should engage, and milestones they may reach as they grow in Christ.

Will you please help with this important research? Your identity will remain anonymous; your input will be compiled with the input of other respondents and used for further research. The findings may be included in a guidebook or handbook for publication, and the finished project will be made available for viewing on Winebrenner’s website. Thank you for your assistance.

When respondents clicked on the link, they were taken to the SurveyMonkey survey, which opened with this additional statement:

What are the key behaviors that growing disciples exhibit or should exhibit? Below, please rate each of the behaviors or skills to help determine which are important in growing as a disciple of Jesus Christ.

The respondents were asked to rate seventy-five behaviors or skills that they believe are important for an adult believer to embrace in order to be successful in his/her personal growth as a disciple of Jesus Christ. The rating of these behaviors/skills are found in Appendix C, and provided substantive quantitative research data.

The following pages contain the survey placed on the SurveyMonkey website.
Key Behaviors for Disciples

Your help is needed on a research project in the Doctor of Ministry degree program at Winebrenner Theological Seminary in Findlay, Ohio.

On the following pages you will find a survey which will take perhaps five minutes to complete. Seventy-five statements will simply require that you rate them; three questions will invite you write a brief answer.

The survey is to help discover key behaviors Christian disciples should exhibit, activities in which they should engage, and milestones they may reach as they grow in Christ.

Will you please help with this important research? Your identity will remain anonymous; your input will be compiled with the input of other respondents and used for further research. The findings may be included in a guidebook or handbook for publication, and the finished project will be made available for viewing on Winebrenner’s website.

Thank you for your assistance.

Key Behaviors for Disciples—Section One

What are the key behaviors that growing disciples exhibit or should exhibit? Below, please rate each of the behaviors or skills to help determine which are important in growing as a disciple of Jesus Christ.

1. Participation in the fellowship of the community of faith.
   - Not Important
   - Somewhat Important
   - Very Important

2. Takes part in a one-on-one discipleship relationship.
   - Not Important
   - Somewhat Important
   - Very Important

3. Knows the order of the books of the Bible.
   - Not Important
   - Somewhat Important
   - Very Important

4. Understands the structure and arrangement of the Old and New Testaments.
   - Not Important
   - Somewhat Important
   - Very Important

5. Student of the Bible engaged in regular study.
   - Not Important
   - Somewhat Important
   - Very Important

   - Not Important
   - Somewhat Important
   - Very Important
7. Practicing tither.  
   Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

8. Developing spiritual fruit in life.  
   Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

9. Submits to accountability in spiritual development.  
   Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

10. Faithful Sunday morning attendance.  
    Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

    Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

12. Engages in private, personal times of worship.  
    Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

13. Lives in intentional community with other Christ-followers.  
    Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

    Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

15. Faithful, ongoing participation in most all-church functions.  
    Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

16. Loves people as Christ loved.  
    Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

17. Spends time alone with God on a regular basis.  
    Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

18. Keeps a journal as part of devotional life.  
    Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

19. Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.  
    Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

20. Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.  
    Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

21. Works to meet felt needs in order to earn the right to share Christ.  
    Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Shows compassion to all.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Shares the Good News of Christ with others.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>Lives out the Great Commission.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>Understands and engages in relational evangelism.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>Invites and includes others in the life of the local church.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>Knows the date of his/her conversion.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>Is able to explain the conversion experience.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>Understands the concept of the Trinity.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>Understands and believes in the eternality of God.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td>Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and the Holy Spirit.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>Understands and believes in Jesus Christ as fully God and fully human.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33.</td>
<td>Lives out the Great Commandment of loving God and loving others.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.</td>
<td>Understands what it means to love one another as Christ loved us.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.</td>
<td>Is able to explain God’s original plan for humanity, and what went wrong.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36.</td>
<td>Belief in a real, tangible spiritual enemy known as Satan or the devil.</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
37. Is able to describe how the church should function in today’s world.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

38. Understands sin, forgiveness, and grace.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

39. Is able to “count the cost” of discipleship.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

40. Understands prayer as conversation with God.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

41. Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

42. Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

43. Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is inerrant; contains no errors.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

44. Believes the Holy Spirit is alive and active in the church today.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

45. How God has gifted us helps us understand what and where he wants us involved.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

46. Is able and willing to help lead a person to faith in Christ.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

47. Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

48. Lives as an ambassador of Jesus Christ in the world.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

49. Has been baptized as a public profession of faith.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

50. Demonstrates how to surrender time and talents in service.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important

51. Helps others discover and sharpen their spiritual gifts(s) for meaningful service.
   Not Important Somewhat Important Very Important
52. Has a practiced and effective verbal testimony and is willing to share it.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

53. Understands the nature and practice of communion or the Lord’s Supper.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

54. Engages in active worship including raising of hands, kneeling, and/or other physical expressions.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

55. Understands and engages in the practice of foot-washing.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

56. Committed to a life of prayer.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

57. Practices the discipline of fasting from time to time.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

58. Practices the disciplines of silence and solitude as part of devotional life.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

59. Has a good reputation in the community-at-large.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

60. Believes that God answers prayer.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

61. Lives a life of example.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

62. Actively involved in partisan politics.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

63. Sends money to western missionaries overseas.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

64. Works to be involved in helping with needs within one’s own community.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

65. Provides support for indigenous ministers and churches overseas.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important

66. Is willing to lay down one’s life for others and/or for the cause of Christ.
   Not Important  Somewhat Important  Very Important
67. Has read through the entire Bible at least once.
   Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

68. Participates in a small group or home group to grow closer to Christ and to others.
   Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

69. Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.
   Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

70. Speaks in tongues.
   Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

71. Holds to a literal interpretation of the Revelation to John.
   Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

72. Desires to grow more and more into the likeness of Jesus Christ.
   Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

73. Comfortable visiting the elderly, the sick, and infirm, and the prisoner.
   Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

74. Shows hospitality to others to both those in the church and those outside of the church.
   Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

75. Hates the sin - but loves the sinner.
   Not Important    Somewhat Important    Very Important

You may have some additional ideas: we would like to know what additional behaviors you might add.

76. Please write in any behaviors and/or skills you believe were missing from the above list, and that you feel are very important for adult disciples.

(Space provided for respondents to write.)
Key Behaviors for Disciples—Section Two

Please answer the following questions carefully and completely.

77. In your opinion, what elements, behaviors, tasks, and/or skills are missing in the lives of adult believers that cause a pause or gap between conversion and further spiritual development?

(Space provided for respondents to write.)

78. What kind of assessment or evaluation will best help measure progress and mastery so that adult disciples and peer disciple-makers can monitor personal spiritual progress?

(Space provided for respondents to write.)

- End of Survey -
APPENDIX C:

QUANTIFIED SURVEY RESULTS
Appendix C: Quantified Survey Results

When respondents opened the survey, they were greeted with this statement:

“What are the key behaviors that growing disciples exhibit or should exhibit? Below, please rate each of the behaviors or skills to help determine which are important in growing as a disciple of Jesus Christ.”

The respondents were asked to rate seventy-five behaviors or skills that they believe are important for an adult believer to embrace in order to be successful in his/her personal growth as a disciple of Jesus Christ.

Below is the rating of these behaviors/skills according to Not Important, Somewhat Important, and Very Important. The numbers in the columns refer to the number of respondents who chose that rating. The far-right column shows the average rating of the Key Behavior. (The far-left number is the question number from the survey.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Behavior</th>
<th>Not Important</th>
<th>Somewhat Important</th>
<th>Very Important</th>
<th>Average Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Participation in the fellowship of the community of faith.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>2.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Takes part in a one-on-one discipleship relationship</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>2.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Knows the order of the books of the Bible.</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>1.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Understands the structure and arrangement of the Old and New Testaments.</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>2.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Student of the Bible engaged in regular study.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>247</td>
<td>2.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Seeks God first.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>276</td>
<td>3.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Practicing tither.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>2.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Developing spiritual fruit in life.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>2.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Submits to accountability in spiritual development.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>224</td>
<td>2.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Faithful Sunday morning attendance.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>2.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Actively participate in corporate worship.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>2.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Engages in private, personal times of worship.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>2.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Lives in intentional community with other Christ-followers.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>207</td>
<td>2.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Presents life as an act of worship.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>2.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Faithful, ongoing participation in most all-church functions.</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>1.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Loves people as Christ loved.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>272</td>
<td>2.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Spends time alone with God on a regular basis.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>2.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Keeps a journal as part of devotional life.</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>2.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>198</td>
<td>2.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Works to meet felt needs in order to earn the right to share Christ.</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>2.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Shows compassion to all.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>2.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Shares the Good News of Christ with others.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>2.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Lives out the Great Commission.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>254</td>
<td>2.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Understands and engages in relational evangelism.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>2.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Invites and includes others in the life of the local church.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>2.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Knows the date of his/her conversion.</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>1.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. Is able to explain the conversion experience.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>2.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. Understands the concept of the Trinity.</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>2.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. Understands and believes in the eternality of God.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>2.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and the Holy Spirit.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>2.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>Understands and believes in Jesus Christ as fully God and fully human.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33.</td>
<td>Lives out the Great Commandment of loving God and loving others.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.</td>
<td>Understands what it means to love one another as Christ loved us.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.</td>
<td>Is able to explain God’s original plan for humanity, and what went wrong.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36.</td>
<td>Belief in real, tangible spiritual enemy known as Satan or the devil.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37.</td>
<td>Is able to describe how the church should function in today’s world.</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38.</td>
<td>Understands sin, forgiveness, and grace.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39.</td>
<td>Is able to “count the cost” of discipleship.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40.</td>
<td>Understands prayer as conversation with God.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41.</td>
<td>Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42.</td>
<td>Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43.</td>
<td>Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is inerrant; contains no errors.</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44.</td>
<td>Believes the Holy Spirit is alive and active in the church today.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45.</td>
<td>How God has gifted us helps us understand what and where he wants us involved.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46.</td>
<td>Is able and willing to help lead a person to faith in Christ.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47.</td>
<td>Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lives as an ambassador of Jesus Christ in the world.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>2.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49.</td>
<td>Has been baptized as a public profession of faith.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>2.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50.</td>
<td>Demonstrates how to surrender time and talents in service.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>2.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51.</td>
<td>Helps others discover and sharpen their spiritual gift(s) for meaningful service.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>2.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52.</td>
<td>Has a practiced and effective verbal testimony and is will to share it.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>23</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>2.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53.</td>
<td>Understands the nature and practice of communion or the Lord’s Supper.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>2.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54.</td>
<td>Engages in active worship including raising of hands, kneeling, and/or other physical expressions.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>129</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55.</td>
<td>Understands and engages in the practice of foot-washing.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>91</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>1.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56.</td>
<td>Committed to a life of prayer.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>253</td>
<td>2.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57.</td>
<td>Practices the discipline of fasting from time to time.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>48</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58.</td>
<td>Practices the disciplines of silence and solitude as part of devotional life.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>40</td>
<td>159</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>2.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59.</td>
<td>Has a good reputation in the community-at-large.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>2.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60.</td>
<td>Believes that God answers prayer.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>262</td>
<td>2.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61.</td>
<td>Lives a life of example.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>254</td>
<td>2.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62.</td>
<td>Actively involved in partisan politics.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>187</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63.</td>
<td>Sends money to western missionaries overseas.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>97</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>1.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64.</td>
<td>Works to be involved in helping with needs within one’s own community.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>2.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65.</td>
<td>Provides support for indigenous ministers and churches overseas.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>57</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>1.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Key Behaviors</td>
<td>Not Important</td>
<td>Somewhat Important</td>
<td>Very Important</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66</td>
<td>Is willing to lay down one’s life for others and/or for the cause of Christ.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67</td>
<td>Has read through the entire Bible at least once.</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68</td>
<td>Participates in a small group or home group to grow closer to Christ and to others.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
<td>Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
<td>Speaks in tongues.</td>
<td>257</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td>Holds to a literal interpretation of the Revelation to John.</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>Desires to grow more and more into the likeness of Jesus Christ.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73</td>
<td>Comfortable visiting the elderly, the sick, and infirm, and the prisoner.</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74</td>
<td>Shows hospitality to others to both those in the church and those outside the church.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>Hates the sin – but loves the sinner.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following shows the seventy-five behaviors or skills as ranked in the order of their average rating (far-right column). As indicated earlier, the numbers in the columns marked Not Important, Somewhat Important, and Very Important refer to the number of respondents who chose that rating. (The far-left number is the question number from the survey.)
<p>| | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>47.</td>
<td>Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72.</td>
<td>Desires to grow more and more into the likeness of Jesus Christ.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38.</td>
<td>Understands sin, forgiveness, and grace.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Participation in the fellowship of the community of faith.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Spends time alone with God on a regular basis.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41.</td>
<td>Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60.</td>
<td>Believes that God answers prayer.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Developing spiritual fruit in life.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40.</td>
<td>Understands prayer as conversation with God.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.</td>
<td>Understands what it means to love one another as Christ loved us.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44.</td>
<td>Believes the Holy Spirit is alive and active in the church today.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61.</td>
<td>Lives a life of example.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>Lives out the Great Commission.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>Understands and believes in Jesus Christ as fully God and fully human.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56.</td>
<td>Committed to a life of prayer.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Shares the Good News of Christ with others.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48.</td>
<td>Lives as an ambassador of Jesus Christ in the world.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Student of the Bible engaged in regular study.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td>Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and the Holy Spirit.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12. Engages in private, personal times of worship.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>22. Shows compassion to all.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>42. Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14. Presents life as an act of worship.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>69. Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>30. Understands and believes in the eternality of God.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>75. Hates the sin – but loves the sinner.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9. Submits to accountability in spiritual development.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>46. Is able and willing to help lead a person to faith in Christ.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36. Belief in real, tangible spiritual enemy known as Satan or the devil.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>66. Is willing to lay down one’s life for others and/or for the cause of Christ.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13. Lives in intentional community with other Christ-followers.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11. Actively participate in corporate worship.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19. Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20. Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>74. Shows hospitality to others to both those in the church and those outside the church.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25. Understands and engages in relational evangelism.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. Practicing tither.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>Percentile</td>
<td>SD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45.</td>
<td>How God has gifted us helps us understand what and where he wants us involved.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50.</td>
<td>Demonstrates how to surrender time and talents in service.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53.</td>
<td>Understands the nature and practice of communion or the Lord’s Supper.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>Invites and includes others in the life of the local church.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Takes part in a one-on-one discipleship relationship</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59.</td>
<td>Has a good reputation in the community-at-large.</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>Is able to explain the conversion experience.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39.</td>
<td>Is able to “count the cost” of discipleship.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64.</td>
<td>Works to be involved in helping with needs within one’s own community.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.</td>
<td>Is able to explain God’s original plan for humanity, and what went wrong.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Faithful Sunday morning attendance.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43.</td>
<td>Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is inerrant; contains no errors.</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>Understands the concept of the Trinity.</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49.</td>
<td>Has been baptized as a public profession of faith.</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51.</td>
<td>Helps others discover and sharpen their spiritual gift(s) for meaningful service.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37.</td>
<td>Is able to describe how the church should function in today’s world.</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52.</td>
<td>Has a practiced and effective verbal testimony and is will to share it.</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Score 1</td>
<td>Score 2</td>
<td>Score 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68.</td>
<td>Participates in a small group or home group to grow closer to Christ and to others.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Works to meet felt needs in order to earn the right to share Christ.</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Understands the structure and arrangement of the Old and New Testaments.</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58.</td>
<td>Practices the disciplines of silence and solitude as part of devotional life.</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>159</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67.</td>
<td>Has read through the entire Bible at least once.</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73.</td>
<td>Comfortable visiting the elderly, the sick, and infirm, and the prisoner.</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57.</td>
<td>Practices the discipline of fasting from time to time.</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65.</td>
<td>Provides support for indigenous ministers and churches overseas.</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Faithful, ongoing participation in most all-church functions.</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55.</td>
<td>Understands and engages in the practice of foot-washing.</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Knows the order of the books of the Bible.</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63.</td>
<td>Sends money to western missionaries overseas.</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Keeps a journal as part of devotional life.</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54.</td>
<td>Engages in active worship including raising of hands, kneeling, and/or other physical expressions.</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>Knows the date of his/her conversion.</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71.</td>
<td>Holds to a literal interpretation of the Revelation to John.</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62.</td>
<td>Actively involved in partisan politics.</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key Behaviors as ranked by respondents

The list below is the same as that in the listing directly above, but listed without rating information or question numbers, showing only the ranking of the key behaviors.

- Seeks God first.
- Lives out the Great Commandment of loving God and loving others.
- Loves people as Christ loved.
- Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.
- Desires to grow more and more into the likeness of Jesus Christ.
- Understands sin, forgiveness, and grace.
- Participation in the fellowship of the community of faith.
- Spends time alone with God on a regular basis.
- Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God.
- Believes that God answers prayer.
- Developing spiritual fruit in life.
- Understands prayer as conversation with God.
- Understands what it means to love one another as Christ loved us.
- Believes the Holy Spirit is alive and active in the church today.
- Lives a life of example.
- Lives out the Great Commission.
- Understands and believes in Jesus Christ as fully God and fully human.
- Committed to a life of prayer.
- Shares the Good News of Christ with others.
- Lives as an ambassador of Jesus Christ in the world.
- Student of the Bible engaged in regular study.
- Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and the Holy Spirit.
- Engages in private, personal times of worship.
- Shows compassion to all.
- Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us.
- Presents life as an act of worship.
- Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.
- Understands and believes in the eternality of God.
- Hates the sin – but loves the sinner.
- Submits to accountability in spiritual development.
- Is able and willing to help lead a person to faith in Christ.
- Belief in real, tangible spiritual enemy known as Satan or the devil.
- Is willing to lay down one’s life for others and/or for the cause of Christ.
- Lives in intentional community with other Christ-followers.
- Actively participate in corporate worship.
- Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.
• Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.
• Shows hospitality to others to both those in the church and those outside the church.
• Understands and engages in relational evangelism.
• Practicing tither.

The behaviors above are the top forty behaviors as ranked by the survey respondents. The list continues below.

• How God has gifted us helps us understand what and where he wants us involved.
• Demonstrates how to surrender time and talents in service.
• Understands the nature and practice of communion or the Lord’s Supper.
• Invites and includes others in the life of the local church.
• Takes part in a one-on-one discipleship relationship
• Has a good reputation in the community-at-large.
• Is able to explain the conversion experience.
• Is able to “count the cost” of discipleship.
• Works to be involved in helping with needs within one’s own community.
• Is able to explain God’s original plan for humanity, and what went wrong.
• Faithful Sunday morning attendance.
• Believes God’s Word (the Bible) is inerrant; contains no errors.
• Understands the concept of the Trinity.
• Has been baptized as a public profession of faith.
• Helps others discover and sharpen their spiritual gift(s) for meaningful service.
• Is able to describe how the church should function in today’s world.
• Has a practiced and effective verbal testimony and is will to share it.
• Participates in a small group or home group to grow closer to Christ and to others.
• Works to meet felt needs in order to earn the right to share Christ.
• Understands the structure and arrangement of the Old and New Testaments.
• Practices the disciplines of silence and solitude as part of devotional life.
• Has read through the entire Bible at least once.
• Comfortable visiting the elderly, the sick, and infirm, and the prisoner.
• Practices the discipline of fasting from time to time.
• Provides support for indigenous ministers and churches overseas.
• Faithful, ongoing participation in most all-church functions.
• Understands and engages in the practice of foot-washing.
• Knows the order of the books of the Bible.
• Sends money to western missionaries overseas.
• Keeps a journal as part of devotional life.
• Engages in active worship including raising of hands, kneeling, and/or other physical expressions.
• Knows the date of his/her conversion.
• Holds to a literal interpretation of the Revelation to John.
• Actively involved in partisan politics.
• Speaks in tongues.
APPENDIX D:

ADDITIONAL SUGGESTIONS FROM RESPONDENTS
Appendix D: Additional Suggestions from Respondents

Following the rating of the key behaviors or skills, the participants were given the opportunity to add their own suggestions of key behaviors or skills in a comment/essay box in the Survey Monkey form. Of the two-hundred, seventy-seven surveys received, 101 respondents contributed to this list (36.46%).

The qualitative responses are listed below in the order of their frequency. This researcher has grouped like responses under broader categories below, followed by specific statements or comments from respondents. All responses were anonymous. No attempt has been made to correct misspellings or incorrect grammar; neither will any notification (e.g. “sic” for *sic erat scriptum*) be given.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Additional Behaviors or Skills</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accepting/Caring/Compassion</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>understands that “coming alongside” someone who has fallen into sin, and pointing out the “un-Christlike” behavior is not “judging” but being the active witness and showing love; be a good listener and a caring person; not judgmental; to be open and accepting of others, irregardless of their lifestyle; understanding the difference between spiritual and psychological issues and also how these interact; developing the art of listening; good listener; tolerance of other Christian beliefs; does not judge others; friendliness; inclusive; keeping confidences; being there for people</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unity/Peace</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the ability to get along in unity with other believers in a local congregation; when disagreement arises seeks solutions that avoid division of the body; able to disagree with others in a loving, respectful way; lives as a peacemaker; being able to work with those that often are divisive within the local church; conflict resolution; live with an attitude of peace, not contentious or argumentative; patience in stressful situations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christlikeness/Sanctification/Holiness</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>understands sanctification; attempts to live a life above reproach morally and ethically; the lack of use of drugs, tobacco and alcohol; speech to be Christ-honoring; does not visit places or people where one would be tempted to sin; modeling God’s characteristics; shows evidence of life change and spiritual growth; has a desire to get closer to God, not out of duty or compulsion, but a sincere longing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forgiveness/Forgiving</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demonstrates the concept of forgiving others and asking for forgiveness from others; knows the importance of giving and receiving forgiveness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discipling/Being Discipled</td>
<td>Obedience/Obedient/Submit/Submission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>it is imperative a disciple is both discipled and discipling; having ongoing Paul, Barnabas, and Timothy relationships: submitting to another who is more spiritually mature, walking with one who is about same spiritual maturity, and discipling someone who is not as far along spiritually; giving spiritual direction; is preparing to disciple others; willingness to share your own weaknesses with others; inviting others to follow you as you follow Christ</td>
<td>obey his still small voice at all times; obedience to God’s instructions needs to be first and foremost in the life of the disciple and not an option; disciples need to learn what it means to come to a place of full surrender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holy Spirit</td>
<td>lives Holy Spirit filled life; learns to “hear” the voice of the Holy Spirit and to distinguish it from all other voices such as self, the evil one, or even the noises of life—John 10:4; being ever more sensitive to the Holy Spirit’s leading in life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leader/Leadership</td>
<td>grows in leadership positions within the church; the higher you rise on the leadership ladder the more discipline that is expected in order for you to lead the church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachable</td>
<td>demonstrates openness as a life-long learner in the things of Christ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role-model/Example</td>
<td>living out your faith 24/7 in your home environment so that the faith passes to the next generation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thankful/Thankfulness</td>
<td>attitude of thankfulness; being thankful for all things regardless of circumstances</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust/Trusting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following individual comments were considered unique and did not fit any of the categories this researcher identified above.

| A disciple needs to learn self-care. (An unhealthy disciple (body, soul, or spirit) cannot produce healthy disciples.) | 1 |
| Committed to closeness with God, connection in community, and influence with others | 1 |
| Discernment—learning how to discern his voice | 1 |
| Embracing the abundant life he offers us (does not necessarily mean prosperity) | 1 |
| Encouraging ourselves in the Lord like king David did | 1 |
| Enjoys the fellowship of the church, but comfortable with “sinners” | 1 |
| Giving must be an act of obedience to the Holy Spirit | 1 |
| [God-honoring] social media behavior | 1 |
| Having unsaved friends (often times believers spend so much time with other believers that they forget how to relate to the unchurched) | 1 |
| Love God, others, and family | 1 |
| Merciful | 1 |
| Not self-righteous | 1 |
| Personal relationship with God | 1 |
| Personal relationship with Jesus | 1 |
| Pleasing only God | 1 |
| Reads extra-biblical sources to help explain the scriptures, deepen understanding, and enrich spiritual walk | 1 |
| Repentant | 1 |
Seeks the Lord to find identity, comfort, and hope 1
Seeks the word, godly counsel, and prayer to make life decisions 1
Sincere faith 1
Submits to those in authority over them in the Lord 1
The healing of past wounds to eliminate wrong idea of God and self 1
To feel a sense of complete security in Christ, regardless of personal circumstances 1
To love children, widows, elderly and treat them with respect 1
Understands the nature and purpose of the church 1
Wisdom of when it is a good thing to speak and when to be silent 1
Works to maintain healthy balance and margin in all areas of life 1

The following are comments from respondents that this researcher could not easily categorize because many were worded in ways that did not read as behaviors or skills missing from the list of seventy-five key behaviors. Some were specific for pastors; some pertained to problems or suggestions for the survey itself; some were composed in such a way that rendered the comment mostly unclear, and to attempt to decipher the respondents’ meaning may have resulted in further misinterpretation; some comments might lie outside of Christian orthodoxy. These uncategorized comments are listed below for full disclosure of all qualitative comments. No attempt has been made to correct misspellings or incorrect grammar; neither will any notification (e.g. “sic” for sic erat scriptum) be given.

- A good leader must be a great follower.
- Ability to delegate authority and to train others so that one person does not try to carry the whole load of ministry.
- Preaching involves study, and study means work, and with many this word has an unwelcome sound. The cost of time, energy, and self-denial that preaching imposes, causes many to shirk their responsibility. Solomon’s description of a lazy bones should be “read, marked and inwardly digested” by all (Proverbs 24:30-34).
- Thinking outside the box when it comes to ministry and meeting today’s challenges even from 10 years ago.

- I only wish there was a box between “Somewhat” and “Very” important. Some believers are new to faith and some have had a long term relationship with Christ and so their place would be different along their walk with Christ.
- Some of the questions I checked somewhat important because I believe that by the leading of the Holy Spirit we will know how important the statement is based upon the circumstances that we have been directed.
- Some of the statements referring to “understanding” certain aspects of the faith are vague. I do not fully understand grace but I am grateful for it. Humility. When we feel we fully understand God’s plan we are presuming an awful lot.
• [The survey] only listed a few spiritual disciplines. I believe each person is created in such a way [that] certain disciplines will prove helpful to become more like Jesus while others such as fasting may not be as personally rewarding.

• I would have preferred to [have] had a percentage scale instead of only three point. This appeared to be [never, sometimes, or always. Most have daily work schedules.

• I found the list quite challenging due to the phraseology. There are quite a few questions that should be worded more carefully so that the responses are not misinterpreted. For example, question number 10 asks about the importance of worship on Sunday. Are you wanting to ascertain if someone should “Keep the Sabbath Holy” as in only on Sunday, or can they go Saturday night to a service? In other words, is weekly corporate worship important or is only Sunday worship important?

• I believe we can always draw closer to the Lord and allow him to continue to do a work in our lives.

• Rather than one-on-one discipleship relationship, which Jesus didn’t have with everyone, a group discipleship relationship is what I deem important.

• I feel very strongly about a person having to be really committed to be a true Christian, and then I am confronted by Paul in 1 Corinthians calling the Corinthians “carnal Christians” indicating they are Christians but still carnal.

• Not so much that a disciple nails a certain spiritual discipline, but practicing spiritual disciplines dependably, regularly. If they never have communion but spend one or two hours every single day in the Word and prayer, they will grow. That’s input. They also need output, as some examples were described. They should use their gifts, share their faith, serve others, though not a single one of them is the key. Active input and output, hear and do, listen and obey. ...regularly... That will make disciples. Thank God for faithful disciples and those who study to make more disciples.

• How important is church growth?

• Simplicity and frugality are necessary to counter material distractions and keep a disciple focused and trusting the rabboni.

• When Jesus says follow me, we follow.

• Compassion and understanding for less fortunate people versus blame.

• Simplicity that distinguishes between the kingdom and cultural norms in living and embodying the reality of Christ.

• To be able to understand more from where people are coming and what their desire is.

• Not to focus on doing but being what God has called you to be. Also not judging others but discerning God’s will in your life and be guided on how to relate to others by your relationship to Christ.

• A broader understanding of church to include the Christian Church Universal and the individual’s attitudes, behaviors, and place in that church.

• It’s important to develop gifts but not necessarily for the church (local congregation) but for the church as a whole.
• Belief that God doesn’t make mistakes and that no matter what, we are always on the right path for our salvation and spiritual growth—how it plays out will be shown to us later.
• Notice and advocate the protocols and punishments prescribed by God for wrong-doers, as Christ did not rescind the Biblically prescribed punishment (for murder, kidnapping).
• Notice that hurt feelings and negative consequences of sin are not to be lifted by others just because the offender is sorry, repents, laments, etc. as the shame and negative consequences are part of their journey to spiritual reformation with God and man.
• When Jesus left this world he came back in the person of the Holy Spirit.
APPENDIX E:
QUALITATIVE CONTRIBUTIONS REGARDING PROGRESS AND ASSESSMENT
Appendix E: Qualitative Contributions Regarding Progress and Assessment

In addition to the rating of the list of key behaviors (Appendix B), and the contributions of additional behaviors (qualitative question one found in Appendix C), two additional questions were posed. These questions allowed the respondents the opportunity to contribute their own personal ideas. The second of the three qualitative questions addressed the disconnect between the experience of God’s grace and the lifelong development into the image of Christ: “In your opinion, what elements, behaviors, tasks, and/or skills are missing in the lives of adult believers that cause a gap between conversion and further spiritual development?” (The third of three questions will be address later in this current appendix.)

The compilation of this list of ideas was meant to help identify those behaviors or skills that respondents felt may be missing or lost, helping to explain the suspension or interruption in the spiritual formation of many adult Christians in North America.

Of the 277 surveys received, 249 respondents contributed to this list of ideas (89.89%). The specific ideas provided by the respondents are found below, listed in the order of their frequency. This researcher has grouped like responses under broad categories below, followed by specific statements or comments from respondents. All responses were anonymous. No attempt has been made to correct misspellings or incorrect grammar; neither will any notification (e.g. “sic” for sic erat scriptum) be given.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In your opinion, what elements, behaviors, tasks, and/or skills are missing in the lives of adult believers that cause a gap between conversion and further spiritual development?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Missing elements that respondents felt cause a pause or gap between conversion and further spiritual development:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discipleship/Discipler/Training/Mentor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a one-on-one, intimate relationship with someone who can model and speak into [a person’s] life; immediate discipleship; personal discipleship from more mature believers in the church; a mentor in their lives; mentoring someone (this encourages them to be serious about discipleship); imitation—we are hesitant to invite others to follow us as we follow Christ, and are hesitant to follow someone else as well; discipleship after conversion first takes place; overcoming the fear to openly and honestly trust another person; solid discipleship experience because most Christians in the West do not engage with new believers in that way; discipline; good Christian role-models (too many professing Christians who set poor examples); a mentor or community of faith to move the person forward; training to become good disciples; the making of disciples is missing (those who are adults in the faith need to disciple others in order that the great commission be fulfilled); effective discipleship; encouragement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
and expectation from other adult believers; mentoring or one-on-one discipleship; mentoring/accountability; regular small group discipleship activities; role-models; being willing to be mentored or taught the ways of Christ (we act as though the conversion experience is all that’s needed; it’s just the beginning); coming alongside new believers and encouraging their development; a good system to create mentorships between mature and new Christians; mentoring accountability to be a disciple, not just a convert to a concept, movement, or ideology; good discipling that fosters a commitment to be a disciple; I believe the biggest thing missing is intentional discipleship (this can be tasked in many ways: I believe the one-on-one relationship with a more mature Christian is the most effective); intentional discipleship training and/or relationship; the need for a spiritual mentor; one holding them accountable for becoming Christlike; willingness to keep growing and learning; teachability and [remaining] open to the leading of the Holy Spirit

God’s Word/Bible/Scripture reading or knowing God’s Word; understanding [and] embracing the truth of God’s Word; taking the time to dig deep into the scriptures and really understanding the meaning of the scriptures; continuous study and understanding of God’s Word; biblical knowledge; biblical literacy; knowing facts and figures of scripture is of utmost importance yet too often insulates the believer from personally knowing God. The need is to know how facts and figures apply not just what they are; the Truth and knowing the Truth; daily Bible reading; the spiritual disciplines of Bible study and memorization; personal biblical study to further their faith and knowledge of Christ; personal interest in ongoing Bible study; biblical literacy (at least be able to identify key passages and applying them in their lives); many people may know God’s Word intellectually, but lack the ability to understand how they can apply his Word in their everyday lives; regular, personal time spent with God and his Word to learn what they need to do to grow in the faith; personal and communal Bible study; a hunger for the word is often missing; knowing the Bible as a story; knowledge of Scripture; biblical understanding (they may read, but not understand); daily Bible study; personal Bible study and time with the Father; constant reading and study of the Bible; daily devotions—bible reading (not just a daily devotion on line); perhaps a commitment to memorization of verses so that the word is consistently first and foremost in your thoughts; biblical literacy and an increasing love for the Father; interpreting scripture and applying to daily lives
Commitment/Maturity

a desire to grow; understanding the necessity of growing spiritually in Christ and not being content with just being saved; true commitment to the person of Christ (having substituted “church membership” and adherence to policies and instructed human interpretation); full commitment to Christ; spiritual maturity in Christ—living out who we are in Christ; walk the talk; radical followership of Jesus versus consumerism and mimicking other Christians; dedicated personal devotion time; a desire to obey all God has commanded out of love vs. out of ordered obedience; the commitment to make time for God (too many times believers allow the world to impose on their time and schedules and takes away from their time spent with God, which hampers spiritual growth); coherence to the mission of God (what is my part and why is my participation important?); passion; devotion; total commitment to Jesus Christ; being truly sold-out to Christ, not merely believing in Him for salvation alone (in other words, dying out to self); a total commitment to following Christ; falling in LOVE with Jesus; understanding real commitment and infusing it into daily life; commitment and/or dedication to God and the church; commitment and trust in the Lord (too many believe they can do all things on their own without help from the Lord); I believe that many persons do not want to give up their time, to take time to spend learning about the love of Jesus (people are too busy to go to church and get involved); Commitment to the church (letting life get in the way and other things become more important); commitment to become totally involved in the church; consistency and intentionality of practice.

Connection/Relationships/Unity

connecting with other believers; sharing their love and God’s love with people; passion for others; the understanding that God calls us to live in relationship with Him and others; connecting with a local body of believers (congregation and/or small group) to further their study of the Word and to enjoy the fellowship of believers; involvement in a local church; having an open and honest [relationship] with a small group of like-minded disciples who are readily accessible to you and to whom you will be accountable; ongoing relationships with people who are struggling in life; personal exposure to those who are coming to know Jesus (first hand or by testimony via video, written, verbal); being a part of a group in the fellowship; continuous love for one another (other believers) and non-believers alike; incorporation into a dynamic local church; deep committed fellowship with other believers; getting connected with others in the local church body; the element of true community as demonstrated by participating in the life of the local congregation; faithful attendance to God’s House; loving the church...with it’s ups
and downs (too easy to leave for another); small group involvement (close community) in some form, leading to a lack of strong Christian connections; being in a prayer group; involvement in local congregation (more than just Sunday mornings); eagerness to engage in friendship; encouraging others in their relationship with Jesus; compassion for others, willingness to lay it all on the line for Jesus; assimilation into the ministry of the local church; dedication and faithfulness to God and his church; getting connected—more than attending one weekly service (it could be a life group or Sunday school program where a deeper pursuit of faith can take place; genuine love/compassion/friendship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priorities</th>
<th>23</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>priority of the call of Jesus over personal issues; persistence is missing (many adult believers get caught up in the busyness of their lives and therefore lag in spiritual development); too many activities conflict with times for church, or small groups (people are pulled in all directions and fail to put God first); putting their faith to work beyond Sunday morning; we have the individual accept Jesus Christ as Lord and Savior but we spend more time talking about the Savior role of Christ rather than the Lordship role of Christ in our lives; care of family, job, and church; taking time for devotion and prayer; living lives that reflect what the Bible expects of us (we can’t constantly get drunk on Saturday night and praise and worship God on Sunday); selflessness; sacrificial attitudes; outward focus; being consistent in practice of beliefs; personal, consistent alone time with God and devotional study most days; regular (daily), dedicated time [with] the Lord; consistent worship; focus on God (can often slide due to worldly demands); balance; finding time for personal Sabbath; personal evaluation; daily quiet time—spent in prayer, with God; a practice of Sabbath; being too busy, not setting better priorities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Spiritual Disciplines</th>
<th>15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>prayer (4); taking time to spend one-on-one with the Lord in prayer and meditation; a life of prayer; constant communion with God through private prayer; tithing (4); accountability (4); worship (2); living a life guided by worship; commitment to practicing spiritual disciplines, such as devotional time, time of solitude, etc.; patience; silence in his presence; the church, in general, and my local church included, does a poor job of emphasizing the importance of a daily quiet time (I first learned of this in college after becoming a Christian but rarely, if ever, hear it mentioned, preached or shared in the church)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Knowing the path/way, people need a clear path of what to expect that they will be held accountable for in their spiritual development, along with a mentor to walk alongside during that development; understanding of [the] basics of Christian life; teaching on spiritual dynamics of how “Christ in me” really impacts every area of life; understanding of 1 Peter 2:5-9 and its implications. In addition, no understanding of APEST [apostles, prophets, evangelists, shepherds, teachers] of Ephesians 4 [ESV]; understanding that following Jesus as a disciple is a lifestyle, not just something we do to escape eternal condemnation; education; proper education; people simply do not know how to deepen their relationship [with the Lord]; expectations of what it means to grow in your faith; an intentional and accountable strategy for maturing in Christ; a clear “map” of how to grow in their faith [resulting in] our efforts [being] piecemeal rather than comprehensive or systematic; inevitably there are gaps in our development as a result.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Obedience/Submission/Willingness</th>
<th>14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>the denying of self is very difficult for western believers; full submission to the working of God in our hearts and lives; willingness to love unconditionally; surrendering our will to God’s will for us (i.e. holiness of heart); understanding what it means to die to self; obedience to the direction of the Holy Spirit; obedience to the Lord’s commands and willingness to on-going conforming to the image of God’s Son; willingness to follow through on commitment; willingness to sacrifice; willingness to change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service/Giftedness</th>
<th>14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>we wait until people “get their act together” before giving them the opportunity to grow and develop through doing; knowing spiritual gifts and passions; finding a church they can serve in; Christian service is largely missing; personal engagement in short term missions to become more aware of the Great Commission; actively engaged in serving others and especially “the least of these”; identification, development, and use of spiritual gifts; service and caring about others; meaningful service outside the local church body; service (both in and outside the church); being a servant; willingness to do things that take us outside of our comfort zone; a place where the new convert may immediately utilize their zeal and excitement in some sort of kingdom work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conversion is the beginning, not the end</th>
<th>12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>conversion is often seen as the end of the journey (the new believer has arrived) rather than as the beginning of a spiritual journey which will last the rest of [one’s] life; historically, we have focused on</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
conversions and not making disciples; I think we place too much emphasis on conversion (as a point of crossing the line) rather than discipleship (which is a life-long journey); transparency on the part of other believers and leaders that conversion does not equal perfection; I believe that sometimes there is such an emphasis on a point of conversion, that people have still not “heard” about this only being the starting point in lifelong spiritual development; upon one’s conversion, the convert must have a partnership with the Holy Spirit to develop behavior, skills, and fruit of the Spirit; acceptance of transformation by the work of the Holy Spirit; attitude toward discipleship whereby conversion is the first, not the only step for discipleship; acting on his guidance; the fullness and the person of the Holy Spirit; allowing him to grow inside the person; spiritual self-feeders (most live the same year over and over spiritually)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Forgiveness</th>
<th>self-forgiveness; knowing for certain that their sin CAN be forgiven whatever it is; loving others as Christ commanded, and leaving it to the Holy Spirit to convict sinners; showing forgiveness to others for their shortcomings and sin; being charitable; not being judgmental</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Humility</td>
<td>humility, that is, the acceptance of our own sin and the continued need to be open to repentance and acceptance of our own weakness</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust/Faith/Belief</td>
<td>faith and belief; stepping out in faith to trust that God is leading them; trusting God to lead, guide, and direct life as he knows what we need better than we do; trust in God; the ability to trust in the Lord and accept all that God wills</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identity in Christ</td>
<td>knowing and embracing one’s true identity in Jesus Christ; an understanding that the spiritual life is greater than myself is frequently missing and necessary to make the jump into further spiritual development; missing is a view of Christianity as relationship/discipleship instead of only as a religious activity</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelism/Witness</td>
<td>ability to simply and concisely communicate the gospel; sharing the Good News with others; clearly knowing and understanding faith to such a degree that they can accurately explain it to others, both Christian and non-Christian alike</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Leaders/Leadership
spiritual church leadership; interest and/or time from leaders to help believers with the growth process; an intentional follow-up on the part of leaders following an individual’s conversion

| Repentance |
| True repentance; repentance is missing (we all want forgiveness but God asks for repentance; we want a Savior but we don’t want to surrender to his Lordship) |
| 3 |

The following individual comments were considered unique and did not fit any of the categories this researcher identified above.

| A broadened understanding of God. |
| Acceptance |
| An orthodox understanding of God (Trinity, incarnation, divinity/humanity of Christ, etc.) |
| Being in relationship with Christ. |
| Open-mindedness. |
| Opportunity. |
| Putting into practice the commands/teaching of Jesus (Matt. 18:20). |
| Recognizing they are a sinner in need of a savior. |
| Selflessness. |
| Understanding problem resolution. |
| Understanding the balance between the Holiness of God and the Love of God. |
| 1 |

The following are comments from respondents that are worded as “negatives” that may be present (as opposed to positives that may be absent as in the list above) that contribute to the pause or gap between conversion and further spiritual development. They are not categorized and are listed in no particular order. All responses were anonymous. No attempt has been made to correct misspellings or incorrect grammar; neither will any notification (e.g. “sic” for sic erat scriptum) be given.

- I believe there is a fear of failure. Many new converts view spiritually mature believers with a sense of awe. The thought of growing and striving toward spiritual maturity is oftentimes intimidating.
- People who confess Jesus with their lips but deny him with their lives.
- Cultural intelligence.
- Self-centeredness.
- Complacency.
- Health issues
• Work requirements
• Discouraged by a local church.
• Lack of commitment by those who call themselves “Christians” by only attending church Sunday AM and not following Christ’s example of service.
• Failure to be encouraged to become a disciple, and to engage in spiritual pursuits that develop spiritual development, mostly from a lack of time, because of busyness of life.
• Worldly distractions and complex living
• A worldly view.
• Self-centeredness gets in the way of being fully committed to full spiritual maturity.
• Allowing the world to “creep” into decisions that are made. Our society puts hidden pressures on each of us. Too many things of little value take up too much of our time and energy.
• Sometimes the church, and other practicing believers, expect too little of each other. Low expectations get low results.
• They are not asking the question, “What is God saying to me?” each day. And more importantly, “What am I going to do about it?”
• There is a satisfaction in their current level of godliness that turns into apathy.
• People look at others, even Christian leaders, whose lives are not committed totally to Christ and they feel good about themselves and are not motivated to become more spiritually developed.
• Our cultural orientation has so dominated that we have not adjusted well to reaching our changing US population.
• In a movie I watched one time a Voo Doo doped up fella stated, “Everybody won go heaven, Nobody won be dead.” We have to die to self. That is missing today.
• Inability to look at both sides of an issue with an open mind.
• Their backgrounds as opposed to our own backgrounds and experience.
• Fear of the Lord taking over too much of “their” lives; fear he may ask more of them than they can comfortably give.
• Adults become too self-reliant.
• Judgment of others—each one of us has enough to work on that we don’t need to be telling others what to do.
• Many “Christians” haven’t understood Jesus’ call for us to sacrifice everything, including personal freedom so worshiped in our country.
• Romans 12:1-2, people hold on to idols. This prevents them from worshipping the Lord with all their heart, soul, and strength which keeps them from having a renewed mind.
• A traumatic event in their lives.
• The biggest challenges are the roadblocks that the enemy places in the new believer’s path.
• A Christian who treats them unkindly.
• Need for instant gratification, self-centeredness.
• Desire to be accepted or popular with peer group.
• Time constraints.
• Observed negative behaviors of other Christians and Christian institutions.
• No one told them they are to continue growing.
• There are those who commit themselves to Christ without a basic understanding that he calls his followers to be in the world. Many people lack the discipline to keep their focus on God and being physically distanced from a community of believers throughout the week weakens any discipline they have to start.
• The church in America has modeled a classroom form of discipleship that has excluded the personal one-on-one discipling. We have focused upon informing the mind but not necessarily renewing the mind and the actions that flow from being like Jesus.
• We are not teaching people to “feed” between Sundays. We are still training pastors to create pastor-centered churches; we are not mentoring and empowering others to lead and to take personal charge of their spiritual growth.
• When an adult is converted they are pumped and excited and they do daily devotions. As we continue on, some get lax in their development as a believer by not getting into devotions, not going to church, and not spending time with God daily.
• Matthew 13:1-8. There are many worldly elements that come in our way to hinder us from following and bearing fruit for the glory of Jesus. There is a very important responsibility on the shoulders of every believer who is walking with Christ to practice the priesthood of every believer and pray for the new convert and be willing to lay your life down for their sake so that they may also learn to grow, mature, and bear much fruit.
• The majority of professing Christians do not truly believe what they are saying they believe, for belief always leads to action. Inaction in day-to-day living for Christ is epidemic in the church in the USA.
• We don’t allow for doubt and open processing of faith in churches
• Failure of the church to have a clear pathway to spiritual maturity.
• Failure to grasp the drag of popular culture—how alien it is to the life of faith.
• Many evangelical believers do not spend enough time in solitude and reflection where they will find ears to hear, eyes to see, and a heart open to God.
• Confusion of the words/principles of Christ appear to leave some drifting, so to speak, and their complete attention to the truth revealed seems to be too far away, too big, or even too “spiritual” in nature. The result is a less than total surrender to Christ and his will.
• Too often a new Christian is not mentored or taught how to apply Christianity to life. We assume too much.
• The identification of deep wounds within themselves and the willingness to allow Christ to renew and transform their minds (it is easier to start attending all the functions and clean up the outside of themselves); lack of daily discipline to connect with God through his Word, the only thing which truly transforms.
• Spiritual models and mentors causes weak growth of the believer. Lack of accountability and self-discipline hinders next step formation, which is usually hard, in the believer’s life. Pride causes one to hold back on changing as God would want.
- Not made to realize the importance of living it day to day in front of their children—to make it personal and part of the raising of their children.
- Too many get connected to the church first then to Christ second. The Gospel plus anything (man-made rules) weakens the Gospel.
- Complacency, I believe, is the problem; spiritual lethargy. I think all of us tend to forget that this is a relationship (with Christ) not a goal to be achieved. All relations take work; the depth of the relationship depends on what we put in to it.
- The idea that our priority is more about eternity rather than this span of time lived on earth. We are overly concerned of personal comfort, the safety of our families, and the security of our ways of life.
- They only seek a savior instead of a Lord
- Suffering
- We are way too self-centered. We want to be entertained rather than be challenged to a deeper walk.
- People rely too much on the pastor to feed them instead of learning to feed themselves on a daily basis.
- The local church often emphasizes either conversion or mission. There should be a more consistent balance. Local churches often turn faith into moralism rather than life dependent on relationship with God.
- Lack of commitment
- Personally I think the computer and internet, while wonderful, are highly distracting and can hinder spiritual development (an answer to a question not asked, sorry).
- Confusing politics with faith life
- I think too many Christians let the cares and work (jobs, hobbies, etc.) of this world interfere with their developing a relationship with God. Maybe they don’t understand grace and the fact that they don’t have to prove something to God.
- There are a number of contributors, but the two main elements seem to be an understanding of the gospel that is simply about consuming a religious good, mainly a free ticket to salvation, without understanding or embracing the call to a kingdom life of submission to Jesus; and a lack of in-depth, discipleship relationships in which they are taught by instruction and modeling what it means to imitate Christ.

The following are comments from respondents that this researcher could not easily categorize. They were worded in ways that did not address elements that are missing in the lives of adult believers that cause a gap between conversion and further spiritual development. Instead, some were addressed specifically to pastors, some were declarative statements, while some were composed in such a way that rendered the comment somewhat unclear, and any attempt to interpret the respondents’ meaning would have proven inadequate or could have potentially changed the respondent’s intended meaning. These are listed below for full disclosure of all qualitative comments. All responses were anonymous. No attempt has been made to correct misspellings or incorrect grammar; neither will any notification (e.g. “sic” for sic erat scriptum) be given.
- It’s difficult to visit newer families because of their hectic schedules especially if there are children in the family.
- Don’t try to control the conversation. Don’t act as if you have all of the answers.
- Preaching through the whole counsel of Scripture not just certain parts.
- Practice what you preach.
- Too few church leaders are willing to step on toes with the Word. We no longer fear God as we ought, largely due to the fact we no longer preach on hell like we should. The church caters much too much to what people want instead of what they need. The church likes her comfort too much. Not enough fire in the heart of our pastors.
- It is vital [that] pastors and leaders not only accurately interpret scripture, but follow through with how one can live that truth out on a daily basis. Understanding the Bible is one thing, living the Bible is another. James 1:22.
- God is looking for Giants for kingdom work and those Giants come from feeding the Holy Spirit that comes to live inside a person. For many, including pastors, the Holy Spirit is starved for the food he needs to grow.
- The Son of Man came to serve, the Holy Spirit gifts us for service, yet often times many in our churches are content to let the pastor do the work (that’s why we pay them right?) and indeed pastors allow this to happen (that’s why they pay me right?) and fall into the consumerist trap of whether or not this church meets my needs. Putting our spiritual gifts into practice is essential.

- Breadth and depth in discipling believers will expand vision and extend mission.
- I think we wait too long to baptize people.
- I find that many adults who pause or don’t show signs of spiritual growth often have not or do not seek help in overcoming past pain/sin/hurt. Too many don’t want to do the hard work it takes to truly be healed of the past so they can become and live as the person God intended them to be.
- In my opinion, there are two essential elements that are paramount to spiritual growth—the Word and Worship.
- The concept of faith as a gift of God; it has been negated by the language of “choice” and that may begin with the wide acceptance of egocentric expressions such as “I made a choice for Christ.” Theologically and biblically this is not supportable; note the post-resurrection accounts wherein the disciples by and large do not come to belief until they are gifted with the Holy Spirit. If spiritual development is taught as a further working of the Spirit, our behaviors of following the spiritual disciplines are more easily seen less as choice and more as obligation...a missing element in today’s protestant ecclesiology.
- A version of the gospel that is not truth in love is being preached. Adults are being taught IN church that they can be Christ-followers without having to deny themselves. People also have learned how to DO church without knowing God’s Word and even the commands of Jesus in how to handle conflict, love others, and eradicate sin.
- I’m not sure that you can really be converted and not have a hunger to know your creator more. As long as the gap is not resource related then I would say the gap is the time between pretending and true conversion.
• The church is doing a disservice in accepting people as they are and not providing some type of accountability and/or discipline to correct the sin that causes continued pain and suffering in the lives of people being misled that they can conform but not be transformed in sanctification with Christ.

• Pride. . . Less of Self, More of Christ—Too Many Trying to Be the One, instead of pointing to the One. . .

• I have heard it said, “We are as close to God as we want to be.” I didn’t used to believe that statement, but the older I get, I’m finding it to be more true than not. It seems to me that most churches are salvation-centric, as opposed to discipleship centered. I feel like authentic disciple making with a clear plan, mentorship when appropriate, and a tremendous amount of grace as we walk and talk alongside our new believers can minimize the “pause” or “gap” of maturity. Discipleship has to be so much more than a book, and the class. It takes genuine, intentional investment of mature believers in the lives of those new believers. It will take their sacrifice of time, money, and effort, and so often anymore, that expectation is not placed upon the mature believer within many congregations.

• Look at the church in what’s in it for me and forget about the lost, taking spiritual responsibility as part of the body of Christ.

• We are pulled constantly by the things of this life. It is hard for us to believe that 2 Corinthians 4:17-18 is really true. It takes crisis to keep us moving closer to God.

• Wanting to be in the world and of the world, and still be called a Christian. The opposite of what Jesus said we should be, “In the world but not of the world.”

• I think it’s just the parable of the soils syndrome. Also, I think Satan’s sifting is so subtle that people get confused about their whole faith experience.

• The Holy Spirit alone can motivate someone to want to develop further spiritually. This cannot be forced but the church does provide the means for the Spirit to develop the believer.

• If these be done it is enough. (This researcher assumes the respondent is referring to the seventy-five key behaviors listed in the survey.)

• The church today—follow our “rules” and you will be just fine. Most times the Bible is ignored. The church, in general, counts nickles and noses and doesn’t care about spiritual growth.

• Family separation, divorce, and early trauma can cause folks to be wary of surrendering all to God because they have learned to be self-protective. I see this need of breaking down that wall of self-preservation and hurt so people can truly engage intimately with God and with other Christians. I see this a lot in families without a father present...if they can’t trust their earthly dad, then how can they trust their heavenly Father? This is a big deal in the church today.

• I think an understanding of the mysteriousness of God and of the spiritual journey of a life with God is an absolute must-have that is missing in the lives of many believers. Encountering the mysteriousness of God forces us to move past so-called “Sunday School answers” and beliefs wherein everything is clear-cut and black and white and reduced to simple formulas. God is so much more, and invites us to so much more than that—the spiritual life is messy and full of gray areas.
• It appears to me that many call themselves believers without following Christ.
• I believe that people feel inadequate to disciple others and we tend to believe that lie and get comfortable with our church and bible groups.
• Becoming a Christian is too easy—you get to go to heaven when you die, but submission to the whole person of Christ is not emphasized.
• Many adult believers are content to be right where they are. They think the [Frances R.] Havergal song is: “Take my life and let it be, let it be Lord, let it be.”

• Perhaps misunderstandings of the differences between the baptism of repentance, and that in the Holy Spirit.
• As society slips farther and farther from the plans and designs of God, with both mom and dad working outside the home, there is less and less time for true relations (family or community), and personal development, as they are always in “catch up” mode, unlike back in the day when mom stayed home with keeping the home, and dad worked (brought home the bacon),...then when dad got home there was time for growing Christian family and community relations, and personal development. Thinking that we need two incomes shows how we (society) are slipping more and more into “naked materialism” and is a buy product of a reprobate government (totally foreign to what our Founding Fathers envisioned) is perpetually destroying the value of our currency, and over-regulating our lives...when all we need are those 613 Laws put forth in the Bible.
• Having a “show me” attitude and then I will have faith and grow, rather than a “lead or direct me” attitude because of my faith and love for God I will go whether He shows me what I desired or not.
• Understanding the tension between grace and truth.
• I think part of the problem is we expect conversion before further spiritual development.
• The causes and tragedy of an unfilled ministry. One of the tragic possibilities for a Christian is to fail in fulfilling the purpose for which Christ saved him or her. This was the Apostle Paul’s great dread. And he said: “None of these things move me, neither count I my life dear to myself, so that I might finish my course with joy, and the ministry, which I received of the Lord Jesus, to testify the Gospel of the grace of God.” Acts 20:24 (KJV)
• Stumbling blocks of life’s happenings through others or self and unable to see past the circumstances.
• Not embracing human depravity and the grace extended to them.
The third of the three qualitative questions was to help determine how assessment or measurement may be designed: "What kind of assessment or evaluation will best help measure progress and mastery so that adult disciples and peer disciple-makers can monitor personal spiritual progress?" It has been the assumption of this researcher that careful, personalized, and intentional monitoring of spiritual development will help adult disciples, and the disciplers who work with them, to measure growth within the discipleship process, enabling peer disciplers to plan developmental activities to guide growing adult disciples.

Of the 277 surveys received, 237 respondents (85.55%) contributed ideas to this question on assessment/measurement. The ideas contributed by the respondents are numbered below in the order in which they were received. All responses were anonymous. No attempt has been made to correct misspellings or incorrect grammar; neither will any notification (e.g. “sic” for *sic erat scriptum*) be given.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What kind of assessment or evaluation will best help measure progress and mastery so that adult disciples and peer disciple-makers can monitor personal spiritual progress?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Personal evaluation form asking direct questions regarding their commitment to discipleship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The simplest measure is to ask ourselves the questions “Am I growing? Am I further along in my spiritual Journey than I was a year ago?”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. None—Only God can assess that. They should sit down, be still before the Lord, have their Bible open (which they live by and read every day), and ask Him to guide them and help them understand how to live their life in a way that would be pleasing to Him. Our society is so goal oriented and we waste precious time analyzing data or developing assessment tools. Important questions to ask Him are: “Lord, how am I doing? What do You want me to work on.? Help me and guide me to grow deeper in relationship with You and those you send to me.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Scriptural understanding of one’s relationship with Christ.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Wish I had a suggestion. I think I am seeing some progress as maturing spiritual leaders assess, encourage and engage developing, growing Christians. (By the way—I was not comfortable answering 4 or 5 questions because the emphasis could be placed or interpreted in a couple of ways.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Someone in an intimate accountability relationship will always be the best and most organic choice. Lifeway puts out a good spiritual development assessment, as well as David Platt’s church.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Relationships.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. An accountability partner.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Relationship with others, the way to face hard time in life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Direct one on one observation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Is a formal assessment or evaluation really necessary?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. One-on-one accountability relationships. I believe every disciple of Christ should have someone who is discipling them and someone they are discipling.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
13. Extent of the fruit of the Spirit present in one’s life.
14. Journaling or even just keeping track of what the individual has read...
15. Discovery of personal, spiritual giftedness and adequate mentoring on the deployment and application of those gifts for the betterment of others and the church. The key here is adequate coaching and mentoring from a qualified person who understands individual uniqueness of each believer and how they may/might fit into a vibrant church based ministry.
16. Understanding and accepting God’s word—and then actually learning to live by it—seems like it would be hard to measure. Each of us would have to make [our] own evaluation.
17. Decide between them what steps need to be taken to accomplish a specific goal; set a specific time line to reach goal, realizing it may take longer than expected.
18. Are they bearing fruit?
19. The baseball diamond- home plate (at bat) is being comfortable with Christians, first base- Conversion; 2nd-discipleship (biblical literacy, spiritual functionality); 3rd- using gifts-service; Home plate-score-leading a person to Christ or being involved in that process.
20. Regular self-examination, having someone keep them accountable on a regular basis.
21. Not sure what tool would be good. But I think whatever the tool if it could be used in one on one or small groups would be best. Meaningful relationship with other believers and accountability are important to spiritual growth.
22. By their fruit shall you know them.
23. Activity with or support of a group of believers.
24. Small group emphasis on different topics, time of practice and evaluating what happened and what could have been done differently.
25. Need to take time for personal devotions.
26. I am not a fan of assessment tools.
27. Matthew 6:33 has 2 parts for the disciple: 1st is the kingdom which is what we do, how we fit in, etc. the 2nd is faith, righteousness—deals with character/fruit of the Spirit. Assessment is how is the disciple progressing in these areas?
28. Not questions that are general. One needs to seek the inner most of a person in order to know where they stand in Christ.
29. A weekly meeting or evaluation is needed to keep the adult disciples on track. Adult disciples should be asked questions about how often they pray, how often they read the Bible, how often they share their faith with others, and in what areas of their life they would like to see more growth.
30. How many people do I know in my neighborhood who don’t know Christ? who do I have a relationship with that don’t currently follow Jesus?
31. Accountability partners that are serious.
32. We evaluate a person’s involvement in closeness with God through private practices, connection in community through group involvement and influence with others through service.
33. On the job training.
34. Fruits.
35. This is not like measuring mastery of other “skills” but rather a quality check of a relationship. A relationship between God and the disciple. It stands to reason that in every other relationship we have, we change; why then would we not expect to see a change in a disciple? When I married my wife I changed. I wanted to change. I wanted to be different than a single man. When I chose to become a father I had to put away childish things and become a man; I wanted to. I would say one of the evaluating criteria we could look at is change. What change has taken place?

36. This is a great list.

37. Each person needs to exam their own heart . . . only God knows what is inside . . . people need to stop trying to exam the hearts of others! God will lead you to where you should be if you stay open to His leading.

38. Are they systematically in the word? Do they do life together with others? Do they leverage their influence in the community?

39. Look for fruit in their lives.

40. A time to share what is happening in their life outside of Sunday mornings.

41. Compare life choices and actions to the list of the fruit of the Spirit in Galatians 5. Basically determining if we are growing in character to be more like Christ.

42. Do 6-month check-ups with the disciple to determine the level of growth that has occurred during that time frame. Once the development of what a disciple of Christ has been worked out (prayer, Scripture, looking at Jesus’ life and walk, the life and walk of the disciple, etc.), a development discipleship plan can be developed based upon the specific gifts, talents and passions of that disciple, that can be worked on and through by the disciple in the body of the church, along with in the Kingdom of God with assistance and guidance from their Mentor. Goals can be set and evaluations made on a 6-month basis to determine actual wholistic growth in their spiritual development.

43. Jesus sent them on mission. Sometimes they succeeded. Sometimes they failed. Real life experience is a good measure. Failure builds conviction. Success breeds confidence.

44. This is the difficulty. There is not a simple step by step assessment and evaluation tool. Perhaps that is what you need to do in your doctoral process.

45. Biblical knowledge, humble servanthood.

46. Donald Whitney’s stuff on spiritual health and maturity are helpful—am I more loving, am I a quicker forgiver, etc. . . .

47. Direct measurement: a test of Bible knowledge. Indirect measurement: an inventory or test of spiritual fruit.

48. I’m not sure. I think it’s less about the metric we expect and more about learning to measure the way my grandmother taught me to make beans. You don’t time them on the stove, you wait for the right smell. Spiritual progress is measured by the smell of transformation. :)

49. I am not sure how to measure something as intangible as spiritual progress with a survey. Spiritual growth is not something that should be measured with a blanket survey when it is called personal spiritual progress. That takes the personal out of the mix and attempts to cookie cutter our faith.
50. More growth in grace means more evidence of fruit of Spirit, Gal. 5...best measurement IMO
51. I do not think there is any “product” that can be developed to measure such progress. It is up to the individual to look where they were a year ago in their spiritual journey and measure against where they are now. The church/pastor/small group/etc. can ask that one thing. The believer can then evaluate their spiritual progress. It is not necessarily about involvement in church activities either. What about their patience, joy, self-control, the fruit by which we are known as believers. These are things that no “product” will evaluate or measure. The 21st century church wants a product and she is missing the centrality of Christ in the fruit bearing life of the believer in the process of wanting to evaluate everything.
52. Walking alongside others in a life-on-life lifestyle.
53. The best effective assessment for evaluation is seeing it lived out in the person’s life—not just at point of teaching, but after the classes are over.
54. If you’re reading the Bible then John 15: 5-8 is all you need. Be observant.
55. The author of Simple Discipleship offers a valuable assessment that can be given at 6 or 12 month intervals to show progress.
56. To the degree they talk about Christ in their lives. They are willing to share what Christ has done, is doing, and will continue to do on a personal level.
57. Always hard to measure spiritual growth because a lot of it is internal and only God knows the heart and the motives for doing “things.” Some ways to evaluate would be 1. Are they involved in a small group Bible study? 2. Do they attend Worship regularly? 3. Do they have an accountability partner? 4. Are they aware of and using their spiritual gifts? These would be a few “markers” that could be used to see if there is any growth in the believer.
58. Accountability.
59. Not sure—besides outward signs of Fruit of the Spirit—it is personal.
60. Honest regular conversation and accountability.
61. How many people are stepping forward to serve and to lead within our churches? Are new ministries starting quarterly in our churches? Are we making a difference in the lives of people who are outside the church in our communities? If the answer is consistently NO to these questions then we are failing to produce mature disciples who are growing in their faith.
62. This is the million dollar question . . . good luck finding an answer.
63. Prayer with our Lord and Savior.
64. Accountability.
65. We will be known by our spiritual fruit. That is how you will monitor spiritual growth.
66. The manifestation of the fruit of the Spirit.
67. Demonstration of the fruit of the Spirit, also a hunger and thirst to know and love God more with the goal being Christ likeness.
68. Other than “fruit” I am not certain an instrument for measurement exists.
69. While this may satisfy a D.Min. project requirement, I am not convinced that these characteristics are quantifiable. I work in higher education and firmly believe this move toward assessment is troubling.
70. Outward life after conversion. What changes were made from the life they once led and are now leading?

71. Accountability to God—not man.

72. What is God saying to you? What are you going to do about it?

73. Action = fruit, if there is no fruit then something is wrong.

74. Leadership development training given to Council and leaders in the church.

75. The 5 faith skills.

76. Regular reviews (quarterly/semi-annually/annually) of who they have invested their lives into as a witness of Jesus (word and deed); review of journals of last year.

77. How genuine they are in their faith commitment?

78. Not sure you can measure what is in a person’s heart. It is too easy to fake it, know the words and actions, but what is their motive?

79. What is one’s personal devotional time like? Do we hurry through it or linger in the presence of the Lord? Do we read the Word with the desire to understand what the Lord is saying or do we read it to appease our sense of duty? Do we pray for others as much, if not more, for others as we do for ourselves? Do we have a genuine burden for the lost that overshadows our lives? Are we encouragers or discouragers in the body of Christ? Do we build others up or tear them down? Does our living out of our faith cost us anything in the world?

80. Look for and access spiritual fruit, have the person articulate how their faith has changed in 1 year, 5 years, etc.

81. It is hard to measure maturity, but it becomes evident in the decisions one makes and how they handle situations. Accountability is a key factor in moving toward spiritual maturity. Hebrews 5:14.

82. Two simple questions to be answered each week. . . . What have you witnessed the Lord doing in you this week? What have you witnessed the Lord doing through you this week?

83. Since “becoming more like Jesus”/”spiritual growth” is so subjective, it’s hard for us to evaluate others. Thus, surveys similar to these become important for people to self-evaluate themselves. The key is taking them frequently (twice per year is ideal) and each spiritual discipline needs to be given a hard number. So, for example, someone may rate themselves on a scale of 1-10 on how loving they are. Obviously this only is effective if the person taking it is brutally honest each time they take it. However if they are, they will be able to compare themselves to themselves over the years to see in what areas they are growing and which areas still need work. Also, the church can give these anonymously from time to time as well for the people to fill out and then have a cumulative average of where people are at in each area. In this way the pastor(s) will be able to see where the body at large is weak and then take a season of concentrated effort in improving that area. Once it is, the survey is again given to see what progress has been made and to also see what they next area of concentration will need to be.
84. My observation after many years is that most assessments are a waste of time. It is only in observing each other and spending time with each other in small group studies, work teams, fun time together, worship, etc. that we really recognize and see progress in our own and other’s spiritual progress.

85. This is truly a personal thing, and God has “gifted” everyone differently. Who are we as mere mortals to think we can measure, or assign some formula to measure? Humans are not bricks made for the Tower of Babel, but undressed stones for that house not made with hands, because only God knows how that “stone” is to be used.

86. In my opinion, one of the best measures of spiritual maturity is our checkbook. Where our treasure is, our heart will follow!!

88. One-on-one and small group participation; personal quiet time with God.
89. Maintain a close relationship.
90. The fruit in one’s life.
92. Love.
93. Accountability group.
94. Constant contact with one another and having an accountability partner where possible.
95. Obeying all that Jesus commanded (putting into practice all that Jesus commanded us to).
96. There must be spiritual fruit developed (Galatians 5:22-23) in a person’s life since we will know them by the by fruit that is produced (Matthew 7:16-20).
97. Higher Ground. Pressing on the upward way, new heights being gained every day.
98. No idea. I am guessing on the individual and God will know how their personal spiritual growth is coming along.
99. Evidence of fruits of the spirit
100. Loving God above everyone else. Loving others the way they would like to be loved.
102. Accountability-awareness at the individual, group, and corporate level. . . not creating legalism but awareness of the importance of intentionality.
103. One-on-one personal evaluation of personal progress in important areas: bible reading, church attendance, participation in ministry, living out the fruit of the spirit, etc.
104. Conformity to the Word—intentional knowledge of scriptural guidelines/directives.
105. That seems to be the role of a genuine, transparent church community that is comfortable enough with conflict to be able to see where a disciple is going astray and lovingly restore them and help them to grow. This takes involvement on a very deep level with people in the church.
106. Spiritual fruit.
107. I can’t think of a specific tool for this. Periodic personal evaluation can be quite effective, especially when it is done with a spiritual leader.
108. Personal interviews and intentional monitoring by spiritual leaders.
109. One that helps identify and monitor one’s holistic love for God (love the Lord with all your heart, soul, mind, and strength) and one’s holistic love for others (Matt 25, etc.).
110. Mentoring program.
111. Through the monitoring of one’s lifestyle, we are able to witness one’s spiritual growth or backsliding.
112. Following God’s teachings and learning from our own mistakes as none of us are perfect . . . there’s only one perfect Jesus!
113. “Withdraw thyself!” 1 Tim. 6:3-5. The preacher must withdraw him or herself from all that would hinder his or hers usefulness in the Lord’s work. He must refuse all unscriptural doctrines. He must avoid all unequal partnerships 2nd Cor. 6:14-18. He must forego all unlawful amusements, habits, and hobbies 1 Thess. 5:22. He must eschew all profitable arguments and unspiritual companionships 1 Tim. 6:4. Thus, from anything and everything that would hinder him, comes the word from his Master: “From such withdraw thyself!”
114. Set and measure personal goals.
115. I’m not sure there is a measure other than what one sees in his or her own life, what others see lived out and what the Holy Spirit convicts us we must do.
116. By this all men will know that you are my disciples, if you love one another. As on is disciples the love of Christ must become evident in their lives, or they really aren’t attempting to follow.
117. A personal mentor; on-going personal introspection and spiritual evaluation; a spiritual director.
118. One-on-one with a mentor that has complete abandon for Christ.
119. I have found that small groups can bridge the gaps and help people become comfortable and able to communicate better with one another than in a large group.
120. Accountability to one another. “As iron sharpens iron we sharpen one another.” Mastering our calling and spiritual growth is paramount.
121. I am an advocate of a relational assessment to help us in the journey . . . mentors, disciple partners, spiritual directors. Growth through community and conversation.
122. This is a person-to-person thing, no evaluation is going to do this correctly. It just shows in how one lives.
123. The best assessment is witnessing growth in individual believers’ lives, demonstrated the preferred/suggested behaviors of disciples of Christ.
124. Society has become so powerful in our daily lives that the church struggles to evaluate the reality as potentially dangerous to spiritual health. Therefore, people sense a wrongness in assessment as a pass or fail, and the possible judgment of others is looked at as “unChrist-like.” This is not to suggest a right method of thinking, but it does show an attitude within the body of Christ that may stop us from helping each other in the growing process.
125. A plan or model, adapted to the individual but shows a progression of both study and praxis that helps to insure all areas of knowledge are covered.
Use of spiritual gifts, inventories, journals, and gauging one’s willingness to do certain activities usual of a disciple.

Jesus said we’d know by our fruit. Not a judge but fruit inspector.

Commitment to whatever they both decide.

The number of disciples should multiply, not add.

By their fruits.

Results: accountability to the community of faith. Do they know what the markers of faith are? Do they self-assess their own progress open and honestly within their fellowship?

Self-evaluation with accountability partner.

For me...I like to be asked to serve and then lead. Once I have followed someone, then I like to be asked to grow through experiencing first hand service to others. Starting with the small things and then finishing with bigger service, preaching, teaching, and leading will reveal someone’s spiritual growth and maturity.

Times of teaching that involve personal reflection.

Not sure how to answer this question! Assessment with a trusted believer—one that will be honest with evaluation. Maybe two different people—one a person would know very well—the other someone who could possibly be more objective about your spiritual progress.

Evident results such as holiness, unity, and witness.

Is the person’s living bearing fruit for the kingdom of God?

More than anything else, the increase of the fruit of the Spirit; Christ-likeness.

Develop personal growth metrics and assess progress—participate in a consistent mentor-peer program.

Unity in the body by putting others before self (Philippians 2:1-11).

Personal growth.

That they are moving forward in their spiritual walk and involvement in ministry.

While it’s tempting to look at numbers to say whether or not people and/or a church are healthy, numbers are a more secondary symptom, not the best evaluator. Better to look for certain characteristics of what makes a disciple. Is this person a person of prayer? Is the person a person of study? Is the person a person who serves others? Is the person a person who shares the good news with others? Such qualifiers are difficult to measure, but are much better than looking to see whether or not a person abstains from certain vices or attends church every week.

The results of spiritual progress are pretty obvious. Disciples live godly lives, and those they come in contact with intentionally or accidentally, are impacted by their lives. The Lord adds to the church through their witness.

Living a life of Christ in front of others.

Accountability partners who walk closely with someone, meet regularly and experience life together. I don’t know of any full-proof objective assessment outside of experience with the person.

Be accountable to small group and small group leader.

A self-assessment done on ongoing dialogue. Not a test to be passed.
Helping another to become a devoted follower of Jesus Christ. Our task is to make disciples.

I don’t think evaluation measurements are important. Personal interaction and accountability is.

How actively they are making other disciples?

I don’t know how one would assess it on paper, but spiritual progress can be observed when someone’s reactions and thoughts look more like Christ’s—showing love yet not compromising truth.

Wow, great question. Discipleship is like a marriage to God. How do you measure a marriage? I suppose with some inputs (time with God, time in Christian community) and some outputs (what are you doing with your gifts, etc.).

Tricky. To what extent is spiritual progress/growth measurable? Cognition and behaviors can be measured (testing, participation record keeping, accountability reports and the like). To what degree can motivations be quantified (right things for right reasons)? Always a worthy quest. Thanks for efforts in this direction.

Wow. What a great question. Since each believer is different in both life history and life experience, it is hard to measure as we would like to measure within a certain time period or maturity pace. Each will mature as God directs, the Spirit enables, and the individual chooses to change and mature. Perhaps the best measure would be a listing of milestones or common elements, behaviors and skills of which all Christ followers should own and incorporate in life. From your survey, I believe you have a listing of milestone behaviors that the maturing disciple of Christ will display.

Honest conversation.

Are they intentional about our “mission” to win the lost for Christ and willing to come along side new converts and mentor them. Realizing it’s not all about them but more and more about Him!!

Constant conversation and accountability. I believe that the lack of communication creates masks for people to hide behind. There must be some transparency and authenticity which creates vulnerability. This is necessary in order for people to co-exist and grow in their personal relationships and spiritual maturity.

Witness of others. Outcomes of activities and commitments.

Look for passion and humility. Be very careful not to intellectualize or create some program for heart issues. Every Pharisee went through measures and peer disciple-makers and passed with flying colors.

Annual evaluation by a mentor.

Accountability to God self, and sometimes other Christians

Good question. Self-assessment utilizing a customized evaluation of godly characteristics, behaviors, and actions rating that could be used in one-on-one accountability groups or mentorships or even with a pastor. Not so much for faultfinding but for genuine goal-setting and enrichment. There will be no perfect tool. But a plan, bathed in prayer, truly understood by those completing it as a tool for honest assessment.
More training in the local churches to help train people to disciple others. It should be a natural progression.

What kind of fruit are they producing?

Consistency.

Meeting for teaching with homework assignments.

Accountability sessions.

Close personal relationship; mentoring, and personal accountability.

I don’t think there is an assessment or evaluation that could ever be even close to adequate, nor could one ever be created. A person can have all the right answers but still be spiritually shallow, and vice-versa. Even extensive training cannot ensure a rich spiritual life. Think Pharisees and disciples. This is simply because there is no benchmark or status to be obtained; it’s just living life in God’s will in light of the work Christ has done in you. So trying to facilitate assessments or evaluations to measure progress and mastery is futile. “Disciple-makers” really are those who are invested in other peoples’ lives. If you want a helpful assessment tool that can show an accurate record of progress, use a scrapbook of photos and letters between a mentor and a mentee that has spanned several years.

Accountability.

I don’t know if there should be an evaluation or assessment other than the lifestyle of the person.

Evaluation by other believers.

Quantifying the spiritual well-being of an individual would be a difficult/impossible assessment to develop.

Galatians 5:22 evidenced in the person’s life . . . “But the fruit of the Spirit is, love, joy, peace, forbearance, gentleness and self-control.”

John Wesley held “Class Meetings” periodically so the ten or so in attendance could make just such assessments. So, small, intimate, intentional group meetings could be a big help.

Personal relationship and fruit.

A life lived for Christ is the best measure of success.

I believe that the world will recognize us as Christ followers when they see miracles of him being evidenced in our lives.

I struggle with this one. To me this question leans toward a desire to see people act and perform within a certain set of preconceived acts of faith that man has determined are what a Christian should look like. I struggle with anyone who holds to a set of policies or desires for what another Christian should look and act like. So my personal beliefs is that we can’t institute a clear set of criteria and expect that everyone should fit in to it. How Christ manifests in our lives can vary greatly and for one person to establish an assessment or evaluation to measure progress circumvents a relationship.

Am I more like Christ today than I was yesterday.

Producing fruit in the Kingdom.

Annual/bi-annual reviews with a mentor.
184. Assessments become paper and pen analysis of prescribed questions with right or wrong answers. It seems difficult to assess the work of the Spirit with man-made assessments. And yet we can observe the fruit of the Spirit or lack thereof in a life.

185. Christian accountability groups.

186. Fruits of the Spirit. Actions in the community of believers, and also non-believers. You can use the above, but you know, God really does the evaluation, not man. Man wants to create a disciple just like him—same beliefs (his interpretation of the Bible) and actions. If you don’t do X you have not grown spiritually.

187. Transformed life = one that is lived differently than before in such aspects of giving, serving, and caring for others.

188. Sorry, no answer. I just pray.

189. Accountability and prayer partners.

190. That is a difficult one since people start on the road of discipleship at different places. Big question is: “Am I moving toward the cross or away from it?”

191. It occurs to me that answering these survey questions is an excellent measure of spiritual progress!

192. Personal relationship with disciples making more disciples.

193. A plan that takes a new believer on a path in all areas (like steps) to a deeper love of Christ and the word of God. Once this is in place the other just flows from there.

194. Spiritual fruit seems to get at the core of the apple.

195. The more people work with other people the more they can understand their position on things spiritual.

196. I believe that disciples of Christ can provide valuable encouragement to others, but cannot measure the spiritual progress of anyone but themselves—and can only look within themselves to gauge their own progress by the power of the Holy Spirit in God-led knowledge not self-led or world-led knowledge.

197. Each person’s walk is so personal, any type of evaluation would not give a complete picture.

198. Going through the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius or a similar intensive retreat with a spiritual director for guidance.

199. Are they teachable? An unteachable, or know-it-all is not a disciple. It is as simple as that.

200. Periodic class and assessment.

201. Verbal and written assessments for evaluation.

202. Accountability partners, asking mature believers for constructive criticism.

203. Assessments might include items such as measurable devotional and prayer time, inner hurts healed, awareness of sin/weakness. We need to measure these things in a way to not create legalism. This is why I said awareness of sin/weakness, not avoidance of sin. Just about anything that indicates a change in behavior and attitude.

204. Seeing something they work on accomplished—sometimes working themselves out of the ministry and letting another take charge of it so they can work on another ministry.
205. Visible fruit in the life of the believer is always the best evaluation in my opinion.

206. If people walk the walk not just talk the talk. How they live their lives and their actions toward others.

207. An actual desire to follow Christ and a heart for repentance when we fall short.

208. Maybe some kind of non-threatening interview.

209. Evaluate willingness to share Christ with others.

210. A “map” which provides a standard. There are several excellent on-line evaluation tools for this and we have developed our own twelve point evaluation form called a “Personal Spiritual Inventory.” It has 12 categories each with 5 questions for personal evaluation. These are: 1. Personal spiritual disciplines; 2. My heart; 3. Quality of my relationships; 4. Practice of evangelism; 5. My life in the community of faith; 6. My life at work; 7. My knowledge of the faith; 8. My conversation; 9. My sexual conduct; 10. My leisure time; 11. My financial life; 12. My body. I have found that this tool is best used when someone has an accountability partner or mentor and they work through it together over time. This would be my conviction about any kind of assessment. Good luck with your dissertation. Would love to see the results.

211. Trust in the process.

212. I would say how much joy they exhibit in their life—not the lack of suffering or problems but how they navigate through the difficulties.

213. Disciplining is relational. Assessment is best achieved in observing the practical application of a person’s faith. The mentor is in the best position to assess based on the new convert’s ability to integrate daily living and practices of faith.

214. Ask them. People know if they are growing in faith or not. Pastors especially should not be afraid to ask this of a congregant.

215. Hmm, not sure about this one. Certainly we need to meet in small groups, 2-3-4 people. In addition to a small group, a personal, one-on-one, advisor/mentor might be helpful in gauging personal spiritual progress.

216. Not sure of the content but it should be something made available for self-evaluation—a written reminder for the new believer of benchmarks that eventually should be met that reflect spiritual growth. By the way, anyone that can do this survey in 5 minutes is performing a miracle. I would suggest that you indicate that it could take 10 minutes—took me 14 minutes.

217. Do quarterly assessment to check on progress

218. We use the first commandment model. 1. Absent of idols or at least able to identify idols that tempt them. 2. biblical worldview. 3. James 1:22.

219. It’s not really something you can necessarily quantify, but more something that can be seen and observed in the daily life. When Christ comes into a person’s life in a real and tangible way, and one’s affection grows for him, there is an unmistakable change in behavior that is almost involuntary. That’s hard to quantify in the form of a test.

220. The personal desire to study the Word to know the Lord and the living out of God’s Word.

221. On-going one-on-one meeting with discipler.

222. Seeing examples of “fruit” in our lives.
223. I don’t know. I think that I have grown in my faith by just keeping at it (praying, surrendering my will, studying, learning to focus on others).
224. Giving, time, money, listening. Concern for others, our world, our environment.
226. Personal relational assessment between believers, mentor, and mentees.
227. Beyond the prescriptive of the Word I do not know what kind of assessment tool would work.
228. I do not know. It is not easy to quantify spiritual progress. Just the idea of being evaluated could turn people off. Spirituality is a journey. Guided reflection might be best.
229. I am not familiar with evaluations or assessments. I have been open to the Spirit’s leading and conviction, which has been a continual spurring on to be more like Jesus.
230. Something that is both standardized, but also allows for personalization. Easy terms; easy to understand and apply.
231. Comparing and evaluating the individual’s growth in the fruit of the Spirit.
232. Accountability questions.
233. Engage them in training and study to understand their role as a Christian disciple. Discussion on the subject, periodic growth surveys.
234. An evaluation of a person’s spiritual progress could best be evaluated by a one-on-one conversation. This however does require a great deal of time, effort, and relationship building between the two parties.
235. Only God and that person can know if they have grown, but these kinds of surveys get you thinking and show me what I can work on.
236. Bible study, small groups, prayer. If you figure this one out, give me a call! :)  
237. I’m not sure there is a true way to measure this. I would argue personal spiritual growth is a subjective concept that cannot be objectively measured.
APPENDIX F:

KEY BEHAVIORS, SKILLS, AND/OR MILESTONES IN THE LIFE OF A DISCIPLE
AND THE BROAD CONTENT CATEGORIES IN WHICH THEY LIKELY FIT
Appendix F: Key behaviors, skills, and/or milestones in the life of a disciple and the broad content categories in which they likely fit

This list of behaviors, skills, and/or milestones in the life of a disciple of Jesus Christ is not meant to be exhaustive, nor is it meant to be interpreted as doctrinally sound for all approaches to the Christian faith. Some may actually be considered offensive to some streams of Christianity. They were not intended to be offensive—they are intended to make one stop and think what truly may be a key behavior or milestone in the Christian life. These are meant to be a starting place for further research.

The following chart shows how this researcher believes the key behaviors most likely fit under the broad content categories.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Behavior/Skill/Milestone</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Praising and adoring God</td>
<td>Seeks God first.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Actively participates in corporate worship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Engages in private, personal times of worship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Presents life as an act of worship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Understands the concept of the Trinity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Understands and believes in the eternality of God.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and the Holy Spirit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Understands and believes in Jesus Christ as fully God and fully human.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Understands prayer as conversation with God.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Believes the Holy Spirit is alive and active in the church today.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Engages in active worship: raising hands, kneeling, or other expressions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Committed to a life of prayer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Practices the discipline of fasting from time to time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Practices the disciplines of silence and solitude as part of devotional life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Speaks in tongues.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loving God and loving others</td>
<td>Loves people as Christ loved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spends time alone with God on a regular basis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lives out the Great Commandment of loving God and loving others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Loves people as Christ loved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is able to explain how the church should function in today’s world.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Understands the nature and practice of communion or the Lord’s Supper.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is willing to lay down one’s life for others and/or for the cause of Christ.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hates the sin—but loves the sinner.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Belonging to the community of faith—the Church | Fellowship in the community of faith.  
Sunday morning attendance.  
Lives in intentional community with other Christ-followers.  
Faithful, ongoing participation in most all-church functions.  
Has been baptized as a public profession of faith.  
Practices the ordinance of Foot Washing.  
Has a good reputation in the community-at-large.  
Lives a life of example.  
Actively involved in partisan politics.  
Comfortable visiting the elderly, the sick, the infirm, and the prisoner.  
Shows hospitality to others, including those in the church as well as non-believers. |
|---|---|
| Growing to be more like Jesus | Participation in a discipleship group or relationship.  
Knows the order of the books of the Bible.  
Understands the structure and arrangement of the OT and NT.  
Student of the Bible engaged in regular study.  
Developing spiritual fruit in life.  
Submits to accountability in spiritual development.  
Keeps a journal as part of devotional life.  
Knows the date of his/her conversion.  
Belief in a real, tangible spiritual enemy known as Satan or the devil.  
Is able to “count the cost” of discipleship.  
Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God.  
Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us.  
Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is inerrant; contains no errors.  
Believes that God answers prayer.  
Has read through the Bible at least once.  
Participates in a small group to grow closer to God and to others.  
Holds to a literal interpretation of the Revelation to John.  
Desires to grow more and more into the likeness of Jesus Christ. |
| Serving God and serving others | Practicing tither.  
Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.  
Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.  
Works to meet felt needs in order to earn the right to share Christ.  
Shows compassion to all.  
How God has gifted us helps us understand where he wants us involved.  
Demonstrates how to surrender time and talents in service.  
Helps others discover and sharpen their spiritual gift(s) for service.  
Works to be involved in helping with needs within one’s own community.  
Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Telling others the Good News of salvation through Christ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shares the Good News of Christ with others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lives out the Great Commission.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understands and practices relational evangelism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Invites and includes others in the life of the church.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is able to explain the conversion experience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is able to explain God’s original plan for humanity, and what went wrong.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understands sin, forgiveness, and grace.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Great Commission includes sharing a verbal witness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lives as an ambassador of Jesus Christ in the world.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Has a practiced and effective verbal witness and is willing to share it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sends money to western missionaries overseas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provides support for indigenous ministers and churches overseas.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX G:
THE FOCUS GROUP’S PLACEMENT OF KEY BEHAVIORS, SKILLS, AND/OR MILESTONES IN THE LIFE OF A DISCIPLE INTO THE BROAD CONTENT CATEGORIES
Appendix G: The Focus Group’s placement of key behaviors, skills, and/or milestones in the life of a disciple into the broad content categories

This list of behaviors shows the work of the Focus Group as the members correlated the distilled list of forty-five behaviors into the broad content categories.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Behavior/Skill/Milestone</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Worship:</strong> Praising and adoring God</td>
<td>Actively participates in corporate worship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Understands and believes in Jesus Christ as fully God and fully human.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Engages in private, personal times of worship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Presents life as an act of worship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spends time alone with God on a regular basis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Practicing tither.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Understands and believes in the eternality of God.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lives a life of example.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Love:</strong> Loving God and loving others</td>
<td>Understands what it means to love one another as Christ loved us.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lives out the Great Commandment of loving God and loving others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spends time alone with God on a regular basis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Loves people as Christ loved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Understands prayer as conversation with God.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Committed to a life of prayer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is willing to lay down one’s life for others and/or for the cause of Christ.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Forgiveness: knows the importance of giving and receiving forgiveness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Belong:</strong> Belonging to the community of faith—the church</td>
<td>Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Participation in the fellowship of the community of faith.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Practicing tither.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Developing spiritual fruit in life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lives a life of example.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lives in intentional community with other Christ-followers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Submits to accountability in spiritual development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lives as a peacemaker.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Forgiveness: knows the importance of giving and receiving forgiveness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Loves people as Christ loved.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Grow:** Growing to be more like Jesus | Seek God first.  
Understands sin, forgiveness, and grace.  
Teachable: demonstrates openness as a life-long learner in the things of Christ.  
Believes that God answers prayer.  
Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.  
Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.  
Submits to accountability in spiritual development.  
Belief in a real, tangible spiritual enemy known as Satan or the devil.  
Believes the Holy Spirit is alive and active in the church today.  
Developing spiritual fruit in life.  
Engages in private, personal times of worship.  
Desires to grow more and more into the likeness of Jesus Christ.  
Student of the Bible engaged in regular study.  
Believes in Jesus Christ as co-eternal with the Father and the Holy Spirit.  
Practicing tither.  
Understands prayer as conversation with God.  
Committed to a life of prayer.  
Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is inspired by God.  
Believes that God’s Word (the Bible) is infallible; it cannot fail us.  
Understands what it means to say “Jesus is Lord.”  
Personal relationship with Jesus.  
Shows evidence of life-change and spiritual growth. |
| **Serve:** Serving God and serving others | Discovers and develops his/her spiritual gift(s) for use in the local congregation.  
Seeks ways to use spiritual gift(s) beyond the local congregation.  
Shows hospitality to others, including those in the church as well as non-believers.  
Shows compassion to all.  
Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends.  
Loves people as Christ loved.  
Is able and willing to help lead a person to faith in Christ.  
Is willing to lay down one’s life for others and/or for the cause of Christ.  
Understands sin, forgiveness, and grace. |
| **Tell:** Telling others the Good News of salvation through Christ | Shares the Good News of Christ with others.  
Lives as an ambassador of Jesus Christ in the world.  
Is able and willing to help lead a person to faith in Christ.  
Lives a life of example.  
Lives out the Great Commission.  
Understands and engages in relational evangelism.  
Believes God sent Jesus to die for humanity in order to save us.  
Is willing to go wherever the Lord leads or sends. |
APPENDIX H:

THE FOCUS GROUP’S INPUT ON PROGRESS AND ASSESSMENT
Appendix H: The Focus Group’s Input on Progress and Assessment

Listed here are some of the memorable comments made by the members of the Focus Group as they brainstormed around two clarifying questions: “How do we motivate people to keep growing after they come to faith in Christ?” and “How can we best measure progress?” This researcher will utilize this input to create a study guide, a discipler’s handbook, and an evaluative tool to facilitate the face-to-face discipling conversations between the adult disciple and the disciple-maker.

The responses were recorded by a volunteer “scribe” and are, in many instances, a composite of the input from more than one person, and do not contain any of the focus group’s specific names.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>“How do we motivate people to keep growing after they come to faith in Christ?”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Missing element</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Discipler/Mentor | • We all need confidants and accountability people.  
• Someone who is older or at least further along in her Christian walk than I am.  
• They need to be of the same gender as the growing disciple, don’t you think?  
• Discipleship under a mentor or coach is a must. Without it there isn’t much forward movement.  
• It’s different from a small group. It’s about one-on-one.  
• There aren’t that many mature Christians, are there?  
• All Christians need a good example to follow, and it can’t always be the pastor. |
| Scripture | • To grow in our faith we have to be in the Word, don’t we?  
• Scripture is foundational. Without it we don’t really ever know God or his plan for us.  
• It’s as though becoming a serious student of the Bible is what will support the process of growing as a believer.  
• It’s not about facts or dates, but about understanding the will of God throughout the ages up to the modern day. For us. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Commitment</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Once we start on the road with Jesus, it’s really important that we stay</td>
<td>• Commitment to being his disciple is a fundamental of faith.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>connected to him. It’s too easy to go back to what the world has to offer.</td>
<td>• We have to have a desire to grow, but then we also need help.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Commitment to being his disciple is a fundamental of faith.</td>
<td>• That goes back to needing a discipler or mentor.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• We have to have a desire to grow, but then we also need help.</td>
<td>• It’s kind of a cliché, but we need to learn to walk the talk.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• That goes back to needing a discipler or mentor.</td>
<td>• It’s about consistency and commitment.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationships</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• My best times of growth have been in my small group. I think that’s</td>
<td>• I feel that in order to really be able in faith, I need people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>important. That’s part of it.</td>
<td>around me, helping me, pushing me if need be.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I feel that in order to really be able in faith, I need people</td>
<td>• Yes, that cannot be said strongly enough. We have to have</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>around me, helping me, pushing me if need be.</td>
<td>each other or there’s no hope.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Yes, that cannot be said strongly enough. We have to have each</td>
<td>• Helping and caring relationships in the church is key. Without</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>other or there’s no hope.</td>
<td>them, we might as well be watching church on TV and living in a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Helping and caring relationships in the church is key. Without them,</td>
<td>bubble.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>we might as well be watching church on TV and living in a bubble.</td>
<td>• When I start to feel alone or start to have doubts, I know I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• When I start to feel alone or start to have doubts, I know I can call</td>
<td>can call someone and they’ll cheer me up or answer my questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>someone and they’ll cheer me up or answer my questions or put me back</td>
<td>or put me back together.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>together.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowing the path</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• I’ve always said I wish someone would just tell me what to do. Instead,</td>
<td>• Give me a list and give me a test and then give me a grade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>it’s all about “read your Bible” and “pray for God’s direction.” I didn’t</td>
<td>card! That’s the system I know best.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>know how to pray! I didn’t know how to read my Bible!</td>
<td>• I’ve kind of been amazed that some people think there’s no way</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Give me a list and give me a test and then give me a grade card! That’s</td>
<td>to organize this discipleship thing. There’s got to be a “map” or</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the system I know best.</td>
<td>“plan of action” to help us know where to go and what to do. We’d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I’ve kind of been amazed that some people think there’s no way to</td>
<td>never go on a trip without a map or a GPS, would we?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>organize this discipleship thing. There’s got to be a “map” or a “plan of</td>
<td>• It’s not so much a list but a set of guidelines or instructions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>action” to help us know where to go and what to do. We’d never go on a</td>
<td>But I go back to the fact that I need a teacher showing me the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tri without a map or a GPS, would we?</td>
<td>way.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conversion is the beginning

- It’s like salvation is graduating from kindergarten, and heaven is retirement and we have to grow in between.
- Yes, I’ve always thought of coming to Christ as graduating from high school, and now we’re supposed to be in college.
- I think most adults, young people too, get stuck at the salvation point. We have our ticket, that’s all we need. Too many of us have been taught that’s all that’s important, and we’re never told to keep moving forward.
- Come forward, accept Jesus, and then coast.
- There’s more to it than that, and my pastor has been saying it in a hundred ways for as long as I can remember.

These responses were part of the information recorded by the focus group’s volunteer “scribe” and are, in many instances, a composite of the input from more than one person; they do not contain any specific names.

This researcher will utilize this input in the creation of a study guide, a discipler’s handbook, and a self-assessment tool to facilitate the one-on-one discipling.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>“How can we best measure progress?”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Element added</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discipler/Mentor</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Having someone walking alongside of me and asking me important questions is probably the best way to help me know if I am growing. That way he can say, “Hey, you’re doing much better in this area.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Face-to-face questions, one-on-one conversations. It’s got to be personal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• But, I think we can still use help with some kind of assessment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Sure. I don’t get the attitude that there’s something wrong with assessment or tools. Whatever works to get us talking and moving in the right direction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• When I have something to look at and discuss with my mentor, I think we’re miles ahead.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Scripture
- If there was some kind of systematic way to move through the Bible. Something other than those force “bible-in-a-year” things. Something that would allow me to really understand. Maybe memorizing some verses, too.
- I’m not sure about memorizing Scripture. I don’t think I grow much from that. But I do need someone to help me process through everything there in in the Bible. Don’t you?
- Without a doubt we need to be in the Word, and memorization of Bible verses may not be the best measure of what we’re learning.
- Just keeping a record of books read. Maybe even some kind of test to make sure we’re picking up the key points. We do that in small group—answer questions to see if we’re learning.
- If we just read, discuss, and move through it over time, isn’t that measurable?

### Commitment
- I think this might be where missions fits in. We all need to be out in the community in some way. We cannot be the church in a building only, but a church out there, too.
- Commitment can be measure in that way, that’s for sure. “Are you doing missional things?” “Did you go on that mission?”
- It has something to do with service in the church, too. Commitment to serving and using our giftedness.
- Tithing. Serving. Taking care of folks who are sick or need help.

### Relationships
- That’s part of relationships. Caring for others.
- Being in small groups. Being in Bible studies. Having an accountability person or partner.
- Showing up early and spending time gabbing with friends.
- And bringing new people to meet our friends at church.
- Do we measure how many people we bring? I’m not sure about that.
- We can measure how many people we meet and how many people we help.
- It’s more about being invested in people. That’s quantifiable, isn’t it?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowing the path</th>
<th>Conversion is the beginning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• If there is a list or a card with instructions on it, then I can know what I’m supposed to do.</td>
<td>• I think a report card is not a bad idea. Like the ones we had in grade school that showed a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I remember in grade school, those SRS reading cards we could go over and do if we had time. We</td>
<td>whole year’s progression. We could see where we started, where we were at the middle of the year,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>knew what we were supposed to do and we went over and did them. They were fun.</td>
<td>and where we were at the end of the year. What’s wrong with that?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Somebody in the list said “just read the Bible” like that’s supposed to give us all we need to</td>
<td>• As long as it’s personal and someone is helping you understand the report card.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>know. That may be true, but I needed help just getting started!</td>
<td>• Definitely. It all comes back to the need for a mentor or coach. Personal one-on-one. Always.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I think most of the responses that were dismissive of a plan were from pastors who are already</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miles ahead of where I am. I need the basics, not something “heady.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I’m sure it’s all in the Bible, but if someone can decipher or make it easy to recognize, why</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>not help others get started and help them stay on the path?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX I:

INPUT FROM RESPONDENTS THAT RESONATE WITH THE RESEARCHER’S PRESUPPOSITIONS
Appendix I: Input from respondents that resonate with researcher’s presuppositions

The following comments from survey respondents seem to resonate with this researcher’s presuppositions regarding assessment. These comments suggest that the concept of peer disciplers, assessment, and a listing of key behaviors or mile markers in the life of an adult disciple are positive steps in the right direction in discipleship.

The numbers to the left indicate the order in which these responses were received. All responses are anonymous.

5. Wish I had a suggestion. I think I am seeing some progress as maturing spiritual leaders assess, encourage, and engage developing, growing Christians.

15. Discovery of personal, spiritual giftedness and adequate mentoring on the deployment and application of those gifts for the betterment of others and the church. The key here is adequate coaching and mentoring from a qualified person who understands individual uniqueness of each believer and how they may/might fit into a vibrant church based ministry.

17. Decide between them what steps need to be taken to accomplish a specific goal; set a specific time line to reach goal, realizing it may take longer than expected.

21. Not sure what tool would be good. But I think whatever the tool if it could be used in one on one or small groups would be best. Meaningful relationship with other believers and accountability are important to spiritual growth.

29. A weekly meeting or evaluation is needed to keep the adult disciples on track. Adult disciples should be asked questions about how often they pray, how often they read the Bible, how often they share their faith with others, and in what areas of their life they would like to see more growth.

32. We evaluate a person's involvement in closeness with God through private practices, connection in community through group involvement and influence with others through service.

42. Do 6-month check-ups with the disciple to determine the level of growth that has occurred during that time frame. Once the development of what a disciple of Christ has been worked out (prayer, Scripture, looking at Jesus’ life and walk, the life and walk of the disciple, etc.), a development discipleship plan can be developed based upon the specific gifts, talents and passions of that disciple, that can be worked on and through by the disciple in the body of the church, along with in the Kingdom of God with assistance and guidance from their Mentor. Goals can be set and evaluations made on a 6-month basis to determine actual wholistic growth in their spiritual development.

57. Always hard to measure spiritual growth because a lot of it is internal and only God knows the heart and the motives for doing “things.” Some ways to evaluate would be 1. Are they involved in a small group Bible study? 2. Do they attend Worship regularly? 3. Do they have an accountability partner? 4. Are they aware of and using their spiritual gifts? These would be a few “markers” that could be used to see if there is any growth in the believer.
83. Since “becoming more like Jesus”/”spiritual growth” is so subjective, it’s hard for us to evaluate others. Thus, surveys similar to these become important for people to self-evaluate themselves. The key is taking them frequently (twice per year is ideal) and each spiritual discipline needs to be given a hard number. . . .

103. One-on-one personal evaluation of personal progress in important areas: bible reading, church attendance, participation in ministry, living out the fruit of the spirit, etc.

108. Personal interviews and intentional monitoring by spiritual leaders.

114. Set and measure personal goals.

117. A personal mentor; on-going personal introspection and spiritual evaluation; a spiritual director.

121. I am an advocate of a relational assessment to help us in the journey . . . mentors, disciple partners, spiritual directors. Growth through community and conversation.

125. A plan or model, adapted to the individual but shows a progression of both study and praxis that helps to insure all areas of knowledge are covered.

126. Use of spiritual gifts, inventories, journals, and gauging one’s willingness to do certain activities usual of a disciple.

131. Results: accountability to the community of faith. Do they know what the markers of faith are? Do they self-assess their own progress open and honestly within their fellowship?

135. Not sure how to answer this question! Assessment with a trusted believer—someone that will be honest with evaluation. Maybe two different people—one a person would know very well—the other someone who could possibly be more objective about your spiritual progress.

139. Develop personal growth metrics and assess progress—participate in a consistent mentor-peer program.


153. Wow, great question. Discipleship is like a marriage to God. How do you measure a marriage? I suppose with some inputs (time with God, time in Christian community) and some outputs (what are you doing with your gifts, etc.).

154. Tricky. To what extent is spiritual progress/growth measurable? Cognition and behaviors can be measured (testing, participation record keeping, accountability reports and the like). To what degree can motivations be quantified (right things for right reasons)? Always a worthy quest. Thanks for efforts in this direction.

155. Wow. What a great question. Since each believer is different in both life history and life experience, it is hard to measure as we would like to measure within a certain time period or maturity pace. Each will mature as God directs, the Spirit enables, and the individual chooses to change and mature. Perhaps the best measure would be a listing of milestones or common elements, behaviors and skills of which all Christ followers should own and incorporate in life. From your survey, I believe you have a listing of milestone behaviors that the maturing disciple of Christ will display.
163. Good question. Self-assessment utilizing a customized evaluation of godly characteristics, behaviors, and actions rating that could be used in one-on-one accountability groups or mentorships or even with a pastor. Not so much for faultfinding but for genuine goal-setting and enrichment. There will be no perfect tool. But a plan, bathed in prayer, truly understood by those completing it as a tool for honest assessment.

193. A plan that takes a new believer on a path in all areas (like steps) to a deeper love of Christ and the word of God. Once this is in place the other just flows from there.

203. Assessments might include items such as measurable devotional and prayer time, inner hurts healed, awareness of sin/weakness. We need to measure these things in a way to not create legalism. This is why I said awareness of sin/weakness, not avoidance of sin. Just about anything that indicates a change in behavior and attitude.

210. A “map” which provides a standard.

213. Disciplining is relational. Assessment is best achieved in observing the practical application of a person’s faith. The mentor is in the best position to assess based on the new convert’s ability to integrate daily living and practices of faith.

215. Hmm, not sure about this one. Certainly we need to meet in small groups, 2-3-4 people. In addition to a small group, a personal, one-on-one, advisor/mentor might be helpful in gauging personal spiritual progress.

216. Not sure of the content but it should be something made available for self-evaluation—a written reminder for the new believer of benchmarks that eventually should be met that reflect spiritual growth.

226. Personal relational assessment between believers, mentor, and mentees.

230. Something that is both standardized, but also allows for personalization. Easy terms; easy to understand and apply.

233. Engage them in training and study to understand their role as a Christian disciple. Discussion on the subject, periodic growth surveys.

234. An evaluation of a person’s spiritual progress could best be evaluated by a one-on-one conversation. This however does require a great deal of time, effort, and relationship building between the two parties.
APPENDIX J:

A GUIDE FOR DISCIPLES—
INCLUDING A SELF-ASSESSMENT TOOL
Appendix J: A Guide for Disciples—including a Self-Assessment Tool

Mile Markers

Method, Measurement, and Mentoring in Christian Discipleship

A Guide for Disciples

Martin Johnson
This guide is dedicated . . .

. . . to disciples everywhere who have asked—or continue to ask—“can you at least tell me if I am going in the right direction?”

. . . *make every effort to add to your faith.* . . . *(2 Peter 1:5)*
Contents

Introduction........................................................................................................................................289

ONE
What is Missing?.................................................................................................................................292

TWO
What is the Method? ............................................................................................................................304

THREE
What is Measurement?..........................................................................................................................314

FOUR
What is Mentoring?...............................................................................................................................321

FIVE
Checking My Progress ..........................................................................................................................334
A self-assessment tool to help you take your spiritual pulse, and create a personal plan for growth.

SIX
Next Steps...............................................................................................................................................343

SEVEN
Study Guide ............................................................................................................................................346

EIGHT
Developing a Plan of Action for Growing as a Disciple .................................................................359

Endnotes..................................................................................................................................................367

Bibliography ..........................................................................................................................................371
Introduction

Several years ago, an adult Christian in a church I was serving asked me these questions: “How do I know if I am growing in Christ? I know I’ll find out how I did when I get to the end of my time on earth, but, isn’t there some kind of ‘report card’ I can get from God—here and now—instead of waiting until it’s too late?”

At first, I thought he was kidding. I even laughed at his humorous suggestion of a report card—until I realized he was quite serious. Our conversation over the next few minutes revealed some very important things to me: most adult Christians do not know what Christlike behaviors or skills they should be discovering, developing, and demonstrating in their lives; most do not know how to assess forward movement in their faith; and most want someone to walk with them to show them the way.

These concerns have guided much of what I do, and have done, as a pastor. Shortly after that conversation, and throughout the ensuing years, I have asked fellow pastors about their thoughts on these subjects. One of my colleagues in ministry counselled me in this way: “Just tell them to pray and study their Bible and God will show them what to do.” Another suggested, “Just tell them to look at the ‘fruit’ in their lives: no ‘fruit’—no growth.”¹ A third told me that “Christians don’t have to do anything at all in this life; it’s up to the Holy Spirit to do all the work to present us complete on the last day.” Another told me, “we are made perfect on the day of our salvation and sealed when we receive the Holy Spirit at our second baptism. If your friend has been baptized with the Holy Spirit, tell him to sit back and wait for heaven.”

No wonder the church is in trouble. Not even those charged with the discipleship and development of a congregation can agree on what constitutes spiritual growth and
formation; we can’t even agree on what discipleship is, or how it should be done. Empty
dvice, pithy slogans, and religious jargon are not going to help.

Maybe what will help is to actually listen to the questions and concerns posed by
the people who are anxious about spiritual growth. What my friend asked for was a report
card. Our extended conversation showed the missing elements that seemed to have
caused a disengagement from the time of his conversion in faith to the time of his
frustrated query: he needed an intentional plan focused on discovering, developing, and
demonstrating key behaviors of Christ-followers, personalized for his life, and featuring a
one-on-one relationship between him and a peer discipler to continually assess growth
and formation. It made sense to me, because I had nearly the identical experience in my
own spiritual journey. Perhaps we had hit upon a plan.

Unfortunately, it sounded like, and felt like, a plan impossible to implement.

What are the key behaviors Christ-followers should exhibit? Is there any way of
identifying these behaviors or skills? Could they be measured? How do you assess
something as nebulous and personal as “spiritual growth?” Surely not with a checklist, or
with something as vague as checking one’s “spiritual fruit.” We can always observe
someone, but when someone is observed, that person tends to act the way he or she thinks
the observer wants. Sunday mornings at church are not good barometers of life at home
or work, Mondays through Saturdays.

Even if a list of skills or behaviors could be identified, and one could master those
skills, someone might complain that this is tantamount to “earning” salvation. Someone
else might argue that such a list would be too confining; that spiritual growth cannot be
contained in any single list. Would there be a second list of skills and behaviors to follow
the first? Would there be a third list? Do mature Christ-followers work on the same list and get assessed on the same list as someone who has just recently come to faith?

Another big question that occurred to me concern who would be the disciplers? Pastors? Small group leaders? Without sounding too dramatic, I must admit to being concerned that there may not be enough mature Christians in the church today to disciple all of the less-mature Christians. If we find a new or better way to disciple, will there be enough disciplers to get the job done? As fallen and broken people, is discipling our job, or is it solely Christ’s job through his Holy Spirit, or is it a joint effort? Clearly, if we decide we can serve as disciplers on behalf of the Master, we must first come to the realization that we must not disciple people to be like us; we must only disciple people to be like Jesus.

As I began my journey toward my doctor of ministry degree three years ago, I decided the time had come to find real, actionable answers to these discipleship concerns. Personalized plans would be perfect because every disciple is a distinct individual. A plan to help the discipler and disciple to monitor progress would be perfect so that everyone could affirm successes and make suggestions for those areas still in development. One-on-one relationships would be perfect because we all need people to encourage us and hold us accountable. It was, and is, a tall order, but our alternative is—while easier—wholly unacceptable: stagnant, vapid lives of faith filling stagnant, vapid churches. My research coalesced: adult Christians are unsure of what to do, so study is needed to discover key behaviors that may be effective in re-establishing spiritual growth and vitality.² This guide, its accompanying self-assessment tool, and a handbook for peer disciplers, are the results of that research and study.
What is Missing?

The best place to start is always the beginning. The beginning is to state these irreducible and inescapable facts: Many adult Christians in the North American church are having difficulties exhibiting growth as disciples of Christ. As a result, Christ’s church is lacking in spiritual vibrancy. As a church, we are missing the quality of intentionality in discipleship (being purposeful about the critical task of growth and development) as well as an understanding of what behaviors should be developed. We are missing the personalization needed in helping individuals grow up in Christlikeness. We are missing ongoing oversight (supervision and guidance for the journey) and any method of evaluation or assessment (for the sake of advisement) of growing disciples by those disciples who are further along in the journey of faith.

Throughout a pastoral ministry spanning over twenty-five years, I have discovered that adult Christians in America, as individuals, seem to be missing the knowledge of how to grow. They are missing an awareness of the activities in which they should engage, they are lacking a well-defined program of study, and they want an effective means of measuring their spiritual progress. It is clear that the church must identify the proper behaviors that must be engaged, identify how growth in these behaviors might best be measured, and identify how this process may be aided by the help of peer disciplers.

Disciples are pilgrims, “people who spend our lives going someplace, going to God,” Eugene Peterson wrote, and as pilgrims rather than “tourists,” we “do not acquire information about God but skills in faith” (emphasis mine).³ What skills should be sought? What behaviors define a life devoted to Christ? God’s Word speaks of growing
to be Christlike, but what parts of the individual self must be lost and what parts of Christ must take their place? How does one make these changes—carving off parts of who one already is in deference to becoming something to which one is distinctly alien? M. Robert Mulholland wrote: “Scripture reveals that human wholeness is always actualized in nurturing one another toward wholeness. . . . There can be no wholeness in the image of Christ which is not incarnate in our relationships with others. . . .” Who is it that can help disciples become spiritually formed and disciplined in Christ?

It is not always the individual believer’s fault. “Some people get ‘stuck’ because church leaders lack the knowledge, skills, and resources to develop healthy, maturing followers of Christ” suggest Ron and Mary Bennett. Some people fail to grow because they have been taught an improper understanding of what it means to be a Christ-follower, perceiving a hierarchy within Christianity. A Christian only needs to acknowledge Christ as Savior; a disciple must acknowledge Jesus as Master. Since both are assured of eternal life, why should anyone choose the more difficult path? Greg Ogden describes this dichotomy perfectly, writing:

Being a Christian is easy. The only thing required is that we acknowledge our need of a savior and to receive a gift that I cannot earn nor deserve. But if I identify myself as a disciple, then I am making a statement about the quality of my followership. Being a Christian is a statement about what Christ has done for me; being a disciple is a statement about what I am doing for Christ.

Many people perceive this as a choice—like the easy way to be a Christian and the challenging way to be a Christian—and choose the path of least resistance. “Christian leaders have sent the message that it is alright to be a Christian without being a disciple of Christ. . . . [W]e have done a miserable job of making disciples” says Ogden. There is
now a culture in many churches that suggest that spiritual formation and discipleship is optional, further exacerbating the dilemma of what an adult disciple should be doing.

Through the years, I have read a lot of books and journal articles, and have attended many workshops and conferences on discipleship. Many were very helpful and constructive; some have missed the point, or muddied the waters. One book in particular contained something I found disconcerting. *The Lost Art of Disciple Making* by Leroy Eims was published by the Navigators, a strong disciple-making group. It has a foreword written by Dr. Robert Coleman the Distinguished Senior Professor of Discipleship and Evangelism at Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary in Boston. By all accounts, it should be a great book on discipleship—and it really is. There is a great deal of wonderful information, ideas, and techniques on growing as a disciple of Jesus Christ and helping others grow as disciples of Jesus Christ. It is a book we should all have on our desks as a resource for discipleship. However, there is a “mistake” in Eims’ book that I believe is indicative of the problem endemic in American Christianity: Eims suggests three life stages or rankings for a Christian: the convert, the disciple, and the worker. In Eims’ thinking, you convert to Christianity from a life of non-belief; once you have converted, you may then become a Disciple; once you have been fully trained, you may graduate to a Worker. Evangelism produces converts; education produces disciples; equipping produces workers.

That is simply incorrect, or, at the very least, misleading. It seems to suggest that one can be a convert to Christ, but never become a disciple. In my understanding, the Great Commission of Matthew 28 does not say, “go out and make converts,” Jesus said, “go make disciples.” If you convert from non-belief to faith in Christ, you are
automatically a disciple, and, according to the apostle James, every disciple should exhibit good works.\textsuperscript{10} It is \textit{not} three stages or degrees from non-belief to service with a stage of discipleship sandwiched in-between; all believers are disciples, and all disciples are to be growing, worshipping, loving, serving, telling, and belonging to one another in community. It is a continuum from non-believer to role-model, and we’re all supposed to be making forward progress.

It is as though we’re saying that being a convert is like wearing flip-flop sandals—the bare essentials. Hey—at least you’re going to heaven, right? A disciple would then be like having tennis shoes; a little more substance, better traction, longer lasting. A worker would be the one with steel-toed, waterproof, hiking boots that will take you anywhere. The problem is: Scripture says nothing about classes of believers or stages of belief, and it does not reserve the term disciple for an elite group of believers. The church in America seems to have changed the very fabric of Scripture; in order to be a Christian in America, you do not even have to know what a disciple is. It is possible, at least as some have suggested, to be Christians without any evidence of growth in Christ—no forward movement in faith. There may be differences in the amount of time you’ve been a disciple, or differences in what your spiritual gifts might be, but there is no such thing as being a Christian without also being a disciple. Discipleship is not an option.

Because this attitude or mindset exists in the modern church, the vast majority of Christians in America decide not to choose the discipleship “option.” Imagine this internal dialogue: “Hmmm, I can 1) become a Christian and go to heaven with no effort
required on my part, or 2) become a Christian and work hard at it for the rest of my life. I choose option A: no effort required!”

As you can see, discipleship is not an option; there is no such thing as a convert who is not a disciple. Everyone who follows Christ is a disciple—a follower of the Master. Let me really challenge you: you are either a disciple—or you are not a Christian. The New Testament is a book about disciples, written by disciples, and written for disciples of Jesus Christ or for those who are trying to decide if they will become disciples. It is written for no one else; it is certainly not written for those who have no faith in Christ, and it is not written for those who claim they believe, but have no desire to grow and develop. The late Dallas Willard summarized the plight of the North American church, warning:

For at least several decades the churches of the Western world have not made discipleship a condition of being a Christian. One is not required to be, or to intend to be, a disciple in order to become a Christian, and one may remain a Christian without any signs of progress toward or in discipleship. Contemporary American churches in particular do not require following Christ in his example, spirit, and teachings as a condition of membership either of entering into or continuing in fellowship of a denomination or local church. Any exception to this claim only serves to highlight its general validity and make the general rule more glaring. So far as the visible Christian institutions of our day are concerned, discipleship clearly is optional.11

“You can only go as far as your learning” is a truism I heard a long time ago.12 It makes some sense, when you stop to think about it, suggesting simply that you are limited by what you have learned or experienced. It does not mean that you can only go as far as what you directly receive from a teacher; that seems far too limiting an understanding of this old truism. That would give us carte blanche to blame all of our teachers and pastors for our stunted or stalled growth as disciples. “You can only go as far as your learning” can apply to what you read, see, witness, practice, learn, or
experience for yourself. If you can engage in the process of learning, you will be able to grow and develop. It also means that if you have not read it, seen it, witnessed it, practiced it, learned it, or experienced it for yourself, then you can’t go “there.” You can’t be a brain surgeon, fluent in a language, a skilled carpenter, or a car mechanic if you have not learned how to do those things. However, if you apply yourself to learning and commit yourself to experiencing important things, then you can do anything—including becoming an unconditional disciple of Jesus Christ.

There’s another old maxim out there that I also believe is true: “When you aren’t practicing, someone, somewhere is practicing—and when you meet him, he will win.” It does not matter if we are talking horseshoes, baseball, skiing, math, singing, selling, speaking a foreign language, or performing surgery—if you are not working on getting better at what you do, someone else is going to have the advantage over you when you come up against her. Of course, this maxim is not just about winning—it is about being at your best all the time. If someone else is trying to be her best and if there is a contest or someone has to decide whether you, or the other person gets that job, scholarship, internship, or opportunity—the one who practiced the most moves forward and the one who stayed static is left behind. Let me repeat: this old maxim is not just about winning or competition; it is about intentionally applying yourself, always staying sharp, and continually growing and developing. That is the lesson I hope you will take away from this chapter as it applies to your spiritual development; if you’re not working to become more Christlike, the enemy is going to have an easy time of knocking you down a few notches.
Maybe you’ve heard this aphorism: “What you permit, you promote.” It simply means if you permit laziness—you promote laziness; if you permit a bad attitude, you promote a bad attitude; if you permit low quality, you promote low quality. I think there is more to it than that: “What you permit, you promote—and what you promote, will prevail.” If you promote good study habits, then good study habits will prevail. If you promote kindness, then kindness will prevail. If you promote steadfastness, then steadfastness will prevail.

What does all of this have to do with being a Christian disciple? What do some old, pithy, words of wisdom say about discipleship? The quick answer is that wisdom can come from many sources, and some of the wisdom may be instructive about our choice to follow closely or lag behind. Think carefully about how you can apply these thoughts to being a disciple of Jesus Christ:

- You can only go as far as you have learned, witnessed, or experienced about Jesus Christ. If you are not growing and developing, you are not moving forward spiritually, and you are not making strides in becoming Christlike. Learning and experiencing is a choice.
- If you permit lazy, disinterested, or casual Christianity in your own life—then you promote lazy, disinterested, and casual Christianity in your life; you also promote it in other people’s lives as well. To make things worse, if you promote lazy, disinterested, casual Christianity in your life and theirs, then lazy, disinterested, and casual Christianity will prevail.
- If you’re not developing your spiritual life, you need to remember that the enemy of your soul is developing their spiritual warfare against you—and when you meet them . . . well, it will not be pretty.

The apostle Peter had some similar wisdom to impart. Read this passage from 2 Peter 1:1-15:

Simon Peter, a servant and apostle of Jesus Christ,
To those who through the righteousness of our God and Savior Jesus Christ have received a faith as precious as ours:
    Grace and peace be yours in abundance through the knowledge of God and of Jesus our Lord.
His divine power has given us everything we need for a godly life through our knowledge of him who called us by his own glory and goodness. Through these he has given us his very great and precious promises, so that through them you may participate in the divine nature, having escaped the corruption in the world caused by evil desires.

For this very reason, make every effort to add to your faith goodness; and to goodness, knowledge; and to knowledge, self-control; and to self-control, perseverance; and to perseverance, godliness; and to godliness, brotherly kindness; and to brotherly kindness, love. For if you possess these qualities in increasing measure, they will keep you from being ineffective and unproductive in your knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ. But if anyone does not have them, he is nearsighted and blind, and has forgotten that he has been cleansed from his past sins. . . . For if you do these things, you will never fall, and you will receive a rich welcome into the eternal kingdom of our Lord and Savior Jesus Christ.

So I will always remind you of these things, even though you know them and are firmly established in the truth you now have. I think it is right to refresh your memory as long as I live in the tent of this body, because I know that I will soon put it aside, as our Lord Jesus Christ has made clear to me. And I will make every effort to see that after my departure you will always be able to remember these things.15

If you are like me, as you read that passage, you sensed that there is something missing—perhaps something terribly wrong—in Christ’s church today. Jesus left us with a commission to make disciples (Matthew 28:18-20), and the apostles John, Paul, and Peter directed significant portions of their epistles to give us instructions on how to live as disciples. In fact, in Peter’s message above, the apostle is telling us to “make every effort” and that he feels this instruction is important enough he is reminding us on the eve of his death, and making assurances that he is going to keep this life of discipleship in front of us even after his death.

Do you see that make every effort level of commitment to discipleship in the church today? I desperately desire for it to be the truth, but, if I am honest, I have to admit that the level of discipleship in which one is making every effort to add to one’s faith is rare. In fact, if we all were honest with ourselves, we would admit that that level
of discipleship is sometimes missing or dormant in our own lives. This is the “something” that is not right in the church today, and because of it, we’re “near-sighted and blind” and “stumbling.”16

During Jesus’ time, being his disciple was pretty straightforward. You left your job and your family to go and learn his teachings as he walked along the way, taught in synagogues, and ministered to the people. In Mark 10:28 we read Peter’s words: “We have left everything to follow you!” Can you imagine doing that today? What would your family members say if you told them you were leaving to follow Jesus, to walk with him, and to study all he said and learn to live his way of life instead of your own? It cost the disciples dearly—but Jesus was the only Master and following him was the only way.

We cannot be with Jesus in the same way. He is gone from us in a physical sense, but he has provided his Holy Spirit to live in us and guide us. The condition of a disciple’s heart is exactly the same today as it was back then. As followers of Christ, we must commit to just that: following him. We must have as our central desire the yearning to put aside our own agenda for his.

Unfortunately, in North American churches today there seems to be a disengagement from true discipleship. As Dallas Willard said: “The very type of life that could change the course of human society—and upon certain occasion has done so—is excluded from the essential message of the church.”17 Many adult believers lose sight of the fact that the Christian faith involves ongoing spiritual formation. A walk with Christ begins with one’s belief in Jesus as Savior and Lord, but it must continue throughout the rest of their lives as they commit to living as his disciples. Ray Vander Laan, Christian
author, teacher, and apologist says: “A Christian disciple not only believes Jesus is the Messiah but also is passionately devoted to doing what the Rabbi (Jesus) commands.”

What is missing in our modern churches today is the “what,” “why,” and “how” of being a Christian. We don’t quite seem to have the full understanding of what it means to be a Christ-follower. We have either forgotten or never learned the necessity of being disciples. We’re happy to be Christians. We love Christianity. We embrace the Christian faith. But that’s exactly where the disconnect starts. The word “Christian” is found only three times in the New Testament—and was used only to refer to the people who followed Jesus as his disciples. The word “disciple” on the other hand occurs 269 times in the New Testament. Many adult Christians either forget, or have failed to realize, that being a disciple of Jesus Christ means giving up their lives and living instead the way of Jesus’ life. Eugene Peterson suggests that to be a disciple means believers “spend our lives apprenticed to our master, Jesus Christ. We are in a growing-learning relationship, always. A disciple is a learner, but not in the academic setting of a schoolroom, rather at the work site of a craftsman.” Believers are to follow in his footsteps and imitate his life. All Christians are disciples of the Master, Jesus.

We have also forgotten why we’re to follow him and give up or surrender our own lives. Some adult disciples mistakenly believe that God is solely responsible for growing the believer in Christlikeness. They read the apostle Paul’s words in Philippians 1:6 “being confident of this, that he who began a good work in you will carry it on to completion until the day of Christ Jesus” to mean that God will do all the work and disciples simply wait until it happens. The truth is that there needs to be a great deal of commitment and steadfast investment of time and energy into the process. That’s why the
apostle Peter tells the church to “make every effort to add to your faith. . . .” and then lists a number of attributes disciples should work to enhance.\(^{20}\) Richard Foster supports the need for personal investment in one’s own discipleship: “The analysis is correct—human striving is insufficient and righteousness is a gift from God—but the conclusion [that there is nothing one can do] is faulty. . . . it would be proper to speak of ‘the path of disciplined grace.’ It is ‘grace’ because it is free; it is ‘disciplined’ because there is something for us to do.”\(^{21}\)

If we just take a rudimentary account of our personal desires and preferences, reflected in the choices we make, it would be pretty simple to figure out what things we hold more dear than being in training to be like Jesus. Here’s the bottom line consideration as to why we should be disciples: if there are things that take more time and are of more value than our life with Christ, then those are the things we’re truly worshiping. If those things take preeminence in our lives, then are we truly his disciples? Jesus said “Whoever wants to be my disciple must deny themselves and take up their cross daily and follow me” (Luke 9:23). He said, “With the measure you use, it will be measured to you—and even more. Whoever has will be given more; whoever does not have, even what they have will be taken from them” (Mark 4:24-25). He said, “No one who puts a hand to the plow and looks back is fit for service in the kingdom of God” (Luke 9:62). These are hard comments—are we going to heed them? If we don’t heed them, aren’t we basically saying we don’t trust his words?

If a car mechanic told you to put oil in your car or your engine would melt, would you do what the mechanic suggested? If a doctor told you to stop doing something or you’d lose your health, would you do what the doctor instructed? If a teacher told you
what chapters to study for the test, “because if you don’t you’ll flunk the test,” would you study those chapters? You’ll follow the instructions of the experts in your life—but will you follow the precepts and instructions of your Master, Jesus?

The other thing that is missing is the “how” of being a disciple of Jesus. How do we start and how do we grow? “How” is the focus of the next chapter on the “Method.”
What is the Method?

I’ve entitled this guide *Mile Markers* because I believe the best method for discipleship—and certainly the best method for jumpstarting a stalled spiritual life—is to identify the key behaviors or spiritual formation skills applicable to all adult Christ-followers, and to engage in doing them and improving in them. Perhaps the best term for these behaviors and skills is “mile markers” (like the ancient milestones along country roads) because they mark off our progress on our journey toward being like Christ. Just as you would use a mile marker on a map, or a GPS, or as you travel down the highway, the mile markers of your journey toward Christlikeness can help you know if you’re on the right path, and if you’re making headway in the journey. M. Robert Mulholland, Jr. speaks to the journey:

> When we say that the Christian journey is a *process*, we express a truth that is both well-known and well-nigh unknown at the same time. If you ask most Christians about their spiritual pilgrimage, they will say that it is a day-by-day experience with its ups and downs, its victories and defeats, its successes and failures. In brief, it is a process. But if you were to ask them how God works transformation in their lives, many would indicate that God “zaps” them at some point and instantly changes them.

Clearly, there is a disconnect on the “how” of discipleship. God does not “zap” us and make us complete. This process of discipleship requires intentionality—we have to do it on purpose, not when we get around to it; it does not happen by accident. It has to be personalized—your approach to growing can build on your personality and giftedness, but it absolutely must be tailor-made to where you are deficient in your spiritual development. There should be regular assessments and evaluations to make sure you can monitor your forward progress. There also needs to be personal supervision and oversight by someone a few steps further ahead of you on the journey, helping you take the next
steps and helping your feet stay on the right path. These ingredients are what I call the “Method” and include what I will cover in the next two chapters on Measurement and Mentoring. I believe they are all part of “making every effort to add to your faith” that the apostle Peter was talking about in 2 Peter 1:5.

Let me address the main parts of the Method: intentionality and personalization.

**Intentionality**

People do not accidentally become discipled; believers must apply themselves and commit to the journey. Without commitment and intentionality, adult believers—many times—simply fail to grow.

You have most likely heard the old saying, “When the going gets tough, the tough get going.”\(^{23}\) It is similar to an old saying from the German philosopher, Friedrich Nietzsche, loosely translated: “That which does not kill you, makes you stronger.”\(^ {24}\) This simply means that when hardships come along, those who are resolved and resilient stick with the plan and see it through, and grow through the experience. That’s certainly true for disciples; when hard times come along, we might get derailed for a time, but most of us get back on track and continue on the journey, usually with a new resolve. However, there is an even more insidious problem most of us face: what do we do when comfort, complacency, and contentment set in? When good times and the good life come along, most of us aren’t even aware of our slowing in spiritual vitality which results in a nearly comatose faith.

There is also the lack of role-model disciples in American churches. For many of us, the image of a mature Christian has been that of a politically-conservative, Bible-thumping, Christianese-spouting, well-dressed person with a southern-accent (even in
northwest Ohio) who can’t talk about anything except church. We tend to shy away from that image—both the male and female version—even though they tend to be present in nearly every congregation. Since many are repulsed by that image, many choose not to be discipled by anyone—out of fear and loathing—and development in Christlikeness gets sidetracked.

What happens then is that we become disciples who are no longer plugged in to the Master or his teachings. Some stop attending a church of any kind. Some may become a church-going, good person, choosing to be with people with similar interests and lifestyles, but there is little understanding of the necessity of, or desire for, growing inwardly. George Barna underscores this absentminded or lackadaisical approach to faith: “More often than not, our goal is to feel happy, comfortable, and secure—so we surround ourselves with people who share our love for Christ and a willingness to affirm and appreciate us,” which results in a “disappointing . . . widespread lifestyle among Christians that fails to demonstrate the practical realities of the Christian faith.”25 We’re a pale reflection of our Master; we need to invest, intentionally, in our spiritual growth as his disciples.

Personalization

In addition to intentionally, there needs to be some personalization or individualization. Spiritual formation or discipleship is highly individualized even while taking place in the context of the larger covenant community, the church. Some learners learn best by listening, some by seeing, some by doing; most adult learners require a personalized mix of all three.
Because discipleship usually happens in the larger church community, the tendency has been for a pastor or teacher to adopt her favorite form of teaching (teacher-centered) and apply it to all learners, rather than adapting her teaching to the different styles of learning present in the teaching environment (learner-centered). Learner-centered teaching (teaching that focuses on how the learner best learns) is hard to do in a single Sunday morning setting, with different learning styles present, different ages present, and non-believers and believers present, hearing the same message. However, discipleship is learning, and learning by definition is “a process that leads to change, which occurs as a result of experience and increases the potential for improved performance and future learning.”

This is a big part of the “how” or the Method: it’s clear that there needs to be some individualization in order for the individual disciples to be more fully motivated to learn.

In discipleship, the individual may be in the process of being conformed to the Master, Jesus, but the individuality of the disciple must always be considered. The emphasis is on “the process of learning” and on the fact that “knowledge is continuously derived from and tested out in the experience” of the disciple. I believe it’s possible—even beneficial—to identify standardized ingredients to growth, such as worship, prayer, serving, and Bible study, but if the growth plan for these ingredients is not tailored to each individual, adult believers can find themselves missing valuable pieces of the spiritual growth puzzle.

These ingredients—the “mile markers”—are at the center of what we must learn about intentionality and personalization. These key behaviors of a disciple really are a standardized skill-set for all adult disciples—but how we employ them or emphasize
them must be individualized to the specific learner. These “mile markers” show what we should be doing (standardized skills for all adult disciples); they also help you know where you are, how far you’ve come, and how far you still need to go (individualized to a specific disciple). These are the “right things” of which author Christopher Adsit speaks, such as “knowledge, understanding, principles, norms, standards, laws, absolutes” found in Scripture. Author Richard Foster, speaks of “spiritual disciplines” that “call us to move beyond surface living into the depths” and to be “the answer to a hollow world.”

My research identified forty mile markers that help us know where we should be growing as Christ-followers. A focus group helped to establish how these forty mile markers (key behaviors) fit under six broad content categories that help define the church and our actions as Christ-followers. Those content categories are:

- Worship: praising and adoring God
- Love: loving God and loving others
- Belong: belonging to the community of faith—the church
- Grow: growing to be more like Jesus Christ
- Serve: serving God and serving others
- Tell: telling others the Good News of salvation through Christ

You may notice that the first two, Worship and Love, have to do with the “upward” aspect or focus of our spiritual lives—those things that are God-focused, and speak to our knowing God. The second two, Belong and Grow, have to do with the “inward” focus of our spiritual lives—those things that are about edifying us internally, and speak to our growing in Christ. The final two, Serve and Tell, have to do with the “outward” focus of our spiritual lives—those things that are aimed at the world around us for sharing the Good News of Christ, and speak to how we are showing Christ to the world.
The focus group also helped organize the mile markers (key behaviors) under three broad developmental categories that show a continuum in spiritual development in the life of a Christ-follower:

- Non-believer to new believer—the *discovering* stage
- New believer to maturing believer—the *developing* stage
- Maturing believer to role-model of the faith—the *demonstrating* stage

It is important to note that this continuum from non-believer to role-model does not suggest phases of growth or classes of Christians; they simply show a progression of growth. These labels do not suggest one can be a convert without being a disciple, they very purposefully show continuous growth as true disciples or Jesus Christ.

What follows is a chart showing the developmental progression of the mile markers of Christian discipleship.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowing</th>
<th>Worship</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Demonstrating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I have discovered the Great Commandment. I have discovered Jesus’ New Commandment.</td>
<td>I have discovered God. I have discovered Worship.</td>
<td>I will present my life as an act of worship. I will praise him for who he is and what he has done, and worship him wholeheartedly.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating an understanding and a heart for worship—privately and corporately. I am demonstrating an understanding of communion and baptism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Love</td>
<td>I have discovered God. I have discovered Worship.</td>
<td>I will present my life as an act of worship. I will praise him for who he is and what he has done, and worship him wholeheartedly.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating an understanding and a heart for worship—privately and corporately. I am demonstrating an understanding of communion and baptism.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I will love so that people see Christ in me. I will spend time alone with my Father, getting to know him better every day.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating love for God and for others. I am demonstrating devotion to a life of prayer, loving God through my conversations with him, enabling me to find direction and answers to the questions of my life.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Developmental Progression - continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Non-Believer to New Believer</th>
<th>New Believer to Maturing Believer</th>
<th>Maturing Believer to Role-Model of the faith</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Discovering**          | I have discovered God’s plan for humanity – *how life was supposed to be*.  
I have discovered Community - *how life is supposed to be NOW.* | I will live in intentional community with other Christ followers, investing my life in them and developing lasting, meaningful relationships.  
I will allow my brothers and sisters in Christ to help me find direction, focus, accountability, and to enable me to carry out God’s plan in my life and in the world. | I am demonstrating what it means to live in community-establishing a good reputation and living out a life of example.  
I am demonstrating that I am committed to loving others and being with them in community. |
| **Belong**               | I have discovered the plan of salvation.  
I have discovered how to develop into an unconditional follower (disciple) of Christ. | I will seek God first – getting my priorities straight – giving all I am to God.  
I will submit to being discipled, and work to live in ways that develop the proper “fruit” in my life. | I am demonstrating spiritual authenticity, submitting to being discipled, and growing towards the time I can disciple others.  
I am demonstrating knowledge of spiritual disciplines such as worship, prayer, confession, submission, fellowship, study, service, solitude, silence, fasting, tithing, and more. |
| **Grow**                 |                              |                                   |                                             |

---

**I have discovered God’s plan for humanity – *how life was supposed to be*.
I have discovered Community - *how life is supposed to be NOW.*

**I will live in intentional community with other Christ followers, investing my life in them and developing lasting, meaningful relationships.**
I will allow my brothers and sisters in Christ to help me find direction, focus, accountability, and to enable me to carry out God’s plan in my life and in the world.

**I am demonstrating what it means to live in community-establishing a good reputation and living out a life of example.**
I am demonstrating that I am committed to loving others and being with them in community.

**I have discovered the plan of salvation.**
**I have discovered how to develop into an unconditional follower (disciple) of Christ.**

**I will seek God first – getting my priorities straight – giving all I am to God.**
**I will submit to being discipled, and work to live in ways that develop the proper “fruit” in my life.**

**I am demonstrating spiritual authenticity, submitting to being discipled, and growing towards the time I can disciple others.**
**I am demonstrating knowledge of spiritual disciplines such as worship, prayer, confession, submission, fellowship, study, service, solitude, silence, fasting, tithing, and more.**
It should be noted that a person’s conversion to faith in Christ is presumed; it is a step taken prior to the behaviors in this progression; prior to continued growth in Christlikeness. Other aspects of church-life such as baptism, communion, and/or church membership are not addressed since these may be quite different for each church.
situation. This list was created to be ecumenical in its language, and in keeping with orthodox Christian faith. These mile markers do not specifically assign or address tasks that need to be accomplished, although they may infer some tasks or activities that could be undertaken for spiritual development. For example, one of the mile markers speaks of discovering spiritual gifts for use in the local congregation. Inherent in this behavior is the task of taking a spiritual gift inventory to find your gifts, and then finding a meaningful ministry in which to actively use your gifts. Another mile marker speaks of developing spiritual fruit in life. This clearly is an observed trait that necessarily requires the “developing” aspect of paying attention to growth, pursuing opportunities for growth, and then doing some careful introspection to see how you are doing in this area.

As we read in chapter one, the apostle Peter told the church to “make every effort to add to your faith. . . .” and then listed a number of attributes believers should work to enhance, adding that if they “possess these qualities in increasing measure, they will keep you from being ineffective and unproductive in your knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ.” There is work to be done, and there is a Method that can help us—intentionality, personalization, and mile markers or key behaviors we must pick up along the way. The other needful ingredients are Measurement and Mentoring, which I will cover in the next two chapters.

Jesus’ Method

It may be helpful to take a look at Jesus’ own method for making disciples. The gospels record instances that I believe point to how Jesus’ helped grow his disciples. The
following is not meant to be an exhaustive study; a cursory investigation yielded examples from each of the four gospels.

1. Jesus asked his disciples to leave their lives behind.  

2. Jesus asked his disciples to accompany him on a new life of living and working together in a unity of purpose and spirit.  

3. Jesus taught them by word and example as they journeyed together.  

4. Jesus made their relationship personal.  

5. Jesus examined his disciples as they learned and developed.  

6. Jesus asked them to continue doing what they witnessed him doing.  

7. Jesus asked them to persist in their faith and their relationship with him forever.  

In these passages we see intentionality, personalization, examination, and oversight in Jesus’ method of discipling. Jesus may not have clearly defined or delineated a method, but he used a method—a method he most likely saw lived out in rabbi-disciple relationships and craftsman-apprentice relationships during his formative years.

We will discover more in chapter four, “What is Mentoring?” For now let’s turn our attention to Measurement.
What is Measurement?

How many parents measure the growth of their child’s pinky finger? Not too many would be my guess. How many teachers measure a student’s progress in toenail growth? Few, if any. Does a city or township monitor the number of birthday party balloons purchased in September? Do you measure the amount of motor oil in your neighbor’s car? Perhaps you catch my drift: we only measure what is important.

Parents measure a child’s growth in height and weight. Teachers measure student progress in key areas of study—like Math, Science, and English. You measure the amount of oil in your car, not in someone else’s car.

Let’s take another look at the apostle Peter’s instruction in 2 Peter 1:1-15.

Simon Peter, a servant and apostle of Jesus Christ,
   To those who through the righteousness of our God and Savior Jesus Christ have received a faith as precious as ours:
      Grace and peace be yours in abundance through the knowledge of God and of Jesus our Lord.
      His divine power has given us everything we need for a godly life through our knowledge of him who called us by his own glory and goodness. Through these he has given us his very great and precious promises, so that through them you may participate in the divine nature, having escaped the corruption in the world caused by evil desires.
      For this very reason, make every effort to add to your faith goodness; and to goodness, knowledge; and to knowledge, self-control; and to self-control, perseverance; and to perseverance, godliness; and to godliness, brotherly kindness; and to brotherly kindness, love. For if you possess these qualities in increasing measure, they will keep you from being ineffective and unproductive in your knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ. But if anyone does not have them, he is nearsighted and blind, and has forgotten that he has been cleansed from his past sins. . . . For if you do these things, you will never fall, and you will receive a rich welcome into the eternal kingdom of our Lord and Savior Jesus Christ.
      So I will always remind you of these things, even though you know them and are firmly established in the truth you now have. I think it is right to refresh your memory as long as I live in the tent of this body, because I know that I will soon put it aside, as our Lord Jesus Christ has made clear to me.
And I will make every effort to see that after my departure you will always be able to remember these things.32

Measuring our spiritual growth and development is important. It’s how we can know if we’re doing well in our spiritual development. Peter gives us a simple measuring tool: If you possess these qualities in increasing measure, they will keep you from being ineffective and unproductive in your knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ. . . . If you do these things, you will never stumble. . . .

Work on your spiritual life, and be effective, productive, and never stumble, these are things we can see and measure today. Then Peter adds another measure that we’ll understand in eternity: “receive a rich welcome into the eternal kingdom of Christ” (2 Peter 1:11).

If you are like me, you will assume the eternal measure is on track because of what Christ did for us. However (again, if you are like me), you have some concerns about the day-to-day measurement: being effective and productive and never stumbling in faith. I seem to stumble just about every day, and I know I am not nearly as effective and productive as I should be.

Most of us realize that something is missing—and we want to find it and grab hold and make some changes in our lives. Where do you start? What do you do? What is it you should be working on? Most adult Christ-followers have questions like these. We began to address those concerns in chapter one on “What is missing?” Now we need to find ways to assess our forward progress in “possessing these qualities in increasing measure,”33 and while Peter offers some help in that area, there seems to be a need for more and better assessment and evaluation—better “measurement.” This chapter is
designed to help you discover some ways of measuring your progress so you can map out a plan of action for spiritual growth that makes sense to you.

In the previous chapter, “What is the Method?” we found that our method involved intentionality and personalization. We need to approach our role as disciples with intention—with meaning and purpose. We also need to work at it in a way that is tailor-made for each disciple; customized for the individual.

Part of our “method” is that we identify some “mile markers” that help us define and describe the Christian life—so we can measure how we’re doing in our spiritual growth. If we don’t know where we’re going, how will we ever know that we get there? If we have no way to measure progress, how do we know we’re actually making headway? I don’t know about you, but I’d love to get some kind of a report card from God on how I’m doing in my growth as a disciple of Jesus. It could be “pass/fail” or “satisfactory/unsatisfactory” or even have the traditional “A, B, C, D, and F”—anything to help me know where I’m needing help, and where I’m doing well.

I was that child who would actually read his grade card or grade report. To be honest, my parents made me read it; they wanted me to learn from my mistakes, so, like history, I wouldn’t be destined to repeat them. I’d look at the letter grade, and then read the comments from the teacher on what needed to be done to improve. From my report cards through the years, I’ve learned these interesting things:

- I like to read; I should read more often; I only like to read what I want to read.
- I like to talk; I like to talk in class; I like to talk to girls in class; I like to pass notes to girls in class.
- I have a command of the language beyond my grade level; I need to keep my mouth quiet during class time; I speak well with adults; I use my ability to speak well with adults to engage the teacher at inappropriate times and cause interruptions.
• Playground is my favorite activity; films in class are my favorite activity; music is my favorite activity; math is not a favorite activity.
• I do best when seated at the front of the class next to the teacher.

Wouldn’t you like to get this kind of feedback from Jesus himself on how you’re doing as his disciple?

Chapter five contains a self-assessment tool to help you find where you have been successful in your spiritual development, and where you might need additional help. It is the centerpiece of measuring your progress. Chapter six then provides some next steps with your self-assessment, leading you to chapter seven and chapter eight which will help you develop a personalized plan of action. It is all about measuring what is important.

When you’re hiking, it’s always helpful to know some things about the length of your stride or how many miles you can walk in 30 minutes so you can estimate your distance. A pedometer on your ankle or belt can help measure the number of steps you’ve taken to give you a reasonable idea of the distance you’ve travelled. If you have food and water for 5 days, and you have a distance of 50 miles to travel, you know you need to cover 10 miles a day on average in order to arrive before you run out of food and water. If you don’t keep track, and travel only 5 miles a day, you’ll run out of food and water halfway through your trek. Not a good idea. People who travel on land use compasses to stay on track. They use the sun and the stars to chart their course. If they have a GPS, they can actually pinpoint their location and keep track of their progress. No one who hikes will set out without knowing direction, and no one will hike without measuring distance in some way in order to ration and conserve supplies, and arrive safely.

Someone who travels on the ocean can use a GPS, or they can use a sextant to take readings and use sea charts to identify currents and to determine latitude and
longitude to keep track of direction and progress. It makes absolutely no sense at all to set out in a boat on the vast, wide, trackless ocean and use neither star nor sun to steer, and no chart to know the currents.

Astronauts on the way to the moon never shoot for the moon by dead reckoning—with the moon in their sights. They’ll end up chasing the moon as it orbits away from them. Astronauts use a sophisticated system of parabolic course projections to shoot for where the moon will be when they get there.

When a young child wants to ride a certain roller coaster, they measure themselves against the measuring stick at the gate to see if they’re tall enough. If they don’t measure up they have to wait; it’s all about keeping them safe. Then, all year long—or perhaps over a period of two or more years—they measure themselves to see if they’ve reached the right height. When they’ve grown tall enough, they go back to ride that roller coaster.

We all use measurement in our lives. Certain grades get us certain scholarships. Certain ACT or SAT scores get us into our choice of colleges and get us scholarships. A cup of sugar in a cake makes a lot better cake than four cups of sugar—or a half cup of sugar. A pinch of salt is not the same as a fist of salt.

Measurement is important—but so is what it is we’re measuring. A teaspoon of vanilla extract is very different than a teaspoon of vinegar. A cup of sugar is a lot different than a cup of sand. Driving 10 miles to a restaurant to spend $500 is a lot different than driving 500 miles to a restaurant to spend $10. Measurement is important—and what we measure is important. I believe it’s possible—even beneficial—to use the mile markers to measure how we’re doing in our journey toward Christlikeness.
We can assess how we’re doing right now, and then re-assess ourselves every 6-12 months to see how we’re doing on the mastery of those behaviors or skills. The self-assessment tool in chapter five helps you evaluate how you’re doing in your spiritual progress in six key content areas in the life of a believer: **Worshipping, Loving, Belonging, Growing, Serving, and Telling**.

The first section of the self-assessment is about **knowing** God—it’s all about knowing God personally and intimately; the *upward* aspect of our spiritual journey. The second section of the self-assessment is about **growing** in your faith and in community—it’s all about your inner being; the *inward* aspect of Christian spirituality. The third section is about **showing** your faith and the love of Christ in the world—it’s all about living a life of witness; the *outward* aspect of a vibrant, growing faith in Christ.

When you follow the instructions in chapter five, and have transferred your results to the chart that follows the self-assessment tool, what you end up with is a starting place for designing a personalized plan of action in chapter eight that maps out your spiritual formation. Then, with the help of a Mentor or peer discipler, which I will address in the next chapter, you can be challenged to grow in those areas in which you need help, and you can be assured that you’re going in the right direction.

Please remember: the self-assessment is not a test. There are no right or wrong answers; you cannot pass it or fail it. This is a personalized self-assessment tool, and your results will be very different from anyone else’s results. The key is that it is *self*-assessment, and that the assessment will be used in conjunction with one-on-one interaction with a peer discipler—a Mentor. Don’t let the assessment cause you anxiety. The assessment is a starting place, that’s all. Some people may feel they’ve done very
well on the assessment, and they may begin to think they’re as spectacular as they’ve always thought. I sure hope no one thinks that way; if you have no room for improvement, there’s something haywire in your spiritual progress.

Some of the statements on the self-assessment simply may not make sense; some statements that you want to be on the list won’t be there; some statements that are on the list might be things you simply don’t think belong on the list. That’s alright: this is a starting place. Your peer discipler can help you iron out all the kinks.

Chapter five’s self-assessment tool may not provide a perfectly accurate picture of the reality of your spiritual progress thus far—but as long as you’re being relatively objective and relatively consistent, this tool will help you get started, and then subsequent evaluations and interactions with a mentor will assist you in determining whether progress is being made. What is certain is that without regular and consistent evaluation, there is a danger of losing sight of the goal, and ultimately failing to grow in faith. George Barna’s research bears this out: “Left to our own devices, we can fool ourselves into believing that we have done better than before—perhaps even the best we can hope to achieve—when in fact we have barely nudged ourselves forward.”

Assessment, evaluation, and measurement will help us grow and help us know how we’re growing.

The apostle Peter was very clear to us: spiritual growth is ongoing (we’re to grow in “increasing measure”); it is personal (he said “add to your faith” not add to “our” faith); and it is intentional (we’re to “make every effort”—he said it twice). For this level of growth to occur, we need ongoing assessment and the help of a spiritual mentor.
What is Mentoring?

Look at the following list of names. What do these people have in common?

- Col. Tom Parker
- Jim Leyland
- Anne Sullivan
- Béla Károlyi
- Brian Epstein

Have you figured it out? They all have been mentors. Col. Tom Parker was Elvis Presley’s manager; Jim Leyland was the Detroit Tigers’ manager; Anne Sullivan was Helen Keller’s teacher and mentor; Béla Károlyi was the Olympic gymnastics coach for Romania and then the United States, coaching Nadia Comăneci, Svetlana Boginskaya, Mary Lou Retton, Betty Okino, and Kerri Strug, among others; Brian Epstein was the manager of the Beatles.

Mentors. Advisors. Coaches. They don’t know more, necessarily, they just know how to help others become more than they could on their own. That’s a good definition of a mentor: helping others go further or do better than they can by themselves.

Jim Leyland was not a better pitcher, catcher, or fielder than the players on his team. He’d just been around long enough to have learned some things so he could advise his players well and utilize their talents, strategically. Col. Tom Parker wasn’t a better rock-and-roll performer than Elvis. He was gifted at navigating contracts, venues, and publicity, and helped Elvis succeed. Anne Sullivan didn’t know the same level of being deaf, blind, and mute like Helen Keller, but she had patience and she knew how humans learned, so she was the best teacher Helen Keller could have had. Béla Károlyi was a boxer not a gymnast, and he was a big man, not a petite, young girl—but he knew how to train and he knew how to prepare physically, so he found success in leading young
female gymnasts to win the gold at the Olympics. Brian Epstein was a saxophone player—not exactly what the Beatles needed in the band—but he was masterful at advising them in their start in the music business.

A mentor isn’t always an expert in what they lead or train; sometimes a mentor can be someone who is just a few experiences ahead of us. Bob Dylan was mentored by Woody Guthrie; Henry David Thoreau was mentored by Ralph Waldo Emerson; Quincy Jones was mentored by Ray Charles. A mentor may not even be in the same field as we, but may simply be more mature or have more experience or wisdom. Gloria Estefan, the famous Latin Pop crossover star, was mentored by her Cuban grandmother Consuelo Garcia; Tom Brokaw, the television journalist, was mentored by Frances Morrow, his elementary school teacher; Sen. John McCain was mentored by William Ravenel, his high school teacher and coach; the late Maya Angelou, America’s Poet Laureate, was mentored by her neighbor, Mrs. Flowers.

Everyone needs mentors. We need them in our finances, in our careers, in our education, and in our relationships. We also need them in our spiritual development. Why? Because the stark reality is, we can’t—or won’t—do it on our own. We need help, training, advice, and someone to turn to when we’re not sure what to do next.

- I consider my wife one of the wisest people I’ve ever known, and I have been mentored by her all through our life together—especially in areas of business, finances, keeping an eye on the future, and discernment about people.
- I have been mentored in worship by a mother of five children who taught me to be obedient in worship—worshipping even when I didn’t feel like it.
- I have been mentored in Bible Study and the vast panoramic survey of Scripture by an 80-year old pastor from New Zealand.
- I have been mentored in “the school of dying graces” by the wife of my former college president as she showed all of us how to die well.
- I have been mentored in being a pastor by men and women—some of them pastors, many of them regular, everyday believers—who have defined and redefined what it means to be a shepherd in this ever-changing world.
Has someone mentored you? Joshua was a young, energetic man who learned by watching Moses. Moses mentored Joshua, and when it was time for Moses to die, Joshua was appointed to succeed him. Elisha was a young prophet. Prophets were spokesmen for God. They were sent to stubborn people who many times got so angry at what the prophet said that they wanted to kill the prophet. Elisha learned from one of the best: Elijah. Elisha asked his master if he could inherit a double portion of Elijah’s spirit and power (2 Kings 2:1-18). Paul was mentored by Gamaliel, and thoroughly trained in the laws of Israel. Paul signed on for mentoring by the greatest rabbinic teacher in the land (Acts 22:3). Paul was also mentored by Barnabas. Silas, Luke, and Timothy were mentored by Paul. John Mark was mentored by Barnabas. The biblical examples go on and on.

How do we know if we’re doing well in our spiritual development, if no one ever asks us the tough questions, or if we never sign up for the training or the help available from one a few steps ahead of us on the journey? I’ve mentioned in previous chapters that there is something missing in American Christianity. We don’t have a workable method for discipleship and we don’t measure what is important to see if we’re actually growing. Perhaps worse, we don’t ask those who are a few steps ahead of us to mentor us on our journey.

Peter’s mentoring instructions to us said: “. . . if you possess these qualities in increasing measure, they will keep you from being ineffective and unproductive . . . if you do these things, you will never stumble. . . .”^39 Let me change Peter’s statement into the negative to give you the full effect: If you don’t possess these qualities in increasing
measure, you are going to be ineffective and unproductive in your knowledge of Jesus Christ . . . if you don’t do these things, you will stumble at every step.

We need assistance and counsel with our spiritual lives—and it’s not going to come from showing up at worship on Sunday mornings for an hour or so. That’s not spiritual growth. I’ve already used this quote from Eugene Peterson earlier in this guide, but it’s appropriateness in this chapter on mentoring requires that it is included a second time; Peterson said: “We are in a growing-learning relationship, always. A disciple is a learner, but not in the academic setting of a schoolroom, rather at the work site of a craftsman.”

Like an apprentice to a silversmith, a farrier, or a cooper who learns her craft at the side of the journeyman craftsman, a disciple learns by observation and imitation at the side of a peer discipler who stands in for our Master, Jesus. No one grows in a vacuum. No one grows without introspection. No one grows without a teacher, discipler, coach, or mentor.

In Luke 9:23 we can get a sense of Jesus’ concise and clear-cut instructions on how to live as a disciple: “If anyone would come after me, he must deny himself and take up his cross daily and follow me.” Inherent in this passage are descriptions of what it means to be one of his disciples:

1. “Come after.” A disciple makes a determination: she searches, discovers, and follows the Master. This is no mere spiritual “seeking,” this is determined, reasoned, decisive action.
2. “Deny himself.” A disciple surrenders his will in deference to and preference for the Master’s will. This is not some form of asceticism whereby he does without some pleasure or desire for a time or even for a lifetime; this is about opting—purposefully and preferentially—for Christ’s plans instead of his own.
3. “Take up his cross.” For disciples the “cross” signifies they are willing to walk beside him on the road of obedience—even suffering—to the end of their days, and that they are willing to die to themselves. The cross is not a metaphor for dealing with troubles in life, nor is it a literal requirement of
carrying a cross to show some form of membership or obedience. The cross is both a symbol and a mindset: “I have been crucified with Christ and I no longer live, but Christ lives in me. The life I live in the body, I live by faith in the Son of God, who loved me and gave himself for me.”

4. “Daily.” It is not a one-time decision, it is an everyday decision. Salvation does not need to be renewed daily, nor does one’s position in Christ, but the decision and determination to deny oneself and carry the cross in obedience to the Master is a daily occurrence. The world continually vies for the disciple’s allegiance, her heart always seeks its own desires, the enemy quietly invades her defenses, and unless she is daily working on moving forward, she is slowly and inexorably losing hard-won ground.

5. “Follow me.” This is more than walking along behind. It is finding what Jesus did and doing it. It is learning his style and emulating it. It is hearing and studying his words then echoing them. It involves falling in behind him and walking in his footsteps, doing and being just like the Master.

Jesus invited the disciples to follow him. The disciple is asked for a decision:

leave one life behind and follow the Master into the life he has willed for the disciple to live. However, this is more than mere following. Following can be done at a distance and without a real relationship. Jesus asked his disciples to actually be in his presence, to walk side-by-side, and to share the intimacy of a true relationship. Jesus poured himself into those who walked beside him—the mark of a true discipler-disciple relationship. He taught them, showed them, led them, mentored them, and positioned them to continue his ministry and mission to the world. The disciple is but a branch of the true vine, and in order to produce fruit, the disciple must remain connected to the true vine. As Jesus sends his disciples into the world, he calls them to remain fully grafted into him. “Apart from me,” Jesus says, “you can do nothing.”

The point is—none of us should try to do it all alone.

“Passing on wisdom to the young for the purposes of character formation has always been around,” writes Bill Hull in his book *The Complete Book of Discipleship.*

There is evidence of master-disciple relationships early in the Old Testament accounts.
Jacob might be considered a disciple of his uncle Laban, although the sense of obligation bordered on indentured servitude (Genesis 27:41-31:55). Joseph was a disciple of sorts to the Hyksos Pharaoh as Joseph rose to become second in power only to the Egyptian king (Genesis 37:1-50:26). Moses had a master-disciple relationship with Joshua from the time of the initial exit from Egypt, throughout the wilderness wandering, to the border of the land of promise in the trans-Jordan. Samuel served the Lord under Eli in a master-disciple relationship, until Samuel grew in stature and knowledge and was able to succeed his master, becoming a prophet, priest, and judge of Israel.

In the Old Testament, we find the terms *talmid* and *limmud*. *Talmid* (תַּלְמִיד) is a Hebrew word for “disciple” or “student” (from *lamad*, לַמַּד meaning to “exercise in,” to “learn”). A *talmid* was trained in a specific discipline; in 1 Chronicles 25:8 we find the mention of a *talmid*, a student being trained for the role of musician in the worship of God, casting lots to determine musical duties under King David. *Limmud* (לִמּוּד) is a Hebrew word that is translated “disciple,” (also from *lamad*, לַמַּד meaning to “exercise in,” to “learn”). Isaiah 54:13 finds the word *limmud* used to describe the sons of Israel being taught by God, and Isaiah 50:4 has the plural *limmudim* denoting disciples as “taught ones.” Many of the Old Testament prophets had students. We read in 1 Kings and 2 Kings of the company of learners who were in the service of, or were disciples of Elijah and Elisha. “Elijah and Elisha formed groups of followers who were called ‘the sons of the prophets’” (1 Ki 20:35). They were companions of the true prophets and were taught by the prophets. . . .” and their relationship was one of master and disciple. In Isaiah 8:16 we read “Bind up the testimony and seal up the law among my disciples.” Much like Elijah and Elisha before him, Isaiah may have had a group of followers who
asked to be instructed by the prophet, or were gathered by the prophet to pass on the prophet’s knowledge and understanding. Although we find no evidence of Isaiah having a formal school, many believe that he had disciples to whom he entrusted these important teachings.

In Greek society, in the five or six centuries before Christ, μαθητής (mathetes, meaning “learner”) referred to a student or disciple who committed himself to be trained by a master. Socrates (c. 469 BC-399 BC) had a number of disciples, one of which was Plato. Plato (c. 428 BC-347 BC) also had a number of disciples; one of special promise was Aristotle. Aristotle (c. 384 BC-322 BC) had a number of disciples, and at one point began teaching Alexander (who would one day be called “the Great”), the young son of Philip of Macedon. As was the custom of that day, these philosophers started their own schools and took on a large following of students; Plato founded a school known as the Academy, while Aristotle founded a school known as the Lyceum, both in Athens. There were other well-known masters during those centuries, such as Pythagoras (c. 570 BC-495 BC) and Epicurus (c. 341 BC-270 BC), both of whom had a number of disciples, and both of whom started their own schools.

In New Testament times, we see evidence of discipleship relationships in many areas of life. Young men would apprentice under skilled craftsmen or laborers, many times learning the skills of a family endeavor such a herding flocks, carpentry, or farming, but at times learning a trade under the mentoring of a master. Those who wanted to pursue training in religious studies would seek out a rabbi (teacher) under whose tutelage the young disciples would gain knowledge and experience. Ray Vander Laan writes:
In Jesus’ day, a rabbi was not the formal head of a religious community or synagogue as we think of a rabbi today. Instead, rabbi was an honored term of respect given to one who interpreted and taught the Hebrew Bible. Rabbi meant “my superior” or “my master” and came from a Hebrew root meaning “great” or “many.” Disciples and others used this term to refer to great scholars and teachers of the Scriptures.

Rabbis played an important role in the Jewish spiritual culture because there were no formal seminaries at the time of Jesus. Each rabbi taught his disciples how the Torah should be interpreted and obeyed, and his disciples willingly submitted to that interpretation. A rabbi, then, was an honored teacher who was well-versed in the text of the Hebrew Bible. He was highly respected for his knowledge, interpretation, and teaching of Scripture as well as for his personal righteousness. Following a rabbi required a deep commitment on the part of the disciple who would live with and follow the rabbi day in and day out for years in order to learn to be like him and live in obedience to God as the rabbi did.

For the Galileans, walking with God took priority over everything. So a rabbi and his disciples typically were highly respected by others in the community. A family or extended family group usually provided housing and food for a rabbi and his disciples. Because of the high respect for study of the Torah, and the fact that the rabbi was leading other people to the kingdom of heaven and the life to come, each disciple was expected to honor the rabbi even more than his own father. It is difficult for Christians today to imagine such love and commitment to a human teacher.

To study under a rabbi was a chosen lifestyle, and the disciples went in search of the best rabbi under whom they could apprentice. As Vander Laan explains:

The talmid willingly left home, family, and occupation to be with the rabbi because he wanted more than anything else in the world to be like the rabbi (teacher) in his walk with God. As the rabbi lived and taught his understanding of the Scripture, his talmid listened to him, watched him, followed him, memorized his words, and imitated his walk with God. Eventually the talmid became a teacher who had his own disciples who wanted to learn from him how to walk with God.

Michael Wilkins explains that “the normal pattern in Israel was for a prospective disciple to approach a rabbi and ask to study with him. Later rabbinic disciples followed their master around, often imitating the master’s teaching of Torah.” Wilkins gives us further insight into the term “disciple” as well as the role and expectations of those who called themselves “disciples”:

---

48

49

50
Matt. and talmidh appear to be equivalent terms. They were popular terms at the time of Jesus to designate a follower who was vitally committed to a teacher/leader and/or movement. The terms themselves did not determine the type of discipleship; the type of discipleship was determined by the type of leader of movement or teaching to which the disciple was committed. The types of discipleship covered the spectrum from philosophical (Philo) to technical (scribes) to sectarian (Pharisees) to revolutionary (Zealots and Menahem) to eschatological (John the Baptist). The terms were general enough to be used for all of the above.

Matt. became a convenient vehicle to carry Jesus’ concept of vital attachment to himself personally. He was his disciples’ supreme teacher and leader (Mt 23:7-10). They were not to be disciples of any other person, and were never to advance to being called rabbi. They were to make disciples of all nations, but all new disciples were to be taught what Jesus had previously taught them (Mt 28:18-20). Matt. was able to become a specialized term for Jesus’ followers because the common usage was general enough to hold the specialized connotations the Christian community appended to it.

Wilkins cautions of a distinctive difference for disciples of Christ: “The disciple of Jesus is not like the disciple of the rabbi who could himself hope to be a rabbi someday. The disciple will always remain a disciple of the Lord.” The fact that Christian disciples will never attain to the level of their Master does not mean that Christian disciples do not teach other disciples. Wilkins highlights the final phrase in Jesus’ Great Commission, “teaching them to obey everything I have commanded you,” and instructs us on its meaning, saying:

The pronoun “them” indicates that everyone who has become a disciple of Jesus is to be involved in the process of discipleship. Access to education by an esteemed rabbi was normally reserved for the privileged men in rabbinic Judaism. Some rabbis denied young girls even the basics of Torah instruction. But Jesus once again breaks down all barriers to indicate that all of his disciples—women and men, Gentile and Jew, poor or rich—must be taught to obey everything he has commanded. This means that everyone who has heard the gospel message and has responded by believing on Jesus for eternal life is a disciple/Christian/believer, all of which are virtually synonymous terms (cf. Acts 2:44; 4:32; 5:14; 6:1-7; 11:26; 26:28).

Today many incorrectly use the title “disciple” to refer to a person who is more committed than other Christians or to those involved in special “discipleship programs.” But we can see from Jesus’ commission that all Christians are disciples. It is just that some are obedient disciples, while others are not.
The activity of discipleship is involved with “teaching.” New disciples are to be taught the rudimentary elements of the Christian life, while more advanced teaching is given to mature disciples as they advance in the Christian life. But the emphasis is not simply on acquiring knowledge; the distinguishing feature is always that disciples are to obey or conform their lives to the teaching. Obedience was the hallmark of Jesus’ disciples. . . .

Wilkins points out, “All disciples, new and mature, are to be taught to ‘obey everything that I [Jesus] have commanded,’ so that they increasingly become like him.”

Jesus taught his disciples to follow, to watch, listen, learn—and emulate. He taught them to teach others using the same techniques: be with, walk beside, spend time, share space, serve together, suffer collectively, copy, and then model. Yet, Jesus was less a teacher of his disciples and more of a man hard at work allowing others to witness what he was doing. Jesus was a teacher, to be sure, but he was always turning experiences and teachable moments into life lessons that would ultimately change the world through those who were watching and learning.

Dr. Martin Luther King was mentored by Dr. Benjamin E. Mays, a minister and the president of Morehouse College in Atlanta, Georgia from 1940 to 1967; Rosa Parks was mentored by Alice L. White, her headmistress at school; Gene Roddenberry (of Star Trek fame) was mentored by Isaac Asimov (a well-known science-fiction writer); Tim Russert (journalist) was mentored by Sister Mary Lucille from his days as a Catholic schoolboy; and Oprah Winfrey was mentored by Mrs. Duncan, her 4th grade teacher. Everyone can benefit from having a mentor in life; every Christ-follower will benefit from having a mentor (peer discipler) who is a few steps ahead of us on the journey towards Christlikeness.
There are three danger areas about which I wish to caution you:

1. Some people will think they don’t need a mentor.
2. Some people will think they’re not worthy to be a mentor.
3. Some people will think they don’t have the time for either.

I think I have sufficiently addressed the first danger area: each of needs a mentor. Elisha, Joshua, Paul, Timothy, John Mark, and Luke all had mentors. You need a mentor, and so do I.

The second danger is that some will think they’re not worthy to be a mentor. Have you ever struggled with prayer? Then you are probably a few steps ahead of a friend who is just beginning a struggle with prayer. Have you ever struggled with stewardship, but finally developed a plan that seems to work? Then you can help someone who has no plan at all figure out how to balance their budget while being generous toward God. Have you ever made a breakthrough in Scripture or had an “aha” moment in Bible Study? Then you’re uniquely qualified to help someone who hasn’t yet had an “aha” moment in Bible Study. Very few of us are looking for Billy Graham as their mentor, we’re looking for a real-life, down-to-earth believer who is engaged in growing spiritually. When you go looking for a mentor, just realize that very few of us feel ready or worthy. If you ask someone a few steps ahead of you for help, and that person says “No, I’m not worthy,” just tell them they have what you need. If someone a few steps behind you on the journey asks you for help – don’t say “No.” Say, “I’ll try.”

The third danger—and the problem that really has no excuse—is that everyone feels too busy for a disciple-discipler relationship. When my son graduated from high school, I asked fifty men in his life to write a letter to encourage him and give advice for life. He received three letters. The biggest excuse? “I just got too busy.” When I first
moved to Toledo in 1998, I asked several area pastors if I could meet them for coffee to get to know them and to pick their brains. Not one, single pastor responded. My best guess is that they just felt too busy.

We all have the opportunity to have someone pour their life experiences into us, or to pour our life experiences into others. Every Christ-follower needs to make enough time to be mentored, and to mentor others on their spiritual journeys—because we all need it, and it’s why we’re here on earth to begin with. Taking the time to be mentored or to provide mentoring is simply a matter of changing your priorities.

For too many of us, the key element generally found missing in our spiritual development is the input, direction, and supervision of a discipler, what Christopher Adsit calls a “disciple-maker” whom “God uses to facilitate the maturing process of his children.”56 While spiritual formation may principally be the duty of the Holy Spirit, the discipler or disciple-maker is the Spirit’s “earthly instrument” in the process.57 A peer discipler/mentor can formulate a plan for growth, using the method and measurement ideas spoken of earlier in this guide and can personally assist the disciple in forward movement in spiritual development. If a method is not used, if measurement is not a part of the process, if a mentor is not employed, growth will most likely stall quickly as the disciple is left to his own devices. “Only through adhering to a tireless process of accountability, in which we are motivated and pushed to reach high standards, will we rise to the heights God intends for us to reach” says Adsit.58

The motivational assistance of a mentor, rather than simply a teacher who primarily uses lecture and non-experiential methods, can help each of us understand and embrace the “subjective value of a goal” as well as the “expectations for successful
attainment of that goal.” Barna’s research shows that, “Reliance upon a community of loving and supportive but high-minded peers in Christ is necessary if we are to make true progress in our spiritual development.” M. Robert Mulholland challenges us: “Scripture reveals that human wholeness is always actualized in nurturing one another toward wholeness. . . . [T]here can be no wholeness in the image of Christ which is not incarnate in our relationships with others. . . .” We all need others to help us become spiritually formed disciples in Christ.

Spiritual growth in Christ must be intentional and ongoing. It must be individualized and personal. It requires the supervision and oversight of a peer discipler. It must also involve ongoing assessment and evaluation to be most effective. If we can finally get a handle on the vital importance of being disciples and find workable ways in which to grow and develop as disciples, the result can be a vibrant, healthy church filled with disciples who are intentional about partnering with the Holy Spirit to become more like Christ.
Checking My Progress

A self-assessment tool to help you

take your spiritual pulse,

and create a personal plan for growth

Each of us is on a spiritual journey. Some of us have just started; some of us are still struggling to understand our life commitment to Jesus Christ; still others are mature in their faith and are seemingly well on their way in their spiritual progress. All of us can use help.

Sometimes we are not sure what to do to grow and develop in our faith and in our commitment to Christ. Sometimes we need a push in the right direction. Sometimes we wish someone would just say, “Do this,” or “Do that,” and show us exactly what to do to get our feet under us so we can walk without faltering.

Have you ever wished for a report card on your spiritual progress? Have you ever thought that it might be nice if the whole faith development thing could be explained or simplified or put in terms that would let you move ahead without wondering if you are going in the right direction?

This tool is designed to help you on your spiritual journey. Using this assessment tool, you will be able to identify where you may be in your spiritual progress in essential skills in six key elements in the life of a believer: Worshipping, Loving, Belonging, Growing, Serving, and Telling. Then, with the help of a mentor or coach, you can be instructed, challenged, and assured that you are going in the right direction.

Are you discovering Christ and the lifestyle of following him? Are you deeply involved in your development? Are you to the point that you can now master these spiritual skills, and demonstrate their understanding to others? Use this assessment tool to
help you determine where you have been successful—and where you might need some additional work. Allow your peer discipler/mentor to look over your results in order to help you design a spiritual development plan for the immediate and long-term future.

Directions:

- On the following pages, read through each statement and fill in the circle (◯) if you feel like you are OK with the statement, are in agreement with it, or have achieved mastery.
- Fill in the square (□) if you think you are not sure or if you might need some help with that statement or skill.
- Fill in the diamond (◇) if you do not understand or do not agree with that particular statement, or have not yet achieved mastery.
- On the chart that follows these statements you will find a list that corresponds with the numbered statements. For every statement that you filled in the circle (◯), place a checkmark (√) next to the statement number on the chart.
- After you have transferred the results of all the statements that have a filled-in circle (◯), take the time to highlight the number preceding all the statements on the chart that do not have a checkmark beside them.
KNOWING: it is all about knowing God personally and intimately. . .

**Worship** – Praising and Adoring God

1. When it comes to the following statements about God. . .
   - I don’t understand
   - I need some help
   - I am OK
   - I understand and believe he is a “triune God” or a Trinity, which means he is “God in Three Persons.”
   - I understand and believe that he always was, and is today, and will be forever—he is eternal.
   - I understand and believe that Jesus is God’s Son and a part of the Trinity; that he is the Savior of all who believe in him; that he is the “Word” and was present at creation; and that he is also known as the Messiah and the Christ.
   - I understand and believe that the Holy Spirit is part of the Trinity; that he is also known as the Comforter and the Counselor.

2. When it comes to the following statements about Worship. . .
   - I don’t understand
   - I need some help
   - I am OK
   - I understand what it means to worship in spirit and in truth.
   - I understand what it means to present myself as a “living sacrifice.”
   - I understand how to show reverence and respect to God.
   - I understand the meanings of thanksgiving, adoration, and praise.

3. I regularly present my life as an act of worship.
   - I don’t think so
   - I need some help
   - Yes, I do

4. I regularly praise him for who he is and what he has done, and worship him wholeheartedly.
   - I don’t think so
   - I need some help
   - Yes, I do

5. I currently demonstrate an understanding and a heart for worship, devotion, and meditation—both privately and corporately.
   - I don’t think so
   - I’m not sure
   - Yes, I do

6. I currently demonstrate an understanding of communion and baptism.
   - I don’t think so
   - I’m not sure
   - Yes, I do
LOVE – LOVING GOD AND LOVING OTHERS

7. When it comes to the following statements about the “Great Commandment” (Matt. 22:37-40)... I don’t understand □ I need some help □ I am OK □

> I understand and embrace that the most important thing in the world is to love God with everything that I am.
> I understand and embrace that just as important is that I love my neighbor and my fellow human being as much or more than I love myself.

8. When it comes to the following statement about Jesus’ “New Commandment” (John 13:34-35)... I don’t understand □ I need some help □ I am OK □

> I understand and embrace what it means to love one another as Jesus loved us.

9. I am working to love so that people see Christ in me. I don’t think so □ I need some help □ Yes, I do □

10. I regularly spend time alone with my Heavenly Father, getting to know him better every day. I don’t think so □ I need some help □ Yes, I do □

11. As evidence of my adoration, I demonstrate a love for God and for others. I don’t think so □ I need some help □ Yes, I do □

12. I have devoted myself to a life of prayer, loving God through conversations with him, and finding direction and answers from him to the questions in my life. I don’t think so □ I need some help □ Yes, I have □
**GROWING:** it is all about my inner being. . .

**BELONG – BELONGING TO THE COMMUNITY OF FAITH—THE CHURCH**

13. When it comes to the following statements about God’s plan for humanity – or, *how life was supposed to be*. . .

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◇</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

> I understand and believe that God created us to be in a loving relationship with him.
> I understand and believe that God created us to be in a loving relationship with one another.
> I understand and believe that humanity walked away from God – *which explains why life is the way it is*, and that this was the entrance of sin into the world. I further understand and believe that the effect of sin is separation from God, broken relationships, futility of life, and death.

14. When it comes to the following statements about “community” - *how life is supposed to be NOW*. . .

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◇</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

> I understand and believe that “community” is the environment in which I can best become like Jesus.
> I understand and believe that “community” is the local church, and is the hope of the world—the tool God designed to accomplish his purposes on earth.

15. I regularly live in intentional community with other Christ-followers, investing my life in them, and developing meaningful, lasting relationships.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>Yes, I do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◇</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

16. I regularly allow my brothers and sisters in Christ to help me find direction and focus, and to enable me to carry out God’s plan in my life and in the world.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>Yes, I do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◇</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

17. I have demonstrated what it means to live in community by establishing a good reputation, living out a life of example.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>Yes, I have</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◇</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

18. I am committed to loving others and being with them in community.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I’m not sure</th>
<th>Yes, I am</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◇</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GROW – GROWING TO BE MORE LIKE JESUS

19. When it comes to the following statements about “salvation”. . .

I don’t understand  □  I need some help  ◊  I am OK  ○

> I understand and believe that I’m born into eternal separation from God—causing me to naturally try to live life apart from God.
> I understand and believe that the payment for my sin is eternal death, but that Jesus paid that price for me.
> I believe that all people need Jesus Christ as their Savior.
> I believe I am saved by God’s unmerited favor through faith in Jesus.
> I understand what it means to be “saved” or “born-again.”
> I understand the concepts of confession, repentance, and becoming a New Creation.

20. When it comes to the following statements about developing as a follower of Christ. . .

I don’t understand  □  I need some help  ◊  I am OK  ○

> I understand what it means to “count the cost” and live as a disciple of Jesus.
> I believe God’s Word is true and reliable.
> I understand that my prayers are personal conversations with God.

21. I regularly seek God first – getting my priorities straight, and giving all I am to God.

I don’t think so  ◊  I need some help  □  Yes, I do  ○

22. I regularly submit to being discipled, and work to live in ways that develop the proper “fruit” in my life.

I don’t think so  ◊  I need some help  □  Yes, I do  ○

23. I currently demonstrate spiritual authenticity by submitting to being discipled, and growing towards the time I can disciple others.

I don’t think so  ◊  I’m not sure  □  Yes, I do  ○

24. I currently demonstrate knowledge of spiritual disciplines such as worship, prayer, confession, fellowship, study, fasting, tithing, and more.

I don’t think so  ◊  I’m not sure  □  Yes, I do  ○
SHOWING: it is all about living a life of witness. . .

**SERVE – SERVING GOD; SERVING OTHERS**

25. When it comes to the following statements about God’s will for me. . .

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

> I understand that I must do good works for him and for others.
> I understand and believe that faith without these good works is a lifeless faith.

26. When it comes to the following statements about spiritual gifts. . .

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

> How God gifted me helps me understand where God wants me involved.
> Every believer has one or more spiritual gifts.

27. I am committed to developing and refining my spiritual gifts for use in the church.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

28. I will seek out ways to do good works using my spiritual gifts because I want a faith that is alive and fruitful.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

29. I believe that in order to earn the right to share Christ with others, I must learn to meet felt needs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

30. I regularly show compassion to those in need.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

31. I currently surrender time and talents in service to God and the people around me by being involved in a place of meaningful service in my church.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

32. I currently sharpen my own spiritual gifts and help others develop their own.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SHOWING—part 2 . .

**TELL** — TELLING OTHERS ABOUT JESUS

33. When it comes to the following statements about Jesus’ Great Commission . . .

> Building relationships of trust is a critical first step to sharing my faith.
> I understand and believe that telling people about Jesus is my responsibility.

34. When it comes to the following statements about God’s mission to save the world . . .

> Missions involves *evangelism* = sharing the good news of Jesus with the world around me.
> Missions involves *outreach* = sharing the love of Christ through my actions and financial support.

35. I will surrender my heart to Christ’s ministry to save the world through sharing the good news.

36. I am working to live out the Great Commission, building relationships with family, friends, and neighbors.

37. I am working to share the message I have been given in my own unique, relational way.

38. I regularly help meet the needs of the world—earning the right to talk to people about Jesus.

39. I demonstrate need-meeting, relational evangelism—sharing the gospel with those around me.

40. I currently demonstrate mission mindedness by regularly participating in “hands-on” missions.

Remember: On the chart that follows find a list that corresponds with the numbered statements above. For every statement that you filled in the circle (○), place a checkmark (✓) next to that statement.
Checking My Progress—CHART

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Non-Believer to New Believer</th>
<th>New Believer to Maturing Believer</th>
<th>Maturing Believer to Role-Model of the faith</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discovering</strong></td>
<td><strong>Developing</strong></td>
<td><strong>Demonstrating</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worship</td>
<td>1. I have discovered God.</td>
<td>3. I will present my life as an act of worship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. I have discovered Word.</td>
<td>4. I will praise him for who he is and what he has done, and worship him wholeheartedly.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. I have discovered the Great Commandment.</td>
<td>5. I am demonstrating an understanding and a heart for worship—privately and corporately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8. I have discovered Jesus’ New Commandment.</td>
<td>6. I am demonstrating an understanding of communion and baptism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Love</td>
<td>9. I will love so that people see Christ in me.</td>
<td>11. I am demonstrating love for God and for others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10. I will spend time alone with my Father, getting to know him better every day.</td>
<td>12. I am demonstrating devotion to a life of prayer, loving God through my conversations with him, enabling me to find direction and answers to the questions of my life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belong</td>
<td>13. I have discovered God’s plan for humanity – how life was supposed to be.</td>
<td>17. I am demonstrating what it means to live in community: establishing a good reputation and living out a life of example.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14. I have discovered Community – how life is supposed to be NOW.</td>
<td>18. I am demonstrating that I am committed to loving others and being with them in community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grow</td>
<td>19. I have discovered the plan of salvation.</td>
<td>23. I am demonstrating spiritual authenticity, submitting to being discipled, and growing towards the time I can disciple others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20. I have discovered how to develop into an unconditional follower (disciple) of Christ.</td>
<td>24. I am demonstrating knowledge of spiritual disciplines such as worship, prayer, confession, submission, fellowship, study, service, solitude, silence, fasting, tithing, and more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serve</td>
<td>21. I will seek God first – getting my priorities straight – giving all I am to God.</td>
<td>25. I am demonstrating how to surrender time and talents in service to God and the people around me by being involved in a place of meaningful service in my local church.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>22. I will submit to being discipled, and work to live in ways that develop the proper “fruit” in my life.</td>
<td>32. I am demonstrating my awareness of spiritual giftedness by sharpening my gifts, and helping others develop their own, to excel in their places of meaningful service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Showing</td>
<td>25. I have discovered God’s will for me.</td>
<td>31. I am demonstrating how to surrender time and talents in service to God and the people around me by being involved in a place of meaningful service in my local church.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>26. I have discovered that how God gifted me helps me understand how and where God wants me to be active and involved.</td>
<td>32. I am demonstrating my awareness of spiritual giftedness by sharpening my gifts, and helping others develop their own, to excel in their places of meaningful service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tell</td>
<td>33. I have discovered the Great Commission.</td>
<td>35. I will surrender my heart to Christ’s ministry to save the world through sharing the good news - starting at home and moving out into the state, nation, and world.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>34. I have discovered the mission to save the world.</td>
<td>36. I will work diligently to live out the Great Commission, building relationships of trust and integrity with my family, friends, and neighbors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>37. I will take the message I have been given and share it with the world around me in my own unique, relational way.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>38. I will help meet the needs of the world around me – earning the right to talk to them about Jesus Christ.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

After you’ve transferred the results of all the statements that have a filled-in circle (●), take the time to highlight the number before all the statements on the above chart that do not have a checkmark beside them. Checkmarks denote mastery; highlights denote areas for growth.
Next Steps

The “Checking My Progress” chart on the previous page contains a listing of 40 “mile markers” (key behaviors or spiritual formation skills) that might be described as some basic “nuts and bolts” of a Christ-follower’s development into maturity. These 40 mile markers are by no means an exhaustive list. There may be many other skills or indicators a believer should work on attaining and mastering. These are simply some of the most recognizable and measurable for nearly every adult Christian.

The checkmarks you see represent the spiritual formation mile markers you feel you have come to understand and have begun to master. Good for you. Continue to grow in these areas.

The mile markers or skills you highlighted are the places in which you feel you may need work to come to a more full and helpful understanding of your faith. By studying these highlighted skills and working to assimilate them into your life, you should begin to feel like you are making some progress in your overall spiritual formation and understanding.

In the next chapter you’ll find some ideas on how to work to develop the skills you have yet to master. Use your Bible to study the scriptures found on the following pages. In chapter eight, work with your peer discipler to design and implement a plan of action to help you grow in some of the missing or deficient skills. Ask God to reveal himself to you as you seek to understand more about him by studying and researching these spiritually formative mile markers.

May I remind you of a very important detail? Knowledge is only one step to growth. This is not about looking up Bible verses and checking off a skill, nor is this
process a checklist to master so you can stop growing or start gloating about your maturity. Working on these spiritual formation mile markers should never be allowed to replace a personal relationship with Christ, nor should this process help you learn to “look good” or “pretend” at being a true disciple of Jesus Christ.

The self-assessment tool in chapter five is about finding some areas for development, and then spending weeks, months—perhaps years—coming to a more full understanding of your faith by studying, praying, being mentored, and interacting with other Christ-followers until you feel you are well on your way to understanding and assimilating the skill or behavior of that mile marker. This is about growing in your inner being—not becoming knowledgeable.

In addition to your Bible, pick up a book or two on the subject of the skill you’re working on and read what a church leader or teacher has to say about it. As you read and study about a skill, jot down the questions that come up, then ask your peer discipler or pastor to show you where to find the answers to your questions. Spend time in conversation with other believers about what you are discovering. Spend time in prayer asking God to show you what you need to know and feel and experience.

Use the “Checking My Progress” self-assessment tool as a starting place—a launching-off point—to new and exciting discoveries in your walk with Christ. Use a new “Checking My Progress” self-assessment each year to help determine where you feel you have grown, and where you feel you still need more growth.

Consider this your own, personal spiritual “Progress Report” and use it to point you in the right directions for your personalized study, development, and spiritual formation.
Now, let’s discover a little more about the 40 mile markers or skills in spiritual formation and discipleship so you’ll be better equipped to create a personal plan of action for your own spiritual growth.
Study Guide

This chapter will help you discover a little more about the 40 mile markers or skills in spiritual formation and discipleship—and some of the tasks that may be associated with them. The information is organized by developmental stages of Discovery, Development, and Demonstration. By working through these pages you should find some ways in which to enhance your growth as a Christ-follower.

Refer to your self-assessment, and the highlighted items on the chart that followed. Please note that topics are underlined, tasks are bolded and underlined, and Bible passages that may assist you are italicized.

Discovery Stage

If you have things to work on in this stage of spiritual development, this is where you should start. **Your principal task is to discover the fundamentals of faith in Jesus.**

NOTE: A public profession of faith generally marks the passage from non-believer to new believer. Have you accepted Jesus Christ as your Master and Savior?

Take some time to write about your conversion or your profession of faith. Do you remember the date? What do you remember about that event? Who witnessed it? Did someone “lead” you to Christ? What is your personal conversion story?
Have you been **baptized**? Write some of your thoughts about that experience.

Once you have come to faith in Christ, you should be discovering some of the following details about being a follower of Christ:

**WORSHIP**: Did you know that God can help you worship?

**LOVE**: Did you know you can love God with every fiber of your being?

**BELONG**: Did you know the church is a family where you can grow and develop?

**GROW**: Did you know you are meant to develop into the image of Christ?

**SERVE**: Did you know you were given gifts by the Holy Spirit—for a purpose?

**TELL**: Did you know that the best way people find out about Christ is from you?

What follows are some **topics**, **tasks**, and **Bible passages** that may help you grow in your faith.

**Worship—Praising and adoring God**

I have discovered God -

We believe God always was, and is, and is to come; the Eternal One.

We believe God is a Triune God or a Trinity: One God in three Persons:

God the Father; God’s name means “I AM.”

God the Son; Jesus; Messiah/Christ; Savior; Master; Lord; Word (Logos).

God the Spirit; Holy Spirit; Guide; Comforter.

*Genesis 1-3; Exodus 3:13-14; Psalm 100; Psalm 150; 2 Corinthians 13:14, John 1:1-14, 32, 7:39; John 3:16; John 14:6; John 14:16, 26, 15:26*

I have discovered Worship - **attending and participating**

Believers worship God in spirit and in truth. We present ourselves as living sacrifices. We approach God with reverence and respect, with thanksgiving, adoration, and praise.

*Matthew 2:22-23; Romans 12:1; Hebrews 12:28; Psalm 100*
Love—Loving God and loving others

I have discovered the Great Commandment: **love God and love my neighbor.**

*Matthew 22:35-40*

I have discovered Jesus’ New Commandment: **loving others as Jesus loved me.**

*John 13:34-35; John 15:12-13*

Belong—Belonging to the Community of Faith—the church

I have discovered God’s plan for humanity (how life was supposed to be) -

To be in a loving relationship with him (he walked with us).
To be in a loving relationship with one another (he made us for each other).
To be in harmony with nature (animals, plants under our dominion).

Then, the Fall (why life is the way it is) – *Genesis 1:1-4:15*
Adam and Eve gave in to temptation; sin entered the world, and its effects were death, separation, broken relationships, frustration, and futility of life.

I have discovered Community (how life is supposed to be now) -

Community is the environment in which discipleship best occurs.
The local church is the tool God designed to accomplish his purposes.
Worship Celebrations; fellowship events – **attending and participating.**
*Hebrews 10:25; John 13:34-35; Ephesians 4:14-16; John 15:12-13; Romans 8*

Grow—Growing to be more like Jesus

I have discovered the plan of salvation. **Profession made?**
The problem of sin: born into death and eternal separation from God (descendants of Adam); sinners by nature; we are self-reliant; try to live life apart from God; pride and arrogance; the wages of sin is death.
*Genesis 3:4:15; Romans 3:21-26, 5:9, 6:23; 7; 1 John 2:2 and 4:10*
Salvation of humanity planned from the beginning.
*John 1, Ephesians 1:3-11, Genesis 3:21 and 4:15*
Jesus means “the LORD saves,” or “He will save.”
*Matthew 1:21*

All people are loved by God and need Jesus Christ as their Savior.
*John 3:16, John 1:12*

We are saved by God’s unmerited favor—grace—through faith in Jesus Christ
*Ephesians 2:8-9, John 3:16, John 14:1-4*
I know what it means to be “saved” or “born-again.” **Profession made?**
- Confess—Admit *(1 John 1:9, Romans 10:9)*
- Repent – Go a new direction *(Acts 3:19)*
- New Creation—New life *(2 Corinthians 5:17)*

**Baptism as outward sign of inward faith** *(Romans 6:1-4)*

I have discovered how to develop into an unconditional follower of Christ –
- Counting the cost – **submitting to discipleship** *(Luke 14:28-33)*
- God’s Word is reliable and infallible – **starting a regular pattern of reading and study** *(2 Timothy 3:16-17, Hebrews 4:12)*
- Prayer is conversation with God – **prayer times with discipler** *(Matthew 6:5-15)*

**Serve—Serving God; serving others**

I have discovered God’s will for me -
You are God’s masterpiece, created in Christ to do good works. *Ephesians 2:8-10*

Each one of us is gifted by God for the common good of all. *1 Corinthians 12:4-7*

Christ’s church is one body made of different parts—each with a part to play. *1 Corinthians 12:12-20*

I have discovered that how God gifted me helps me understand how and where God wants me involved -
Each of us is gifted with particular spiritual gifts for the building of his church and serving in meaningful ministry. *(1 Corinthians 12, 13, and 14)*

**Spiritual Gifts Inventory, coaching, and placement.**

**Tell—Telling others about Jesus**

I have discovered the Great Commission - *(Matthew 28:18-20)*
Jesus left us with a commission. It’s something we’re all to do.

**Writing your faith story so you can prepare to share it with others.**

I have discovered the mission to save the world -
God loves humanity enough to send his Son to save us. *(John 3:16-17)*

He holds back the end of human history to give the world the chance to hear the Gospel. *(2 Peter 3:9)*

We are his ambassadors in the world. *(2 Corinthians 5:16-21)*

We will be his witnesses in our spheres of influence—and throughout our world *(Acts 1:8)*
The following scriptures can help you on your path of discovering some of the details of growing in this stage of discovery.

- Genesis 1:4-15
- Psalm 150
- Matthew 6:5-15
- Luke 14:28-33
- John 7:39
- John 15:12-13; 26
- Romans 5:9
- Romans 10:9
- 2 Corinthians 5:17
- Ephesians 1:3-11
- Hebrews 4:12
- James 2:17
- 1 John 4:10
- Exodus 3:13-14
- Matthew 1:21
- Matthew 22:35-40
- John 1
- John 13:34-35
- Acts 3:19
- Romans 6:1-4, 23
- Romans 12:1
- 2 Corinthians 13:14
- Ephesians 2:8-10
- Hebrews 10:25
- 1 John 1:9
- Psalm 100
- Matthew 2:22-23
- Matthew 28:18-20
- John 3:16
- John 14:1-6; 16; 26,
- Romans 3:21-26
- Romans 7-8
- Romans 12:1-14
- 2 Timothy 3:16-17
- Ephesians 4:14-16
- Hebrews 12:28
- 1 John 2:2

All of us have a lot to learn about these areas. Don’t be afraid to ask questions—we’ve all been in this stage, and many of us are still in this stage of growth. Sometimes, many of us will have several items in this stage that we keep struggling with for many years. We’re all here to help one another grow.

Perhaps some of the areas in this stage of spiritual development are things at which you have become pretty proficient. Maybe you’re moving on into learning some of the details of the next stage: the Development Stage.

**Development Stage**

Once you have become fairly proficient in most of the Discovery Stage, the things you will begin to work on in this new stage of spiritual development suggest that your principal task is to *develop your increasing faith in Jesus*. The following topics, tasks, and Bible passages will help you grow in your faith.
NOTE: Inherent in the following mile markers, a growing believer will:

1. **submit to being discipled**;
2. **exhibit a regular pattern of Bible Study**;
3. **possess a basic knowledge of the Bible’s structure and contents**.

**Worship**

Worship is why we were created. Our ability to worship corporately is a direct result of our ability to worship privately and personally. God is more interested in our private worship, but requires our corporate worship as well. Discuss this with your peer discipler. *(If you are working on this area, or feel you have accomplished it, you should regularly be engaging in corporate Worship Celebrations and attending prayer or worship retreats or events throughout the year.)*

*I will present my life as an act of worship. Romans 12:1*

**Active participation in worship.**

*I will praise him for who he is and what he has done, and worship him wholeheartedly. Psalm 95:1; Matthew 2:22-23*

**Private worship practices.**

**Love**

Loving God and loving people is our assignment—and it is the greatest gift from God and the highest fruit of life in the Spirit—but here is where humans have perhaps failed the most. Discuss this with your peer discipler. *(Someone working in this area should love the unlovable, embrace the lonely and forsaken, and regularly show God’s love to the world.)*

*I will love so that people see Christ in me. John 13:34-35, Galatians 2:20*

*I will spend time alone with my Father, getting to know him better every day. Prayer journal or prayer list. Mark 1:35, Luke 5:16, Matthew 6:5-15*
Belong

Discipleship cannot grow without the proper environment of true, authentic, heartfelt fellowship. There is no such thing as “private Christianity.” Discuss this with your peer discipler. *(If you are working on this area, or feel you have accomplished it, you will be in regular attendance in the life of a local church. That means more than attending Worship—but attending small groups, retreats, workshops, and other activities—being with other Christ-followers in unity and fellowship.)*

I will live in intentional community with other Christ-followers, investing my life in them and developing lasting, meaningful relationships. *Acts 2:44-47*

**Fellowship, service opportunities, attending church, becoming active in my church and being in each other’s homes.**

I will allow my brothers and sisters in Christ to help me find direction, focus, accountability, and to enable me to carry out God’s plan in my life and in the world. *Ephesians 5:21, Hebrews 10:25*

Grow

Perhaps Galatians 2:20 is the highest maturity level we can ever work on, yet never fully feel like we’ve mastered. Being like Christ should be our greatest goal throughout life—and one we should never abandon. Discuss this with your discipler. *(People working on this area or beyond it should be involved in a weekly Bible study group, small group, and actively listen and learn from sermons/messages—and remain involved in study for the rest of their lives.)*

I will seek God first—getting my priorities straight—giving all I am to God. *Galatians 2:20; Matthew 6:33*

I will submit to being discipled, and work to live in ways that develop the proper “fruit” in my life. **Participating in regular discipleship.** *Galatians 5:22-23; 2 Peter 1:3-11; John 13:34-35*
Serve

Everyone has been equipped by God to do good works to serve the people he places in our path. Serving is a natural outpouring of our faith; we serve from the overflow of gratitude and love in our hearts. Discuss this with your peer discipler. (If you are working on this area, or feel you have accomplished it, you should know and seek to develop your spiritual gifts and be active in a place of meaningful service. Annual refresher courses on spiritual gifts is considered wise and helpful.)

I will develop and refine my spiritual gifts for use in the church, because God has called Christ-followers to serve the family of God and the world.

**Spiritual Gifts refresher; coaching.** 1 Corinthians 12-14, Romans 12:3-4

I will seek out ways to do good works (Ephesians 2:10) using my spiritual gifts (1 Corinthians 12-14) because I want a faith that is alive and fruitful (James 2:17).

**Serving in meaningful ministry within the church.**

I will embrace the concept that in order to earn the right to share Christ with others, I must learn to meet their felt needs first. **Local and international mission events.**

I will show compassion to those in need. **Contribute to meeting needs.** Psalm 82:3-4, James 2:17

Tell

We possess amazingly great good news—salvation from sin, as a gift from God, resulting in eternal life with God—but, sometimes we treat it like it’s a secret. That should never happen. Jesus gave us the Great Commission to share the gospel with everyone. How do we share Jesus with others? Discuss this with your peer discipler. (If you are working on this area, or feel you have accomplished it, you should know how to talk to people about Christ, and know how to lead them to cross the line of faith.)
Personal, relational evangelism should be the norm in your life before considering yourself finished with this area.)

I will surrender my heart to Christ’s ministry to save the world through sharing the good news – starting at home and moving out into the state, nation, and world.

I will work diligently to live out the Great Commission (Matthew 28:18-20) building relationships of trust and integrity with my family, friends, and neighbors.

**Evangelism training; practice sharing verbal witness.**

I will take the message I have been given and share it with the world around me in my own unique, relational way.  

2 Corinthians 4:7, Ephesians 6:19-20  
**Listing people I know who don’t know Jesus; sharing my faith.**

I will help meet the needs of the world around me – earning the right to talk to them about Jesus Christ.  

Psalm 82:3-4  
**Inviting and including others.**

As you can see, there is great deal of developing to be done in our spiritual lives—and we never finish in this lifetime.

To help you develop, there are hundreds of retreats, workshops, and classes in your area—some in your local church, some in your state, and many throughout the country—that you should take to help you grow. Your church will help you grow and progress. **Find a mentor/coach** who will advise you on where and how to grow and stay committed to being developed for the rest of your life. **Prayer** must become a high priority and a valuable tool for your continued formation. Your Bible should become well-worn and filled with notes from **regular reading and studying.**
Read some of these scriptures to help you continue on your path of growing in this stage of developing.

*Psalm 82:3-4*  
*Malachi 3:10*  
*Mark 1:35*  
*Acts 2:44-47*  
*2 Corinthians 4:7*  
*Galatians 5:22-23*  
*1 Timothy 6:17-19*  
*Psalm 95:1*  
*Matthew 2:22-23*  
*Luke 5:16*  
*Romans 12:1-4*  
*2 Corinthians 8:7*  
*Ephesians 5:21*  
*Hebrews 10:25*  
*Psalm 121:1-2*  
*Matthew 5-7*  
*John 13:34-35*  
*1 Corinthians 12-14*  
*Galatians 2:20*  
*Ephesians 6:19-20*  
*James 2:17*

You may have things in both the **Discovery Stage** and in this **Development Stage** on which you need to work. That’s perfectly normal and expected. All of us are different, and all of us are at different places in our journey of faith.

Perhaps some of the areas in this **Development Stage** are things you’ve nearly mastered—or perhaps you’re moving on into learning some of the details of the next stage of development: the **Demonstrating Stage**.

**Demonstrating Stage**

As you work on the details of this stage of spiritual development, your principal task will be to learn to **demonstrate** what faith in Jesus Christ should be. That means, instead of merely growing and maturing—you are also teaching and role-modeling what it means to be an unconditional follower of Christ.

If you find that you’re only appearing in a few of the areas of the **Demonstrating Stage**, that’s fine—and normal. You have room to grow.

In the **Demonstrating Stage**, everything you’re doing is done with the help and supervision of a peer discipler. These skills are not only learned in personal discipleship relationships and through hands-on experience in serving others, they must also be
demonstrated publicly in your church and community, as witnessed firsthand by pastors, leaders, and disciplers.

The following are all worded as tasks because they all are “demonstrations.” Use the Bible passages to help you delve more deeply.

NOTE: To truly move into the maturity level of a role-model, many pastors and church leaders believe a Christ-follower will commit to being a tither. (Matthew 5:1-7, 6:33, 23:23; 1 Timothy 6:17-19; Malachi 3:10; Exodus 14:18-20; 2 Corinthians 8:7.)

Worship: Surrendering your life to the adoration of God

I am demonstrating an understanding and a heart for worship, devotion, and meditation—privately and corporately. HebreWS 6:19-20


Love: Living out Christ’s Great Commandment in your world

I am demonstrating love for God and for others. 1 John 4:10-12; Mark 12:28-31; John 15:9-14

I am demonstrating devotion to a life of prayer, loving God through my conversations with him, and finding direction and answers to the questions of my life. Psalm 66:16-20

Belong: Developing lasting relationships in the Community of Faith

I am demonstrating what it means to live in community—establishing a good reputation and living out a life of example. Proverbs 3:3-4; John 15:11; John 15:34-35; John 13; Philippians 4:5; Philippians 2:3-4

I am demonstrating that I am committed to loving others. Acts 2:42-47; John 13:34-35; John 15:12-13
Grow: Following in Christ’s footsteps—becoming more like him

I am demonstrating spiritual authenticity, submitting to being discipled, and growing towards the time I can disciple others.

Peter 1:3-11; Philippians 4:6-7; Hebrews 5:12-14; Titus 2:11-13

I am demonstrating knowledge of the spiritual disciplines such as worship, celebration, submission, fellowship, study, prayer, service, confession, solitude, silence, fasting, frugality, tithing, secrecy, and sacrifice.

Serve: Engaging in meaningful ministry to God and others

I am demonstrating how to surrender time and talents in service to God and the people around me by being involved in a place of meaningful service in the local church.

Colossians 3:17, 1 Corinthians 12-14, 1 Thessalonians 5:15

I am demonstrating my awareness of spiritual giftedness by sharpening my gifts, and helping others develop their own, to excel in their places of meaningful service.

Tell: Sharing the Good News of Christ

I am demonstrating need-meeting, relational evangelism - sharing the gospel with the world around me.

I am demonstrating mission mindedness by regularly participating in “hands-on” outreach through a local or global mission effort.

Matthew 28:18-20

If you are one of the few who have all 40 mile markers in all of the three stages complete and assimilated well into your life, there is something important to remember: you have not yet arrived! Read Philippians 3:12-16. There are still many, many ways in which you can grow. Visit with your peer discipler about next steps.

Most Christ-followers find themselves with a few undeveloped or unfinished skills or mile markers scattered throughout all three stages of development—discovering new things about faith, developing and growing in foundational areas, and learning to
demonstrate to others what this life in Christ is all about. This is normal. It just shows that you have more to do to grow into the likeness of Jesus Christ.
Developing a Plan of Action for Growing as a Disciple

Now that you’ve identified some of the areas in which you’ve grown, and some of the areas in which you need growth, it’s time to make a personal plan of action to help you. There are a few key tools all Christ-followers can use to grow. Review them below before you begin creating a plan of action:

God’s Word

Regular, intentional study of the Bible is important in the life of every growing believer. Daily personal study, recreational reading, and research in an organized, intentional Bible Study are all important ways to be getting into God’s Word.

Prayer

Christ-followers are children of God. Children express their fears and their joys, ask questions and ask for favors, and generally hold heartfelt conversations with their Father every day. Prayer is conversation with your Father.

Worship

The ability for us to worship grows out of worshipping God every chance we get. Personal, private worship helps us connect to our Father to tell him how much we love and adore him. When we learn to worship personally and privately, the worship experience of the entire church is greatly enhanced.

Community

Christ-followers grow most effectively in community. In fact, it’s very difficult to grow and develop as a believer in Christ without others around you helping. There’s no
such thing as private Christianity, and the community of believers provides the environment in which discipleship best occurs. Spending time in a weekly small group or Bible Study is critical. Attending church activities to help develop new friendships is vital. In addition, taking part in workshops and retreats will give you the people and the advice you need around you to challenge you, build you up, and hold you accountable.

Discipline

Spiritual formation is about growing your inner being to be more like Jesus Christ. This is done best in a discipling relationship with a peer discipler/mentor. This challenging person in your life will help grow you by asking tough questions, making suggestions, giving assignments, and coaching you in acquiring the needed spiritual “skills” to be more like Christ.

These are the essential tools you’ll need as you develop your plan of action for spiritual growth and formation. With these in mind, you’re ready to begin developing your plan.
Designing the Plan

Start by spending time asking God where he wants you to grow. In the space below, write down your thoughts and impressions, and use them as a guide for your planning.

Using the “Checking My Progress” chart found after your self-assessment tool, find one (1) mile marker or skill you highlighted for each of the six content categories: Worship, Love, Belong, Grow, Serve, and Tell. The goal here is to find the highlighted skill with the lowest listed number (1 versus 4, or 4 versus 12) in each of the six content categories. (If all of the mile markers in the Discovering Stage are already checked, find one of the markers in the Development Stage list; if they are all checked, find one in the
list of the Demonstrating Stage.) Again, select one for each content category of **Worship, Love, Belong, Grow, Serve,** and **Tell.** These are the first things you will begin to research and develop. Write these in the following chart.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content Category</th>
<th>Mile Marker (Key Behavior or Skill)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>WORSHIP</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LOVE</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BELONG</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GROW</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SERVE</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TELL</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Look back at the areas you have checked on the “Checking My Progress” chart to see if there are any you’d like to re-visit or strengthen. Write those below. You can work on these as you work on the mile markers you’ve listed above.
Now, as you begin to plan how to research, study, experience, and practice each of these skills, it’s time to ask for guidance and assistance in your spiritual development.

Prayer

Commit your study, research, and growth to the Lord. Ask him what he wishes you to learn. Determine through your prayer times if the markers you have highlighted match up with what God desires for you. If so, commit to the Lord that you will work to grow in your knowledge and understanding of him with your whole heart.

Introspection

Now it is time for some meditation and contemplation in the Lord’s presence. What are some of the old habits that get in the way of you having quality devotional time and times of growth with God? Write them down below.

How can you get rid of those old habits? What are some of the new habits you need to form in order to have important, daily time with God? Write down some ideas below.
*Input from other Christ-followers*

Ask your Christian friends to help you identify any areas of your life that may get in the way of you progressing in your relationship with Christ. Write their input below.

Ask your peer discipler/mentor what suggestions he/she may have for developing spiritually.
**Bible Study**

What obstacles stand in the way of you studying the Bible? What things keep you from being in his Word each day? Write down those obstacles below.

What can you do to remove those obstacles? How can you begin to immerse yourself in God’s Word?
My Plan of Action for Spiritual Formation  

Date: ____________

*Read through what you have written on the previous pages. Work to formulate it all into a plan of action below.*

I will commit the following time to the Lord:
- ________ minutes per ________ for my devotional time;
- ________ minutes per ________ for my study time.

I commit to working on the following spiritual mile markers or skills this year:

#  
#  
#  
#  
#  
#  

I commit to getting rid of the following habits that hinder me:

I commit to starting these new habits that will support my spiritual development:

I commit to spending quality time in conversation with my Heavenly Father. ☐ Yes

I commit to doing all I can to grow into the likeness of my Savior, Jesus. ☐ Yes

I commit to working regularly with a mentor or discipler. ☐ Yes

Make a copy of your plan of action, and place it where you will see it every day. Ask God, and your peer discipler, for help in accomplishing it. Remember that this is just a starting point—not the end; it is a launching pad—not the destination. The mile markers (key behaviors or spiritual formation skills) you have chosen to develop are there to help you move in a positive direction.

May God richly bless you on your continuing journey to be more like Christ.
Endnotes for
*Mile Markers—Method, Measurement, and Mentoring in Christian Discipleship*
A Guide for Disciples

1 See Galatians 5:22.

2 Martin Johnson, “Key Behaviors and Milestones in Adult Discipleship—Fashioning Intentionality, Personalization, Oversight, and Assessment,” doctoral dissertation, WTS, Findlay, OH, January 28, 2015. “[A]dult Christians are unsure of what to do” is a shortened version of the author’s dissertation project’s *Statement of the Problem*, while “study is needed to discover key behaviors that may be effective in re-establishing spiritual growth and vitality” is a shortened version of the author’s *Purpose of the Study*, two critical elements providing impetus to the study.


4 2 Corinthians 5:17; Galatians 2:20.


8 Ogden, *Discipleship Essentials*, 7.


10 Consider the book of James, especially 1:19-25 and 2:14-26.


12 The origin of this saying could not be found.
This saying, in many variations, has been attributed to Charles Edward “Easy Ed” Macauley (1928–2011). In 1960, at age 32, Macauley was the youngest male player to be admitted to the Naismith Memorial Basketball Hall of Fame, a distinction he still holds today.

The origin of this saying could not be found.


2 Peter 1:9-10, [NIV]. This researcher uses The NIV Study Bible, 10th Anniversary Edition (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1999) throughout, unless otherwise noted.


Peterson, A Long Obedience in the Same Direction, 17.

2 Peter 1:3-9.


Mulholland, Invitation to a Journey, 19.

This saying has been attributed to many people, including Joseph P. Kennedy and Knute Rockne. Research has not uncovered a definitive origin.

Nietzsche, Friedrich. Götzen-Dämmerung, oder, Wie man mit dem Hammer Philosophiert [Twilight of the Idols, or, How to Philosophize with a Hammer]. Translated by Duncan Large. New York: Oxford University Press, 2009, n.p. The actual quote, in English, is: “From life’s school of war: what does not kill me makes me stronger.” It has been paraphrased in many different ways: “That which does not kill us, makes us stronger” is perhaps the paraphrase in widest use.


29 Foster, *Celebration of Discipline*, 1.


31 2 Peter 1:3-9.


33 2 Peter 1:8.

34 Barna, *Growing True Disciples*, 111.

35 2 Peter 1:5 and 10.


37 Ibid.


39 2 Peter 1:8-10.

40 Peterson, *A Long Obedience in the Same Direction*, 17.

41 Galatians 2:20.

42 John 15:5.


Ibid.


Spiros Zodhiates, ed. *Hebrew-Greek Key Word Study Bible-NIV* (Chattanooga: AMG Publishers, 1997), 1531.


Ibid., 17.


Michael J. Wilkins, “The Concept of Disciple in Matthew’s Gospel: As Reflected in the Use of the Term Ἰησοῦς.” *Supplements to Novum Testamentum* (Leiden, The Netherlands: E. J. Brill, 1988). It should be noted that Wilkins prefers the transliteration *talmidh* compared to Vander Laan’s *talmid*.

Wilkins, “The Concept of Disciple,” 146.


Ibid., 956-957.


Ibid.

Ibid.


Mulholland, *Invitation to a Journey*, 17.
Bibliography for
*Mile Markers—Method, Measurement, and Mentoring in Christian Discipleship*
A Guide for Disciples


APPENDIX K:

HANDBOOK FOR PEER DISCIPLERS
Appendix K: A Handbook for Peer Disciplers

Mapping the Route

Discipling others using
Method, Measurement, and Mentoring

A Handbook for Peer Disciplers

Martin Johnson
This handbook is dedicated . . .

. . . to disciplers everywhere, who want to help others grow in their faith in the Master, Jesus, but are unsure of where to start, how to counsel, or how to design a personal plan of growth.

*And the things you have heard me say in the presence of many witnesses entrust to reliable people who will also be qualified to teach others.* (2 Timothy 2:2)
Contents

Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 378

ONE
  Missing Pieces ............................................................................................................. 382

TWO
  Method to the Madness ............................................................................................... 384

THREE
  Measuring What is Important ..................................................................................... 389

FOUR
  Mentoring for Life Change ......................................................................................... 393

FIVE
  Knowing How to Use the “Checking My Progress” Self-Assessment Tool .............. 399
  Spiritual Progress Record ............................................................................................ 408

SIX
  Next Steps in Discipling .............................................................................................. 415

SEVEN
  Using the Study Guide ................................................................................................. 419

EIGHT
  Understanding and Utilizing a Plan of Action in Discipleship .................................. 431
Introduction

You have chosen, or are considering, the vitally important and rewarding task of discipling another to be a better disciple of Jesus Christ. Some time ago, an adult Christ-follower asked this question: “How do I know if I am growing in Christ?” It’s a simple enough question, but a question with a fairly difficult and potentially illusive answer. This person also asked: Isn’t there some kind of ‘report card’ I can get from God—here and now—instead of waiting until it’s too late?”

Perhaps you have asked similar questions in your walk with Christ. Perhaps you have found people asking questions like these, yet had concerns about what they should do first. The reality in Christ’s church in North America is that most adult Christians do not know what Christlike behaviors or skills they should be discovering, developing, and demonstrating in their lives; most do not know how to assess forward movement in their faith; and nearly everyone needs—even if they do not at first realize it—someone to walk with them to show them the way.

This handbook is written as a companion to the *Mile Markers* guide for disciples, a helpful study guide for adult disciples who wish to grow and develop in their Christian faith. I strongly suggest that you read that book first. Without reading *Mile Markers* guide for disciples, this handbook will not make much sense. This handbook, *Mapping the Route*, builds on the contents of that book, and the two works are meant to become the 2-volume reference set for discipling adult Christ-followers.
Through the years, I have asked fellow pastors about their thoughts on the subject of discipleship, spiritual formation, and development as a Christian. I painfully discovered the unfortunate truth that no two pastors can agree on what constitutes spiritual growth and formation. We can’t agree how discipleship should be done. In my reading and research through the years, I have found volumes of advice, slogans, and jargon, but very little in the way of real help. What are the key behaviors Christ-followers should exhibit? Is there any way of identifying these behaviors or skills? Can they be measured? How do we go about assessing something as personal and fluid as “spiritual growth?”

An even bigger question might be, “Who will do the discipling?” It is possible, in our modern day and age, with our population growing and our church memberships shrinking, that there may not be enough mature Christians in the church today to disciple all of the less-mature Christians. The only way this can work is if we disciple one, then another, then another, with each of them discipling one, then another, then another. It can’t be addition, it can’t even be multiplication; this has to be about exponential discipleship. Simply put—we want to make disciples who in turn want to make disciples who in turn want to make disciples. The process is ongoing and self-perpetuating and results in exponential growth rather than simple addition or multiplication. Look at the following table. Which is better?
In twenty years, one disciple who makes a new disciple every year, who has each of those disciples make one disciple every year has made a grand total of no less than 524,288 disciples. That sounds like a workable plan. Let’s take it further:

- Twenty-five years = 16,777,216 (Compared to 25 by addition or 48 by multiplication.)
- Thirty years = 536,870,912 (Yes – that’s 536 million compared to 30 by addition or 58 by multiplication.)
- Thirty-five years = 17,179,869,184 (17 billion compared to 35 by adding or 68 by multiplying.)
- Forty years = 549,755,813,888 (We’re talking half a trillion disciples compared to 40 or 78!)

The good news is that as of 2015, there are slightly more than 7 billion people in the world. If we disciple people exponentially—starting now—we can reach the entire world population somewhere between 2045 and 2050. It can be done . . . but it starts with you. If we find a new or better way to disciple, there will be enough disciplers to get the job done. What we need now is a process that works.
The initial assessment found in the *Mile Markers* guide for disciples allows you to develop a personalized plan for every distinct disciple which whom you work. Using that personalized plan, using the assessment tool on an annual basis, and using a record page found at the end of this handbook, you and the disciple are able to monitor progress in spiritual formation and development. You are able to encourage and hold accountable those you disciple.

A standardized list of key behaviors or “mile markers” for growth may seem a bit contrived, but the alternative is no assistance at all. Using an assessment tool and building a personalized plan of action is a tall order, but our alternative is stagnant and atrophied lives of faith filling stagnant and atrophied churches. Adult Christians are unsure of what to do, so the use of key behaviors can be effective in establishing (or re-establishing) spiritual growth and vitality. Adult Christians need to know if they’re on the right track, so the use of the assessment tool will help them—and you—map out a plan of action. This handbook, and its accompanying discipleship records pages, will help you help others grow to be more like Jesus Christ.
**Missing Pieces**

The best place to start is always the beginning. The beginning is to state these irreducible and inescapable facts: Many adult Christians in the North American church are having difficulties exhibiting growth as disciples of Christ. As a result, Christ’s church is lacking in spiritual vibrancy. As a church, we are missing the quality of *intentionality* in discipleship—being purposeful about the critical task of growth and development. We are missing the *personalization* needed in helping individuals grow up in Christlikeness. We are missing ongoing *oversight*—supervision and guidance for the journey, as well as any method of *evaluation* or assessment of our journey of faith.

Many adult Christians in America want and need the knowledge of how to grow. They want and need an awareness of the activities in which they should engage. They want and need a well-defined, personalized program of study. They want and need an effective means of measuring their spiritual progress. We all have our work cut out for us.

**Method**

In Chapter Two, entitled “Method to the Madness,” you will find 40 key behaviors or “mile markers” that guide us in growth. You’ll also learn about *intentionality* and *personalization* as vital elements in growing as a Christ-follower.

**Measurement**

In Chapter Three, entitled “Measuring what is Important,” you will discover the details of why measurement is important, and how measurement can help with both *intentionality* and *personalization*.
Mentoring

In Chapter Four, entitled “Mentoring for Life Change,” you will learn more about your task as a peer discipler, and why your ministry is essential in growing adult disciples, and, in turn, growing Christ’s church.
Method to the Madness

I’ve entitled this handbook for peer disciplers’ *Mapping the Route* to correspond with the guide for disciples, *Mile Markers*. The “mile markers” are the key behaviors or spiritual formation skills you will use to “map the route,” designing personalized plans of action for intentional spiritual growth for those you disciple. The mile markers of the journey toward Christlikeness help you know if you’re on the right path; knowing how to navigate that path is part of the peer discipler’s task—helping the adult disciple make headway on their journey.

As mentioned before, the process of discipleship requires *intentionality*—we have to do it on purpose, it does not happen by accident. This process must also be *personalized*—an individual’s approach to growing can build on their personality and giftedness, but it absolutely must be tailor-made to where each person is deficient in their spiritual development. There should be regular assessments and *evaluations* to make sure each person is making forward progress, and your personal *supervision* and oversight help the adult disciple take the proper next steps and stay on the path. Intentionality, personalization, evaluation, and supervision: these make up our “Method.”

I believe it’s possible—even beneficial—to identify standardized ingredients to growth, such as worship, prayer, serving, and Bible study. What then must happen is for these key behaviors to be tailored to each individual, adult believer. The “mile markers” we’ll discover in this chapter are at the center of the Method; these key behaviors of a disciple really are a standardized skill-set for all adult disciples—but how we employ them or emphasize them must be individualized to the specific learner. The mile markers
show what we should be doing (standardized skills for all adult disciples); they also help you know how best to help disciple the individual (individualized to a specific disciple).

My research identified forty mile markers that help us know where we should be growing as Christ-followers. A focus group of church leaders helped to establish how these forty mile markers (key behaviors) fit under six broad content categories that help define the church and our actions as Christ-followers. Those content categories are:

- Worship: praising and adoring God
- Love: loving God and loving others
- Belong: belonging to the community of faith—the church
- Grow: growing to be more like Jesus Christ
- Serve: serving God and serving others
- Tell: telling others the Good News of salvation through Christ

The first two, Worship and Love, have to do with those things that are God-focused, and speak to our knowing God. The second two, Belong and Grow, have to do with those things that are about edifying us internally, and speak to our growing in Christ. The final two, Serve and Tell, have to do with those things that are aimed at the world around us for sharing the Good News of Christ, and speak to how we are showing Christ to the world. The list of mile markers (key behaviors) is also organized under three broad developmental categories that show a continuum in spiritual development in the life of a Christ-follower:

- Non-believer to new believer—the discovering stage
- New believer to maturing believer—the developing stage
- Maturing believer to role-model of the faith—the demonstrating stage

Please be careful to note that this continuum from non-believer to role model does not suggest stages of growth or classes of Christians—they show a continuum of growth.
Please study the following chart of the developmental progression of the mile markers of Christian discipleship.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Developmental Progression</th>
<th>Non-Believer to New Believer</th>
<th>New Believer to Maturing Believer</th>
<th>Maturing Believer to Role-Model of the faith</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discovering</strong></td>
<td>I have discovered God’s plan for humanity – how life was supposed to be. I have discovered Community - how life is supposed to be NOW.</td>
<td>I will live in intentional community with other Christ followers, investing my life in them and developing lasting, meaningful relationships. I will allow my brothers and sisters in Christ to help me find direction, focus, accountability, and to enable me to carry out God’s plan in my life and in the world.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating what it means to live in community-establishing a good reputation and living out a life of example. I am demonstrating that I am committed to loving others and being with them in community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Worship</strong></td>
<td>I have discovered the Great Commandment. I have discovered Jesus’ New Commandment.</td>
<td>I will love so that people see Christ in me. I will spend time alone with my Father, getting to know him better every day.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating love for God and for others. I am demonstrating devotion to a life of prayer, loving God through my conversations with him, enabling me to find direction and answers to the questions of my life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Love</strong></td>
<td>I have discovered God’s plan for humanity – how life was supposed to be. I have discovered Community - how life is supposed to be NOW.</td>
<td>I will live in intentional community with other Christ followers, investing my life in them and developing lasting, meaningful relationships. I will allow my brothers and sisters in Christ to help me find direction, focus, accountability, and to enable me to carry out God’s plan in my life and in the world.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating what it means to live in community-establishing a good reputation and living out a life of example. I am demonstrating that I am committed to loving others and being with them in community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Growing</strong></td>
<td>I have discovered God’s plan for humanity – how life was supposed to be. I have discovered Community - how life is supposed to be NOW.</td>
<td>I will live in intentional community with other Christ followers, investing my life in them and developing lasting, meaningful relationships. I will allow my brothers and sisters in Christ to help me find direction, focus, accountability, and to enable me to carry out God’s plan in my life and in the world.</td>
<td>I am demonstrating what it means to live in community-establishing a good reputation and living out a life of example. I am demonstrating that I am committed to loving others and being with them in community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developmental Progression – <em>continued</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Non-Believer to New Believer</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discovering</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have discovered the plan of salvation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have discovered how to develop into an unconditional follower (disciple) of Christ.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>New Believer to Maturing Believer</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Developing</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I will seek God first – getting my priorities straight – giving all I am to God.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I will submit to being discipled, and work to live in ways that develop the proper “fruit” in my life.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Maturing Believer to Role-Model of the faith</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Demonstrating</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am demonstrating spiritual authenticity, submitting to being discipled, and growing towards the time I can disciple others.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am demonstrating knowledge of spiritual disciplines such as worship, prayer, confession, submission, fellowship, study, service, solitude, silence, fasting, tithing, and more.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Growing** |
| I have discovered God’s will for me. |
| I have discovered that how God gifted me helps me understand how and where God wants me to be active and involved. |

| **Serve** |
| I will develop and refine my spiritual gifts for use in the church, because God has called Christ-followers to serve the family of God and the world. |
| I will seek out ways to do good works using my spiritual gifts because I want a faith that is alive and fruitful. |
| I will embrace the concept that in order to earn the right to share Christ with others, I must learn to meet their felt needs first. |
| I will show compassion to those in need. |

| **Showing** |
| I have discovered the Great Commission. |
| I have discovered the mission to save the world. |

| **Tell** |
| I will surrender my heart to Christ’s ministry to save the world through sharing the good news - starting at home and moving out into the state, nation, and world. |
| I will work diligently to live out the Great Commission, building relationships of trust and integrity with my family, friends, and neighbors. |
| I will take the message I have been given and share it with the world around me in my own unique, relational way. |
| I will help meet the needs of the world around me – earning the right to talk to them about Jesus Christ. |

| **Tell** |
| I am demonstrating need-meeting, relational evangelism - sharing the gospel with the world around me. |
| I am demonstrating mission-mindedness by regularly participating in “hands-on” outreach through local or global mission efforts. |
A person’s conversion to faith in Christ is presumed in this developmental progression; it is a step taken prior to the behaviors listed, and prior to continued growth in Christlikeness. Other aspects of church-life such as baptism, communion, and/or church membership are not addressed since these may be quite different for each church situation, however, they may be added in as dictated by your specific church by-laws or beliefs.

You will notice that the mile markers do not specifically assign tasks that need to be accomplished, such as taking a spiritual gifts inventory or finding a place of meaningful service although they may infer some tasks or activities that could be undertaken for spiritual development. Some of those tasks are included in Chapter Six, “Next Steps in Discipling,” and on the records page found at the end of Chapter Five, “Knowing How to Use the ‘Checking My Progress’ Self-Assessment Tool.”

There is work to be done. We’ve identified a Method that can help us which includes intentionality, personalization, evaluation, and supervision. We’ve also identified mile markers or key behaviors that help describe a growing disciple. The other needful ingredients are Measurement and Mentoring.
Measuring What is Important

Measuring what is important is a key to success in leading and teaching adults. Measuring how many bible passages get memorized may not be all that important for discipleship, but measuring the quality of your bible study may be. Measuring what is important in spiritual growth and development is important because it lets us know if we’re doing well in our spiritual development. Peter gives us a simple measuring tool: “[I]f you possess these qualities in increasing measure, they will keep you from being ineffective and unproductive in your knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ. . . . [I]f you do these things, you will never stumble. . . .” (2 Peter 1:8, 10)

Work on your spiritual life, be effective, productive, and never stumble, these are things we can see and measure today. Then Peter adds another measure that we’ll understand in eternity: “receive a rich welcome into the eternal kingdom of Christ” (2 Peter 1:11).

As you disciple adult followers of Christ, a first step is to determine if they have, in fact, crossed the line of faith from lost and wandering to redeemed by Christ and saved. Once that determination is made, you can rest in the assurance that the eternal measure is on track because of Christ’s work on the cross. Your concern now becomes the day-to-day work of “possessing these qualities in increasing measure” and becoming and remaining effective and productive and never stumbling in faith. These are the aspects you must work to measure and evaluate if you’re to help those you disciple.

In the previous chapter we found that our method involves intentionality and personalization. The work of a peer discipler is to help those we disciple to approach their work of growing in Christ with intention, meaning, and purpose. Peer disciplers
must also work in such a way that the discipleship process is tailor-made for each
disciple; personalized and customized for the individual.

Part of the method is to utilize “mile markers”—key behaviors and/or skills that
help us define and describe the Christian life—so we can help adult disciples measure
how they’re doing in their spiritual growth. If they don’t know where they’re going, how
will they ever know that they get there? If there is no clear way to measure progress, how
does anyone know if disciples of Christ are actually making headway?

Chapter Five, “Knowing How to use the ‘Checking My Progress’ Self-Assessment Tool,” helps explain how to employ the assessment tool to help adult
disciples find where they have been successful in spiritual development, and where they
need additional help. This evaluative tool is the centerpiece of measuring progress.
Chapter Six, “Next Steps in Discipling,” helps you take what you have found in the
assessment tool and find opportunities and likely steps for growth for those you disciple.
Chapters Seven and Eight will help you and your adult disciples develop personalized
plans of action.

It’s all about measuring what is important. A cup of sugar in the batter makes a
much better cake than a tablespoon of sugar. A pinch of salt is not the same as a fist of
salt. Measurement is important—but so is what it is we’re measuring. A teaspoon of
vanilla extract is very different than a teaspoon of vinegar. Measurement is important—
and what we measure is important. It is possible to use the mile markers to measure how
our adult disciples are doing in their journey toward Christlikeness. It is strongly
recommended to assess how an adult disciple is doing at the outset of discipleship, and
then re-assess their progress and growth every 6-12 months to evaluate their mastery of those behaviors or skills.

The self-assessment tool in Chapter Five helps evaluate spiritual progress in six key content areas in the life of a believer: **Worshipping, Loving, Belonging, Growing, Serving,** and **Telling.**

The first section of the self-assessment is about **knowing** God—it’s all about knowing God personally and intimately; it’s where we find questions and declarative statements about Worshipping and Loving—the *upward* aspect of our spiritual journey. The second section of the self-assessment is about **growing** in your faith and in community; it’s where we find the Belonging and Growing questions and statements—the *inward* aspect of Christian spirituality. The third section is about **showing** your faith and the love of Christ in the world—living a life of witness—with Serving and Telling questions and statements showing the *outward* aspect of a vibrant, growing faith in Christ.

Help your adult disciples follow the instructions in Chapter Five, then transfer their results to the chart that follows, what you end up with is a starting place for designing personalized plans of action for those you are discipling.

Please remember—and remind your adult disciples: the self-assessment is *not* a test. There are no right or wrong answers; you cannot pass it or fail it. This is a personalized self-assessment tool, and everyone’s results will be very different. That’s what we want; different results mean personalization. The key is that it is *self*-assessment, and that the assessment will be used in conjunction with the one-on-one interaction you will provide as the peer discipler. Don’t let the assessment cause anxiety; the assessment
is a starting place to more fully create a personalized plan of action. (Please note: it is very likely some may feel they have done poorly on the assessment; encourage them. If they think they’re already failed, then they won’t commit to the hard work. It is just as likely that some people may feel they have done very well on the assessment, and may think they are “super-Christian;” reign in that attitude. If they have no room for improvement, then they won’t think there’s anything more to be done.)

Some of the statements on the self-assessment may not make sense at first; some statements that you want to be on the list won’t be there; some statements that are on the list might be things you simply don’t think belong on the list. That’s alright: this is a starting place. Together, you and your disciple can iron out all the kinks.

Chapter Five’s self-assessment tool may not provide a perfectly accurate picture of the reality of your adult disciples’ spiritual progress—but as long as you and they are being relatively objective and relatively consistent, this tool will help you get them started, and subsequent evaluations and your ongoing one-on-one interactions will assist in determining whether progress is being made. What is certain is that without regular and consistent evaluation, there is a danger of losing sight of the goal, and ultimately failing to grow in faith. Measuring what is important will help us grow and help us know how and where we are growing. Chapters Six through Eight will provide even more detailed instructions on how to use the knowledge gleaned from the self-assessment.
Mentoring for Life Change

Mentors, advisors, coaches, teachers, disciplers; they don’t necessarily know more, they just know how to help others become more than they could on their own. That’s a good definition of a peer discipler: helping others go further or do better than they can by themselves.

A peer discipler is a mentor; they’re also a coach, and a counselor of sorts. The term “mentor” perhaps best sums up the activities of a peer discipler, but I feel it is critical to remember the aspect of “peer” in the discipleship process because peer disciplers/mentors aren’t always experts in spiritual growth, they’re just a few experiences ahead of those they mentor or disciple.

Everyone needs mentors. We need them in our finances, in our careers, in our education, and in our relationships. We also need them in our spiritual development. Why? Because the stark reality is, we can’t—or won’t—do it on our own. We need help, training, advice, and someone to turn to when we’re not sure what to do next.

We need assistance and counsel with our spiritual lives. Like an apprentice to a silversmith, a farrier, or a cooper who learns at the side of the journeyman craftsman, a disciple learns by observation and imitation at the side of a peer discipler/mentor—you—who is serving as the stand-in for our Lord and Master, Jesus. No one grows in a vacuum. No one grows without introspection. No one grows without a teacher, discipler, coach, or mentor.

In Luke 9:23 we can get a sense of Jesus’ concise and clear-cut instructions on how to live as a disciple: “If anyone would come after me, he must deny himself and take up his cross daily and follow me.” Inherent in this passage are descriptions of what it
means to be one of his disciples, and what your job description might be as a mentor and peer discipler:

1. “Come after.” A disciple makes a determination: she searches, discovers, and follows the Master. This is no mere spiritual “seeking,” this is determined, reasoned, decisive action. **As a mentor, you exhibit this same kind of determination, modeling this behavior and both instilling and calling out the intentional commitment to ongoing spiritual growth.**

2. “Deny himself.” A disciple surrenders his will in deference to and preference for the Master’s will. This is not some form of asceticism whereby he does without some pleasure or desire for a time or even for a lifetime; this is about opting—purposefully and preferentially—for Christ’s plans instead of his own. **As a mentor, role modeling is critical; there is no replacement for living out what it is you are asking of your adult disciples. You must prefer—and choose—to follow the Master’s will and purpose.**

3. “Take up his cross.” For disciples the “cross” signifies they are willing to walk beside him on the road of obedience—even suffering—to the end of their days, and that they are willing to die to themselves. The cross is not a metaphor for dealing with troubles in life, nor is it a literal requirement of carrying a cross to show some form of membership or obedience. The cross is both a symbol and a mindset: “I have been crucified with Christ and I no longer live, but Christ lives in me. The life I live in the body, I live by faith in the Son of God, who loved me and gave himself for me” (Galatians 2:20). A **mentor does more than carry or wear the “bling” of Christianity: a Bible and a cross around the neck; a mentor chooses to live a Christ-centered and cross-focused lifestyle. This is not possible the Holy Spirit’s help.**

4. “Daily.” It is not a one-time decision, it is an everyday decision. Salvation does not need to be renewed daily, nor does one’s position in Christ, but the decision and determination to deny oneself and carry the cross in obedience to the Master is a daily occurrence. The world continually vies for the disciple’s allegiance, her heart always seeks its own desires, the enemy quietly invades her defenses, and unless she is daily working on moving forward, she is slowly and inexorably losing hard-won ground. **That’s part of the job of the mentor/peer discipler: regular interaction with those you are mentoring. Perhaps talking with them “daily” is not possible; certainly speaking or meeting with your adult disciples weekly is doable.**

5. “Follow me.” This is more than walking along behind. It is finding what Jesus did and doing it. It is learning his style and emulating it. It is hearing and studying his words then echoing them. It involves falling in behind him and walking in his footsteps, doing and being just like the Master. **Emulating the Master, echoing the Master, walking in the footsteps of the Master: an excellent description of the work of one who mentors others to be like Jesus.**
Jesus poured himself into those who walked beside him—the mark of a true discipler-disciple relationship. He taught them, showed them, led them, mentored them, and positioned them to continue his ministry and mission to the world. The point is—none of us should try to do it all alone.

In New Testament times, we see evidence of discipleship relationships in many areas of life. Young men would apprentice under skilled craftsmen or laborers, many times learning the skills of a family endeavor such as herding flocks, carpentry, or farming, but at times learning a trade under the mentoring of a master. Those who wanted to pursue training in religious studies would seek out a rabbi (teacher) under whose tutelage the young disciples would gain knowledge and experience. To study under a rabbi was a chosen lifestyle, and the disciples went in search of the best rabbi under whom they could apprentice. It should be carefully pointed out that as a mentor/peer discipler, you are not the master who has taken on disciples; you are serving as Christ’s ambassador, helping others grow to be like him. The fact that Christian disciples will never attain to the level of their Master does not mean that Christian disciples do not teach other disciples. Jesus’ own words in the Great Commission tell us to teach them (other) to obey everything he commanded. What has been missing in American churches are those willing to do the peer discipling, and a working method with which to do the hard work of discipling others to be like Jesus.

Jesus taught his disciples to follow, to watch, listen, learn—and emulate. He taught them to teach others using the same techniques: be with, walk beside, spend time, share space, serve together, suffer collectively, copy, and then model. Yet, Jesus was less a teacher of his disciples and more of a man hard at work allowing others to witness what
he was doing. Jesus was a teacher, to be sure, but he was always turning experiences and teachable moments into life lessons that would ultimately change the world through those who were watching and learning. This is your calling as a peer discipler. Every Christ-follower will benefit from having a mentor (peer discipler) who is a few steps ahead of them on the journey towards Christlikeness.

There are three danger areas about which I wish to caution you:

1. Some people will think they don’t need a mentor.
2. Some people will think they’re not worthy to be a mentor.
3. Some people will think they don’t have the time for either.

I believe I have sufficiently addressed the first danger area: each of us needs a mentor. Elisha, Joshua, Paul, Timothy, John Mark, and Luke all had mentors. You need a mentor, I need a mentor, everyone needs a mentor—a peer discipler who is a few steps ahead of us on our personal spiritual journey with Christ.

The second danger is that some will think they’re not worthy to be a mentor. Have you ever struggled with prayer? Then you are probably a few steps ahead of a friend who is just beginning a struggle with prayer. Have you ever struggled with stewardship, but finally developed a plan that seems to work? Then you can help someone who has no plan at all figure out how to balance their budget while being generous toward God. Have you ever made a breakthrough in Scripture or had an “aha” moment in Bible Study? Then you’re uniquely qualified to help someone who hasn’t yet had an “aha” moment in Bible Study. Very few of us are looking for Billy Graham, Francis Chan, or Andy Stanley as a mentor, we’re looking for a real-life, down-to-earth believer who is engaged in growing spiritually. As you think about the work of serving as a mentor, just realize that very few
of us feel ready or worthy. When someone a few steps behind you asks for help, don’t say “No. I’m not worthy.” Just say, “I’ll try.”

The third danger—and the problem that really has no excuse—is that everyone feels too busy for a disciple-discipler relationship. When my son graduated from high school, I asked fifty men in his life to write a letter to encourage him and give advice for life. He received three letters. The biggest excuse? “I just got too busy.” When I first moved to Toledo in 1998, I asked several area pastors if I could meet them for coffee to get to know them and to pick their brains. Not one single pastor responded. My best guess is that they just felt too busy. I since found pastors to share the faith journey, grow with, and learn from, but we must always fight the insidious enemy of “busy-ness.”

We all have the opportunity to pour our life experiences into others and to have someone pour their life experiences into us. Every Christ-follower needs to make enough time to mentor others on their spiritual journeys and to be mentored on their own spiritual journey—because we all need it and it’s why we’re here on earth to begin with. Taking the time to mentor and to be mentored is simply a matter of changing your priorities. We all need others to help us become spiritually formed disciples in Christ; this is the calling of the mentor/peer discipler.

Spiritual growth in Christ must be intentional and ongoing. It must be individualized and personal. It requires the supervision and oversight of a peer discipler. It must also involve ongoing assessment and evaluation to be most effective. If we can finally get a handle on the vital importance of being disciples and find viable ways in which to develop, the result can be a vibrant, healthy church filled with disciples who are intentional about partnering with the Holy Spirit to become more like Christ.
Allow me to repeat this caution and caveat: In addition to helping the adult disciple assess his or her current mastery of the “mile marker” behaviors, then working out a personalized plan of action for growth, and then sharing their journey with them and asking the tough questions as you mentor them, you must stay ahead of your adult disciples as you continue to grow in Christlikeness. Perhaps one of the biggest things missing in American Christianity—in addition to not having a workable method for discipleship and not measuring what is important to see if we’re actually growing—is the unfortunate practice of trying to do it all on our own. You are called to help others on their journey; you are also called to continue on the journey as well.

Peter’s mentoring instructions to us said: “. . . if you possess these qualities in increasing measure, they will keep you from being ineffective and unproductive in your knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ . . . if you do these things, you will never stumble. . . .” (2 Peter 2:8, 10). Let me re-word Peter’s statement as a negative to drive home the point: If you don’t possess these qualities in increasing measure, you are going to be ineffective and unproductive in your knowledge of Jesus Christ . . . if you don’t do these things, you will stumble at every step. These words are important for those you disciple; they’re equally important for your own discipleship development.
In Chapter Five of the disciple’s guide, *Mile Markers*, you will find a helpful self-assessment tool. The tool is designed to be used as a starting place and as an ongoing examination of the spiritual journey of those you disciple. By using this assessment tool, you will be able to assist adult disciples identify where they are in their spiritual progress in the forty mile markers in the six content categories of **Worshipping**, **Loving**, **Belonging**, **Growing**, **Serving**, and **Telling**. As the peer discipler, you then use the results to help develop a personalized plan of action for ongoing growth in Christlikeness.

It is vital that you help your adult disciples understand that this self-assessment tool is not a test. No one can “pass” or “fail.” Use terms such as assessment tool, evaluative instrument, barometer, spiritual GPS, or “checking the pulse.” This is designed to take stock of where an adult disciple is—so he or she can begin to make intentional plans for taking steps to move to where he or she needs to be.

Your assistance may be needed. Please familiarize yourself with these instructions, and make sure you take a look at the details of the assessment tool to answer any questions that may arise.

- On the following pages, read through each statement and fill in the circle (○) if you feel like you are OK with the statement, are in agreement with it, or have achieved mastery.
- Fill in the square (□) if you think you are not sure or if you might need some help with that statement or skill.
- Fill in the diamond (◇) if you do not understand or do not agree with that particular statement, or have not yet achieved mastery.
- On the chart that follows these statements you will find a list that corresponds with the numbered statements. For every statement that you filled in the circle (○), place a checkmark (✔) next to the statement number on the chart.
• After you have transferred the results of all the statements that have a filled-in circle (○), take the time to highlight the number preceding all the statements on the chart that do not have a checkmark beside them.

After the results have been tabulated and properly marked on the chart, transfer those results to the Spiritual Progress Record pages that are found at the end of this chapter. Use the Spiritual Progress Record to make a baseline for where your adult disciple is at the outset of discipling. Refer to the Spiritual Progress Record as you work out a personalized plan of action (in the next chapter) and as you regularly meet with your adult disciple.
KNOWING: it is all about knowing God personally and intimately. . .

**Worship – Praising and Adoring God**

1. When it comes to the following statements about God. . .
   - I understand and believe he is a “triune God” or a Trinity, which means he is “God in Three Persons.”
   - I understand and believe that he always was, and is today, and will be forever—he is eternal.
   - I understand and believe that Jesus is God’s Son and a part of the Trinity; that he is the Savior of all who believe in him; that he is the “Word” and was present at creation; and that he is also known as the Messiah and the Christ.
   - I understand and believe that the Holy Spirit is part of the Trinity; that he is also known as the Comforter and the Counselor.

2. When it comes to the following statements about Worship. . .
   - I understand what it means to worship in spirit and in truth.
   - I understand what it means to present myself as a “living sacrifice.”
   - I understand how to show reverence and respect to God.
   - I understand the meanings of thanksgiving, adoration, and praise.

3. I regularly present my life as an act of worship.

4. I regularly praise him for who he is and what he has done, and worship him wholeheartedly.

5. I currently demonstrate an understanding and a heart for worship, devotion, and meditation—both privately and corporately.

6. I currently demonstrate an understanding of communion and baptism.
KNOWING—part 2.

**LOVE — LOVING GOD AND LOVING OTHERS**

7. **When it comes to the following statements about the “Great Commandment” (Matt. 22:37-40). . .**

   a. I don’t understand
   b. I need some help
   c. I am OK

   > I understand and embrace that the most important thing in the world is to love God with everything that I am.
   > I understand and embrace that just as important is that I love my neighbor and my fellow human being as much or more than I love myself.

8. **When it comes to the following statement about Jesus’ “New Commandment” (John 13:34-35). . .**

   a. I don’t understand
   b. I need some help
   c. I am OK

   > I understand and embrace what it means to love one another as Jesus loved us.

13. **I am working to love so that people see Christ in me.**

   a. I don’t think so
   b. I need some help
   c. Yes, I do

14. **I regularly spend time alone with my Heavenly Father, getting to know him better every day.**

   a. I don’t think so
   b. I need some help
   c. Yes, I do

15. **As evidence of my adoration, I demonstrate a love for God and for others.**

   a. I don’t think so
   b. I need some help
   c. Yes, I do

16. **I have devoted myself to a life of prayer, loving God through conversations with him, and finding direction and answers from him to the questions in my life.**

   a. I don’t think so
   b. I need some help
   c. Yes, I have
GROWING: it is all about my inner being. . .

**BELONG – BELONGING TO THE COMMUNITY OF FAITH—THE CHURCH**

13. When it comes to the following statements about God’s plan for humanity – or, *how life was supposed to be*. . .

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>○</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

> I understand and believe that God created us to be in a loving relationship with him.
> I understand and believe that God created us to be in a loving relationship with one another.
> I understand and believe that humanity walked away from God – *which explains why life is the way it is*, and that this was the entrance of sin into the world. I further understand and believe that the effect of sin is separation from God, broken relationships, futility of life, and death.

14. When it comes to the following statements about “community” - *how life is supposed to be NOW*. . .

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>○</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

> I understand and believe that “community” is the environment in which I can best become like Jesus.
> I understand and believe that “community” is the local church, and is the hope of the world—the tool God designed to accomplish his purposes on earth.

15. I regularly live in intentional community with other Christ-followers, investing my life in them, and developing meaningful, lasting relationships.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>Yes, I do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◊</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

16. I regularly allow my brothers and sisters in Christ to help me find direction and focus, and to enable me to carry out God’s plan in my life and in the world.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>Yes, I do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◊</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

17. I have demonstrated what it means to live in community by establishing a good reputation, living out a life of example.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I have</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◊</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

18. I am committed to loving others and being with them in community.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I’m not sure</th>
<th>Yes, I am</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◊</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GROWING—

GROW – GROWING TO BE MORE LIKE JESUS

19. When it comes to the following statements about “salvation”. . .

I don’t I need some help I am OK
understand

I understand and believe that I’m born into eternal separation from God—causing me to naturally try to live life apart from God.

I understand and believe that the payment for my sin is eternal death, but that Jesus paid that price for me.

I believe that all people need Jesus Christ as their Savior.

I believe I am saved by God’s unmerited favor through faith in Jesus.

I understand what it means to be “saved” or “born-again.”

I understand the concepts of confession, repentance, and becoming a New Creation.

20. When it comes to the following statements about developing as a follower of Christ. . .

I don’t I need some help I am OK
understand

I understand what it means to “count the cost” and live as a disciple of Jesus.

I believe God’s Word is true and reliable.

I understand that my prayers are personal conversations with God.

22. I regularly seek God first – getting my priorities straight, and giving all I am to God.

I don’t I need some help Yes, I do
think so

I regularly submit to being discipled, and work to live in ways that develop the proper “fruit” in my life.

I currently demonstrate spiritual authenticity by submitting to being discipled, and growing towards the time I can disciple others.

I currently demonstrate knowledge of spiritual disciplines such as worship, prayer, confession, fellowship, study, fasting, tithing, and more.
SHOWING: it is all about living a life of witness.

**SERVE – SERVING GOD; SERVING OTHERS**

25. When it comes to the following statements about God’s will for me.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

  > I understand that I must do good works for him and for others.
  > I understand and believe that faith without these good works is a lifeless faith.

26. When it comes to the following statements about spiritual gifts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

  > How God gifted me helps me understand where God wants me involved.
  > Every believer has one or more spiritual gifts.

27. I am committed to developing and refining my spiritual gifts for use in the church.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

28. I will seek out ways to do good works using my spiritual gifts because I want a faith that is alive and fruitful.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

29. I believe that in order to earn the right to share Christ with others, I must learn to meet felt needs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

30. I regularly show compassion to those in need.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>Yes, I do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

31. I currently surrender time and talents in service to God and the people around me by being involved in a place of meaningful service in my church.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>Yes, I do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

32. I currently sharpen my own spiritual gifts and help others develop their own.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>Yes, I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SHOWING—part 2 . .

**TELL – TELLING OTHERS ABOUT JESUS**

33. When it comes to the following statements about Jesus’ Great Commission. . .

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◊</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

> Building relationships of trust is a critical first step to sharing my faith.
> I understand and believe that telling people about Jesus is my responsibility.

34. When it comes to the following statements about God’s mission to save the world. . .

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◊</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

> Missions involves *evangelism* = sharing the good news of Jesus with the world around me.
> Missions involves *outreach* = sharing the love of Christ through my actions and financial support.

35. I will surrender my heart to Christ’s ministry to save the world through sharing the good news.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t understand</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◊</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

36. I am working to live out the Great Commission, building relationships with family, friends, and neighbors.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◊</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

37. I am working to share the message I have been given in my own unique, relational way.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I am OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◊</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

38. I regularly help meet the needs of the world—earning the right to talk to people about Jesus.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I do OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◊</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

39. I demonstrate need-meeting, relational evangelism—sharing the gospel with those around me.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I do OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◊</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

40. I currently demonstrate mission mindedness by regularly participating in “hands-on” missions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I don’t think so</th>
<th>I need some help</th>
<th>I do OK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◊</td>
<td>□</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Remember: On the chart that follows find a list that corresponds with the numbered statements above. For every statement that you filled in the circle (○), place a checkmark (✓) next to that statement.
Checking My Progress—CHART

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowing</th>
<th>Worship</th>
<th>Non-Believer to New Believer Discovering</th>
<th>New Believer to Maturing Believer Developing</th>
<th>Maturing Believer to Role-Model of the faith Demonstrating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. I have discovered God.</td>
<td>1. I have discovered God.</td>
<td>3. I will present my life as an act of worship.</td>
<td>5. I am demonstrating an understanding and a heart for worship—privately and corporately.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. I have discovered Worship.</td>
<td>2. I have discovered Worship.</td>
<td>4. I will praise him for who he is and what he has done, and worship him wholeheartedly.</td>
<td>6. I am demonstrating an understanding of communion and baptism.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. I have discovered the Great Commandment.</td>
<td>8. I have discovered Jesus’ New Commandment.</td>
<td>9. I will love so that people see Christ in me.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. I am demonstrating devotion to a life of prayer, keeping God through my conversations with him, enabling me to find direction and answers to the questions of my life.</td>
<td>10. I will spend time alone with my father, getting to know him better every day.</td>
<td>11. I am demonstrating love for God and for others.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Growing</th>
<th>Belong</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13. I have discovered God’s plan for humanity</td>
<td>14. I have discovered Community — how life is supposed to be.</td>
<td>15. I will live in intentional community with other Christ followers, investing my life in them and developing lasting, meaningful relationships.</td>
<td>17. I am demonstrating what it means to live in community—establishing a good reputation and living out a life of example.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. I will allow my brothers and sisters in Christ to help me find direction, focus, accountability, and to enable me to carry out God’s plan in my life and in the world.</td>
<td>17. I am demonstrating what it means to live in community—establishing a good reputation and living out a life of example.</td>
<td>18. I am demonstrating that I am committed to loving others and being with them in community.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. I have discovered the plan of salvation.</td>
<td>20. I have discovered how to develop into an unconditional follower (disciple) of Christ.</td>
<td>21. I will seek God first—getting my priorities straight—giving all I am to God.</td>
<td>23. I am demonstrating spiritual authenticity, submitting to being discipled, and growing towards the time I can disciple others.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. I will submit to being discipled, and work to live in ways that develop the proper “fruit” in my life.</td>
<td>24. I am demonstrating knowledge of spiritual disciplines such as worship, prayer, confession, submission, fellowship, study, service, solitude, silence, fasting, tithe, and more.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Showing</th>
<th>Serve</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25. I have discovered that God has a will for me.</td>
<td>26. I have discovered that how God gifted me helps me understand how and where God wants me to be active and involved.</td>
<td>27. I will develop and refine my spiritual gifts for use in the church, because God has called Christ followers to serve the family of God and the world.</td>
<td>31. I am demonstrating how to surrender time and talents in service to God and the people around me by being involved in a place of meaningful service in my local church.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. I will seek out ways to do good works using my spiritual gifts because I want a faith that is alive and fruitful.</td>
<td>29. I will embrace the concept that in order to earn the right to share Christ with others, I must learn to meet their felt needs first.</td>
<td>30. I will show compassion to those in need.</td>
<td>32. I am demonstrating my awareness of spiritual giftedness by sharpening my gifts, and helping others develop their own, to excel in their places of meaningful service.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. I will seek out ways to do good works using my spiritual gifts because I want a faith that is alive and fruitful.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Tell | | Non-Believer to New Believer Discovering | New Believer to Maturing Believer Developing | Maturing Believer to Role-Model of the faith Demonstrating |
|------|----------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| 33. I have discovered the Great Commission. | 34. I have discovered the mission to save the world. | 35. I will surrender my heart to Christ’s ministry to save the world through sharing the good news—starting at home and moving out into the state, nation, and world. | 39. I am demonstrating need-meeting, relational evangelism—sharing the gospel with the world around me. |
| 36. I will work diligently to live out the Great Commission, building relationships of trust and integrity with my family, friends, and neighbors. | 37. I will take the message I have been given and share it with the world around me in my own unique, relational way. | 38. I will help meet the needs of the world around me—earning the right to talk to them about Jesus Christ. | 40. I am demonstrating mission-mindedness by regularly participating in “hands-on” outreach through a local or global mission efforts. |

After you’ve placed a checkmark next to the number of all the statements from the assessment that have a filled-in circle (○), take the time to highlight the number before all the statements on the above chart that do not have a checkmark beside them. Checkmarks denote mastery; highlights denote areas for growth.
Spiritual Progress
Record

A record of developmental markers
to help monitor and guide an individual’s growth
from new believer to maturing disciple
to a role model of the Christian faith

DATE: __________________ NAME of DISCIPLE: _______________________________

Note to Peer Disciplers, Mentors, Coaches, Pastors:

The following pages contain a checklist of the forty standardized skills or behaviors identified as mile
markers or guideposts for helping direct and evaluate an individual believer’s spiritual development. These
mile markers are certainly not the only ways to evaluate spiritual growth, but a standardized tool helps to
facilitate working together to map out and monitor personal progress in the primary abilities and basic
knowledge that serve as hallmarks for believers in Christ.

Where you see a box (□) please place your initials there only as you personally witness this individual
master that skill or fully engage that behavior. Where you see an arrow (▶) please note that there is a task
that can be associated with the mastery of that skill. Suggested Scriptures are included to help guide you in
coaching, counseling, teaching, and creating a personalized plan for discipleship.

It is highly recommended that you do not begin checking off skills or activities in any stage of development
until all skills in the previous stage are mastered. Use the spaces between skills to make notes about
progress, plans, and suggestions for growth. Please keep these pages confidential when in your possession.
It is recommended that you keep a copy for use when you meet with the person being discipled. Make sure
he or she has a copy as well in order to keep track of progress.
BECOMING a NEW DISCIPLE
Principal Task: To Discover

NOTE: A public profession of faith marks the passage from non-believer to new disciple.
The following DISCOVERY skills are stressed at this time.

Conversion/Profession: Date: ___________ Place: _______________ Witness: __________________
Believer’s baptism: Date: ___________ Place: _______________ Baptizer: __________________

WORSHIP—Praising and adoring God

☐ I have discovered God -
   1 AM; Always was, and is, and is to come; the Eternal One; I AM; Trinity; Jesus; Son of God; Savior;
   Word (Logos); Messiah/Christ; Holy Spirit; Guide; Comforter (Genesis 1-3; Exodus 3:13-14;
   Psalm 100; Psalm 150; 2 Corinthians 13:14, John 1:1-14, 32, 7:39; John 3:16; John 14:6; John
   14:16, 26, 15:26)

☐ I have discovered Worship -
   In spirit and in truth / living sacrifices / reverence and respect / thanksgiving, adoration, and praise
   (Matthew 2:22-23; Romans 12:1; Hebrews 12:28; Psalm 100)

LOVE—Loving God and loving others

☐ I have discovered the Great Commandment –
   Love God—Love your neighbor (Matthew 22:35-40)

☐ I have discovered Jesus’ New Commandment –
   Love others as Jesus loved (John 13:34-35; 15:12-13)

BELONG—Belonging to the Community of Faith—the church

☐ I have discovered God has a plan for humanity (how life was supposed to be) -
   To be in a loving relationship with Him (He walked with us)
   To be in a loving relationship with one another (He made us for each other)
   To be in harmony with nature (animals, plants under our dominion)
   Then - the Fall - why life is the way it is - Adam and Eve and temptation; entrance of sin into the world;
   the effect of sin (death, separation, broken relationships, frustration and futility of life) –
   (Genesis 1-4:15)

☐ I have discovered Community (how life is supposed to be NOW) -
   Community is the environment in which discipleship can occur.
   The local church is the tool God has designed to accomplish His purposes on earth.
   Worship Celebrations; fellowship events – learning to attend and participate.
   (Hebrews 10:25; John 13:34-35; Ephesians 4:14-16; John 15:12-13, Romans 8)
BECOMING a NEW DISCIPLE – (continued)
(Principal Task: To Discover)

GROW—Growing to be more like Jesus

☐ I have discovered the plan of salvation—Note conversion or profession above.
  The problem of Sin - born into death and eternal separation from God (descendants of Adam); sinners
  by nature; we are self-reliant; try to live life apart from God; pride and arrogance; the wages of sin
  is death; something must die for sin (Genesis 3:4-15; Romans 3:21-26, 5:9, 6:23; 7; 1 John 2:2,
  1 John 4:10)
  Salvation of humanity planned from the beginning (John 1, Ephesians 1:3-11, Genesis 3:21 and 4:15)
  Jesus means “He will save” (Matthew 1:21).
  All people are loved by God and need Jesus Christ as their Savior. (John 3:16, John 1:12)
  We are saved by God’s unmerited favor—grace—through faith in Jesus Christ (Ephesians 2:8-9, John
  What it means to be “saved” or “born-again” – Profession made?
    Confess – Admit (1 John 1:9, Romans 10:9) Repent – Go a new direction (Acts 3:19)
    New Creation (2 Corinthians 5:17) Baptism as outward sign of inward faith (Romans 6:1-4)

☐ I have discovered that I am to develop into an unconditional follower of Christ -
  Counting the cost – submitting to discipling (Luke 14:28-33)
  God’s Word is reliable and infallible – starting a regular pattern of reading and study (2 Timothy
  3:16-17, Hebrews 4:12)
  Prayer is conversation with God – prayer times with discipler (Matthew 6:5-15)

SERVE—Serving God; serving others

☐ I have discovered that God has a will for me -
  You are God’s masterpiece, created in Christ to do good works. (Ephesians 2:8-10)
  Each one of us is gifted by God for the common good of all. (1 Corinthians 12:4-7)
  Christ’s church is one body made of different parts—each with a part to play. (1 Corinthians 12:12-20)

☐ I have discovered how God gifted me helps me know how and where God wants me involved -
  Each of us is gifted with particular spiritual gifts for the building of his church and serving in
  meaningful ministry.
    (1 Corinthians 12, 13, and 14) Spiritual Gifts Inventory, coaching, and placement.
    Gift(s): ____________________________

TELL—Telling others about Jesus

☐ I have discovered the Great Commission -
  Jesus left us with a commission. It’s something we’re all to do. (Matthew 28:18-20)
  Writing a verbal witness.

☐ I have discovered the mission to save the world -
  God loves humanity enough to send His Son to save us. (John 3:16-17)
  He holds back the end of human history to give the world the chance to hear the Gospel. (2 Peter 3:9)
  We are His ambassadors in the world. (2 Corinthians 5:16-21)
  We will be His witnesses in our spheres of influence—and throughout our world. (Acts 1:8)
GROWING as a MATURING DISCIPLE
Principal Task: To Develop

NOTE: After a public profession of faith, a growing believer will submit to being discipled, will exhibit a regular pattern of Bible Study, and will demonstrate a basic knowledge of Bible structure and contents. The following DEVELOPMENT skills are stressed through this stage of progress.

Participation in discipleship for ___________ months. Attested to by: _______________________

Pattern of Bible study observed: __________ Date: _______ Observer: ___________________

Shows knowledge of books of the Bible. Date: _______ Observer: ___________________

Shows knowledge of structure of the Bible. Date: _______ Observer: ___________________

GROW
Perhaps Galatians 2:20 is the highest maturity level we can ever work on, yet never fully attain in this lifetime. Being like Christ should be our greatest goal throughout our entire life – and we should never give up the effort. Discuss.

☐ I will seek God first – getting my priorities straight – giving all I am to God. (Galatians 2:20; Matthew 6:33)

☐ I will submit to being discipled, and work to live in ways that develop the proper “fruit” in my life. Participating in regular discipleship. (Galatians 5:22-23; 2 Peter 1:3-11; John 13:34-35)

BELONG
Discipleship cannot grow without the proper environment of true, authentic, heartfelt fellowship. There is no such thing as “private Christianity.” Discuss.

☐ I will live in intentional community with other Christ-followers, investing my life in them and developing lasting, meaningful relationships. (Acts 2:44-47) Fellowship, service opportunities, attending church, and being in each others’ homes.

☐ I will allow my brothers and sisters in Christ to help me find direction, focus, accountability, and to enable me to carry out God’s plan in my life and in the world. Becoming active in my church. (Ephesians 5:21, Hebrews 10:25)

WORSHIP
Worship is why we were created! Our ability to worship corporately is a direct result of our ability to worship privately. God is more interested in our private worship, but requires our corporate worship as well. Discuss.

☐ I will present my life as an act of worship. Active participation in worship. (Romans 12:1)

☐ I will praise Him for who He is and what He has done, and worship Him wholeheartedly. Private worship practices. (Psalm 95:1; Matthew 2:22-23)
GROWING as a MATURING DISCIPLE: (continued)  
(Principal Task: To Develop)

LOVE  Loving people has been commanded – and it is the greatest gift from God and the highest fruit of life in the Spirit – but here is where humans have perhaps failed the most. **Discuss.**

☐ I will love so that people see Christ in me. *(John 13:34-35, Galatians 2:20)*

☐ I will spend time alone with my Father, getting to know Him better every day.

**Prayer journal or list.** *(Mark 1:35, Luke 5:16, Matthew 6:5-15)*

SERVE  Everyone has been equipped by God to do good works. Serving is a natural outpouring of our faith. Faith without serving others is a lifeless faith. We serve from the overflow in our hearts. **Discuss.**

☐ I will develop and refine my spiritual gifts for use in the church, because God has called Christ-followers to serve the family of God and the world. **Spiritual Gifts refresher; coaching.** *(1 Corinthians 12:14, Romans 12:3-4)*

☐ I will seek out ways to do good works *(Ephesians 2:10)* using my spiritual gifts *(1 Corinthians 12-14)* because I want a faith that is alive and fruitful *(James 2:17)*. **Serving in meaningful ministry within the church.**

☐ I will embrace the concept that in order to earn the right to share Christ with others, I must learn to meet their felt needs first. **Local, regional, and international outreach and mission events.**

☐ I will show compassion to those in need. **Contributing to meeting needs.** *(Psalm 82:3-4, James 2:17)*

TELL  We carry amazing, great good news – salvation from sin resulting in eternal life with God! Yet, sometimes we treat it like it’s a secret. Nothing could be further from the truth. The Great Commission that Jesus gave us is to share the gospel with everyone. But sharing our faith can be scary! How do we share Jesus with others? **Discuss.**

☐ I will surrender my heart to Christ’s ministry to save the world through sharing the good news – starting at home and moving out into the state, nation, and world.

☐ I will work diligently to live out the Great Commission *(Matthew 28:18-20)* building relationships of trust and integrity with my family, friends, and neighbors. **Evangelism training; practice sharing verbal witness.**

☐ I will take the message I have been given and share it with the world around me in my own unique, relational way. *(2 Corinthians 4:7, Ephesians 6:19-20)* **Listing people I know who don’t know Jesus; sharing my faith.**

☐ I will help meet the needs of the world around me – earning the right to talk to them about Jesus Christ. **Inviting and including others.** *(Psalm 82:3-4)*
BECOMING a ROLE-MODELING DISCIPLE

Principal Task: To Demonstrate

NOTE: These mile markers are learned in personal discipleship relationships and through hands-on experience in serving others, then they must be demonstrated publicly in your church and community, as witnessed first-hand by peer disciplers, mentors, or pastors. There are no arrows (▶) on this page because all the skills are stated in the form of an assigned demonstration. To truly move into the maturity level of a role model, a believer will commit to being a tither.

Committed to tithing. Date: _______________ Witness: __________________________________________

(Matthew 5:1-7, 6:33, 23:23; 1 Timothy 6:17-19; Malachi 3:10; 2 Corinthians 8:7)

SERVE: Engaging in meaningful ministry to God and others

☐ I am demonstrating how to surrender time and talents in service to God and the people around me by being involved in a place of meaningful service in my local church.

(Colossians 3:17, 1 Corinthians 12-14, 1 Thessalonians 5:15)

☐ I am demonstrating my awareness of spiritual giftedness by sharpening my gifts, and helping others develop their own, to excel in their places of meaningful service.

TELL: Sharing the Good News of Christ

☐ I am demonstrating need-meeting, relational evangelism - sharing the gospel with the world around me.

☐ I am demonstrating mission mindedness by regularly participating in “hands-on” outreach through a local or global mission effort.

WORSHIP: Surrendering your life to the adoration of God

☐ I am demonstrating an understanding and a heart for worship – privately and corporately.

(Hebrews 6:19-20)

☐ I am demonstrating an understanding of communion and baptism.

BECOMING a ROLE-MODELING DISCIPLE – (continued)
(Principal Task: To Demonstrate)

**LOVE:** Living out Christ’s Great Commandment in your world

- I am demonstrating love for God and for others.
  *(1 John 4:10-12; Matthew 28:18-20; John 15:12-13)*

- I am demonstrating devotion to a life of prayer, loving God through my conversations with Him, enabling me to find direction and answers to the questions of my life.
  *(Psalm 66:16-20)*

**BELONG:** Developing lasting relationships in the Community of Faith

- I am demonstrating what it means to live in community – establishing a good reputation and living out a life of example.
  *(Proverbs 3:3-4; John 15:11; John 15:34-35; John 13; Philippians 4:5; Philippians 2:3-4)*

- I am demonstrating that I am committed to loving others and being with them in community.
  *(John 13:34-35; John 15:12-13)*

**GROW:** Following in Christ’s footsteps—becoming more like Him

- I am demonstrating spiritual authenticity, continuing in submission to being discipled, and growing towards the time I can disciple others.
  *(2 Peter 1:3-11; Philippians 4:6-7; Hebrews 5:12-14; Titus 2:11-13)*

- I am demonstrating knowledge of spiritual disciplines such as: worship, prayer, confession, submission, fellowship, study, service, solitude, silence, fasting, tithing, and more.

Peer Discipler, Mentor, Coach, Pastor:

If the disciple you are working with has mastered these 40 standardized skills or mile markers, they should be living as role models in the Christian faith, even if there may be some things yet to polish. Yet, even if they are fine examples of maturing and role model disciples, they aren’t finished yet. No one finishes growing in Christ-likeness until Christ returns or they go home to be with Him; there’s still more to be done.

“A Role-Model who continues to be led by the Holy Spirit and continues to grow into the image or likeness of Christ” is the definition of an unconditional follower or disciple of Jesus Christ. This is not the end of the journey—but another stage in their development. In this stage of progression, they should be learning more and more about giving themselves away in service, teaching others, and giving generously of time, talent, and treasure. Encourage them to enjoy their continued journey with Christ, and to become leaders, teachers, missionaries, disciplers, and/or shepherds in the church. Perhaps some seminary classes would be beneficial to them. Maybe they’re ready to help plant a new church. Are they sensing a call to vocational or avocational ministry? Work with them to design “next steps” and to go deeper.
Next Steps in Discipling

You now have a “Checking My Progress” chart containing a series of checkmarks that suggest some level of mastery of certain mile markers (key behaviors or spiritual formation skills), and a series of highlighted mile markers that are the first place towards which you should turn your attention. You also have a series of “Record Pages” that will help you design and keep track of a personalized plan of growth and development. Please use these tools well; look over them before you meet with your adult disciple. Study them; pray about what these pages contain; ask the Holy Spirit to help you help your adult disciples to grow.

Remember, these mile markers are by no means an exhaustive list. There may be many other skills or indicators a believer should work on attaining and mastering. These are simply some of the most recognizable and measurable for nearly every adult Christian. The checkmarks represent the spiritual formation mile markers the adult disciple feels he or she has mastered or begun to master. Encourage your disciples in these areas and urge them to continue to grow in these areas. The highlighted mile markers represent the places in which the adult disciple feels he or she may need work. Helping your adult disciples study and work on these highlighted mile markers will make their discipleship plan personal and focused; they will begin to feel like they are making progress in their overall spiritual formation.

Pay close attention to the Records Pages. You will notice that there are blanks to be filled in, arrows that denote tasks to be undertaken, and bible verses to be studied. Start at the top of the first of the Record Pages and work through each item on the list. If they do not have a “conversion experience” to recount, help them work through how it is
they came to know Jesus Christ. You may be the first person to lead them to accept Christ as Savior and Lord. If they are already a believer, work with them to try to remember a date or a range of time when they believe they came to faith in Christ.

Have they been baptized as a believer? Perhaps that is an area that needs attention before moving on. Where you see a box (□) this is where you will place your initials only as you personally witness the individual adult disciple master that skill or fully engage that behavior. Where you see an arrow (➤) pay careful attention to the task that may be associated with the mastery of that mile marker. Suggested Scriptures are included to help guide you in coaching, counseling, teaching, and creating a personalized plan for discipleship.

Let’s address just a few of the tasks found on the Records Pages.

- **Learning to attend and participate.** Talk about what it means to be an active and involved participant in the life and fellowship of the local church.
- **Profession made?** Talk to them about their public confession of faith in Christ.
- **Believer’s baptism?** Perhaps this is a good time to schedule their baptism.
- **Submitting to discipling.** Have they—will they—work with you in the discipleship process?
- **Starting a regular pattern of reading and study.** Talk about the importance of careful and deliberate study of God’s Word.
- **Prayer times with discipler.** Start praying with them to help them learn to converse with their Heavenly Father. Help them learn to pray.
- **Spiritual Gifts Inventory, coaching, and placement.** Take them through a Spiritual Gifts Inventory to help them identify their spiritual gifts, then coach them on where they might use their gifts in meaningful service.
- **Writing a verbal witness.** One of the best steps in teaching your adult disciple to share their faith in Jesus Christ is to have them write out their personal testimony. Work to tweak the testimony into a tight, well-written narrative, then have your disciple share their verbal testimony with you each time you meet. The more we practice, the less frightened we are to share our story.

These are just eight of forty-two tasks that can be used in the discipling process.

As you can see, each task offers you a valuable opportunity to have discussions, impart
knowledge, share insights, and practice key discipleship skills, together. Nearly every
task has one or more Scripture passages that help underscore the skill to be developed,
and where a task does not have a specific Scripture references listed, you have an
opportunity to find suitable biblical or extra-biblical instruction.

It is highly recommended that you do not begin checking off skills or activities on
the Records Pages in any stage of development until all skills in the previous stage are
mastered. However, as the peer discipler, you are in charge and have the right to move on
to more “mature” skills if you feel the need. Use the spaces between skills on the Records
Pages to make notes about progress, plans, and suggestions for growth. Please keep these
pages confidential when in your possession. It is recommended that you keep a copy for
use when you meet with the person being discipled. Make sure he or she has a copy as
well in order to keep track of progress.

In the next chapter you’ll find ideas on how to help your adult disciple(s) develop
the skills they have yet to master. In Chapter Eight, the work of designing a personalized
plan of action will truly come together. Use Chapters Seven and Eight to fine-tune a plan
for helping the individual disciple grow in these spiritually formative mile markers. Ask
God to reveal himself and his plan for your disciple-discipler relationship as you seek to
take important steps in the journey of becoming more like Christ.

Remember this very important detail: knowledge is only one step to growth. This
is not about looking up Bible verses and checking off a skill, nor is this process a
checklist to master so your adult disciple can stop growing or start gloating about his or
her maturity, nor is this about you becoming puffed up about how quickly you “grew” a
disciple. Working on these spiritual formation mile markers will, by necessity, take time,
and should never be allowed to replace a personal relationship with Christ. This process is never to be about “looking good,” “pretending,” or “bragging.” This process is about helping your adult disciples to find areas for development, then working with them for weeks, months—perhaps years—as they come to a more full understanding of their faith through the mentoring process. Together you will study, pray, and interact with other Christ-followers until both of you feel the adult disciple is well on his or her way to understanding and assimilating each mile marker.

In addition to God’s Word, I highly recommend picking up other books and read what a church leader or teacher has to say about growing. As you read and study about a skill, jot down the questions or ideas that come up, then talk with your adult disciple about what you’ve found. Spend time in conversation with other peer disciplers about what you are discovering and about what techniques they are using. Spend time in prayer asking God to show you what you need to know and how you need to help others grow.

Use the “Checking My Progress” self-assessment tool as a starting place—a launching-off point in designing a personalized plan of action, then use a new “Checking My Progress” self-assessment each year to help assess growth and forward movement, serving as a personal spiritual “Progress Report” that helps point the way for personalized study, development, and spiritual formation.
Using the Study Guide

Let’s dig a little deeper into the mile markers (skills in spiritual formation and discipleship) and some of the tasks associated with them. The information is organized by developmental stages of Discovery, Development, and Demonstration. Using the self-assessment, the highlighted items on the chart that followed, and the Records Pages, working through this chapter to find ideas and techniques to enhance your adult disciple’s growth as a Christ-follower.

(On the following pages, please note that topics are underlined, tasks are bolded and underlined, and Bible passages that may assist you are italicized.)

Discovery Stage

Note: if your adult disciple has things to work on in this stage of spiritual development, this is where you should start. (Always try to meet all the developmental markers in one stage before moving on to the next stage of development.) In this stage, the principal task for your disciples is to discover the fundamentals of faith in Jesus.

It is important to consider that a public profession of faith generally marks the passage from non-believer to new believer. Has your adult disciple accepted Jesus Christ as Master and Savior? Have the disciple take the time to write about her conversion experience or her profession of faith. Does she remember the date? What does she remember about that event? Who witnessed it? Did someone “lead” her to Christ? What is her personal conversion story? (Add this information to the Records Pages.)

Have the disciple write about it in the box provided in the Mile Markers guide.
Has your disciple been baptized? Who baptized her? When and where? Have her write some of her thoughts about that experience. (Record this on the Records Pages.)

Once an adult disciple has come to faith in Christ, he should be discovering some of the following details about being a follower of Christ:

**WORSHIP:** Did you know that God can help you worship?

**LOVE:** Did you know you can love God with every fiber of your being?

**BELONG:** Did you know the church is a family where you can grow and develop?

**GROW:** Did you know you are meant to develop into the image of Christ?

**SERVE:** Did you know you were given gifts by the Holy Spirit—for a purpose?

**TELL:** Did you know that the best way people find out about Christ is from you?

What follows are some topics, tasks, and Bible passages that may help your adult disciple grow in his faith.

Worship—Praising and adoring God

I have discovered God -

We believe God always was, and is, and is to come; the Eternal One.
We believe God is a Triune God or a Trinity: One God in three Persons:
  God the Father; God’s name means “I AM.”
  God the Son; Jesus; Messiah/Christ; Savior; Master; Lord; Word (Logos).
  God the Spirit; Holy Spirit; Guide; Comforter.
*Genesis 1-3; Exodus 3:13-14; Psalm 100; Psalm 150; 2 Corinthians 13:14, John 1:1-14, 32, 7:39; John 3:16; John 14:6; John 14:16, 26, 15:26*

I have discovered Worship – attending and participating

Believer worship God in spirit and in truth. We present ourselves as living sacrifices. We approach God with reverence and respect, with thanksgiving, adoration, and praise.

*Matthew 2:22-23; Romans 12:1; Hebrews 12:28; Psalm 100*
Love—Loving God and loving others

I have discovered the Great Commandment: **love God and love my neighbor.**

*Matthew 22:35-40*

I have discovered Jesus’ New Commandment: **loving others as Jesus loved me.**

*John 13:34-35; John 15:12-13*

Belong—Belonging to the Community of Faith—the church

I have discovered God’s plan for humanity (how life was supposed to be) -

To be in a loving relationship with him (he walked with us)
To be in a loving relationship with one another (he made us for each other)
To be in harmony with nature (animals, plants under our dominion)

Then, the Fall (why life is the way it is) – *(Genesis 1:1-4:15)*
Adam and Eve gave in to temptation; sin entered the world, and its effects were death, separation, broken relationships, frustration, and futility of life.

I have discovered Community (how life is supposed to be now) -
Community is the environment in which discipleship best occurs.
The local church is the tool God designed to accomplish his purposes.
Worship Celebrations; fellowship events – **attending and participating.**
*Hebrews 10:25; John 13:34-35; Ephesians 4:14-16; John 15:12-13, Romans 8*

Grow—Growing to be more like Jesus

I have discovered the plan of salvation. **Profession made?** *(Note on Records Pages)*

The problem of sin: born into death and eternal separation from God (descendants of Adam); sinners by nature; we are self-reliant; try to live life apart from God; pride and arrogance; the wages of sin is death.

*Genesis 3:4-15; Romans 3:21-26, 5:9, 6:23; 7; 1 John 2:2 and 4:10*

Salvation of humanity planned from the beginning.

*John 1, Ephesians 1:3-11, Genesis 3:21 and 4:15*

Jesus means “he will save.”

*Matthew 1:21*

All people are loved by God and need Jesus Christ as their Savior.

*John 3:16, John 1:12*

We are saved by God’s unmerited favor—grace—through faith in Jesus Christ

*Ephesians 2:8-9, John 3:16, John 14:1-4*

What it means to be “saved” or “born-again” – **Profession made?**

- Confess—Admit *(1 John 1:9, Romans 10:9)*
- Repent – Go a new direction *(Acts 3:19)*
- New Creation—New life *(2 Corinthians 5:17)*

**Baptism as outward sign of inward faith** *(Romans 6:1-4)*
I have discovered how to develop into an unconditional follower of Christ –
- Counting the cost – submitting to discipleship (Luke 14:28-33)
- God’s Word is reliable and infallible – starting a regular pattern of reading and study (2 Timothy 3:16-17, Hebrews 4:12)
- Prayer is conversation with God – prayer times with discipler (Matthew 6:5-15)

Serve—Serving God; serving others
I have discovered God’s will for me -
You are God’s masterpiece, created in Christ to do good works. (Ephesians 2:8-10)
Each one of us is gifted by God for the common good of all. (1 Corinthians 12:4-7)
Christ’s church is one body made of different parts—each with a part to play. (1 Corinthians 12:12-20)

I have discovered that how God gifted me helps me understand how and where God wants me involved -
Each of us is gifted with particular spiritual gifts for the building of his church and serving in meaningful ministry. (1 Corinthians 12, 13, and 14)
Spiritual Gifts Inventory, coaching, and placement.

Tell—Telling others about Jesus
I have discovered the Great Commission - (Matthew 28:18-20)
Jesus left us with a commission. It’s something we’re all to do.

Writing your faith story so you can prepare to share it with others.

I have discovered the mission to save the world -
God loves humanity enough to send his Son to save us. (John 3:16-17)
He holds back the end of human history to give the world the chance to hear the Gospel. (2 Peter 3:9)
We are his ambassadors in the world. (2 Corinthians 5:16-21)
We will be his witnesses in our spheres of influence—and throughout our world (Acts 1:8)

The following scriptures can help you and your adult disciples discover some details for this stage of discovery.

Genesis 1-4:15  Exodus 3:13-14  Psalm 100
Psalm 150  Matthew 1:21  Matthew 2:22-23
Luke 14:28-33  John 1  John 3:16
John 7:39  John 13:34-35  John 14:1-6; 16; 26,
Remind your disciples that all of us have a lot to learn about these areas, and we never stop growing or developing. Even if we feel we have mastered something, chances are that a year from now, we will need some bolstering or tweaking in that area or skill. Encourage your disciples to ask questions—we’ve all been in this stage, and you are here to help them grow.

Development Stage

As your disciple becomes somewhat proficient in most of the Discovery Stage, it may be time to begin work in the Development Stage. In this stage of spiritual development, your disciples’ principal task is to develop their increasing faith in Jesus. The following topics, tasks, and Bible passages will help you grow in your faith.

NOTE: Inherent in the following mile markers, a growing believer will:

1. submit to being discipled;
2. exhibit a regular pattern of Bible Study;
3. possess a basic knowledge of the Bible’s structure and contents.

Worship

Explain that we were created for worship; for his glory, for his praise (Ephesians 1:11-12; Colossians 1:16). Our ability to worship corporately is a direct result of our ability to worship privately and personally. God is more interested in our private worship,
but requires our corporate worship as well. Discuss this with your disciple. *(If the disciple is working on this area, or feel she has accomplished it, she should regularly be engaging in corporate Worship Celebrations and attending prayer or worship retreats or events throughout the year.)*

I will present my life as an act of worship. *Romans 12:1*

**Active participation in worship.**

I will praise him for who he is and what he has done, and worship him wholeheartedly. *Psalm 95:1; Matthew 2:22-23*

**Private worship practices.**

**Love**

Talk with your disciples about our assignment: loving God and loving people (Mark 12:30-31). This assignment is the greatest gift from God and the highest fruit of life in the Spirit—but here is where humans have perhaps failed the most. Discuss this with your disciple. *(Someone working in this area should love the unlovable, embrace the lonely and forsaken, and regularly show God’s love to the world.)*

I will love so that people see Christ in me. *John 13:34-35, Galatians 2:20*

I will spend time alone with my Father, getting to know him better every day. *Mark 1:35, Luke 5:16, Matthew 6:5-15*

**Prayer journal or prayer list.**

**Belong**

Discipleship cannot grow without the proper environment of true, authentic, heartfelt fellowship. There is no such thing as “private Christianity.” Discuss this with your disciple. *(If your disciple is working on this area, or he feels he has accomplished it, he will be in regular attendance in the life of a local church. That means more than attending Worship—but attending small groups, retreats, and other activities.)*
I will live in intentional community with other Christ-followers, investing my life in them and developing lasting, meaningful relationships.  

Acts 2:44-47

**Fellowship, service opportunities, attending church, becoming active in my church and being in each other’s homes.**

I will allow my brothers and sisters in Christ to help me find direction, focus, accountability, and to enable me to carry out God’s plan in my life and in the world.  

Ephesians 5:21, Hebrews 10:25

**Grow**

It could be said that Galatians 2:20 is the highest maturity level we can ever work on, yet never fully feel like we’ve mastered. Being like Christ should be our greatest goal throughout life—and one we should never abandon. Discuss this with your disciple.

(People working on this area or beyond it should be involved in a weekly Bible study group, small group, and actively listen and learn from sermons/messages—and remain involved in study for the rest of their lives.)

I will seek God first—getting my priorities straight—giving all I am to God.  

Galatians 2:20; Matthew 6:33

I will submit to being discipled, and work to live in ways that develop the proper “fruit” in my life.  **Participating in regular discipleship.**

Galatians 5:22-23; 2 Peter 1:3-11; John 13:34-35

**Serve**

Everyone has been equipped by God to do good works to serve the people he places in our path (1 Corinthians 12:7). Serving is a natural outpouring of our faith; we serve from the overflow of gratitude and love in our hearts. Discuss this with your disciple. (**If she is working on this area, or feels she has accomplished it, she should know and seek to develop her spiritual gifts and be active in a place of meaningful service.**

Annual refresher courses on spiritual gifts is considered wise and helpful.)
I will develop and refine my spiritual gifts for use in the church, because God has called Christ-followers to serve the family of God and the world.

**Spiritual Gifts refresher; coaching.** *1 Corinthians 12-14, Romans 12:3-4*

I will seek out ways to do good works *(Ephesians 2:10)* using my spiritual gifts *(1 Corinthians 12-14)* because I want a faith that is alive and fruitful *(James 2:17).*

**Serving in meaningful ministry within the church.**

I will embrace the concept that in order to earn the right to share Christ with others, I must learn to meet their felt needs first. **Local and international mission events.**

I will show compassion to those in need. **Psalm 82:3-4, James 2:17**

**Contributing to meeting needs.**

Tell

We possess amazingly great good news—salvation from sin resulting in eternal life with God—yet, sometimes we treat it like it’s a secret. That should never happen.

Jesus gave us the Great Commission to share the gospel with everyone. How do we share Jesus with others? Discuss this with your disciple. *(If he is working on this area, or feels he has accomplished it, he should know how to talk to people about Christ, and know how to lead them to cross the line of faith. Personal, relational evangelism should be the norm in his life before considering himself finished with this area.)*

I will surrender my heart to Christ’s ministry to save the world through sharing the good news – starting at home and moving out into the state, nation, and world.

I will work diligently to live out the Great Commission *(Matthew 28:18-20)* building relationships of trust and integrity with my family, friends, and neighbors.

**Evangelism training; practice sharing verbal witness.**

I will take the message I have been given and share it with the world around me in my own unique, relational way. **2 Corinthians 4:7, Ephesians 6:19-20**

**Listing people I know who don’t know Jesus; sharing my faith.**

I will help meet the needs of the world around me – earning the right to talk to them about Jesus Christ. **Psalm 82:3-4**

**Inviting and including others.**
Help your disciples know that there is great deal of developing to be done in our spiritual lives; help them understand that we never finish in this lifetime (Philippians 1:6). Suggest taking part in retreats, workshops, and classes—some in the local church, some in the state, and many throughout the country—that will help with the developmental process. The local church will help with development, and ongoing work with a mentoring peer discipler will help them grow and stay committed to being developed for the rest of their lives. Prayer must become a high priority and a valuable tool for their continued formation, and their Bible should become well-worn and filled with notes from regular reading and studying.

The following scripture passages will help both you and your disciples continue on the path of growth in this stage of developing.

- Psalm 82:3-4
- Malachi 3:10
- Mark 1:35
- Acts 2:44-47
- 2 Corinthians 4:7
- Galatians 5:22-23
- 1 Timothy 6:17-19

- Psalm 95:1
- Matthew 2:22-23
- Luke 5:16
- Romans 12:1-4
- 2 Corinthians 8:7
- Ephesians 5:21
- Hebrews 10:25

- Psalm 121:1-2
- Matthew 5-7
- John 13:34-35
- 1 Corinthians 12-14
- Galatians 2:20
- Ephesians 6:19-20
- James 2:17

It is possible that your disciples may have things in both the Discovery Stage and in the Development Stage on which they need to work. Although I have cautioned to attempt to finish all of one stage before starting the next, the reality is that some disciples will have one or two mile markers that continue to challenge them, while other mile markers in the next stage will come more easy them. That’s perfectly normal and expected; we cannot be artificially restricted to one stage and ignore all others. Each of your adult disciples is different; all of us are at different places in our journey of faith.
Demonstrating Stage

As your disciples work on the details of this stage of spiritual development, their principal task will be to demonstrate what faith in Jesus Christ should be. Instead of merely growing and maturing—they will be learning to teach and role model what it means to be an unconditional follower of Christ—a disciple.

In the Demonstrating Stage, everything the disciple is doing is done with your help and supervision. What’s more, these skills are not only learned in the personal disciple-discipler relationship and through hands-on experience in serving others, they must also be demonstrated publicly in your church and community, as witnessed firsthand by you, a pastor, or other church leaders.

The following are all worded as tasks because they all are “demonstrations.” Use the Bible passages to help you delve more deeply, together.

NOTE: To truly move into the maturity level of a role model, most pastors believe a Christ-follower will commit to being a tither. (Matthew 5:1-7, 6:33, 23:23; 1 Timothy 6:17-19; Malachi 3:10; Exodus 14:18-20; 2 Corinthians 8:7.)

Worship: Surrendering your life to the adoration of God

I am demonstrating an understanding and a heart for worship, devotion, and meditation—privately and corporately. Hebrews 6:19-20


Love: Living out Christ’s Great Commandment in your world

I am demonstrating love for God and for others. 1 John 4:10-12; Mark 12:28-31; John 15:9-14
I am demonstrating devotion to a life of prayer, loving God through my conversations with him, and finding direction and answers to the questions of my life.

Psalm 66:16-20

Belong: Developing lasting relationships in the Community of Faith

I am demonstrating what it means to live in community—establishing a good reputation and living out a life of example.

Proverbs 3:3-4; John 15:11; John 15:34-35; John 13; Philippians 4:5; Philippians 2:3-4

I am demonstrating that I am committed to loving others.


Grow: Following in Christ’s footsteps—becoming more like him

I am demonstrating spiritual authenticity, submitting to being discipled, and growing towards the time I can disciple others.

Peter 1:3-11; Philippians 4:6-7; Hebrews 5:12-14; Titus 2:11-13

I am demonstrating knowledge of the spiritual disciplines such as worship, celebration, submission, fellowship, study, prayer, service, confession, solitude, silence, fasting, frugality, tithing, secrecy, and sacrifice.

Serve: Engaging in meaningful ministry to God and others

I am demonstrating how to surrender time and talents in service to God and the people around me by being involved in a place of meaningful service in the local church.

Colossians 3:17, 1 Corinthians 12-14, 1 Thessalonians 5:15

I am demonstrating my awareness of spiritual giftedness by sharpening my gifts, and helping others develop their own, to excel in their places of meaningful service.

Tell: Sharing the Good News of Christ

I am demonstrating need-meeting, relational evangelism - sharing the gospel with the world around me.
**I am demonstrating mission mindedness by regularly participating in “hands-on” outreach through a local or global mission effort.**  
*Matthew 28:18-20*

We never stop growing. If you have adult disciples who seem to have all 40 of the mile markers in all three stages complete and assimilated well into their lives, there is something important you must tell them: *they have not yet arrived!* Have them read (and memorize) Philippians 3:12-16. There are still many, many ways in which they can and should grow. This is a rare opportunity to make a personalized plan of action for a role model of the Christian faith to continue to grow and develop.

Most Christ-followers find themselves with a few undeveloped or unfinished skills or mile markers scattered throughout all three stages of development—**discovering** new things about faith, **developing** and growing in foundational areas, and learning to **demonstrate** to others what this life in Christ is all about. This is normal. Continue to work with them on those areas, strengthening the areas they’ve mastered, and going deeper in becoming more like Jesus.

This chapter is designed to help you know what to talk about and what to “assign” as helpful tasks and Bible passages to move your disciples in the right direction. The next chapter has more details on how to develop the actual personalized plan of action.
Understanding and Utilizing a Plan of Action in Discipleship

In Chapter Five you identified some of the areas in which your disciple has grown, and some of the areas in which he needs growth; it’s now time to make a personalized plan of action to help him grow. You are reminded that there are a few key tools all Christ-followers can use to grow and develop in their faith; review them below:

God’s Word

Regular, intentional study of the Bible is important in the life of every growing believer. Daily personal study, recreational reading, and research in an organized, intentional Bible Study are all important ways to be getting into God’s Word.

Prayer

Christ-followers are children of God, our Heavenly Father. Children talk to their Father. Children express their fears and their joys, ask questions and ask for favors, and generally hold heartfelt conversations with their Father each and every day. Prayer is conversation with our Heavenly Father.

Worship

The ability for us to worship grows out of worshipping God every chance we get. Personal, private worship helps us connect to our Father to tell him how much we love and adore him. When we learn to worship personally and privately, the worship experience of the entire church is greatly enhanced.
Community

Christ-followers grow most effectively in community. In fact, it’s very difficult to grow and develop as a believer in Christ without others around helping. There’s no such thing as private Christianity, and the community of believers provides the environment in which discipleship best occurs. Spending time in a weekly small group or Bible Study is critical. Attending church activities to help develop new friendships is vital. In addition, taking part in workshops and retreats will help provide the people and the advice needed to challenge, build up, and hold us accountable.

Discipline

Spiritual formation is about growing your inner being to be more like Jesus Christ. This is done best in a discipling relationship with a peer discipler/mentor. That’s your calling and commission (Matthew 28:18-20). Being a peer discipler in someone’s life will help her grow as you ask tough questions, make wise suggestions, give helpful assignments, and coach her in acquiring the needed spiritual “skills” to be more like Christ.

These are the essential tools you and your disciple will need as you develop the personalized plan of action for spiritual growth and formation. With these in mind, you’re ready to begin developing the plan.

The primary work of developing the plan lies in the hands of the individual disciple. The Mile Markers guide contains careful instructions to guide adult disciples in developing the plan. You simply need to know the process, and provide helpful assistance as needed. Tweak and fine-tune the plan to make it both challenging yet attainable.
Designing the Plan

Your disciples are asked to spend time asking God where he wants them to grow. A space is provided to allow them to write down their thoughts and impressions, and use them as a guide for their planning.

Using the “Checking My Progress” chart found in Chapter Five, your disciples are asked to find one (1) mile marker or skill they highlighted for each of the six content categories: Worship, Love, Belong, Grow, Serve, and Tell. The goal here is to find the highlighted skill with the lowest listed number (1 versus 4, or 4 versus 12) in each of the six key areas. (If all of the mile markers in the Discovering Stage are already checked, find one of the markers in the Development Stage list; if they are all checked, find one in the list of the Demonstrating Stage.) Again, select one (the lowest number) for each content category of Worship, Love, Belong, Grow, Serve, and Tell. These are the first things your disciples will begin to research and develop. A chart is provided like the one below in which they should record the selected highlighted mile markers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content Category</th>
<th>Mile Marker (Key Behavior or Skill)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WORSHIP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOVE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BELONG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GROW</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SERVE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TELL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Your disciple is also encouraged to look back at the areas they checked on the “Checking My Progress” chart to see if there are any they would like to re-visit or strengthen; a space is provided to record those mile markers that need bolstering. They can work on these as they work on the mile markers they’ve highlighted as needing growth and listed in their chart (like the one above).

Once they have identified what they plan to work on, your disciples are encouraged to ask guidance and assistance.

Prayer

Help them commit their study, research, and growth to the Lord and to ask him what he wishes them to learn. Encourage them to determine through their times of prayer if the markers they have highlighted match up with what God desires for them. If so, agree together to commit to the Lord that they will work to grow in their knowledge and understanding of him with their whole heart.

Introspection

Encourage them to take a few hours—even days—to invest in some meditation and contemplation in the Lord’s presence. They are asked to write down some of the old habits that get in the way of them having quality devotional time and times of growth with God.

They are also asked to write down how they might get rid of those old habits, and to write down some of the new habits they may need to form in order to have important, daily time with God.
Input from other Christ-followers

Your disciples are encouraged to ask their Christian friends to help identify any areas of that may get in the way of them progressing in your relationship with Christ. This input is written down in spaces provided.

They are also asked to get from you, their peer discipler/mentor, any general suggestions you may have for developing spiritually. Of course, you will always have opportunities throughout the disciple-discipler relationship to suggest more specific, individualized ways they can grow.

Bible Study

Your disciples are asked to think of any obstacles that stand in the way of them studying the Bible. What things keep them from being in his Word each day? A space is provided for them to write down their thoughts, and to brainstorm what they might do to remove those obstacles and begin to immerse themselves in God’s Word.

After they have prayed and written down their introspective notes, you should take the time to read through what they’ve written. Include brief notes, impressions, and ideas in the Records Pages. Then, turn to the actual Plan of Action; a sample Plan of Action is provided below. After your disciple has filled out his Plan of Action, spend some careful time talking about the ramifications of this “contract” they have created for themselves. Make a copy of the Plan of Action and attach it to the Records Pages. Use it to evaluate growth and forward movement.

May God richly bless you as you embark on this journey of helping others grow to be more like Christ. I know you will find that you grow in him as well.
My Plan of Action for Spiritual Formation       Date: _____________

Read through what you have written in the previous pages. Work to formulate it all into a plan of action below.

I will commit the following time to the Lord:
• _______ minutes per _______ for my devotional time;
• _______ minutes per _______ for my study time.

I commit to working on the following spiritual mile markers or skills this year:

#
#
#
#
#
#
#
#

I commit to getting rid of the following habits that hinder me:

I commit to starting these new habits that will support my spiritual development:

I commit to spending quality time in conversation with my Heavenly Father. ☐ Yes
I commit to doing all I can to grow into the likeness of my Savior, Jesus. ☐ Yes
I commit to working regularly with a mentor or discipler. ☐ Yes

Make a copy of your plan of action, and place it where you will see it every day. Ask God, and your peer discipler, for help in accomplishing it. Remember that this is just a starting point—not the end; it is a launching pad—not the destination. The mile markers (key behaviors or spiritual formation skills) you have chosen to develop are there to help you move in a positive direction.

May God richly bless you on your continuing journey to be more like Christ.
APPENDIX L:

FOCUS GROUP PERMISSION LETTER
APPENDIX L: Focus Group Permission Letter

The following letter was signed by each member of the focus group. Their signed responses are not listed here to keep private their identities and personal information. The actual permission letters are on file with the researcher.

July 17, 2014

NAME
ADDRESS
CITY, STATE, ZIP

Dear ________,

I am completing my doctoral dissertation at Winebrenner Theological Seminary entitled “Key Behaviors and Milestones in Adult Discipleship—Fashioning Intentionality, Personalization, Oversight, and Assessment.”

I seek your permission to use any statements, comments, or contributions you may have made, verbally, or in writing, before, during, or after the focus group, which met on Monday, June 23, 2014.

The requested permission extends to the planned online publication, digital archival repository, and bound printed publication of my dissertation by Winebrenner Theological Seminary through the University of Findlay Shafer Library and ProQuest UMI (http://www.proquest.com/about/who-we-are.html) and potentially other dissertation databases. The rights you provide me will in no way restrict your use of your own statements, comments, or contributions.

If you are agreeable to this arrangement, I would be most grateful if you would please sign this letter below and return it to me.

Yours sincerely,

Martin D. Johnson

I hereby grant my permission for the use requested above.

Signed: _________________________________________________________________
(Please print your name, followed by your signature.)

Date: ________________
APPENDIX M:

PERMISSION FROM PUBLISHERS
Appendix M: Permission from Publishers

Permission for use of copyrighted figures. The actual e-mails are on file with the researcher to keep private all e-mail addresses, physical addresses, and phone numbers.

**Figure 2.3** – Dimensions of Mentoring; Multiple Roles in Leading Adults

Hello Martin,

Thank you for contacting the CIPD. I apologise for the delay in responding.

I have had a look at this small figure and I see no reason why you should not go ahead and use it in your dissertation. Please acknowledge the title and date of the publication and add, “with the permission the Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development, London (www.cipd.uk).” Please place the acknowledgement alongside the figure if possible.

S. Savage, Rights and Permissions, CIPD, London, UK

**Figure 3.2** – Perry’s Scheme

License # 3587200342226. You are hereby granted a personal, non-exclusive, non-sub licensable (on a stand-alone basis), non-transferable, worldwide, limited license to reproduce the Wiley Materials for the purpose specified in the licensing process.

**Figure 3.3** – Modification of Perry’s Scheme

RE: NON-RIGHTSLINK License Number 3587200342226~289405.

Dear Dr. Martin Johnson

Thank you for contacting the RightsLink service at the Copyright Clearance Center. I have copied the Wiley permissions team in this reply to inform them that you with to modify the content and attached a copy of your license. Hopefully, we will receive a reply soon.

L. Dequito, Customer Account Specialist, Copyright Clearance Center, Danvers, MA

Dear Mr. Johnson - Re: the attached license to modify our content

Permission is hereby granted for the use requested subject to the usual acknowledgements (author, title of material, title of book, ourselves a publisher). You should also duplicate the copyright notice that appears in the Wiley publication in your use of the Material.

S. Safdar, Permissions Coordinator, Wiley, Hoboken, NJ.
WORKS CITED


WORKS CONSULTED


Marzano, Robert J. *Formative Assessment and Standards-Based Grading*. Bloomington, IN: Marzano Research Laboratory, 2010.

———, David C. Yanoski, Jan K. Hoegh, and Julie A. Simms with Tammy Hefelbower and Phil Warrick. *Using Common Core Standards to Enhance Classroom Instruction and Assessment*. Bloomington, IN: Marzano Research Laboratory, 2013.


Snyder, Catherine. “Finding the ‘Royal Road’ to Learning to Teach: Listening to Novice Teacher Voices in Order to Improve the Effectiveness of Teacher Education.” *Teacher Education Quarterly* (Fall 2012): 33-53. *Education Source*, EBSCOhost [accessed September 3, 2013].


From life's school of war: what does not kill me makes me stronger. It has been paraphrased in many different ways: "That which does not kill me makes me stronger." This saying has been attributed to many people, including Joseph P. Kennedy and Knute Rockne. Research has not uncovered a definitive origin. A long obedience in the same direction is perhaps the paraphrase in widest use.


Brown, Driver, and Briggs. 540.


Foster, Richard J. Invitation to a Journey


Hull, Bill. John 15:5, NIV


Mulholland. Growing True Disciples

Ogden, Greg. Ogden. Growing True Disciples

Peterson, Eugene H. A Long Obedience in the Same Direction.